IMPACTS OF TERTIARY EDUCATION ON THE SOCIAL STATUS OF WOMEN, IN RELATION TO LOCAL SOCIAL OBLIGATIONS AND EXPECTATIONS: A case study from Mababe, Botswana

—

Golang Segadimo
Master thesis for the Degree of Master of Philosophy in Indigenous Studies

IMPACTS OF TERTIARY EDUCATION ON THE SOCIAL STATUS OF WOMEN, IN RELATION TO LOCAL SOCIAL OBLIGATIONS AND EXPECTATIONS:

A case study from Mababe, Botswana

By

Golang Segadimo

Master thesis for the Degree of Master of Philosophy in Indigenous Studies

UiT- The Arctic University of Norway

Spring 2018

Supervised by:

Jennifer Hays

Førsteamanuensis

Department of Social Sciences

UiT- The Arctic University of Norway

Cover photo: A sign of Mababe village which is seen immediately as at the entrance of the village from Maun.

Photo by: Golang Segadimo

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My greatest and deepest gratitude are extended to God my creator. It is in Him that I have lived to write this thesis.

My supervisor Jennifer Hays, how do I express my gratitude to the tireless and professional effort you extended in this work! What an eye-opening experience to the world of writing I had in working with you. Your patience, sweet personality, and above all, professionalism has humbled me! I could go on and on, but let me sum it up by saying, "You are simply the best"!

I also extend my gratitude to Professor Sidsel Saugestad. So much time you put on helping me prepare for the data collection. What a sacrifice she made! Your knowledge about indigenous people in my country was mind blowing.

The people of Mababe who took part of this project, I sincerely thank you. This wouldn't have happened without your input. I also extend my gratitude to the University of Botswana San Research center for their support.

My husband and our two beautiful girls. You were my pillar of strength. You had to spend long hours without me as I had to work on this thesis, yet you never complained but rather encouraged me from time to time. You are the best life could ever give me!

Last but not least, let me acknowledge the Sami center for sponsoring my project. Thank you very much!

ABSTRACT

This project is about how exposure to different cultural values can impact the indigeneity of women. It focuses of how the culture of the majority, which is mostly imposed on these indigenous women through education and tertiary institutions, impacts the choices they make, as compared to the expectations and obligations of own community. I am using the case study on one indigenous group located in Mababe, Botswana.

The Botswana education system syllabus promotes the culture of the majority, which is Tswana, despite the rich cultural diversity that the country has. The syllabus is also lined up to suit the western style of education. Learners are expected to learn all and practice some of the values learnt in the classroom. On contrary, learners are brought up in their communities being taught oral tradition, and own cultural values, and expected to practice them at home. Traditional values are completely different from values taught in the formal education system. This therefore causes a cultural mismatch.

As much as education is important to the lives of many, and considered a way of personal development, to some indigenous communities the same can mean making sacrifices. This is because some indigenous communities still consider culture and oral tradition as a strong and important part of their lives. Retaining culture, at the same time pursuing formal education put these women on the cross-roads sometimes, causing cultural mismatch and making it hard to find a balance between the classroom culture and home culture. In finding themselves in the cross roads some learners react differently to this dilemma. Some choose to abandon own culture and assimilate in the culture of the majority, while others choose or are forced by circumstances to abandon education and keep own tradition. This thesis looks at the circumstances surrounding this issue, basing on the Khwee women of Mababe.

Key word: Education, Indigeneity, Cultural values, Oral tradition, Women, Identity

TABLE OF CONTENTS

FIGURE AND PHOTOS

ACROYNMS

ACHPR: African Commission on Human and People's Rights

ACWGIP: African Commission's Working Group on Indigenous Populations

UNDRIP: United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People

UNFPA: United Nations Population Fund

ILO: International Labour Organisation

RADP: Remote Areas Development Program

ICRKSD: International Conference on Research for Khoe and San Development

CHAPTER ONE

1.1 Introduction

My thesis looks at the choices made by indigenous women belonging to one particular indigenous group in Botswana, in relation to education and social obligations. In many circumstances, education can be considered positive and beneficial, particularly to the improvement of socio-economic status. To some communities, however, acquiring tertiary education can come along with costs and some sacrifices to make, as much as it brings benefits. Such sacrifices entail moving away from one's own local communities, possibly being assimilated into the culture of the majority, and in some cases, eventually despising one's own cultural identity. In instances where communities live in areas with less development, like my area of study, opportunities for further study and employment are very slim, forcing the educated generation to move out to bigger cities and towns to pursue their careers and earn a living. The process of moving out from one's own community results in exposure to the cultural values of dominant groups, which consequently may come to have a more significant impact on one's daily choices, than what has learned from one's own communities. On the other hand, not managing to further their education means continuing to live within own community, possibly continuing to live within the values according to their community's expectations but with less economic opportunity. In this thesis, I intend to closely look at this issue. The thesis seeks to establish the extent to which education impacts the choices of two groups of women, with and without tertiary education, made on daily basis and their perceptions to own cultural values and own identity in relation to what their own local society expects of them.

1.2 Scope of the study

The data collection for this research was carried out in a place called Mababe, a small village in the Northwestern part of Botswana. Mababe has a population of about 500 people and is situated in an area reserved for tourism purposes due to its richness in flora and fauna. The place is inhabited by some tribes that fall under an internationally recognized indigenous group San, but are locally known as 'Basarwa'. Originally, this group was nomadic and practiced hunting and gathering as a means of living, and equally importantly, as part of their culture. While men and women were actively involved in gathering, this traditional subsistence activity was mostly expected to be done by women, whereas men were active hunters. However, with the hunting restrictions imposed by the Botswana government in 1979 (Taylor 2001) and

consequently banning of hunting in 2013, as well as the promotion of education to all citizens, this group has resorted to other means of survival, although some parts of culture have survived. The area has several safari camps and camping sites, some of which are run by the community in collaboration with the government, and some are privately owned. These have turned out to be the main source of employment and livelihood for most of the community members. The data collection also extended to an area called Maun, which is the closest town to Mababe, to which some women and other community members relocated in order to have more available employment opportunities. A few more interviews were carried out in Gaborone, the capital city of Botswana where some of the educated women live. Some of my participants, particularly women with tertiary education could not be found in either Mababe or any of the places I visited for data collection. Therefore, I had to make telephone interviews while in Botswana and had to make some arrangements to call them while I was here in Norway. The whole data collection was done in a period of approximately two months.

I chose to do my research with the people of Mababe mainly because I have an attachment to the place. I spent part of my childhood in Mababe, and originally come from a neighboring village, Sankoyo, which is about 30 kilometers from Mababe. The tribe that I belong to, 'Bayeyi' or 'Yei', is officially recognized as a national minority in Botswana. The Bayeyi have a special relationship with San groups of Mababe, including calling each other cousins, since the two ethnic groups have lived close to each other for a long time.

1.3 Background of the study

Indigenous people in Botswana generally face marginalization and subjugation from dominant groups, mainly the Tswana (or Batswana) group which makes up about 85% of the country's population (Molefe 1999). This becomes particularly evident in places where indigenous people are outnumbered by the majority, for example in schools, towns and cities. It is not possible to find statistics showing differences between indigenous and non-indigenous students, since Botswana does not differentiate its citizens according to ethnicity, despite the country's rich ethnic diversity.

Indigenous communities in Botswana, like a lot of national minorities in the country, mostly inhabit very remote areas with no schools and major developments (Hays 2009). In most instances, primary schools are the highest learning institution found in such areas. Some of these primary schools are too small to accommodate all children in the villages, forcing others to seek primary school spaces elsewhere, both far and nearer to their communities. This also

2

means that those who manage or choose to further their studies remain with no other alternative than that of moving from their communities and live most of their lives, if not the rest, among different cultures with different cultural values.

Fig 1: Map showing where in Botswana Mababe is located. (*Source: google maps*)

Moreover, schools in Botswana use only Setswana and English as languages of instruction. Spoken by at least 80% of the population, Setswana is the only local language in Botswana which is considered national, and is expected to be learned by every citizen, despite the fact that the country has over 20 languages (Molefe 1999). English was officially adopted as a national language when the country gained independence from Britain in 1966, and is the only language used for instruction in tertiary institutions. This means all Mababe women who pursue their education will consequently use their mother tongue less and concentrate on Setswana and English, despite the fact that their society could expect them to speak their own local language.

Mababe is one such community, with one school for elementary education. This implies that the generation pursuing education past the primary level, and who have started going to school in Mababe, will eventually move out of their community to bigger towns. It is in such instances that some experience severe marginalization and learn values and norms of different cultures, especially because the Botswana school syllabus promotes the culture of the dominant Tswana group, as well as and some western values.

Photo 1: Some classrooms in a primary school in Mababe. *(Field photo by researcher, 2016)*

The last decade has also seen a significant change in the Mababe social system with the boom of the tourism business. This business started in the 90's as an initiative by the government to improve the lives of the societies living in remote areas rich in wildlife. Mababe was chosen as one of these areas. At the introductory stage, 60% of the proceeds from the business were entirely for the benefit of the local people. However, things changed with time, with the government taking over larger percentage of the proceeds, after several complaints of mismanagement of proceeds by the local leaders. Since the business was aimed at improving the lives of the local people, there has been a significant change in the means of livelihood, with people shifting from the traditional ways of sourcing out food to working in the tourism safari camps.

These safari camps have become main employers particularly for the uneducated group of the community (women included), for simple jobs such as housekeeping, gardening, escort guiding, and cleaning. This has partly shifted the focus of the society from striving to search for food in a cultural means to acquiring finances to buy food. However, gathering is still practiced for supplementary food, and by those with interest.

Some of the women who could not continue with further educations, take advantage of the employment opportunities offered by these Safari camps, especially because they are situated around the village. Working in the safari camps enable them to stick around their communities,

therefore having a chance to get involved in the cultural practices which are still carried out occasionally in the village.

Even though the local culture does not dictate that women should fulfil some societal obligations such as playing the roles expected of them in social gatherings, the community still holds some level of expectations towards these women. There is a general expectation from the society on certain aspects of women such as their way of dressing, their conduct in different settings, and their involvement in different social activities such as funerals, weddings and families. While in pursuit of education, these women get exposed to societal activities, and cultural values and norms of the dominant groups. The extent to which they retain, promote or shift from their own cultural values remains in question.

This thesis seeks to find out what kind of social impacts education has on the choices these women make on a daily basis? What is the Mababe society's general view on education among women? Is it something positive or negative? After attaining education, and being exposed to other cultural values, do local women still appreciate and value their own cultural views and expectations of how they should be as women? While in the midst of the cultural hegemony, do they promote their own culture or find a cover within the majority? Are those without education missing something by not having it, or is it an advantage in sticking to their culture? This is what this research is looking at.

1.4 Statement of the problem

In the presentation made by the local indigenous activist Lydia Nyati-Ramahobo to the International Conference on Research for Khoe and San Development in 2003, she highlighted that, after getting educated, exposed to different lifestyles, and having other cultural values imposed on them, some indigenous children never come back to their communities and consider their culture as backward, and would not want to be identified or associated with their ethnicity (Nyati-Ramahobo 2003). Because of the marginalization indigenous women suffer at the hands of the dominant groups; the cultural expectations on them in order to be seen as appropriate women in the community; and the possible cultural dilemmas they might find themselves in in pursuit of careers, some indigenous women with formal education find themselves at a difficult crossroads of finding a balance between the three. While some get assimilated, others choose to take pride in their uniqueness and promote their identity. On the other hand, women who do not further their education either by choice or because they do not meet the requirements or because of various other challenges they face at schools, stay in Mababe and possibly stick

strongly to their traditions, get involved in the occasional cultural practices, and are active in societal activities.

I wondered if the presence or absence of tertiary education has a significant impact on the choices of these two groups of women. But the question remains, to what extent, and why? And is this impact considered positive or negative? This thesis intends to find some possible answers, through the following research questions:

1. After being in a system where dominant cultural values are imposed upon them, do Mababe San women with tertiary education still choose to maintain their own cultural values?

2. How much is the involvement of the two groups of women in their roles as expected by the society?

3. Does having an education change these women, in terms of how they view themselves as women in their local community?

4. Do local women with tertiary education still appreciate the way society regards women in general, as compared to those without tertiary education?

5. If given a chance to practice their careers in Mababe, would the women with careers choose to work within their society or move out? What is the role of education in this choice?

6. To what extent are these two groups of women influenced by what they learn from their society in making their daily choices e.g. clothing, behaviour, daily conduct? Is education creating a social conflict?

7. What general views do these two groups of women express towards education?

When generating these research questions, I had some assumptions about education and indigeneity. For example, I had always thought the Khwee society in general was against education of women, and preferred sticking to their traditional way of life over modern life. However, the responses I got from my participants challenged these assumptions, which led me to broaden my scope of research to including some of the issues I had not initially thought of including in this thesis, like including a group of men in my data collection. I will discuss this in detail in chapter 5.

Photo 2: Part of the village is situated in the wetlands, hence the area's richness in flora and fauna. *(Filed photo by researcher, 2016)*

1.5 Description of Botswana education system in the context of my research

The education system in Botswana uses a structure in which elementary or primary school is seven years, then junior secondary school is three years, then senior school is two years. From senior school, learners can proceed to tertiary institutions, depending on their performance or their career choices. From primary to junior school, education is free and mandatory to all. The entry point for senior schools and tertiary institutions depends on the performance of an individual learner. Those who do not meet the required standard are not allowed to proceed with their education. Progress in education to the higher level is entirely based on merit. In relation to how I chose my participants, the first group is for women who have completed tertiary education. The second group is that of women who only made it to as far as junior secondary school but could not proceed further. Furthermore, I did interviews with different people of all ages and genders in the society to get different views on women.

1.6 Research objectives

The main and general objective of this research is to study the extent to which education, particularly tertiary, impacts the indigeneity of the women of Mababe, how they are influenced by different values they learned or came across when attaining education in making their day to day choices, and if education creates a social conflict.

7

The main objectives will be achieved through the following;

- Understanding the traditional or societal expectations of a San woman of Mababe.
- Identifying the relationship between education and culture or tradition.
- Relating education and indigeneity through the data collected from these women and other groups of participants.

1.7 Relevance of the study

This project aims to point out the possible impacts education could have on the character or behavior traits and personal views towards own culture of an indigenous woman, considering the case study of Mababe. Education and increased participation in the capital economy have caused a significant change to the lives of indigenous women on views and perceptions of their own cultural norms, in as such causing a possible change of their roles in society. Instead of concentrating on local societal expectations, some indigenous people choose to pursue what seems best and more important to them, such as education, and concentrate on being the best in their own way, and not in the ways of the society. This project looks closely at how education and the system of governance pertaining to education can cause an indigenous woman who is in pursuit of a career to have a limited choice between clinging to her own cultural place with no education or having to live among the dominant majority to have an education, which may mean sacrifice of her own cultural values, thus leading to assimilation. The project also looks at the possibility of indigenous women moving towards overcoming stigmatization and marginalization of their ethnic identity to making it to positions where mostly only dominant groups are expected to be.

