

1 Automated mapping of glacial overdeepenings 2 beneath contemporary ice sheets: approaches 3 and potential applications

4 Henry Patton^{a,b,1,†}, Darrel A. Swift^{a,*†}, Chris D. Clark^a, Stephen J.
5 Livingstone^a, Simon J. Cook^c, Alun Hubbard^b

6 ^a*Department of Geography, University of Sheffield, Winter Street, Sheffield, S10 2TN, UK.*

7 ^b*Department of Geology, University of Tromsø – The Arctic University of Norway, N-9037*
8 *Tromsø, Norway.*

9 ^c*School of Science and the Environment, Manchester Metropolitan University, Chester Street,*
10 *Manchester, M1 5GD, UK.*

11 ¹*Present address: Department of Geology, University of Tromsø – The Arctic University of*
12 *Norway, N-9037 Tromsø, Norway.*

13 ^{*}*Corresponding author. Email d.a.swift@sheffield.ac.uk. Telephone +44 114 222 7959*

14 [†]*These authors contributed equally to this work.*

15 **ABSTRACT** There is growing awareness of the significance of overdeepenings in ice sheet
16 systems. However, a complete understanding of overdeepening formation is lacking, meaning
17 observations of overdeepening location and morphometry are urgently required to motivate
18 process understanding. Subject to the development of appropriate mapping approaches, the
19 availability of high resolution subglacial topography datasets covering the whole of Antarctica and
20 Greenland offer significant potential to acquire such observations and to relate overdeepening
21 characteristics to ice-sheet parameters. We explore a possible method for mapping overdeepenings
22 beneath the Antarctic and Greenland ice sheets and illustrate a potential application of this
23 approach by testing a possible relationship between overdeepening elongation ratio and ice sheet
24 flow velocity. We find that hydrological and terrain filtering approaches are unsuited to mapping
25 overdeepenings and develop a novel rule-based GIS methodology that delineates overdeepening
26 perimeters by analysis of closed-contour properties. We then develop GIS procedures that provide
27 information on overdeepening morphology and topographic context. Limitations in the accuracy
28 and resolution of bed-topography datasets mean application to glaciological problems requires
29 consideration of quality-control criteria to (a) remove potentially spurious depressions and (b)
30 reduce uncertainties that arise from the inclusion of depressions of non-glacial origin or those in
31 regions where empirical data are sparse. Potential criteria are introduced to address the problem of
32 overdeepening elongation, and discussion of this example serves to highlight the limitations that
33 mapping approaches – and other potential applications of such approaches – must confront. We

34 predict that improvements in bed-data quality will reduce the need for quality control procedures
35 and facilitate increasingly robust insights from empirical data.

36 **Keywords:** overdeepenings, automated landform mapping, glacial erosion, landscape evolution,
37 Antarctica, Greenland.

38 **1. Introduction & aims**

39 The mechanisms by which glaciers and ice sheets form spectacular alpine and fjord landscapes are
40 well known, and such landscapes have been exploited widely for purposes of palaeo-glaciology
41 and process understanding (e.g. Glasser and Bennett, 2004; Hooke, 1991; Sugden, 1978).
42 Recently, this understanding has been aided by implementation of simple ice-erosion laws within
43 numerical models, which are able to simulate depths and patterns of glacial incision with
44 compelling success (e.g. Harbor, 1992; Kessler et al., 2008; MacGregor et al., 2000). However, the
45 mechanisms that produce overdeepenings (Fig. 1) remain unclear, and the implementation of
46 candidate processes within ice-erosion models, including quarrying-related ice-erosion feedbacks,
47 has met with limited success (e.g. Egholm et al., 2012).