CHAPTER TWO: PREVIOUS RESEARCH AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 Introduction

This chapter includes three sections. The first section looks at the complexities surrounding indigeneity in the African contest, as well as the definition of the term. The situation of the indigenous people of Botswana is also discussed. In the second section, some previous literature on the indigenous of Botswana is reviewed. The last section looks at the two theories employed in relation to this thesis.

2.2 SECTION A: GENERAL CONTEXT OF INDIGENEITY IN AFRICA

Many African states have been finding it challenging to support indigenous right movements. One has to understand the history of the continent in order to understand the reasons why, which are strongly linked to colonisation or European influence. While history shows that most continents have suffered from European dominance, Africa has experienced the worst suffering. The European dominance of Africa, which at some point came in the name of colonisation, had some grueling and devastating impacts on most of the countries in the continent with dichotomies such as white-black, coloniser-native, economic domination-subjugation, and the involvement legally in the political climate (Saugestad 2008). Upon liberation, and now in the process of decolonisation, it is difficult for the states to differentiate between discrimination and affirmative action (Saugestad 2008), making it difficult to support indigenous movements, let alone recognising their own indigenous people. In the post-colonial era, these states have their focus more on collective rights, and helping all citizens to equally access fundamental rights which they have been long denied by colonisation (Osaghae 2008). All people are considered to be a part of the society, and therefore no group needed to be granted some kind of 'special' rights (Osaghae 2008). Furthermore, the continent is rich in cultural diversity, with a huge variety of ethnic groups who mostly live in very unpleasant conditions. Granting some 'special' rights to some groups might end up stirring ethnic conflicts and tribalism in the economies in which some are already crippled by political instabilities (Osaghae 2008).

Since the international indigenous movement started including Africa in 1990's, there has not been a clearer international definition of the term 'indigenous people' that makes sense to the African states (Crawhall 2006: 5). For a long time, this challenge has not helped African states to draw a clear line between who is indigenous, and who is not. The United Nations has adopted the definition of Jose Martinez Cobo, which linked indigeneity with historical continuity, non-dominance, as well as distinct ethnic identity and cultural patterns (Crawhall 2006). This definition was still controversial because it seemed to define all native Africans, not some particular groups. The situation has therefore prompted the African Commission of Human and People's Rights (ACHPR) to come up with a definition that is more relevant or meaningful to the African context. The ACHPR defines indigenous people as people whose

"cultures and ways of life differ considerably from the dominant society, and that their cultures are under threat, in some cases to the point of extinction. A key characteristic for most of them is that the survival of their particular way of life depends on access and rights to their traditional lands and the natural resources thereon. They suffer from discrimination as they are regarded as less developed and less advanced than other more dominant sectors of society. They often live in inaccessible regions, often geographically isolated, and suffer from various forms of marginalization, both politically and socially. They are subjected to domination and exploitation within national political and economic structures that are commonly designed to reflect the interests and activities of the national majority. This discrimination, domination and marginalization violates their human rights as peoples/communities, threatens the continuation of their cultures and ways of life and prevents them from being able to genuinely participate in decisions regarding their own future and forms of development."

This definition has been created to take into consideration the historical, social and political dynamics of the African states, making it possible for indigenous communities to be easily identifiable. Such communities mostly include the hunter-gatherers, pastoralists and small-scale farmers. Even though some challenges of indigeneity in Africa still remain, a significant change has taken place, with some on the way partly prompted by the involvement of the indigenous people themselves in the international movements, as well as the fact that some UN Conferences were held on African soil, giving the indigenous people a forum and platform to air their concerns (Saugestad 2008).

2.2.1 Indigeneity in Botswana

Botswana is one of the countries that voted for the UNDRIP declaration, yet it maintains that the declaration is not applicable to the situation of its people and/or the people in Southern African countries, despite the fact that indigenous people in Botswana are internationally recognised (Saugestad and Bolaane 2011). Botswana does not recognise any particular ethnic group as indigenous but rather considers every citizen as native and indigenous, a move the country also took to prove how distanced it was from apartheid, which was practiced by the neighbouring country of South Africa (Saugestad 2008). This was a way of the government administering equal treatment to all citizens and avoiding any kind of discrimination. However, the practice has encouraged cultural hegemony on the part of the majority Tswana groups, leading to the nationalisation of only one language (Molefe 1999). Despite the fact that the country has over ten ethnic groups, all were named with one name, Tswana, and all citizens are expected to learn or know the Tswana culture (Molefe 1999). This was nothing but another form of discrimination among other ethnic groups, which were for a long time referred to as 'minorities' because they were few in numbers as compared to the majority Tswana groups. Because of this, indigeneity is not an issue of any importance to the government, even though subjugation and discrimination of some ethnic groups remains very evident (Saugestad 2008). In fact, the government discourages any kind of special focus or treatment on any tribe, and regards it as tribalism, as all tribes are deemed indigenous and equal in the country. The San in Botswana find themselves in this challenging position, where the government does not recognise them as indigenous people, even though they are, internationally. They remain more vulnerable to subjugation and discrimination than other ethnic groups, yet the government still overlooks the fact that they should be granted indigenous rights but rather treats them like any Botswana citizen with social problems (Pelican & Maruyama 2015). The government also disregards the distinct way of life of the San, expecting them to integrate and live like any other citizen.

2.2.2 Paradox of indigenous ethnic naming

Basarwa (singular- mosarwa), which is the more common local term for the San, comes from a Setswana word 'Mosarwa' (singular-Lesarwa), which is a very demeaning term and was used by Batswana (Mafela 2014). The Setswana prefix 'Ma' is often used on animals and is dehumanizing. It was used on Basarwa because of their lifestyle which the dominant ethnic groups ascribed to animals (Mafela 2014). This prefix was also used on other minority groups all around the country. The term Masarwa was later changed to 'Basarwa', with prefix 'Ba'

(singular- 'Mo') being more human and politically correct (Mafela 2014). The term Basarwa has therefore been widely accepted and used in the country, including the indigenous groups themselves, even though some groups still strongly prefer to use their own ethnic reference names. It is worth noting that the Basarwa was used as a collective word referring to all San or indigenous groups around the country, in spite of their own ethnic reference.

2.2.3 The San

The San, or Bushmen, (as internationally referred to), or the Basarwa (as locally referred to), are the single largest indigenous community in Botswana. They are comprised of different small tribes and speak different languages which include clicking sounds (ACWGIP 2005). They are not officially recognised as indigenous people by the government of Botswana but internationally recognised. It is estimated that they make up 3.3% of the national population and mostly live in the most disadvantaged conditions (IWGIA 2016). The San community is non-homogenous, yet distinct in away from the rest of the population with their culture, linguistics and at some instances, their physical appearance. They are considered politically and economically marginalized and remain vulnerable to exploitation by other ethnic groups (ACWGIP 2005). The ACWGIP (2005) also described the Basarwa as lagging behind other tribes in terms of political representation, because of their lack of education, isolation and ignorance of civil rights. Even though they are originally hunters and gatherers, the lack of education and hunting restrictions by the government have hit them hard, prompting some to work as livestock herders for the non-Basarwa ranchers. Because they are originally hunters and gathers, most San communities inhabit places that are regarded as of value to the government because they are rich in tourism attraction sites and game. Tourism is the second largest source of income to the government of Botswana. While other minorities in the country have also been affected, the San communities are mostly affected by the government's hunting restrictions and strict land policies on reserved land because of their original lifestyle and the parts of land they originally inhabited and still inhabit (ACWGIP 2016).

2.2.4 The San of Mababe

Like the rest of the San community in Botswana, the San of Mababe are originally hunters and gathers. They live in a small village located in a crown land, currently. In his PhD research, Taylor (2000) narrates the historic experiences that the people of Mababe underwent over decades. Taylor attributes that to the maladministration of the combination of the dominant

local groups and the Europeans, who both advocated for the need for the part of the land to be restricted from hunting and human habitation. Following this, plus the complaints raised that the Basarwa were 'finishing' the animals, part of the land of Mababe was forcefully taken from the people and made part of a national game reserve, and hunting restrictions were imposed. This led to the Mababe village and some surrounding land as land which both people and animals could inhabit. In this move, land that was richer in wild berries and game was taken away from the people who had inhabited it for centuries, if not decades (Taylor 2000). This has henceforth affected the livelihood of the people, forcing them to find other means of survival. Because of the rich variety of game found in Mababe, the tourism business has found a huge market and has employed many local people, mostly in unskilled jobs. Others have moved outside Mababe to bigger cities for more available employment opportunities.

2.2.5 The San and education system of the Botswana government

As previously stated, most of the San are situated in very rural and isolated areas, with very minimal developments. In most cases, primary schools (for elementary education) are the highest learning institutions found in these villages and at times the schools do not have all the facilities required. The government thus introduced a plan to take learners to other places where they could have full access of education facilities and have them accommodated in boarding facilities for some learners as young as six years (Hays 2009). It is mostly under these circumstances that kids suffer subjugation and marginalization since they will be few in numbers and foreign to the place and language. Developments in infrastructure around the country has meant more schools built in rural places, which has caused minimization of the arrangement of boarding facilities. However, for those who continue with their education to secondary and tertiary schools would have to move outside their communities, sometimes with the financial aid from the government. During my research, I have met some women who benefited from the government financial aid and will elaborate on it more in my findings.

2.3 SECTION B: PREVIOUS LITERATURE

There has not been literature found about the indigenous women of Mababe and education. However, there is numerous literature about indigenous people and formal education around the world. Though situated in different places, with different cultural backgrounds, the challenges that indigenous communities encounter in regard to formal education are similar, and include language, manner of instruction, and separation (Hays 2016). Their progression in different levels of study is marred with numerous struggles emerging from these challenges, consequently affecting their level of interest in education, as well as level of progress. Some communities have always fought for their right for education, showing huge interest in formal education but are challenged by the failure for formal education systems to incorporate the indigenous ways of knowing, which is a strong pert of most of the indigenous communities, into the formal system.

2.2.1 General overview on formal education versus indigenous education

Oral or indigenous education is considered important in most of the indigenous communities, and mostly make up one of the most important parts of their culture. However, in many ways, it differs from formal education, which I occasionally refer to as western education in this paper. The differences include the way of administration, the purpose, and the manner in which it is done. In indigenous education, it is more probable if not obvious that the skills are passed to the children or younger generations, and are also used purposefully for their own survival, or for the survival of the whole community (Akena 2012). I will give a more precise comparison of an example of one of the San communities in Namibia called the Ju|'hoan. Hays (2016) pointed out that many ethnographers described the children's manner towards their indigenous education as "self-motivated, gradually moving through varying levels of legitimate peripheral participation, towards full participation in a community of practice as trackers, hunters, botanists, gatherers and healers" (2016:77). She also described the Ju|'hoan education as not so much precisely taught to children by instructions or rules but was rather performed and told through stories, and direct instructions would only be given to individual learner(s) if need be (Hays 2017). The most important part of indigenous knowledge is that skill is being transferred to the learner, and that the learners demonstrate it properly, and the skill is used for survival as opposed to formal education which is administered in classroom, with some certain level of expectations both in performance and discipline in ways which are also strange and new to learners (Akena 2012).

2.3.2 Reasons why the San resist education

Botswana is one of the few African countries that have heavily invested in education and seen a success in the growth in universal education, with elementary and secondary education being free and compulsory to all despite race or ethnicity (Ramahobo 2003). Even though this is considered a success story in a developing nation, with many citizens having benefited from this free education system, the story has been different among the San community. To the San, the road to acquire education has been filled with challenges that are similar to those experienced by the indigenous communities' world-wide. Statistics in Botswana have shown that high school drop-outs, poor performance and poor attendance in schools have been more prevalent among the San children than other ethnic groups (Le Roux 2000). It is only a handful who manage to push through these challenges and make it to tertiary institutions. One might wonder why would so much effort be made by the government to increase access of education to the San, yet its success and effectiveness remains limited. I will discuss some of the reasons below, as found by different researchers.

2.3.2.1 Language

After gaining independence from Britain in 1966, the government of Botswana has developed an education system with only two languages of instruction, Setswana and English. The first four years of elementary education in schools is in Setswana, thereafter English is used until tertiary level (Mafela 2014). For a long time the country has operated as a monolingual, completely ignoring the languages of the minorities (Hays 2005). It is only recently that the government has started recognising other languages, even though such languages are not included anyway in the formal systems. Languages of instruction in schools however remain unchanged.

As stated previously, Basarwa inhabit very remote areas and mostly stick strongly to their culture, which include their language. When starting school, some San children are moved from their homes, and suddenly put in a different environment, where they have to speak a new language, and are not allowed to use their own mother tongue, while others who start schools while living within own communities also face the similar hardships of switching to a new foreign language while in classroom. This brings discomfort, lack of morale and motivation, ultimately leading to dropout and/or poor performance in schools.

2.3.2.2 Separation

Since Basarwa mostly inhabit very remote areas in the country, schools are not normally found in their home villages, except for few villages such as Mababe which have schools for elementary education. Because of this situation, the government of Botswana started the RADP, (which will be discussed more in chapter 5) scheme to improve access of education for children in remote areas in government schools, of which 80% of its beneficiaries are San (Hays 2005). The government has invested heavily in this scheme. Part of the scheme entails moving the San children (or children of other minorities who benefit from the scheme), to be housed elsewhere where schools are available, some as young as 6 years. In this case, children are separated from their parents, far away from their communities, and placed with other people employed by the government as care takers. There have been some cases of abuse and maltreatment by staff members to the children. It can be concluded that such situation brings discomfort and uncertainty to these children, consequently affecting the children's learning capabilities, morale and motivation.

2.3.2.3 Way of dominance

San children also consider being introduced to schools as a way of exposing their inferiority, and the dominance of the systems over them, as Mafela 2014 puts it that

> "in the school and the classrooms, the San learners are subjected to experiences that devaluate their lifestyles, traditional knowledge and cultural practices. The schools alienate the learners because its processes are divorced from the learners' familiar life experiences, which are unthreatening, due to the fact that San traditional education is informal and is incorporated into the daily lives of the people' (2014:53).

Moreover, the education syllabus in Botswana does not promote values other than that of the dominant Tswana ethnic group. In other words, learners are taught new systems of knowledge, with a foreign or new language, by people from cultures that are different, discriminate against, and are considered superior to their own (Hays 2016). In such a sense, it is highly probable that the motivation for learning will be seriously reduced or completely diminish because their competence is ignored or not appreciated at the beginning. One of the San who made it through tertiary education to getting a formal job, Kuela Kiema, recalled his days in class and pointed out that

"We were taught Setswana proverbs which carried Tswana philosophies of human behaviour. Our education paid no attention to our own traditional philosophies. We were told that '*ga se setswana*' (it is not according to the Tswana tradition), or *ga se setho* (it is inhuman)."

This clearly points out that the classroom was, in a way, an environment which was used to impose (in dominance) certain 'new ways' of doing things, as opposed to what San children were initially taught in their homes.

2.3.2.4 Manner of instruction as opposed to community values

The manner in which formal education is administered, the way of disciplining the learners, and the manner of instruction, the values applied or taught in the classroom setting completely oppose that of the San culture. For example, the things learners would be disciplined for, that were considered inappropriate in class are totally accepted and a part of the daily practices of the San culture (Kiema 2010). This had also brought a dilemma to the learners on how to behave in these two different settings, classroom and home, in return causing demotivation among learners as Kiema (2010) states;

> While Bakgalagadi students followed classes with ease, we Kua were caught between two worlds. We loved our culture and customs, we loved our traditions and our history. We followed our traditional religious rituals with humility and believed in them. But our teachers did not. We wanted to be educated within our cultural environment without having to disown our traditions" (2010:40).

Such a situation would mean learners remain with two choices. The first one is to accept and live by the values taught by the system, which would also deem them traitors deviating from their society. The second choice would be to resist what the system entails and maintain their own culture and identity, which also contradicts the education requirements. As it is hard to take a side, especially taking into consideration that of the system, demotivation towards formal education becomes the end result and results in school dropout.

2.3.3 Formal Education, identity and the San

The government of Botswana is fully aware of the hard conditions that most of the San are living with and has been pursuing some strategies to bring about improvement which includes the RAD Program (I will discuss it more in Chapter 5). All government efforts toward improving the livelihood of the San community has been centered around increasing the literacy

level, which would hopefully improve their socio-economic status eventually. While there are cases of success, the schemes have not achieved as much as expected. One of the reasons schemes do not always reach the target is a lack of understanding, or rather the different views of the San and the government towards education and the San's distinct way of life. While the San treasure their culture and way of life, the government on the other hand considers it backwards and uncivilised, and therefore uses education as a tool to "develop" or "civilise" them (Zips-Mairitsch 2013). The government uses education as a way of changing the identity of the San and assimilating them in the mainstream. Kiema gave her experience in class:

> "the teacher said the government wanted to make us human beings and that we should stop being Basarwa. They started teaching us 'proper' human behaviour". (Kiema 2010:41).

Receiving such remarks that deem their culture inhuman can cause some to even look down upon their own culture. In a report presented by one of the indigenous activists, Lydia Nyati-Ramahobo to the ICRKSD in 2003, she highlighted that in pursuit of education, San children learn about and get exposed to different cultures therefore considering their own culture backward and then never go back to their communities (Nyati-Ramahobo 2003). They do not want to identify with their culture or communities anymore and feel better with identifying with the majority.

However, some San use education as a means of resistance to the stigmatization put on them by proving wrong the wide belief that San cannot make it to a higher education and social status, such as the case with my research findings. However, having made it, some still face the challenges of dealing with the differences in their own culture and those of the mainstream (Hays 2016), which may cause them to make a choice of either maintaining their identity, or assimilating to the culture of the mainstream, thereby changing their San identity in some ways.

2.4 SECTION C: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

Even though my focus in this thesis is on indigenous women, I have chosen theories that are more focused on education and indigeneity, because of my findings. During the data collection, the two factors that arose from my participants have more to do with education and identity (or indigeneity) than they do with femininity. In this chapter, I will discuss the two theories, and later relate them to my research in chapter 5.

2.4.1 Structural inequality theory

Even though this theory was used to explain the situation of the American Indians and the Education system of the dominant groups, I find it relevant and suitable to the case of this thesis. Different scholars have referred to this theory by different names, such as cultural-ecological theory, oppositional culture theory, macrostructural explanations (Huffman 2010). However, the different names are all centred around the same explanations and views. Structural inequality theory considers the broad societal and school factors as well as the dynamics within the minority communities (Ogbu and Simons 1998). (Ogbu and Simons 1998) explain this theory by breaking down the word into two: culture and ecology.

a) Ecology: this refers to the 'setting', the 'world', or the 'environment' of the minority (or indigenous communities) of that which they live in.

b) Culture: this refers to the way the minorities (and indigenous people) perceive, understand and see their world, and how they behave in it.

This theory looks at how the minorities are treated or mistreated by the 'system' at a macro level, in terms of the education policies generated and applied to them, as well as how minorities perceive and respond to the education system as a consequence of the treatment they receive (Ogbu and Simons 1998). The lack of support and the misunderstanding of the culture of the minorities at a macro level, the failure to help integrate this culture in the learning environment would create some discomfort for the minorities, eventually causing them to either resist the system or get assimilated into the system. This theory looks into structure of the education at a macro level such as the education syllabus, governmental financial support, and social support systems in education (Huffman 2010). If such systems are created or structured under the influence of a certain culture (or cultures), and thereafter implemented on a different culture (cultures), there will always be a misunderstanding in these cultures. There is therefore a likelihood of negative responses such as resistance, demotivation for education or poor performance, meaning that the system itself has failed, not the learners.

2.4.2 Cultural discontinuity theory

This is one of the most discussed and recognised theory in educational anthropology. Just like cultural discontinuity theory, this theory is originally birthed from the American Indian studies by educational anthropologists, but is considered relevant to most settings similar to that of the American Indians, which is the reason why it would be used in this thesis. Cultural discontinuity theory considers the existing mismatch between the culture in the school and the culture at

home, that eventually results in the misunderstanding between the teacher and the student in the classroom, and failure of the students in their school performance (Huffman 2010). This theory looks at the micro level of culture conflicts. It considers culturally based differences such as communication styles, gestures, use of words etc., which cause discomfort and conflict, and ultimately failure of the students (Huffman 2010). In the classroom setting, the culture of the mainstream is encouraged, and the culture of the minorities discouraged, which in the long run can mean learners might extend some classroom culture (which is of the mainstream) to their homes, which can cause some perplexing dilemmas between the students, teachers and parents. Kiema (2010:40) gave a relevant example of his own experience at school, narrating that;

> "Slowly but surely, however, Tswana culture began to influence us. Our parents saw that the school was making us disobedient and disrespectful toward our traditions and started to complain about it. Because of this lack of respect for ancestral laws they said that we were the main source of a lot of natural disasters which occurred then. We children began to feel torn between the school culture and our family traditions. Many children, with the support of their parents, began to leave school. As a result, our teachers claimed that the Basarwa culture didn't approve of formal education. The truth was that the education system didn't approve of us."

Misunderstandings exist because the culture of the classroom happened to be inconsiderate of the views and values of the learners, clinging to what is considered appropriate according to the eyes of the teachers, and probably using the culture of the majority as a benchmark.

CHAPTER THREE: METHODS AND METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction

In this chapter, I explain how I followed the indigenous research methodology throughout the entire process of my research. I also discuss the methods of data collection I have used, as well as the ethics I followed for the whole project. I also briefly explain the area of data collection as well as my sampling. Lastly, I explain the challenges I faced when collecting my data.

3.2 Methodology

"I don't want to talk to a researcher one more time! I am tired of researchers coming here and using us for their own benefit. In fact, I don't want to see a researcher again."

This is a response I got from one elderly woman after my research assistant introduced me as a researcher to her. She was my first possible participant, the very first person we approached in Mababe! This she said, as she turned away from us, giving us the back of her head and she seemed she never wanted to see us again. I still remember standing there, looking at my research assistant in shock, disbelief, and a kind of despair. Just a while before this introduction, the elderly lady was excited to have remembered my parents, and even told us a few stories of some good memories. This excitement seemed to immediately disappear the moment I was introduced as a researcher. Deep down I had a sense of discomfort by just imaging how I seemed to her. Was I still a daughter of the people she was once close to, or was I one of the researchers she did not even want to see? This question rang loudly in my mind.

I then explained to her how she had the right not to participate and that it would not affect our relationship in anyway and then said a goodbye. She was still looking away. I proceeded to my second possible participant. This was a prominent village elder, I was told (and also knew), and he was well acquainted with the history of Mababe. The man remembered me perfectly and we had a very nice catch-up chat. Since he was an uncle to my researcher, she decided to now tell him why I was there. The response was shocking.

"No no! Researchers have finished my knowledge. My knowledge is very far away. In the western world, in Tanzania, very far away with the westerners. I don't have any more knowledge, and therefore there is nothing I can share with one more researcher. You people should go away because I am not even feeling well now. I want to rest."

Again the mood changed. I stood there uncomfortable, discouraged, and even more, hopeless! I wondered if I would ever have any success in my data collection with such an experience right

at the beginning. We then decided to take a break for the day. The following day I made a good number of interviews, about three. Then I kindly requested to take some photographs. It was like I had made a mistake. I had some regrets, even though I knew I was doing the right thing. This is the response I got from one person.

> "You researchers get pictures of us and then take them to the western countries. You put us on big billboards, which is so demeaning, depicting us as backward and suffering, and then get some donations by using us."

Just when I thought I was making a breakthrough in my data collection, there was another thing to deal with. This tended to be the response of the people that I was requesting to photograph. Eventually my researcher opened up and told me that this is what people in the village believed and she didn't think anybody would ever agree to get photographed. I was tempted to do it in hiding and without their consent, but indigenous research methodologies was my primary goal, and I knew I had to do the right thing, of which I did.

Through these experiences, I got to know the reality of the negative impacts of research methodologies conducted possibly in ways that do not seem right in the eyes of the communities. If many people in such a small community can boldly speak so negatively about researchers, surely it says a lot about the research methodologies that had been in place when such research was conducted. It could have been that methodologies used previously on the people were only based on satisfying the need of the researchers, which has been the case in research for a long time. This reminded me of an example which Evjen (2008) highlighted, of the research conducted on the Sami community of Tysfjord in which their body parts were measured without their consent. In the article, Evjen started with a quotation given by a young person about how the grandmother was held and had her body parts measured while not prepared, and that it seemed the researcher wanted the grandmother to look that way. This was a sign of the footprints of the negative effects left behind by such research methodologies, not only to the people researched but also to the coming generations. It also shows the urgent need to use indigenous research methodologies when conducting research with indigenous communities, which may change the views of such communities towards researchers.

However, there has been a paradigm shift in the research methodology, particularly with the research concerning indigenous communities. This has been partly because of tools like the UNDRIP and ILO 169, which encouraged respect of the rights of the indigenous people and their inclusion in the matters that concerns them. Furthermore, the rise of scholars with an

indigeneity background who openly critiqued the old or scientific research methodology on indigenous people, have also seen a shift in the whole paradigm, creating room for embracing indigenous research methodology. Smith (2011) likened scientific research methodology with another type of colonisation on indigenous people because information about the indigenous people was collected and analysed through the eyes of the West, and then presented back to the 'colonised' communities through the same eyes. Smith calls for research with indigenous research methodology that will recognise and include the indigenous communities, and encourage self-determination, and where possible for the research to be done by the people themselves.

Moreover, Shawn (2008) emphasises the importance of relationships and building trust in ideas, things, as well as the land, in indigenous research methodologies. He explained that research in the indigenous research paradigm include building relationships with ideas, land, and the people, respecting such relationships and therefore gaining from each other through such relations. He raised the four elements of indigenous research paradigm, which are epistemology, ontology, axiology and methodology. The four are interrelated, and centred on the body of knowledge which are acquired through building relationship, and then treating the relationships with respect, reciprocity and responsibility. He continued to describe indigenous research as a ceremony that should be celebrated by both the researcher and the people the research is done with.

In conducting my research, I tried as much as possible to apply the indigenous research methodology. I faced the challenge of applying the methodology during the data collection when I came face to face with people who seemed to be tired of having researchers in their village. Facing such a resistance was an obvious blockage for me as a researcher to try and build any possible relationships around, or make research a ceremony, or for any possible exchange of knowledge, as Shawn (2008) emphasised. I could not celebrate research with people who were already tired of it and did not even want to see a researcher around. I could see how different my views and theirs were on research. I was a Master student in Indigenous studies, passionate about indigenous people and their rights, and therefore wanted to apply the theories of indigenous methodologies that I learned back at the university. On the contrary, I was facing a group of elderly people who told me they did not want to talk to or see any researcher around in the village, or get photographed, because of the bad experiences they had in the past. With such two different views, research could not be a ceremony.

I also noticed that even though I had already existing personal relationships with some people, and possibly with the land that I spend part of my childhood at, this did not guarantee an obvious relationship with the people now as a researcher. It felt completely different.

However, I remained within the principles of indigenous methodologies as well as the agreement I had with the village head, the Botswana ethics body in research and the Norwegian ethics regulatory body, in conducting the research. Throughout all those challenges, I have respected all my participants decisions, and the feelings they expressed to me, I have worked within the framework of their preference, and therefore applied indigenous research methodology.

3.2 Area of study

The study was carried out in a place called Mababe. It is situated about 120 km east of one of the most popular tourist hubs of Botswana, Maun. The place is inhabited by about 500 people, mainly from one of the groups officially recognised as indigenous San. The group is internationally categorised as Khwee,

3.4 Sampling

The sampling method used in the data collection was basically random. With the help of my research assistant, I randomly chose any of the people interested in participating then I would establish if they fit within any of the four categories. If they did, then I would go ahead with the data collection. Even though I once lived in Mababe, I wasn't very familiar with most of the people who were potential participants, especially the youth, and I therefore had to depend on my research assistant' negotiation with the people she felt comfortable with to request interviews. In return, my research was dependent on the possible participant's willingness to engage in the interview. However, in the category of elderly people, since I knew a good number of them, I could simply ask them randomly picking from those that fell into the category. My research assistant still helped me to request some interviews.

When it came to the telephone interviews, I would also say I have used the same random sampling. This kind of interview was used to interview women who have relocated out of Mababe for work or study purposes. I chose these participants basing on my knowledge about them which I got from my research assistant. Not so many of them fall into that category so my choice was limited here. I knew most of them and had their contacts, so it made things easier for me. I just contacted any of those that fitted in the category and explained my work, then

requested an interview with them. All of those that I called were very helpful. In fact, none of them turned me down.