48 The reverse-bed gradient that occurs in the presence of an overdeepening has been shown to exert
49 strong influence on glacier hydrology, ice dynamics, and ice-mass stability (cf. Cook and Swift,
50 2012; Creyts and Clarke, 2010; Dow et al., 2011; Schoof, 2007; Stokes et al., 2014; Thomas and
51 Bentley, 1978; Weertman, 1974) (cf. Fig. 1C), meaning a complete understanding of
52 overdeepening formation and morphology is essential to elucidate and understand critical ice-bed
53 processes and to inform predictions of past and present ice-mass behaviour. Cook and Swift
54 (2012) have argued that process understanding has been disadvantaged by an absence of
55 quantitative studies of overdeepening morphology that perhaps reflects the term's uncertain
56 etymology and, as a possible consequence, an unconscious disregard of overdeepenings as distinct
57 morphological features. Hence, fundamental data are urgently required to motivate process
58 understanding, as well as to provide quantitative test-data for ice-erosion models.

59 In this paper, we develop a computationally efficient GIS-based methodology for mapping of
60 overdeepenings and quantification of their morphometry. Inspired by studies that have investigated
61 glacier depositional and erosional phenomena (e.g. Clark et al., 2009; Evans, 2006; Stokes et al.,
62 2013), we develop methods that can be used to extract overdeepening length, width, depth and
63 volume, as well as overdeepening long- and cross-profiles that pass through the deepest point.
64 Measurements of these phenomena require delimitation of the basin perimeter and identification of
65 basin in- and out-flow points, and also require identification of overdeepenings within

66 overdeepenings (i.e. nested overdeepenings; Fig. 1D). From these phenomena, further metrics,
67 including elongation ratio (cf. Clark et al., 2009), normal and adverse slope lengths and gradients,
68 and planform area, can then be derived (Fig. 2).

69 We use comprehensive subglacial topography datasets for the Antarctic and Greenland ice sheets
70 (Bamber et al., 2013; Fretwell et al., 2013) to illustrate a possible application of our methodology
71 that seeks to relate overdeepening form to ice velocity. These recently published datasets provide
72 an incentive for the development of landscape analysis tools that can systematically examine ice-
73 sheet beds, not least because the application of traditional methods of geomorphological mapping
74 at this scale is inappropriate. Nevertheless, automated analysis of such datasets need to be
75 appreciative of dataset quality and resolution, the presence of features of non-glacial origin, and
76 the inherently different timescales of ice mass and landscape response.

77 **2. Study areas and datasets**

78 **2.1 Study areas**

79 The landscape beneath present-day ice sheets provides an unparalleled opportunity to elucidate
80 ice-bed processes and evolution because of the size of the ice-covered area and, where ice cover
81 remains present, the absence of thick postglacial deposits that in palaeo-glaciated landscapes
82 accumulate within areas of deep erosion. Comprehensive subglacial topography datasets for the
83 Antarctic (Bedmap2) and Greenland ice sheets have recently been made available (Bamber et al.,
84 2013; Fretwell et al., 2013) and these are used in the example application of our methods in
85 section 5. For practical purposes, the development of these methods was undertaken on a relatively
86 small domain surrounding the Byrd Glacier catchment and Transantarctic Mountains, adjacent to
87 the Ross Ice Shelf, in East Antarctica (Fig. 3). This 5.22×10^5 km² region provides an excellent
88 methodological test-bed, combining substantial variability in relief with the presence of a large
89 number of bed depressions that exhibit a range of depths and areas.

90 **2.2 Antarctic subglacial topography**

91 The Bedmap2 dataset provides subglacial and continental shelf topography for the Antarctic
92 continent (Fretwell et al., 2013) using the most up-to-date compilation of empirical ice-thickness
93 measurements for the Antarctic ice sheets. Raw ice-thickness data for Bedmap2 have been derived
94 from a variety of sources, including: direct airborne radar sounding and seismic measurements;
95 satellite altimetry and free-air gravity surveys; and ‘synthetic’ data computed using a ‘thin-ice’
96 model. The rationale for including modelled topography within the source data was to prevent
97 rock outcrops from overly skewing the ice-thickness distribution in mountainous areas where few
98 empirical measurements exist. Although this output gives the appearance of accurate relief within

99 ice-marginal mountain ranges, it is worth noting that this topography is not directly constrained by
100 any empirical data. Continental shelf topography is derived from the GEBCO 2008 bathymetric
101 compilation mosaiced with sub-ice shelf data from Timmermann et al. (2010).

102 The Bedmap2 topography is rendered on a 1-km grid but empirical and synthetic measurements of
103 ice thickness were sampled at 5 km, primarily because the distribution of empirical measurements,
104 which require interpolation (kriging) to form a continuous surface, did not warrant a higher
105 resolution (Fretwell et al., 2013). Notably, the spatially non-uniform distribution of ice-thickness
106 measurements obtained by airborne radar surveys, in which across-track sampling density is
107 potentially 3 or 4 orders of magnitude lower than the density along the flight tracks, means that
108 even large, valley-scale features may be absent or resolved poorly. Furthermore, the fragmentary
109 nature of completed radar surveys carried out across Antarctica has left many regions sparsely
110 constrained. For example, in Bedmap2, 80% of grid cells have data within 20 km, and the greatest
111 distance from a grid cell to the nearest data point (the ‘poles of ignorance’) is ~ 230 km (Fretwell
112 et al., 2013). For this reason, the non-genetic term *depression* is used in the methodological
113 sections of this study, thereby avoiding the implication that all basin-like features in the digital
114 elevation models (DEM) surface are genuine closed-depressions and/or glacial overdeepenings.

115 **2.3 Greenland subglacial topography**

116 Subglacial and continental shelf topography for Greenland is provided by Bamber et al. (2013). As
117 with Bedmap2, topography in this dataset is rendered on a 1 km grid with subglacial topography
118 mainly derived using ice-thickness measurements obtained from airborne radar surveys and
119 satellite observations. As such, similar error sources, assumptions and levels of uncertainty exist.
120 Continental shelf topography is sourced from the most recent IBCAO (International Bathymetric
121 Chart of the Arctic Ocean) compilation of offshore bathymetric datasets (Jakobsson et al., 2012),
122 supplemented with additional soundings from Jakobshavn fjord. It should be noted that where
123 bathymetry is not well known, or observations do not exist, bed elevations are often
124 underestimated by up to several hundred metres, particularly within fjords (Bamber et al., 2013).

125 **2.4 Additional datasets**

126 Higher-resolution ice thickness datasets for several areas of Antarctica were obtained from the
127 Centre for Remote Sensing of Ice Sheets archive (CReSIS; <https://data.cresis.ku.edu>) to evaluate
128 the implications of DEM resolution for the delineation of overdeepening perimeters. These
129 products, which have restricted geographical coverage, are derived from airborne radar surveys
130 and are published at a grid spacing of 500 m. Ice-surface velocity data derived from InSAR
131 observations over Antarctica and Greenland were sourced from datasets compiled by Rignot et al.
132 (2011a) and Joughin et al. (2010a), respectively.

133 3. Automated mapping of overdeepenings

134 3.1 Delimitation of overdeepenings in the landscape

135 A key challenge in mapping geomorphological phenomena is delineating their boundaries. For
136 example, overdeepenings do not represent isolated pockets of deep glacial erosion in an otherwise
137 unmodified fluvial landscape. Most frequently, overdeepenings occur as areas of deeper erosion in
138 the floors of deep, glacially-carved valleys (cf. Cook and Swift, 2012) and, as such, the flanks of
139 an overdeepened basin are inseparable from those of the host valley. The use of hydrological tools
140 to delineate overdeepenings (see section 3.2.1) by means of 'filling sinks' does not therefore
141 necessarily have a strong, physical basis. Further, subaerial and subglacial hydraulic gradients will
142 differ, meaning that an overdeepening that in the subaerial environment contains a lake will only
143 contain a subglacial lake if the gradient of the adverse bed-slope exceeds 11 times that of the ice-
144 surface gradient (the 'ponding' threshold; Clarke, 2005).