The size of the research sample was a little high, with about 28 participants. This was because I had three different categories of participants to cover up in my data collection. I believe that getting different perspectives would broaden the scope of responses, therefore contributing to enrich the findings. Using two sets of different questions, I interviewed two groups of women, with and without education. The first group was comprised of eight women while the second had eight. With another set of questions, I interviewed two categories of participants, a group of men from different age groups, and one group of elderly women. I had initially intended to interview one of the village elders and an official. However, I have realised it was not as easy as I thought it would be. The elders were not willing to participate while the officials did not even respond to my request. I was then left with no choice but to stick to the only participants who were willing to take part. All participants were not willing to reveal their identity therefore I have used numbers and refrained from identifying them in any way.

3.5 Methods of data collection

3.5.1 Observation

My initial reason for the choice of this method rested in the hope that there would possibly be some social functions taking place in the village during my stay. None took place. However, I chose to observe what was happening in the village with the help of the research assistant and my background knowledge about the village and the people's lifestyle. My observation was therefore non-participant and open. Some of the observation was made during the time I conducted interviews, which made it clearer for me to understand several things I was questioning as I could simply ask my participants. My hope was to find some groups of women in some place chatting or probably engaging in some cultural work together. This did not happen. As we walked around the village, which has house clusters sparsely located, there weren't many people in the vicinity. While some have relocated to the nearest bigger town, Maun, most of the locals have taken advantage of the employment opportunities from the safari companies around. Most of these companies are located a few kilometres away from the village, in the bush, and therefore employees have to relocate and reside there. This was very evident as from time to time we would witness some vehicles with a relevant number of locals coming in and going out of the village. I later learned that those were employees from the nearby safari companies occasionally coming to check on their relatives or for some other errands. This

showed the connection that most locals have with their village even though they might have been forced to move away from their village due to circumstances.

Furthermore, the number of women who live in the village full-time are mostly unemployed. Some have tertiary education that could qualify them for formal jobs elsewhere but remain near Mababe full time because they are unemployed. Youth unemployment is one of the main challenges Botswana as a whole is facing, and is as high as 16%, according to Boikhutso and Molosiwa (2016). It has hit most of the young people so that some with a formal education end up taking non-skilled jobs just to earn a living.

3.5.2 Interviews

This was the main method I used for the data collection in my research, even though it was used together with observation, from time to time. While the two methods are different, I found that incorporating them at some stages of data collection gave me complimentary information. The interviews were conducted informally in different locations around the village, mostly in private yards since we were walking from yard to yard requesting people's participation. I had all questions of all categories of participants written down on the paper which I carried with me. Before conducting an interview, I would go through the questions and tried to memorize them so that I would stay away from looking at the paper as much as possible. I discovered that not looking at the paper regularly helped the participants to relax and treated the interview as a normal chat, instead of set of questions that one had to answer in a particular way. Not looking at the questions in the paper also helped me to keep the discussion flowing and easily pick up questions that arose from the responses that participants gave. It also helped me to allow some participants, especially those who offered their life stories, to freely express themselves and follow their own way of answering which in turn gave me more detailed information that I needed. The interviews were recorded on the voice recorder, which I held in my hand. I, however, made some notes of the things which I felt needed to be recorded separately.

3.5.3 Life stories

This method of data collection was not in my initial proposed research plan. It only came about during the interview as a result of how some of the participants answered the questions. When describing the proper code of dress for a woman, some elderly women couldn't help but compare and explain the differences between the way women were dressing up then as compared to now. A similarity that I discovered in these life stories is that these elderly women

spoke out of concern about the vast change that took place between the time they were young and the recent times of the dress code of local women, especially young ladies, who used to wear long covering dresses and skirts but now wear very tight and short clothes which reveal most of their body parts. I found this part very interesting since participants spoke out of experience and became very personal as they gave their own views about what they think of the changes they witnessed as time unfolded.

3.6 Reflexivity and ethics

3.6.1 Reflexivity/role of the researcher

In this research I consider myself as both insider and outsider. Outsider in a sense that I am neither indigenous nor come from Mababe. However, being a woman who spent part of her childhood among the Mababe community, to some extent I perceive myself an insider. I originate from a neighbouring place to Mababe, called Sankoyo, which is just 30 km away and is comprised of an ethnic group 'Bayeyi' (as known in the country), or 'Wayeyi' (as they call themselves), which is internationally recognised as national minority. In all my childhood, I have always seen the two small communities living together so much so that in some instances, children have one parent from each of the village. My grandfather, who was from Sankoyo, was married to a woman from Mababe, which was part of the reason why I spent part of my childhood there.

During my times within the Mababe community when I was young, I remember hearing some informal discussions about education and the change of tradition on local people, and women in particular, which is where the idea for this topic was born. As a woman who spent part of her life in this community, upon getting the opportunity to write a thesis, I took it as a good opportunity to explore this topic further.

During my data collection, I felt mostly at home because of the good number of people who still remembered either me or my parents. In some instances, it turned out to be like a reunion. Upon requesting interviews, some of the participants I knew made it clear to me that they were only taking part on the interviews to help me with my studies since they knew me. Even though I was happy that I was getting progress in my data collection, I was equally skeptical and wondered about the authenticity of the answers I would get. I was suspecting the possibility of such participants giving me the information they thought would be good for me. However, I tried all the means to emphasise to them to be honest with their answers.

3.6.2 Ethics

Ethics is one of the most essential aspects of conducting research, especially with vulnerable people like indigenous communities. As a researcher, I clearly recognised my role to ensure I fulfil my responsibility of following all the necessary ethics before and during data collection. Being ethical in research can also pave the way for incoming researchers as it does not give participants unpleasant experiences that might make them reject researchers in the future.

There are two main ethics requirements I had to fulfil before I could proceed to Botswana for the research. The first one was with the Norwegian Data Approval Official commonly known as the NSD from which I had to apply for an ethics clearance approval since I was doing the research from Norway and for a Norwegian institution. A lot of specific information about the communities I was to research with was required, as well as the materials I was going to use. I acquired the approval after meeting the requirements.

The second requirement was that from the San Research Centre of Botswana, of which I was to apply for a research permit, ethical clearance, as well as an affiliation with any indigenous institution in the country. This was done to ensure that I followed the correct protocol on research requirements in my country. Part of the requirements was to translate all my research interview questions into Setswana, which is the national language that is spoken by almost all citizens in the country, and also avail them to the research center. Most of the people in Mababe do not speak English, so I had to prove that I was capable of conducting my interviews in the widely spoken language in the country and Mababe. I managed to meet the requirements and got an affiliation with the same center.

After this very important part of the requirement was done, I proceeded to contact the local headman or village head, Mr. Kgosimonte Kebuelemang, to request permission to conduct research in his village. This was also a requirement from the government of Botswana. I am well known to Mr Kebuelemang, so I had to avoid any casual agreements or chat. I tried to be as formal and professional as possible in explaining to him all about the project. He gave me access dependent on the people's consent in participation, even though he personally was not interested in participating in the interviews. I found getting the consent of the tribal headman (and of the people, which will be discussed next) very relevant and important because the ILO 169 calls for the involvement, understanding and cooperation of the tribal people in the matters or issues that involve them.

Now that I had a permission from the village headman, I moved on to the participants. The major ethical issues that I followed here were confidentiality and informed consent, which also

have recently become some of the major ethical concerns in research. Getting consent from the participants "aims to support the principle of individual autonomy and is widely agreed to be a safeguard for the rights of the people participating knowingly and voluntarily in research", (Ali and Kelly, 2011). I always requested the participation of the informants calmly and clearly explained their right to decide for themselves. It took me by surprise to learn that the Mababe community was very familiar and even 'tired' of researchers, as some participants openly told me. The elders and some elderly did not even want to talk to me at all, there were only a few who openly told me they were not interested in taking part. Such encounters brought to reality what Smith (2012:1) wrote

> "the term research is probably one of the dirtiest words in the indigenous world's vocabulary. When mentioned it stirs up silence, it conjures up bad memories, it raises up a smile of knowing and distrust".

I could relate to these words during my fieldwork as I was having a great time with some possible elderly research participants, who were so excited to see a grandchild of the person they were once very close to, my grandfather. Then immediately when I now introduced myself to be in Mababe for research, the mood completely changed and there was either silence accompanied by a sense of tension, or some local expressions which showed lack of interest. In such cases, I explained to them how much I respected their decision. For those I personally knew, I had to explain to them that exercising their right would not affect our relationship.

For those who agreed to take part, I requested their consent in using the voice recorder and to publish the information they were giving me. Most of the information I was requesting was not very sensitive, so most of the participants seemed to not be hesitant of that one. Some of the participants even requested to hear the questions before I could start recording the interviews. In that case I read the questions from the paper to them. However, I brought it to their attention that more question could arise during the interview, which was the case mostly, and emphasized that the interview would be as casual and relaxed as possible.

Protecting my participants was also of great importance. I have always explained to them that their identity will be hidden. All of them did not want their identity revealed which I highly respect in writing this paper.

3.7 The challenges I faced

I faced a number of challenges during the research, some of which I had a theoretical understanding of, but then they became real. One major challenge I faced was that the village elders who refused to participate in the interview at all cited the reason that researchers come

to collect their knowledge and they alone benefit from it. One of them in particular told me that his knowledge is 'finished', all gone to countries overseas. Therefore, I could not interview any village elder. The other challenge I faced was that villagers expected some financial or material gain from me. Some plainly told me that they have been researched so much and it is irritating, and researchers have used them a lot for their own financial gain. I didn't have much to do but to calmly explain all about my research and status. Occasionally my assistant would help with the explanations. While others stuck to their decision of wanting to be rewarded in some way, others understood enough and were willing to take part in the interviews. One more major challenge I faced was that of pictures. None of the locals I approached were willing to have their pictures taken. All of them declined. It seems many of them have the same impression because of all the reasons they gave for refusing to be photographed were centered around the same phenomenon. They were very strong on the issue no matter how much I tried to explain my standing. I therefore did not manage to get any pictures, except those of the village itself and buildings around.

One more challenge I had was what term to use when referring to the local person. I grew up in Mababe knowing that the local San are ethnic Xanikwe, but the term was not commonly used. This is the term I used when planning for the research. However, when I got into the field, I realised that the locals did not really have a specific ethnic term they preferred, except the one used by the majority. This forced me to also change the term.

CHAPTER FOUR: PRESENTATION OF DATA: EDUCATION INDIGINEITY AND THE WOMEN OF MABABE

4.1 Introduction

This chapter is about the presentation of data collected. I present my findings according to how the participants responded, and in accordance with the issues that I am mainly focusing on in this thesis.

4.2 Local culture or Tswana culture?

When I formulated my interview questions, I had known that I was going to be specific with the culture of my participants and refer to them with a local term. This is what I tried to make clear during the interviews. I had always made it clear to my participants that I'm focusing on their own culture, the culture for the Basarwa of Mababe. However, when giving me answers concerning their culture, many of my participants kept on saying '*Ka ngwago hela ya rona ya Setswana'*, which translates 'according to our Tswana culture'. This was not a shock to me because I understand cultural hegemony in my country. I actually considered it an added advantage that I was from Botswana and could understand why my participants used that expression. I then kept trying to remind them now and then that we are focusing on the local culture, not the common Tswana culture. However, I noticed that even though some could clearly differentiate between the two cultures, it was not always the case for all to draw a line between the two cultures. I will discuss it in the next chapter.

4.3 An 'appropriate Khwee' or local woman according to the elderly women

To establish the community's description of an appropriate woman, and to establish its expectations from a woman, I interviewed a group of four elderly women in the village. This was the hardest part of my data collection. Elderly people in Mababe were extremely difficult to approach about research as compared to the younger generation. It took me many days to be able to reach the number that I have interviewed, especially because I had to do it at the beginning of my data collection. I needed to know the community's description of the appropriate local woman before I could proceed with other interviews. When defining an appropriate local woman, the main traits that came about were connected to dress code, behaviour, responsibility in the family and helping in the social gatherings. I found the answers of the four participants very similar. They said the community expects a good woman to dress well, that means clothes that cover her body well and do not reveal certain parts of the body.

They were also skeptical about women who wear trousers, as that kind of dressing is not culturally part of their society's way of dressing. They however said the society seem to have accepted that women wear trousers, even though they expect them (trousers) to be well covering, and not very tight.

The women also said a good woman should help in social gatherings such as weddings and funerals. There are certain roles in social gatherings that are expected to be carried out by women only. For example, at funerals women should cook, lead the singing in prayer sessions, and comfort the bereaved. At weddings, they have to serve the guests, and advise the woman who is to get married (this part is done by married women only). A good woman is expected to carry out these roles willingly. My elderly participants also told me that a good woman would also be identified by keeping the dress code of the social gathering, as there are different codes for different occasions. But the general similarity of the dress codes is that the clothes should not be revealing or tight. One participants told me that

> "We elderly women have always known that an appropriate or good woman has to cover her body well, at least to the knees level. In fact her knees should not be seen. But for this younger generation, showing their body is considered fashion. It's like if you cover yourself well you are not a real woman, according to this young generation".

In terms of behaviour, the elderly women defined a good local woman as one who follows the set behavioural expectations of different social gatherings, at home and around the community. They said a good woman should not be seen around drinking, quarrelling and displaying unruly behaviour. They said women should be respectful to all, including their husbands, and be responsible enough to take care of their family members.

All four participants also told me that there have witnessed a lot of change among women in Mababe. They believed that the change was more negative than positive and has altogether changed the identity of the local women. They said it is beyond the community's capability to do anything about the changes since it emerges somewhere else outside Mababe. Asked if they link the changes among women with education, three of them said they strongly agreed because women start displaying these changes after they have been to schools. One answered differently as she said she believed all young women behave the same way, whether educated or not. She said this could be a culture that their children learn either from other tribes or local people who have already adopted it. Nevertheless, all of them stressed the importance of local women getting educated. They said educated women have better jobs and are useful to the society as

they can be good representatives of Mababe in politics and in return bring some developments to the village.

4.4 Education and culture

In relation to the aspect of education and identity, the was a huge similarity between the responses of my participants. I present the three sets of responses differently below.

4.4.1 Responses of women without tertiary education

Even though these women have not been to tertiary schools, they have been to junior and senior secondary schools, which gave them some level of experience of education and culture. These women admitted the existence of a huge conflict between what they were taught at home and what they learned in schools, which in return made an impact on the behaviour of women in general. They proclaimed that such change is mostly seen or experienced in the behaviour, as well as the way they view existing cultural activities. They linked what is learned from class and other cultures to the inappropriate or as unusual behaviours, and has now become popular in their community. They say exposure to different cultural values, as they move out of Mababe, and what is imposed on learners in classrooms, cause them to have a different judgement for their cultural values, mostly belittling them. Most of the participants admitted having also seen such changes in themselves as some of the different cultural values are learned from elementary schools and secondary schools, of which they have been through. They said to have witnessed more changes in women with tertiary education, as compared to themselves. They said women with tertiary education spend more time in towns and cities, and also go further in education, which makes them learn more different cultural values, as compared to those who live within their community, as one participant said

> "After they take so long at schools, or at their jobs, they come here and consider everything faulty. It's like everything in the village is uncivilised. In some community meetings, when we try to contribute our discussions, it gets to be like those who do not have education do not even make sense. That's is how much education changes them. But it is not like they are bad people. It's only that they do change in some ways".