145 To avoid consideration of such complexities, we follow the definition provided by Cook and Swift
146 (2012), who use *overdeepening* (verb) to describe the excavation of a topographic depression that,
147 subglacially, would require ice, water and sediment to traverse a locally reversed (or adverse)
148 slope. This usage therefore describes the creation of a specific landform, an *overdeepening* (noun),
149 which on deglaciation would form a sedimentary basin or lake (cf. Fountain and Walder, 1998).
150 This definition of an overdeepening as a subaerial 'closed depression' means that the elevation at
151 the outflow point can be used to delineate the perimeter. Mapping of closed depressions in
152 predicted subglacial hydraulic potentials (cf. Shreve, 1972) is avoided intentionally because
153 depression form and location would depend partly on the morphology of the ice surface, which is
154 inherently variable. A classification based on purely morphological grounds is therefore
155 independent of glaciological processes. Clearly, closed-depressions can also be formed by non-
156 glacial processes, including tectonic processes (e.g. by faulting), whilst some mapped depressions
157 are artefacts resulting from interpolation between sparse empirical data. Methods of identifying
158 erroneous depressions and tectonic basins are also therefore considered in this study.

159 Despite the morphological simplicity of closed-depressions, mapping methodology must overcome
160 several important challenges. Firstly, automated analyses of DEMs at the ice-sheet scale, even at 1
161 km resolution, require computationally efficient techniques. Secondly, like other bedforms (cf.
162 Clark et al., 2009), overdeepenings tend to develop a distinctive ovoid planform (Cook and Swift,
163 2012), but constraints imposed by topography often produce sinuous overdeepenings that follow
164 the axes of large troughs (e.g. Fig. 1B), while others are influenced by geological structures or
165 changing phases of ice-flow direction, resulting in circular or irregular shapes. Thirdly,
166 overdeepenings are frequently nested (cf. Fig. 1D), with larger examples occasionally containing

167 many generations of nesting. Finally, many overdeepenings beneath contemporary ice sheets may
168 be relict landforms that represent erosion during earlier stages of glaciation, which may limit
169 meaningful analysis of mapping results. For example, ice flow direction during depression
170 formation, and thus the location of in- and out-flow points, cannot always be established.

171 **3.2 Delineation methods**

172 Three GIS-based methodologies were evaluated for the purpose of delineating depressions in a
173 DEM surface that would constitute subaerial closed-depressions in a landscape. The third approach
174 was adopted for this study.

175 **3.2.1 Hydrological filling**

176 In the post-glacial landscape, overdeepenings are sinks for water and sediment (e.g. Preusser et al.,
177 2010; van Rensbergen et al., 1999). An instinctual approach to mapping overdeepenings is
178 therefore to use GIS hydrological tools to identify sinks (or areas of internal drainage) across the
179 digital terrain (e.g. Arnold, 2010). ‘Fill’ tools offer the simplest approach, and work by filling
180 sinks to capacity, thereby creating a ‘depressionless’ DEM. A major disadvantage of this method
181 is that smaller depressions located within larger depressions cannot be delimited, meaning
182 overdeepenings within tectonic basins or rift systems, or smaller overdeepenings nested within
183 larger overdeepenings, go unrecognised (Fig. 3). The wide size range exhibited by overdeepenings
184 (Cook and Swift, 2012) means those solutions to this problem that use fill criteria to limit the size
185 of the fill area for individual depressions are unworkable at the scale of whole ice sheets.

186 **3.2.2 Terrain filtering**

187 A more sophisticated yet computationally simple approach to mapping overdeepenings is to apply
188 signal-processing techniques to the DEM surface (e.g. Leonowicz et al., 2009; Stumpf et al.,
189 2013). This approach considers the landscape as a three-dimensional waveform within which
190 depressions and mountain peaks represent anomalous interference. By filtering the elevation data
191 at specific wavelengths, a smoothed surface largely voided of relief (interference) can be created.
192 Overdeepened topography can then be extracted by calculating the negative residuals beyond a
193 given threshold compared to its original form. Figure 4 shows how a two-dimensional, circular
194 (200 km), low-pass Gaussian filter of the form

$$195 \quad \text{Feil!} \quad (1)$$

196 where sigma (σ) and mu (μ) are the standard deviation and mean of the elevation distribution
197 respectively, can be used to produce a map of probable areas of overdeepening. In contrast to basin
198 extents mapped using hydrological filling techniques (above), this approach lacks precise

199 thresholds required for delimiting closed depression perimeters. Furthermore, the approach does
200 not enable mapping of nested features. A more rigorous GIS-based approach is therefore needed
201 that as appropriate to the complex morphology of large depressions.

202 **3.2.3 Contour tracking**

203 A final approach to delineating overdeepenings is to track changes in closed-contour length as an
204 observer moves away from an elevation minimum. The novel contour-tracking process developed
205 for this study is threefold. Firstly, a terrain analysis mask is calculated that delimits depression-like
206 areas in the DEM surface (Fig. 5A–B). By eliminating large areas of the surface that are not
207 depression-like, this initial step greatly enhances computational efficiency at the ice sheet scale.
208 Secondly, locations of elevation minima are pinpointed using zonal statistical analyses to find the
209 minimum point within each closed-contour that intersected the terrain-analysis mask (Fig. 5C).
210 Finally, changes in contour length are tracked away from each elevation minima to identify sharp
211 increases in length that would indicate the breach of a closed depression (Fig. 6A-B). The steps
212 detailed below were implemented using toolboxes and commands found within ArcGIS 10.1 and
213 GRASS GIS, with automated workflow achieved using packages within Python such as ArcPy.

214 *Step 1 – Terrain analysis mask*

215 Many existing methods of automated terrain analyses have their roots in differential geometry,
216 using combinations of morphometric parameters such as slope, gradient, curvature and aspect to
217 classify the form of the DEM surface (e.g. Brenning, 2009; Drăguț and Blaschke, 2006; Evans,
218 1980; Klingseisen et al., 2008; MacMillan et al., 2000; Saha et al., 2011; Wilson and Gallant,
219 2000; Wood, 1996). Here, two parameters are used to delimit broad areas of depression-like relief:
220 plan curvature (horizontal curvature, intersecting with the XY plane) and minimum curvature in
221 the direction perpendicular to the direction of maximum curvature. The quantitative foundation to
222 this methodology thus creates several free parameters, the sensitivity of which can be fine-tuned
223 depending on the desired mapping criteria (cf. Table 1). For example, plan curvature and minimum
224 curvature can be tuned to mask only small cirque-like features that are confined by high
225 topography.

226 *Step 2 – Finding elevation minima*

227 Elevation minima are found by running a zonal statistical tool on the depression-like areas
228 identified in Step 1. Where contours are completely within the terrain analysis mask, a grid of
229 points with elevation attributes is created, from which points of minimum elevation associated
230 with each contour are deduced. Repeat points, or erroneous elevation peaks, can be removed by
231 systematic comparison with the elevation and the ID of the bounding contour.

232 *Step 3 – Contour analysis*

233 Depression perimeters are delineated by determining the highest elevation ‘bounding contour’
234 using a process of ‘contour-tracking’. This method works by measuring the change in contour
235 length between successive contours at increasing distance from the point of elevation minima (Fig.
236 6A). In the case of depressions, contour lengths will increase in size, and contour length will
237 increase rapidly when a depression is ‘breached’. For this study, a change in contour length of
238 90% from the preceding contour was chosen, which represents a factor-of-three increase in the
239 bounded area. This method was used to identify generations of nested depressions (Fig. 6B) by
240 running multiple passes whilst ‘ignoring’ previously identified depression breaches.

241 A range of parameters can be specified during this process (Table 1). For this study, values were
242 chosen that provide sensible results, but these are far from definitive. In addition, classification of
243 nested depressions can be undertaken, and for this study a simple top-down approach based on
244 nested depression order was applied (Fig. 6C).

245 **4. Automated extraction of overdeepening metrics**

246 Whilst mapping methods (above) can provide qualitative information on the distribution, platform
247 morphology and nesting of probable overdeepenings, further methods are required to extract
248 information on overdeepening form (e.g. Fig. 2). GIS-based methods suitable for extracting such
249 metrics from very large numbers of mapped overdeepenings are described below.