I found a similar pattern in the responses of the participants, in which they expressed the negative change brought by education in their identity as women, that such change comes not only because of tertiary education, but is also picked up from elementary and secondary schools. They also said tertiary institutions are not the only source of different cultural values

33

which are intruding on the Khwee community, but also cited civilisation, modernisation and cultura values learnt from other ethnic groups.

4.4.2 Responses of women with tertiary education

There has been a very big similarity on responses from women with and without education in a sense that both categories agreed that tertiary education and exposure to different cultures brings some certain degree of change of their identity, especially dress codes and behaviour. The participants went on to give more examples of some more aspects of cultural values affected by education, such as respect, and views towards some cultural rituals. One woman whose career is related to health gave an explicit example from her own experience. She said

> "When growing up in Mababe, we were always taught that certain sickness that attacked children could be treated with some traditional herbs, which we collected from the forest, or with some other ways demonstrated by our parents. However, in the learning institution I was taught the exact opposite. I was told treating those sicknesses in such a way can cause some deadly consequences. Because of that, I now undermine some of the exact things I used to practice. I now look down upon some of the things I used to believe and practice".

Another participant emphasized the change in behaviour that education brings about in women particularly in the family setting, saying

> "In our family setting in Mababe, we have always been taught that a woman should always respect her husband and be humble. However, in schools, as women we are encouraged to always stand up for our rights and express ourselves in any way we want. We are encouraged to be out-spoken and to anyone including our husbands"

This participant, who is also married with children, and also holds a senior position in the government, told me that she applied what she learned from school to her life with wisdom because of the possible consequences it might bring to her family or marriage. She said she believed that even though education comes as an eye-opener to Khwee women and encourages them to speak out and stand for their rights, it might also cause them to lose some important aspects such as respect and humility, which are highly emphasised in the Mababe family setting and community.

Two participants had different views. While they said they could not deny the existence of the conflict between tertiary education and their culture, individuals are not forced to take a side.

34

They said acquiring formal education does not necessarily have to make one to change their identity or views towards culture, unless the individual has always wanted to change. They said it was possible for one's identity to remain the same before, during and after formal education, even though they admitted the difficulty of that possibility in reality.

4.4.3 Responses from community members

The elderly participants also had a lot to say about formal education versus the identity of a Khwee woman. All four elderly participants admitted that women who go to school eventually change, either due to what they learn in classes, or from other cultures. It seemed to be a concern to them. One of them told me that

> "Our children go outside the community and get educated. Wherever they go, they pick up bad manners from other nations and also bring a different culture here to Mababe. To be precise, the dress code. They grow up here dressing up well, covering their bodies properly. Due to the requirements of education, they move outside Mababe, where they learn other things and join other nations. But by the time they come back, they wear very tight clothes, which are also revealing. I think they consider this kind of dressing as contemporary".

In addition to that, another elderly participant expressed that cultures women learn outside their home village and during their times in schools are completely different from what they learn in schools,

> "Our girls grow with cultural behaviour which we instilled in them, until they move out to get further education. When they come back home, they start showing some unruly behaviours, like dressing as if they are almost naked, and even talk to us as if we are their age mates. If you try to guide them back to the way, they will plainly tell you that's how things are done in places they now live in. In fact we can't even advise them because they don't listen to us anymore".

It seemed easy for all respondents to link the identity of an appropriate Khwee woman with behaviour and dress code, but it was not that easy to link it with the duties of a woman in some cultural activities. In fact, all respondents highlighted the fading away of cultural events, due to the change of lifestyle and some government regulations affecting them. Apparently, there are a few cultural activities such as ceremonies and dances which still exist in the village, and are only practiced on demand and with payment. One of events done the most is called '*pina*'.

35

This is an entertainment session where there is traditional singing and dancing. *Pina* was originally performed while a traditional healer would carry out healing sessions on people with certain types of sicknesses. This is now done as a performance by a group of volunteers, and mostly as a means of a tourist attraction. However, over twenty women, with and without education have shown interest in taking part, if they must, but cannot because they are busy and are not available as they do not live in the village. They have indicated that they find it easier to take part in *pina* because the ceremony no longer includes some rituals, but rather simple entertainment of which all they need to do is to sing and clap their hands. Two participants from the women with education group have made it clear that they do not have interest in taking part at all because, as they say, it's something that is just not meant for them. When it comes to some practices like gathering of wild berries, the two groups of women that I interviewed said they do not do it at all. They told me it's something that is not common because everybody is now busy looking for jobs. They said gathering is for the elderly, who also do it as a choice, or because they grew up doing it. One of my participants told me that

> "even if women were still to gather, what is there to gather? There is nothing in the bush to gather. Besides, people are busy looking for money. They need money to buy food and pay for some other amenities. Gathering is not so very important now."

This has shown the existence of the changes that have come with education, capitalisation and globalisation, spreading far enough to reach such small communities.

4.5 Reasons of women pursuing further education

There are various reasons given by women with education for furthering their studies. From the nine participants who have been interviewed under this category, two women explicitly told me that the main motive for pursuing their studies further was to prove that the San are also capable of making it in life, just like any other ethnic group would. Like I have stated in the previous chapter, there is a strong stereotype on Basarwa by other cultures in Botswana. Basarwa are undermined in many ways, considered low in the society and are said to be behind when it comes to education and representation in the country's politics, and that levels of school drop-outs are high among them. Some Basarwa are also aware of this stereotype, and others, like these two women, respond by trying to use it as motivation factor and prove people wrong, rather than taking it as discouragement. One of these two respondents has a diploma in education assistance, but currently resides in Mababe and works a different job because of unemployment. She told me that

"People really undermine Basarwa. So we Basarwa have to strive to be like any other tribe in Botswana, more like Bakalaka (one of the minorities in Botswana believed to be more educated than other ethnic groups). We also want to make that mark. People look down upon us, so it is up to us to make them recognise us. We have to show people that there is no difference between us and other tribes in the country."

One more reason why women want to further their studies that was pointed out is to share financial obligations of the family with men or husbands. It is traditionally widely known and is according to most of the cultures in Botswana, that a man or husband is the provider of the household and mainly carries the role of meeting the financial needs of the family while the woman mainly does the household jobs. Nevertheless, she can help with sourcing some food for the family in other means common to the society. However, with the new systems that demand more finances, women also focus on sourcing finances, as one of the participant told me that

"I pursued my studies because I have always wanted to also take part in contributing to the family financially, as a woman. In my culture, it is known that a man is the provider of the household. Even though we cannot dispute that, I believe a woman should also help financially. This comes with women pursuing her studies in order to get a good job with a better salary, so that it enables her to fend for the family, to put food on the table and take care of some other financial responsibilities"

Several participants revealed their main reason for pursuing education as to have good job opportunities in order to live more comfortable lives. Unemployment in very rife in Botswana and seems to affect more youth than any other age group. Some young people who are educated end up taking any available jobs which is not related to their career, either skilled or non-skilled, just to earn a living, rather than staying without an income at all. These participants said they have noticed that the higher you go in education, the better employment opportunities you get. One of the participants who has finished her first diploma but is now pursuing another one said

"I have always wanted a better job, so I had to do what it takes to further my studies so that I get to do what I have always wanted to do. It's unfortunate that I did not qualify to take a much better programme, but at least I'm doing something good. I wish all women in Mababe could pursue their education so that we all change the way we live in this village. There is a lot of unemployment here and youth end up being caught up in some wrong practices. It is just not right. Maybe with better

education women could go somewhere where life could be a lot better than staying here and drinking alcohol. Maybe higher education could bring about development and betterment on people's lives here."

Furthermore, one more participant who is working as a paramedic, expressed that her urge to pursue her studies was the determination to change the social circumstances of her family which she did not like while growing up. She pointed out that

"I had always noticed that all people in my family do not have good jobs and could barely afford to take good care of their children. I wanted to make things different. I wanted to help. I wanted to have a much better job, that's why I made a decision to pursue my education. I really want women in Mababe to further their education because this would help them get better jobs and improve their lives"

From the nine ladies that I have interviewed, five of them expressed the hardships that follow with one doing a non-skilled job. Even though they themselves are not currently doing such jobs, they said they have witnessed it in the society they grew up in, because a higher percentage of the village population is employed in the informal sector. They found this as a motivating factor to further their education, as they wanted a different lifestyle.

4.6 Reasons of women NOT pursuing further education

There are several reasons raised by women for not continuing with their education, even though they were willing to in some instances. One of the reasons which was given by the most number of participants was failure to reach school requirements. Like I have previously stated, success in education in Botswana is entirely based on merit. All learners are entitled to start the elementary education and proceed to junior secondary schools. From there certain requirements should be met in order to proceed to senior secondary school. Three out of ten of my participants from this category pointed out that they could not continue pursuing their education because they did not qualify to proceed to senior secondary schools. Two out of ten participants managed to proceed to secondary school, but still could not qualify for tertiary education. Their failure to proceed was attributed to different things such as lack of seriousness in education, hardships in understanding foreign languages and some personal circumstances. One participant told me that she was taken away from her parents at the age of seven to live in a boarding facility. She said life was too hard for her because she missed her parents so much and could barely understand the language spoken. Because of this, she said she found it very difficult to concentrate in class, hence her failure to perform better in school. She said it was

unfortunate that she found herself in such a situation because she had wanted to continue with her studies. Such reasons are very common among the San, especially in the older generation who went to school when the government arrangement of taking San to boarding facilities was very common. In fact, all participants who are in their forties and over said they started their elementary school outside Mababe, while those who are in their thirties and under said they went to the elementary school in Mababe.

One more reason for not continuing with further education was teenage pregnancy. Four out of ten participants said they had dropped out of school because they were pregnant. One participant told me that

> "I got pregnant when I was still at senior school and therefore had to take a break from my studies and had to come back home. After I gave birth, there was nobody who could look after my child so that I go back to school. Therefore, I got stuck with my baby and had to give away my studies. But the truth is I had really wanted to proceed with furthering my education and if I had the opportunity to have done it, I could have done it".

Teenage and adolescent pregnancies is one of the big challenges that the ministry of education in Botswana is currently battling to minimise. According to the UNFPA report of 2013, during the year 2011, Botswana has recorded as high as 500 cases of school dropouts due to pregnancies of learners from primary, junior and senior secondary school (UNFPA 2013). The government of Botswana provides free family planning services even to the young people. The problem still however exists because of the lack of easy access to the resources in some places, and the shame or stigmatisation that follows young people showing their need or want for sex by seeking the services (UNFPA 2013). The government, however, is putting in place some programs to work with young people in making the services reachable and friendly to the youth. Although the situation is not regarded catastrophic by the UNFPA in comparison to other developing countries, it can still be regarded as a big challenge to a country of the population of only a little over two million.

One more reason that most women could not proceed with education was that they did not understand the importance and value of education and therefore failed to put their priorities in the right hierarchy. This response was also given by some ladies who dropped out of school because of pregnancy. About six ladies pointed out that during their school years, they were still young and did not judge life like they do now. They explained that having grown up in the time when oral education was regarded as very important, they failed to see the value of a

formal education and therefore did not take their studies seriously, which then led to them concentrate on something else, ultimately leading to either dropping out of school or failure.

4.7 Views of men towards woman identity and education

This was one of the most interesting parts of my interviews because it allowed me to hear opinions of people of a different gender. Honestly, I had thought I would hear views that are completely different from what I got from the women. From the four males that I have interviewed, the responses I got was more like their expression of what they desired or expected from local women, but which is not actually there, and also could almost no longer be found because of the changes in life that came about with education and civilisation. Just like women, they strongly connected the identity of a local woman with the dress code, behaviour, and responsibility in the family. They said a real local woman should dress to cover their bodies well, take care of the children and her husband, and not be associated with unruly behaviours such as drinking and having multiple relationships with men. This is very similar to the responses I got from women. They said a real woman should also have respect for her husband because men do need to be respected in a family. This aspect was also raised by some women but not all of them, but all of the men stressed its importance. When asked if there are still women with such qualities, these male participants said such women are hardly found because of the changes that came about in women. My third respondent became very personal and told me

> "women have changed very much. Nowadays there are no good women at all. That is the reason why I am staying single. I don't want a woman near me because contemporary women are very troublesome. Women nowadays can't even keep a marriage, not even a family. If you take one to your house, it's more like inviting trouble to yourself. I prefer to be alone and remain single because I don't want trouble".

This correspondent, who is in his forties, told me that he has seen too much negative change in women throughout the years of her life, that it made him doubt if there were any good women any longer. This was, however, the general view of my male participants. According to them, such a change is to be blamed on education and what these women learned from other cultures, which they termed civilisation.

In relation to education, all male participants stressed the importance of local women having tertiary education. Even though their reasons were expressed differently, they were all centred around the same thing - to get better jobs. The male correspondents expressed the need for local

women to have better jobs in the community and improve their dignity as Basarwa. One of the respondents pointed out that,

> "It is very important for local women to get educated because they are the backbones of the families in the community. It will even challenge men and cause them to step up and try to do the same. They have to strive to bring change in our community. How I wish that our local women can get more education just like other women out there! They should not be known of having the lowest levels of education just because they are Basarwa. They should try hard and come to the level where other nationalities have also come to, and show that Basarwa women can also do it."

One of the participants added something more. He stressed the importance of the educated people, not only women, to incorporate informal education with formal education, and not choose formal education over the informal one.

> "While we appreciate the importance of education, we should also embrace our roots. You can't just find a grown-up tree and love it for what it already is. You have to recognise and embrace what watered its roots. The informal education that we received from home is more like the water that watered our roots. When one is educated, they don't have to now look down upon what their parents taught them at home simply because the (parents) do not have a formal education. What we learned from our homes is more like the water that has watered our roots to be the strong trees that we are now. That should be a perception of every local individual or woman with formal education. We should not undermine the knowledge that our parents have instilled in us".

The above comment supports three similar responses given by other male participants who acknowledged having witnessed the changes in the identity on local women that came along with education, time and civilisation. While they could explicitly outline the changes they witnessed taking place in women, they could not tell or connect specific timeframes with certain changes they have witnessed in women.