250 **4.1 Depression in- and out-flow points**

251 The identification of depression entry and exit points is a critical step in the measurement of
252 depression length, elongation, and the morphology of normal and adverse slopes. In order to
253 provide adaptability to different contexts, three approaches are presented here. The first two are
254 topographic and hydrological methods that utilise the bed topography alone and may be
255 appropriate where ice-thickness data are not available (e.g. in palaeo domains), although we also
256 consider a more sophisticated hydrology based approach that makes use of ice-thickness data to
257 infer subglacial water flow directions. The third uses only simple analysis of ice-surface elevations
258 above the depression perimeter. All three approaches have methodological limitations, a summary
259 of which is given in Table 2. Although methods that infer subglacial water flow may offer
260 advantages for understanding some processes (see below), the ice-surface-based approach was
261 considered to be the most robust (see Discussion).

262 **4.1.1 Topography based**

263 Where grounded ice-thickness data do not exist (e.g. continental shelves and palaeo ice-sheet
264 domains), in- and out-flow points can be inferred by identifying broad trends in landscape
265 elevation by means similar to the filtering method presented above (Section 3.2.2). However, thick
266 ice sheets may become independent of topography and may subsume and dissect mountain ranges,
267 meaning ice-flow directions can reverse as ice sheets grow. For the Byrd test domain, a 1500 km²
268 moving window is required to overcome the influence of the Transantarctic Mountains and
269 identify a general trend in relief that reflects the westwards flow of the East Antarctic Ice Sheet.
270 By reducing the size of this moving window, more localised trends in elevation change can be
271 extracted, which may be suitable for defining in- and out-flow points during periods when
272 glaciation was more restricted and smaller ice masses occupied only higher elevations. However,
273 different sectors of a single ice sheet can be characterised by contrasting styles of glaciation,
274 meaning this method can be difficult to apply across ice-sheet scale domains.

275 **4.1.2 Hydrology based**

276 An intuitive approach to identifying in- and out-flow points where ice-thickness data are absent is
277 to use 'hydrological tools' to calculate water flow direction and flow accumulation rasters for the
278 DEM surface. Because ice flow in areas of deep erosion and overdeepening development is
279 directed by topography, flow routing can be used to infer locations where maximum ice flux enters
280 and leaves each depression. However, the assumption that subaerial water flow represents an
281 accurate proxy for ice flow does not, as discussed above, hold true for ice sheets that subsume
282 mountainous landscapes. If ice thickness is known, a more direct approach can be used (see 4.1.3
283 below), but the availability of ice-thickness data presents a further hydrology based approach,
284 which is to infer subglacial water flow direction through calculation of hydraulic potentials (cf.
285 Shreve, 1972) at the ice-bed interface (e.g. Livingstone et al., 2013). This method is likely to
286 provide a better approximation of the pathways of water and sediment through an overdeepening
287 than ice-flow-based methods, and may therefore be useful for understanding certain
288 overdeepening-related processes and feedbacks. However, flow patterns are sensitive to changes in
289 ice surface geometry and will not follow the deepest path through an overdeepening where the
290 adverse slope approaches or exceeds the ponding threshold (Clarke, 2010), meaning the
291 identification of outflow points using this method is unlikely to be robust.

292 **4.1.3 Ice-surface based**

293 The preferred method for identifying in- and out-flow points in this study uses the elevation of the
294 overlying ice-sheet surface. Assuming that the surface of ice flowing immediately above an
295 overdeepening approximates a uniform plane that slopes in the direction of flow, the points of

296 maximum and minimum ice-surface elevation that lie above the bounding contour of the
297 depression (Fig. 7) will provide a reasonable approximation for the principal entry and exit points
298 in terms of the greatest flux of ice. Where multiple points of equal ice-surface elevation exist
299 around the depression edge, a single in- or out-flow point can be determined by choosing the point
300 most distant from the basin minima. Given the size of depression that can be mapped from a 1 km
301 resolution DEM, the ice-surface elevation dataset is sufficiently precise to enable the identification
302 of in- and out-flow points even for depressions in the centre of an ice sheet, and application to the
303 test area domain demonstrates that this method is robust in most contexts (Fig. 8). The suitability
304 of this method will, however, collapse under flat ice surfaces, such as those of ice shelves or above
305 large subglacial lakes, and where overdeepening planform is highly complex.