One more thing these men pointed out is the existence, or reality of the community's expectation from women, which are mostly linked to their behaviour, dress code and their participation in social gatherings. They said that, even though the community has certain expectations for women, it is the same case as with men, and there is no pressure put on either men or women who does not act accordingly. Certain measures are only taken for offensive behaviours like uttering insults of insinuating fights. However, they have expressed their concerns for the changes that came about in women, and said they even fear for the worst. As a Motswana woman, speaking the language they preferred to use and having lived in that

community at some point, I stood a better chance of understanding the local expressions they used very well. This also helped me and my male participants to engage in some kind of personal conversations because they spoke to me as they would speak to one of the community members. Again, having undertaken most of my studies in Botswana, I could relate with some of the examples they were citing, even though at times I felt like a victim of circumstances. Occasionally they would refer to the tight jeans I wore during the interviews, other times throwing the questions back to me because they thought I was asking something that I had full knowledge of. While I always tried to know my boundaries as a researcher, the whole experience was also a way of showing the extent to which I was an insider/outsider in this research.

CHAPTER FIVE ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS

5.1 Introduction

This chapter entails the discussion of the data presented in the previous chapter. I will start with relating my data to the two theories used in this research, which are structural inequality theory and cultural discontinuity theory. I will then discuss the dilemmas surrounding culture, education and identity, focusing on my area of study even though I, at some point, make a general overview of indigeneity in relation to some issues.

5.2 Relating education and cultural discontinuity theory and the effect

This theory looks at the cultural mismatch that happens as a result of learners' interaction between school culture and home culture. The theory looks at cultural values such as communication styles, gestures, use of words, body language etc.

In relation to my research, I found this theory reflecting to both groups of women I have interviewed. The women expressed the complexities that arose as a result of learning classroom culture and home culture, which has also reflected in their views towards these two cultures. Khwee cultural values and norms has its own way of defining wrong and right. On the other hand, the classroom culture has a different way of defining right and wrong, which brought about a complication in the learners' way of judgement, and therefore reflecting generally in their views towards education. Since their judgement regarding right and wrong is significantly affected, some women responded by making a preference between these two cultures, mostly giving a preference to the classroom culture.

The responses of the community members interviewed indicated misunderstanding or conflict of culture in Mababe, in relation to the changes women display particularly on the women's dress code, and judgement towards some traditional practices. According to these participants, such changes are said to have a negative reflection on the dignity of Khwee women. One of their concerns is that education causes young women to belittle traditional education and make their parents appear that they do not have much value to teach them as they do not have formal education.

Moreover, men raised a similar concern on how education negatively impacts Khwee women, which is also a sign of misunderstanding and conflict. Similarly, their concern was on dress code, behaviour and a negative attitude towards the oral tradition women displayed. Some men even pleaded with me to use my research as a forum to appeal to Khwee women to incorporate local culture with formal education. While I could not promise much as a researcher, I could

however see the reality of the existence of this misunderstanding or conflict between classroom learned values and home learned values that exist in the society.

Furthermore, as previously stated, the structure of education in Botswana schools has been formed to be in line with the European model of education and to also promote the values of the culture of the majority (Arthur 1998), as was the government's initiative to promote oneness and equality among all citizens. The Tswana culture has, over the years, been imposed in all other minority ethnic groups so much that such groups find it difficult to draw a borderline between their own cultural values and those imposed on them. This aspect became very clear in my research when my participants kept referring to their culture as Tswana culture, and some of their practices as Tswana. It was also easy to tell that some of the cultural aspects the community expected from the Khwee women were more Tswana than Khwee but have been infiltrated in the Khwee society and ended up being adopted and accepted as local. For example, the roles of a woman in social gatherings, such as singing and comforting the bereaved.

Although I personally am from the Yei tribe, and am acquainted with my own cultural values. I have also grown to understand (and to some level adopt) the Tswana culture relatively well because I have learned it in school (as everyone else who went to Botswana schools), and have come to know how it has been adopted by many ethnic groups across the country. I had the privilege to learn some differences between the Yei culture through some oral teachings from the elderly people in our community, and also in practice since some of the community members have managed to stick strongly to their own culture such as traditional healings, ritual dances and singing, and '*bongwale*' (rituals done to a young woman who had her first menstruation). Even though some of the Tswana cultural values have creeped in, and seemed unavoidable, the Yei cultural values still exist, or at least are orally explained. During my data collection, I noticed that my participants referred to some cultural values such as '*merapelo*' (prayer sessions held when a person has passed away), the style of wedding celebration and the roles of women in the celebrations which in my community is known to be Tswana, as their own. My background made it very easy for me to notice this 'cultural mix'.

While I understood how this came about, it was a clear sign of the Tswana cultural hegemony among the minorities, the assimilation of the minority (and indigenous groups) into the culture of the mainstream, and the classroom was used as one the effective ways to accomplish the goal as the culture was taught to every learner. In their responses, the community members also seemed to be aware that some of the unusual behaviours seen in the Khwee women are adopted from schools, and may be from different tribes in the bigger towns. Most of the men and the

elderly explicitly said that girls grow up respecting and practicing Khwee cultural values, and only change to devalue them after having been to schools, mostly away from Mababe.

5.3 Relating education with structural inequality theory

While different authors have different views in explaining this theory, Huffman (2010) explained structural discontinuity theory as the cultural mismatch caused by education as a result of the social structural barriers at the macro-level.

In the case of the Khwee, the education system of Botswana has been structured such that it promotes the culture of the majority, and to some extent, is modelled to suit the European style of education (Arthor 1998) which means some western values are also included in the education system. The education system aims for total integration of the minority tribes into that of the majority (Le Roux 2001), meaning that the culture of the San, or of any other minority tribe, is not included in the syllabus, or in the education system. The use of just English and Setswana as languages of instruction in class, means the language of the San and other minorities are not used. San mostly grow up in very remote areas and speak only their own local languages. This therefore means the usage of other languages in the classroom puts them at a disadvantage compared to other learners who have grown up in places where Setswana and English are mostly used.

The women find themselves in a dilemma. They have been trapped in the capitalist society that requires education as a one of the main gateways to a good income, yet the same education is a tool used to discourage them from continuing with their cultural values. For some women, assimilation in the structure becomes a much easier option, as it makes them cope better with the situation they find themselves in. For others, who found it harder to cope with the system, end up either dropping out of school or giving education the least priority, which in return deem the programs employed by the government unsuccessful. Even though both categories of women appreciate the government financial aid and free education, they also acknowledge the shortcomings of the system. Even though these women partly blame themselves for their lack of success in education, the system could not be entirely left out of the blame. Some practices done by the system such as separating learners from their parents, introducing them to a completely new culture of the classroom where their own culture of language is not reflected in anything, act as contributing factors for learners to make have such decisions which has led them to not be able to continue with their studies.

5.4 San culture or Tswana culture

As described in my data presentation, most of my participants kept using phrases such as "*ka ngwao ya rona ya Setswana*", which means "in accordance to our Setswana culture", "*mosadi hela wa Setswana*", which means "A proper Tswana woman", and "*Ka Setswana re godile re itse gore*" which translates "growing up, our Tswana culture dictated that". In every incident that arose, I kindly redirect my participants to the Khwee cultural context. Upon correction, none of them insisted on them not being Batswana or the said cultural values not being Tswana, but would rather re-phrase the question. However, I noticed that the content of the answer would not change, but only that the participants would be clearer that it is rather Khwee culture, and not Tswana.

I could easily identify as what I would call "cultural mix" because of my background knowledge. As previously stated in chapter 3, cultural hegemony in Botswana was consciously promoted after independence in order to avoid any kind of discrimination or favouritism among ethnic groups, and as a way for the government to distance itself from any practice similar to apartheid, which was done by the neighbouring South Africa (Molefe 1999). The culture of the majority was given much higher recognition, and its values were expected to be learned by every citizen. All citizens were also referred to by one name - "Batswana". The word "Batswana" has two meanings. The word is a plural term referring a Botswana citizen (singular being Motswana), and secondly, it refers to a member of the Tswana tribes, which formed the majority of the population. This is the group whose name was nationalised and used to refer to the country, the culture and the people (Arthor 1998). Their cultural values were also adopted in the government systems and promoted and spread through the education system to be learned by all citizens. The least was done to recognise cultures of the minority, until recently when the government started engaging in some initiatives to recognise and promote such cultures through cultural festivals, even though nothing has been formally done to incorporate them in the formal systems, like the education system.

What I have described above is also proof that promotion of Tswana culture has brought a serious threat to the existence of other cultures. It is more like a discontinuity of culture of other ethnic groups, in an effort to cause continuity of the preferred one. Lack of recognition of the indigenous culture by not incorporating it in the education system can challenge its transition to the younger generations (Hays 2009).

Furthermore, I noticed that some of the cultural values that the Khwees of Mababe claimed as their own, are neither Khwee nor Tswana. For example, women wearing long dresses, and

merapelo (prayer sessions held to comfort the bereaved) which is done during *loso (gatherings done when one has passed away. Sometimes it involves some ritual performances).* The long dresses on women were imposed by missionaries on Batswana whose clothes were previously made out of animal skins and therefore considered more revealing and inappropriate (Comaroff and Comaroff 1991). In the same manner, *merapelo* was also imposed by the missionaries during the introduction of Christianity to Batswana, who until then had believed in their ancestors. After adopting these values, Batswana then imposed them, through dominance, to other minority tribes such as the Khwee. The values became very commonly practiced by many ethnic tribes and were eventually adopted as their own, like in the case of the Khwee. Such values are also taught in the education syllabus and referred to as Tswana cultural values. There is still a question about the originality of these values, especially those taught in schools. Hjort (2010) noted that when school system was started in Botswana, missionaries were highly involved in the content of the school syllabus, and even went to the extent of changing some of the cultural education, and made it suitable to their mission work. This then shows that Tswana culture itself has, to a point, changed and adopted cultural values from other cultures, especially those of the missionaries.

5.5 Education, gender and discrimination

The Botswana government is one of the African states that has been commended by the ACHPR for its fairness in providing an equal right to education to both girls and boys in its education system (ACHPR 2010). The same ACHPR report also recognises the efforts of the Botswana government for its free education up to tertiary level which ensures that even children from disadvantaged social backgrounds have access to education. The education system promotes education among all children or students, without any stated preference towards or discrimination against any gender (Fombad 2004).

I could relate this with my findings of the Khwee women having not experienced any kind of gender-based discrimination in schools. They highlighted that, as women, they believe they have been granted the same opportunity for education as men, hence their education being financed by the government. They related their lack of success in education (for those without education) with other social circumstances not related to their gender. Moreover, the fact that the Mababe society encourages education among women made it easier for them to get educated, as there is no pressure from the society on them to not pursue their studies and careers. From both sides, the women and the community, participants have strongly linked women to caregiving roles, such as serving, taking care of the kids, etc. In the same manner, they have

shown a strong desire for education among Khwee women, meaning that the societal expectations do not confine women only to care giving roles, but to any career of choice possible. The women are neither discriminated nor disadvantaged by either the education system or the society in their quest for education.

Even though gender has never been a challenge with these women, they were said to have had experienced discrimination in relation to their indigeneity at the hands of other ethnic groups. The discrimination was mostly verbal and was based on the negative stereotyping attached to the San, for example, being ridiculed for speaking 'broken' Setswana, or doing things in an 'uncivilised' way, or being laughed at simply because they are Basarwa. Discrimination against the San in Botswana is not encouraged or supported in any way at the government level, but it highly exists at the community level, from other non-Basarwa ethnic groups (Fombad 2004). These women have confirmed having suffered such discrimination and have heard some negative remarks being uttered to them. The remarks were based on the belief that has become popular in the country that the San are backwards and uncivilised (Mafela 2014). This stereotyping is so common that in some places people have a common expression used when someone has done something that is considered uncivilised or backward, "*ke eng okare o Mosarwa jaana",* meaning, "why do you behave like a Mosarwa", which means Basarwa are associated with uncivilised and improper behaviour. I have also witnessed this and heard that expression used many times, even in places like Qangwa, with a higher population of San. According to my own observation, the non-Basarwa were deliberately using such derogatory words toward Basarwa to show some level of dominance over them, as well as trying to pass a message that they are far better in social status than the San.

As my findings have revealed, some of the San women of Mababe have used this challenge as a motivating factor to achieve higher education. They said they want to go as high as possible in their education, at the same time identifying as Khwee, therefore challenging this negative stereotype put on them. They have also taken advantage of the government aid schemes. The government has some schemes currently reserved for the students from families with challenging social circumstances, some of which are financed by some international organisations. Some schemes such as RADP was planned to assist the San specifically but had to include other ethnic groups who are socially disadvantaged in rural areas due to strict Botswana government laws restraining any ethnic favouritism (Saugestad 2001). However, higher numbers of the San still qualify for this scheme because they mostly inhabit rural areas

and are disadvantaged socio-economically (Lucas 2008). The government also has another initiative of lowering the education requirements of qualification for tertiary institutions for children from socially disadvantaged families. San mostly benefit from the initiative as well. About four of my participants from the group of women with education have benefited from this initiative, while the other four have qualified for the normal government tertiary sponsorship offered to every citizen who qualifies.

My research findings agree with those of other research working in the region. Findings of the study done by Nyati-Ramahobo (2001) revealed that diverse social challenges that San children encounter significantly affect their interest in education, and consequently their performance. Similarly, a report presented by Le Roux (2001) on the San of Botswana, Namibia and South Africa, has shown that the challenges San children face in the education system, which the governments does not appropriately adhere to, significantly affect their level of interest in formal education, and to some degree, their performance and success. The spoken issue has not been different in my research, with many women having encountered various challenges in their education. Similarly, a study done by Hays (2016) on one group of the San in Namibia, showed the difficulties learners encounter in the education process as a result of the complexities that arise from the education systems, as well as the differences that exist between formal education and the oral one, which is what the learners get acquainted with first and at an early age. However, amid such challenges in education, which are common among indigenous communities all around the world, a strong support of formal education still exists in the Mababe community as such significant progress among some women.

Furthermore, I expected intersectionality theory to reflect in my findings. Intersectionality theory explains the situation of aspects such as race, gender, class and sexuality reinforce each other and create discrimination, causing severe consequences (Crenshaw 1989; Sylvian 2011, Olsen 2016). Sylvian (2011) discussed this in particular in relation to San women in Namibia, of the challenges they face in relation to their indigeneity and feminism status. Findings in my research do not seem to match these, as Khwee women did not express any gender related discrimination. Although my research did not uncover gender-indigeneity related discrimination, the possibility of its existence cannot be completely ruled out.

5.6 Education and identity

My findings have revealed that Khwee women have the passion to pursue their education, despite the negative stereotyping attached to them, and the fact that the structure of the

49

education system does not favour continuity of their culture. They have shown that their main aim in pursuit of education is not necessarily to maintain their cultural values. Their passion is not entirely in the struggle for cultural survival or preservation, but rather in proving their capability to acquire a higher level of education, while ethnically identifying as Khwee. They said their desire is to live a life similar to, or even better than that of the other ethnic groups in the country, therefore defying the stereotypes attached to the San through acquiring the highest level of education and getting better jobs. This came out clearly from the women with education, who expressed their strong desire for young women to move outside Mababe and pursue education and change their lifestyle to be like other ethnic groups. The traditional way of life was not an option they considered, especially because it is rarely practiced among the youth in Mababe. They considered the traditional way of life physically demanding compared to working and getting money. They also say the traditional way of life is more suitable to the elderly because they are used to it.

While this sounded like the willingness for these women to integrate into the culture of the majority, it might also be more like a sacrifice they have to make in pursuit of education. A study done by Nyati-Ramahobo (2010) on the San of Botswana and the education system revealed that education among the San might come with a huge sacrifice to make. Her findings showed that after being educated, some San children change their mindsets towards their own culture, despise and consider it backwards, and regard other cultures they were exposed to as better and more civilised. On the other hand, these women are caught in a capitalist system and materialism, where finances are crucial for most of the basic necessities. They want to get a better education for better socio-economic status. Their initial desire is not to move out of their home village or to choose any other culture above theirs, or to change who they are, or what they believe. This changes as they pursue education, move out of Mababe at some point, and get exposed to other ways of doing things, which also turns out to be an easier option for some of them than maintaining some of own cultural values.

I find this as rather paradoxical, and more complicated than the responses these women gave me. Even if these women had the desire to continue to stick strongly to their cultural values, the education system does not provide a favourable environment for that, which could be the reason why they have had to, at some point, choose the culture of the majority. Furthermore, having been caught in the middle of a capitalist system, they need to concentrate on getting better careers, which would therefore require them to keep up with the demands of the education system to develop their career. It is therefore probable that these women end up making choices

that seem convenient to them due to the circumstances surrounding them, but it does not necessarily mean they consider it the best choice. It is possible that these women don't really want to despise their Khwee cultural values or abandon some of them but are rather 'forced' to go for a more favourable and easy option, which consequently has a significant impact on their Khwee identity.

This paradox also extends to the cultural identity of women without tertiary education. Most prefer living among their community and have expressed their love for their culture and maintaining their identity as Khwee women. Even though they have admitted that education changes the identity of Khwee women, they still expressed the strong longing for education. One may wonder why they want education if they know it would significantly affect their Khwee identity. The answer lay in their current circumstances. Basic necessities require some substantial amounts of money, which one can possibly get from a good career and also requires a high level of education. What they exactly want is not education but a good source of income. I found the same setting with the elderly women and the men. They both emphasised how education can negatively change the identity of Khwee women. On the other hand, they put the same emphasis on the need of the Khwee women to get educated. They linked education with the development in Mababe, and the individual women's financial independence. Even though they knew education sacrificed their own culture, but they still preferred it because of the needs that exist in their lives. It seems that what they really want is not education but its benefits.

Various literature has been written about the above mentioned paradox of education and indigeneity. May and Aikman (2003: 142) shared the same views stating that

> "…on one hand, the role of formal education and schooling as an institution has contributed significantly to the loss of indigenous identity, control, and self-determination. Schooling has been explicitly and implicitly a site of rejection of indigenous knowledge and language, it has been used as a means of assimilating and integrating indigenous people into a 'national' society and identity at the cost of their indigenous identity and social statuses. Indigenous people, on the other hand, also clearly want access to formal education- and why shouldn't/wouldn't they?"

As much as they show interest in formal education, indigenous communities should have free access to it, but at the same time should have an option to maintain their tradition. Having said that, what the Mababe community needs more of is the formal education that is based on or incorporates their culture, at the same time providing them with opportunities in the national and international economy. Though this option seems important and the best option to the

indigenous communities, it is a difficult and slow process that has to overcome national policies aimed at assimilation and homogenisation, as in the case in Botswana education system. It becomes even more challenging where the state-run formal schooling system aims for standardisation, maintaining a greater distance from accepting or recognising indigenous people or any other alternatives (May & Aikman 2003).

In that sense, the UNDP encourages the involvement of the indigenous communities in formal education, and their right to access it. Article 14 of the UNDRIP (2007, article 14) stipulates that

> 1. Indigenous peoples have the right to establish and control their educational systems and institutions providing education in their own languages, in a manner appropriate to their cultural methods of teaching and learning.
>
> 2. Indigenous individuals, particularly children, have the right to all levels and forms of education of the State without discrimination.
>
> 3. States shall, in conjunction with indigenous peoples, take effective measures, in order for indigenous individuals, particularly children, including those living outside their communities, to have access, when possible, to an education in their own culture and provided in their own language

My findings have revealed the current shortcomings of the government to meet the mandate of the UNDRIP in terms of the involvement of the San and incorporating their culture in the education system, which is would be a better option for the San, as my research has shown.

5.7 Western values and traditional knowledge

As previously stated, the Botswana education system is structured to be in line with the European model of education. For indigenous communities, the government education content promotes the dominant Tswana culture and western ways of knowing, as opposed to the traditional knowledge. Traditional knowledge has been a very important part of Batswana, and very useful in many ways, for many decades. Practices such as traditional healing and ancestral worship, have seen a huge decline after the arrival of the missionaries in Botswana (and Southern Africa), in the 1800's. The missionaries regarded these cultural practices as sinful and unholy (Comaroff 1991). Some ethnic tribes, like the Khwees, have managed to continue administering their traditional knowledge. The knowledge seems to now be threatened by the western values or scientific ways of knowing, which is spread through education. Indigenous knowledge is transmitted to the younger generation through oral tradition, first-knowledge, and empirical observations, as opposed to scientific knowledge which is proven through research

(Stevenson 1996). Therefore, if the education system transmits the scientific ways of knowing to the younger Khwees, and regard Khwee traditional practices as dangerous, a serious threat is posed to the continuity of this culture. This issue was confirmed by a good number of my participants from all categories.

One of the elderly ladies expressed concern for the change their children display after acquiring education. She said women grow up valuing the oral knowledge they have learned from their parents and community members, but tend to despise it after they learn western values.

> "Our children grow up here under our close monitoring and doing what we teach them. But soon as they start going to schools, they come back and start despising all that we have taught them. In fact they say we are not educated and therefore cannot teach them how things are done. They believe what they have learned from schools is better for them. When we want to do *mothuso (*some ritual performances done on newly born babies for protection*),* they tell us we will kill their babies".

This is a similar example given by one of the ladies with education. She picked the same example that the elderly woman gave, of *mothuso*. She explicitly told me that when she grew up, her parents and other elderly people in Mababe carried out *mothuso* on every baby as it was regarded as very important to their (babies') health and development. She said she had to change that belief after she was taught in tertiary that such practices can have deadly side effects on babies, as science has proven. Even though she did not say it clearly, my understanding of her statement was that she believed what science suggested was better because it has been proven.

I relate this with an argument raised by Francis Akena that, indigenous knowledge to indigenous communities is a lived world and a form of reason that informs and sustains people who make up their homes in local areas, a knowledge that is of great importance to the adaptation of human groups to their environment. Akena (2007) continues to argue that

> "indigenous knowledge over time however, has been deliberately suppressed and branded as inferior, superstitious, and backward by the western academia, a phenomenon that shows the dominance of the western ways of knowing as well as the unbalanced power relations in academia. If indigenous communities do not opt to resist, refuse, and transform their perspectives of knowledge, then indigenous knowledge faces a serious threat" (2007:601).

5.8 Men and education on women

The international indigenous women's movement put an emphasis on cultural collective rights of women, portraying women as more responsible to preserve and transmit their culture, and therefore strongly connecting their identity with reproductive and care-giving roles (Sylvain 2011). Sylvian continues to argue that such a movement can easily promote patriarchy in the culture, and potentially increase gender oppression. This matches my experience with my experience with different rural communities in Botswana, where women are associated with care giving roles, and there is some degree of possible gender oppression. In some settings, men would be outspoken in support for it.

Based on these experiences, I expected my male participants to express similar views, but I was surprised in my interviews that it wasn't the case. The men in Mababe have instead shown their strong support for women in the community getting educated and for them to be financially independent. They advocate for women who, through education, contribute to self-development as well, to some extent, that of the community. This did not mean they disassociate women from the caregiving roles. They believed that culturally, such roles remain the responsibility of a woman in every family in the Khwee community, even though significant changes came about with education and modernisation. They see education as the major contributing factor to the changes witnessed on women towards their cultural values over time.

I still found a complexity of education and identity in women still existing here. Even though men highly recommend education among women, they still strongly link education to the decline in morality found among women in their village, and the diminishing Khwee cultural values. I relate this with a history project in which San youth interviewed their elders from different San groups around Botswana, compiled by White and le Roux (2010), in which some expressed the hardships they face in trying to live within the capitalist system, as well as the challenges of getting better wages to catch up with their financial demands, as three of the following quotes explain;

> "…if you hunt you are taken to jail. These changes have forced most people today to have cash to live. They are relying on money and don't remember how it used to be."
>
> "Saving money is what one needs to do in today's day. That is, if people have enough money."
>
> "Well, if there is a way to make it better for all of us, I think someone should balance the scale of wages, so that all people can get the same money and then they can sort out the prices for everyone, so we can be equal again."

This gave me a clearer picture of why men strongly supported education for financial independence among women. Even though they express how education negatively impacted the identity of Khwee women, they still highly recommend it.

5.9 Initiatives contributing to San education

Education in Botswana is free for every citizen. Due to social circumstances that pose challenges to some communities in relation to education, some initiatives have been put in place to offer help. Some initiatives are collaborations between local and international institutions. It is worth noting that directing help to or special focus on a particular ethnic group in Botswana is highly discouraged and considered tribalism (Saugestad and Bolaane 2011). The aim of the government social service is to equally distribute benefits among all in order to archive social justice. A huge number of the San however remain beneficiaries of such programs as they are mostly located in rural areas and have dire social circumstances. Below I have briefly discussed two of the programs.

5.9.1 The RAD Program

This scheme was initially called Remote Area Dwellers Program when it was founded in 1978 as a joint initiative of the international and local input (Saugestad 2001). Its name was later changed to Remote Area Development Program. Initially, the involved international supporters had proposed that RADS be particularly directed to the needs of the San, but the complexities of the policies of the Botswana government regarding equality and ethnicity made this difficult. According to the government website, RADS is aimed at the "upliftment of the standard of living in remote areas characterised by lack of access to basic social amenities due to their geographic location" (www.gov.bw). Beneficiaries of this program are assisted with different resources, depending on their level of study. Generally, they are provided with transportation, school uniforms, monthly rations, and in some cases, accommodation. The government also has an initiative of lowering requirements for tertiary institutions for these learners and also offer guidance in application for tertiary schools. (www.gov.bw). Over 80% of the women I have interviewed have benefited from this program.

5.9.2 UBTROMSØ

UBTromsø is an informal name given to a collaboration program between the University of Botswana and the University of Tromsø. The program was initiated in 1998 as one of the ways

to help with the wider challenges the San are facing using education (Bolaane and Saugestad 2011). The main mandate of the program was to promote research and education among the San, and to encourage changes in the government policies to be more accommodating to the indigenous and other minorities. Over time, the program has since expanded to birth the Research Center for San Studies at the University of Botswana, which is meant to expand the efforts of the initial program by handling the political aspect of the San studies in Botswana and encourage research by the indigenous communities (Bolaane and Saugestad 2011). After challenges in the effectiveness of the strategies employed, UBTromsø, in collaboration with the Center for Saami Studies, added another dimension which has seen the birth of the San Youth Capacity Building Program with the mandate to facilitate the San's access to higher education through scholarships; work for curriculum change to better serve the needs of the San; to provide information, guidance and assistance in application procedures for potential students (Bolaane and Saugestad 2011). Higher education is considered essential for the participation of the San in the socio-economic status of their communities and for the sustainability of the San development programs in Botswana and beyond. UBTromsø has seen relevant achievements particularly their contribution to higher education among the San, as well as providing them with opportunities for exposure to the experiences of other indigenous communities (Bolaane and Saugestad 2011).

Conclusion

This chapter has shown how education significantly impacts the identity of the Khwee women, in a way that the community termed 'negative'. The strong support and need of education on the community of Mababe was established, which brought about the dilemma that indigenous communities around the world experience, education being needed while it is also a source of cultural and identity loss. However, indigenous communities have the right to improve their socioeconomic status, of which education is considered the means to such an achievement. In the same manner, they have the right to maintain their culture while obtaining formal education and that should not be disadvantaged by them obtaining formal education.

CHAPTER SIX: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

6.1 Summary

In the first chapter I outlined my research questions, which focused on the impact that tertiary education has on the identity of women. Growing around their Khwee community where they learn their own cultural values, these women are eventually required to move out in search for education, where they learn and get exposed to different cultural differences. On the other hand, some women do not make it further in education, and therefore live within their community. This work has established how the presence and absence of tertiary education impacts the perceptions of these two groups of women, in relation to the community's expectations and obligations.

Answering my research question required on some level, the indigeneity in southern Africa, which is what chapter 2 entails. I discussed the complexities surrounding the definition of the term 'indigeneity' in the African context, which leads to many states finding it unreasonable to give recognition to their indigenous communities. The effects of colonisation and injustices that Africans suffered at the hands of Europeans settlers has tremendous impacts on the way some African states handle the issue of indigeneity. As such, the indigenous communities of Botswana, the San, find themselves in a challenging state where the government does not recognise their indigeneity, despite being recognised internationally, and that they remain the most marginalised ethnic group in the country. The distinctiveness of their culture and hard social circumstances make it hard for them to progress further in education, as compared to other tribes. Again, the vast differences between their culture and that of the majority has contributed to their lack of progress in education, yet the government has not employed any initiative specifically for the San, as the government considers them the same as any other citizen with social challenges. This was also the case with the Khwee of Mababe.

The Mababe community expressed strong support towards education for Khwee women, but on the other hand, linked it to the negative changes they have witnessed on the identity of the local women. While education is important and needed for the improvement of the socio-economic status, is also comes with sacrifices of the loss of culture. Tswana cultural hegemony and the failure of the government systems to incorporate San culture in the education system poses a great threat to the discontinuity of the San culture, and that of other minorities. The educated generation primarily prefers what they learn in schools, considering it much better that what their culture dictates of them. Which are mainly Tswana culture and western ways of

knowing since they are entailed in the Botswana government education syllabus. This has also been partly a source of changes witnessed in the Khwee women.

6.2 The contribution of my research

This thesis has been written with indigenous women in mind, in relation to education and culture, in one particular indigenous community- The Khwee of Mababe. Literature like (Nyati-Ramahobo 2003, May and Aikman 2003) brought to light the dilemmas that indigenous people face in their desire to pursue further education, at the same time retaining their cultural values, with the systems lacking support to help them archive such. My research findings fit into this literature, only bringing the issue down to a specific community. As much as Mababe women and the community in general have blamed education for the negative changes, it brought on the identity of a Khwee woman and they equally expressed the need for it.

This thesis had also shown some level of success the government's financial aid of the San in formal education, even though the aid is not directed specifically to the San but to all people with social needs. Except for one, all respondents from the women with education had their tertiary education paid for by the government. This is a relatively higher number taking into consideration how small the Mababe population is, as well as the general lower numbers of San children in education across the country.

My research has also revealed a community in which men are in support of financial dependency among women, and not encouraging any kind of pressure on women with their daily choices, in relation to the expectations of the society. Even though the traditional roles of a Khwee woman dictates otherwise, the Khwee community do not put pressure on women but rather allows them to make their own choices and decisions.

On the other hand, the study has shown women who have expressed their passion for education despite the challenges they encountered on the way, and stereotyping attached to their indigeneity. Literature (Hays 2009, Le Roux 2000) has revealed some challenges that children from San communities face in the quest for education, some of which are linked to their identity and cultural distinctiveness, which can significantly affect their progress in education. This has also been pointed out by my participants. Some of these women said the same challenges turned into a motivation for them to pursue further studies.

6.3 Conclusion

In this thesis, I have worked to show the background and existence of cultural hegemony in Botswana, and how it spread throughout the country, even to small indigenous communities such as Mababe. The Tswana culture which was spread with the name of unity and oneness has seen a 'cultural mix' in the Khwee community, in which originally some of the cultural values that have been adopted are local, are not Mababe. The thesis has shown the difficulties of keeping Khwee culture, and even some other different cultures of the minorities in Botswana, "pure" as circumstances which lead to cultural change remain hard to resist.

Furthermore, the thesis has revealed how the indigenous communities of Mababe have shown less resistance in the realities of globalisation or modernisation. I find this quote from Belton (2010:194) summarising this whole issue well, that

> "the idea that the world is changing, becoming more interconnected, and allowing events and actors from afar to influence the happenings and actions of the others in other lands is not new to the twenty-first century ... change from afar in the form of new technologies and ideas and novel ways of living and dying has been thrust upon indigenous people without their consent since well before the term globalisation was introduced. What makes this current wave of change and interconnectedness more palpable, however, is not only the strength and speed by which it evolves but the ability of indigenous people to rise along with it"

While the above quote was made in the general context of indigenous communities, I find it relevant, in a way, to the situation of Mababe. Change, which came as Tswana cultural hegemony and some western values, have long intruded on the Khwee society, through education and modernisation (or globalisation). While loss of culture was not supported, less emphasis was put on the resistance on the interference of cultural values.

Moreover, women in the Khwee society expressed the importance of education and said they consider it as an answer to most of the social problems in Mababe and the entire San community. While they accept the fact that education negatively impacts their identity as Khwee women, they still believe the modern kind of life is tougher without education, therefore emphasising its importance over traditional ways of living, which they described as old fashioned and tiring. They however did not disguise their identity as Khwee women, which they do not strongly link to their ways of living as such.

Just as is the case with many other indigenous communities around the world, the Khwee community of Mababe has shown the desire for education as well as the need to retain some of their cultural norms and values. This in line with the UNDRIP (2007) which stipulated the right

of the indigenous people to improve their socio-economic status, as they will. Article 21 of the declaration states that

> 1. Indigenous peoples have the right, without discrimination, to the improvement of their economic and social conditions, including, inter alia, in the areas of education, employment, vocational training and retraining, housing, sanitation, health and social security.
>
> 2. States shall take effective measures and, where appropriate, special measures to ensure continuing improvement of their economic and social conditions. Particular attention shall be paid to the rights and special needs of indigenous elders, women, youth, children and persons with disabilities. (UNDRIP 2007, article 21)

So far, it has not been possible to incorporate the two, the Khwee culture is facing threat at the expense of Tswana culture and some western education, which are taught in the class.

Lastly, my study had established a clear strong relationship between education, coupled with modernisation at some point, the identity of Khwee women of Mababe and education. The presence of education in women comes together with the strong sense of their own cultural disguise, and lower recognition of cultural values and norms caused by the acceptance of the culture of the majority, or what seems normal in the eyes of many. On the other hand, absence of education for women was linked to discontentment and lower socio-economic status, yet relatively stronger cultural recognition.

6.4 Recommendations

A lot of research has been carried on the San in general and education, but not much on San women in particular. Recommendations have been made to the Botswana government, in relation to how to increase the literacy level among the San, as well as other minorities, and help them overcome changes that hamper their progress in education and decrease the level of drop-outs. Recommendations range from the need for the mother tongue education at the elementary school level to enable smooth and easy transition of students to schools, multilingual education, the training of teachers from indigenous communities and social minorities (Hays 2006).

A research done by Le Roux (2001) on education and the San of South Africa, Botswana and Namibia, suggested recommendations such as the development and inclusion of San teachers to serve in their own areas, introduction of second language teachers for smooth transition of learners to the language of instruction in schools and formation of San language institutions.

The level of progress in education among the San, at least in Mababe, still remains a challenge, which I personally interpreted that recommendations are not adhered to or implemented. Lucas (2008) revealed some of the reasons for the government's failure to openly receive some recommendations was the mistrust between the government and the international organisations assisting the San; lack of communication between the Basarwa individuals working with researchers, and the government; lack of consultation from the government's side on Basarwa before implementations of some initiatives directed to promoting education among the Basarwa. The fact that the government of Botswana has not come up with initiatives to specifically help the San as the most marginalised community in the country, calls for more research to be done. Some research could focus particularly on the reasons for the government's failure to either accept or implement recommendations.

As much as research had been undertaken with the San of Botswana, results have been generalised among all San across the country. Since my research findings had shown some things that I did not expect, such as the participants strong support for education for women, my desire therefore is for researchers, the government and all organisations working with Basarwa, to treat different communities differently, and realise that different initiatives can work for different San communities.

The last thing, and very important thing is my wish to see indigenous scholars in Botswana. Raising local researchers was one of the objectives of the UBTromso program and has to some extent, seen success with a rise of a significant number of local researchers on the San issues. While this is significantly important, I believe the presence of San scholars on San issues would bring a much higher level of progress.

Moreover, initiatives such as the UBTromso with the aim to assist San students with more access to tertiary education, coupled with the government's financial aid to San who qualify for tertiary education, would possibly increase level of literacy among the San, which may increase possibilities for the rise of San indigenous scholars.

All women in Mababe with education focused of improving social status through better paying jobs. None of them has shown interest in research or academia. I am just a beginner in writing but have so far experienced that being a scholar brings enlightenment to many issues surrounding indigeneity. Even though I am a Motswana, I still don't think I can ever be in a better position to speak out for indigenous people of Botswana, than the people themselves. With relatively good progress to higher institutions of learning among indigenous people, I

believe in no time an indigenous scholar, if not a few, will rise up and be in the best position to stand up for the rights of the whole indigenous population in Botswana.

References

1. ACHPR (2005). The Report of the African Commission's Working Group on Indigenous Populations/Communities; Mission to the republic of Botswana. Banjul, The Gambia.

2. ACHPR (2010). Consideration of Reports submitted by States Parties under the Terms of Article 62 of the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights: Concluding Observations and Recommendations on the Initial Periodic Report of the Republic of Botswana. Banjul, The Gambia.

3. ACHPR. (2006). Indigenous Peoples in Africa: The Forgotten Peoples? The African Commission's work on Indigenous People in Africa. Banjul, Gambia.

4. Akena, F. A. (2012). Critical Analysis of the Production of Western Knowledge and its Implications for Indigenous Knowledge and Decolonisation: *Journal of Black Studies*, 43 (6), 599-619.

5. Arthur, J. (1998). Institution Practices and the Cultural Construction of Primary School teaching in Botswana: *Comparative Education*. Vol 34 (3), 313-326

6. Bakwena, M., & Sebudubudu, D. (2016). Implications of the Internship Programme for Youth Employment in Botswana: *Mosenodi Journal*. Vol 19 (1&2), 3-13.

7. Belton, K. A. (2010). Indigenous Politics: Migration, Citizenship, Cyberspace: Alternatives: *Global, Local Political*. Vol 35 (3), 193-215.

8. Bolaane, M., & Saugestard, S. (2011). The University of Botswana and the University of Tromsø Collaborative Program: Its Relevance to Minority Education and San Youth Capacity-Building: *Diaspora, Indigenous, and Minority Education*. Vol 5 (2), 119-125.

9. Comaroff J, & Comaroff J. 1991. Of Revelation and Revolution: Christianity, Colonisation, and Consciousness in South Africa, Vol 1. The University of Chicago Press, Chicago.

10. Crawhall, N. (2006). Indigenous Peoples' of Africa. Occasional Paper. Norwegian Church Aid. Oslo.

11. Crenshaw, K. (1991). Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity, Politics, and Violence Against Women of Color: *Stanford Law Review*. Vol 43 (6), 1241-1299.

12. Evjen. B. (1997). Measuring of heads: Physical Anthropological research in North Norway: *Acta Borilia*. Vol 14 (2), 3-30.

13. Fombad C. M. (2004). The Constitution Protection Against Discrimination in Botswana: The International and Comparative Law Quarterly. Vol (53) 1, 139-170

14. Hays J, (2009). Steps Forward and New Challenges: Indigenous Communities and Mother Tongue Education in Southern Africa: International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism. Vol 12 (4), 401-413.

15. Hays J. (2016). Owner of Learning: The Nyae Nyae Village Schools over Twenty-Five Years. Basel: Chicago.

16. Hays, J. (2005). Education and the San of Southern Africa: *Indigenous Affairs.* Vol 1, 26-34

17. Hays, J. (2005). For the benefits of all: Mother tongue education for Southern African Minorities. A Comprehensive Summary Report from a Regional Conference on Multilingualism in Southern African Education. Gaborone, Botswana.

18. Hjort, J. (2010). Pre-Colonial Culture, Post-Colonial Economics Success? The Tswana and the African Economic miracle: The Economic History Review, New Series. Vol 63 (3), 688-709.

19. Huffman, T. E. (2010). Theoretical Perspectives on American Indian Education: Taking a new look at Academia Success and the Achievement gap. Lanham, Md: AltaMira Press.

20. IWGIA. (2018, February 15). Retrieved from https://www.iwgia.org/en/botswana.

21. Kiema, K. (2010). *Tears for my Land: A Social History of the Kua of the Central Kalahari Game Reserve, Tcamnqoo*. Gaborone, Botswana: Mmegi Pub. House.

22. Le Roux, W, & White, A. 2010. Voices of the San: Living in the Southern Africa Today. Kwela: Cape town.

23. Le Roux, W. (2001). Torn apart, San children as Change agents in a Process Acculturation: A report on the Educational Situation of the San Children in Southern Africa. Pp 86-138. Southern Africa.

24. Lucas, B. T. (2008). Basarwa: Genuine Targets of Empowerment or Pawns in a Political Power?: *Botswana Notes and Records*. Vol 40, 124-134.

25. Mafela, L. (2014). Education and the Perception of "Other": Colonial Education of Batswana and Formal Education of Indigenous San of Botswana: *Alternative: An international Journal of Indigenous Peoples.* Vol 10, (1), 3-14.

26. May, S., &, Aikman, S. (2003). Indigenous Education: Addressing Current Issues and Developments: *Comparative Education*. Vol 39 (2), 139-145.

27. Molefe, D. B. (1999). Language, History, and Social Change in Botswana: *Journal of Southern African Studies.* Vol 25 (4), 45-79.

28. Molosiwa, A., & Boikhutso, K. (2016). Low education participation of marginalised children in Botswana's rural remote schools: Interface between cultural, structural and institutional factors. *Africa Education Review,* 13 (12), 48-63.

29. Nyati-Ramahobo, L. (2003). Culture in Education for the Khoesan Peoples of Botswana: Paper presented at the international Conference of Research for the Khoe and San Development (pp 1-7). Gaborone: Botswana.

30. Ogbu, U. J, & Simons, D. H. (1998). Voluntary and Involuntary Minorities: *A cultural- Anthropology and Education Quarterly*. 29 (2), 155-188.

31. Olsen, T. A. (2016). Gender and/in Indigenous Methodologies: On Trouble and Harmony in Indigenous Studies: *Ethnicities*. Vol 17 (4), 509-525

32. Osaghae, E. (2008). "Social movement and Rights Claims: The Case of Action Groups in the Niger Delta of Nigeria", Voluntas: *Internal Journal of voluntary and Non-profit Organizations*. Vol 19 (2), 189-210.

33. Pelican, M., & Maruyama, J. (2015). The Indigenous Rights Movement in Africa: Perspectives from Botswana and Cameroon: *African Study Monographs*. Vol 36 (1), 49-74.

34. Saugestard, S. (2001). The Inconvenient Indigenous: Remote Area Development in Botswana, Donor Assistance, and the First People of the Kalahari. Sweden. Centraltryckeriet Åke Svensson

35. Saugestard, S. (2008). Columbus Context: New Challenges as the Indigenous Discourse is Applied to Africa. Indigenous Peoples. Self Determination, Knowledge, and Indigeneity, 157-173.

36. Seal, C. (Ed). (2011). Researching Societies and Culture (3rd Ed). London: Sage Publications.

37. Shawn, W. (2008). *Research is Ceremony: Indigenous Research Methods*: Fernwood Publishing, Black Point.

38. Smith, L. T. (2011). *Decolonising methodologies: Research and Indigenous People*. New Zealand. Ontago University Press.

39. Stevenson, M. G. (1996). Indigenous Knowledge in Environmental Assessment. *Arctic*. Vol 49 (3), 278-291.

40. Sylvain, R. (2011). At the intersections: San Women and the Rights of Indigenous People in Africa: *The international Journal of Human Rights*. Vol 15 (1), 89 -110.

41. Taylor, M. (2001). Life, land and power: Contesting development in northern Botswana. University of Edinburgh.

42. UN General Assembly, 2007. United Nations Right of the Indigenous People: resolution/ adopted by the General Assembly, 2 October 2007.

43. UNFPA. (26 February 2018). Teenage pregnancy on the rise. Retrieved from http://botswana.unfpa.org/news/teenage-pregnancy-rise.

44. Van der Hoogte L., & Kingma, K. (2004). Promoting Cultural Diversity and the Rights of Women: The Dilemma of 'intersectionality' for Development Organisations: *Gender and Development Organisations*. Vol 12 (1), 47-55.

45. Zips-Mairitsch, M. (2013). Lost Lands?: (land) Rights of the San in Botswana and the Legal Concept of indigeneity in Africa: LIT Verlag. Berlin.