306 **4.2 Depression morphology and context**

307 Following the identification of depression minima, bounding contours, and in- and out-flow
308 points, a range of descriptive profiles and quantitative metrics can be extracted for each depression
309 (e.g. Fig. 2). Many of the metrics are readily calculated using simple GIS techniques and to give a
310 thorough description here would be unnecessary. However, some, such as the long-profile and the
311 calculation of elongation ratio for sinuous or asymmetric depressions, require bespoke methods.

312 **4.2.1 Long-profiles**

313 For depressions with sinuous planforms, the path of a long profile that follows the deepest route
314 through the depression is far removed from a straight line that joins the in- and out-flow points. A
315 convenient solution is to calculate a ‘least-cost’ path between the in- and out-flow points that
316 passes through the depression minimum (Fig. 8B). The in- and out-flow locations and position of
317 the depression minimum can then be used to divide the profile into normal and adverse slopes. For
318 adverse slopes with gradients that are below 11 times the ice surface gradient (Clarke, 2005), this
319 path will approximate the route taken by subglacial water through the depression, and as noted
320 previously this may offer some advantages. However, steeper adverse slopes will cause flow to
321 flow around the overdeepening or distribute across the adverse slope. Consequently, hydrological
322 methods for determining the depression long-profile were deemed unsuitable.

323 **4.2.2 Depression shape**

324 The shape of each mapped feature can provide important information on its probable origin and
325 history of erosion. For example, many glacial geomorphological phenomena demonstrate
326 ovoid or elongate forms (see section 5.2), meaning ovoid depressions may be considered more
327 likely to have a glacial origin than those with more complex planform morphologies, and a glacial
328 origin may be considered even more secure for those with ovoid planforms that are elongate in the
329 direction of ice flow. Small, isolated and circular depressions appear to be characteristic of artefact

330 depressions created by kriging at flightline intersections in regions of sparse empirical data, giving
331 a ‘pockmarked’ appearance to the DEM surface.

332 Two shapes are thus of interest: circular and elongated (i.e. ovoid). Absence of elongation can be
333 assessed using a minimum bounding geometry methodology, whereby a depression is enclosed
334 within a polygon that is defined by its minimum possible area (Fig. 9A). Where a depression fills
335 more than 60% of a square polygon, it can be classified as ‘circular’. However, elongation cannot
336 be assessed using this method if a depression exhibits strong sinuosity (e.g. Fig. 1B) or a complex
337 planform. As a result, have developed a novel method for assessment of elongation in which
338 elongation is determined with respect to the presumed direction of ice-flow at all points along the
339 depression long-profile. This was achieved by calculating the mean width of the depression
340 perpendicular to the least-cost transect at regular intervals along the long-profile (Fig. 9B).
341 Further, the threshold for elongation was defined as an elongation ratio (transect length divided by
342 mean width) that exceeds 2. Depressions that exhibit neither circularity nor elongation in the
343 direction of ice flow are deemed ‘unclassified’.

344 **4.3 Contextual classification**

345 Overdeepening form and location is likely to be influenced by a range of local factors that affect
346 erosion potential, including lithological changes or weaknesses and the location of moulins that
347 direct surface runoff to the glacier bed (Cook and Swift, 2012; Herman et al., 2011; Hooke, 1991).
348 Often, the simplest method for isolating such external drivers will be by cross-referencing
349 depression location and/or relevant metrics with other numerically modelled or empirical datasets.
350 Other factors can be isolated by automated classification of mapped depressions using such
351 datasets. For example, empirical observations have indicated that topographic-focussing of ice flux
352 in regions of high relief is a strong control on overdeepening location and depth (e.g. Kessler et al.,
353 2008; Roberts et al., 2010). In this instance, a depression can be classified as ‘topographically
354 confined’ using a simple proximity-based GIS-method that calculates the mean elevation of the
355 topography within a small (20 km) buffer of the depression perimeter.

356 **5. An assessment of the influence of overriding ice velocity on** 357 **overdeepening morphology**

358 Application of the methods outlined above to bed-topography datasets for Antarctica and
359 Greenland (Bamber et al., 2013; Fretwell et al., 2013; Patton et al. in prep) produces a database of
360 >13,000 bed depressions (including nested depressions). To demonstrate the potential insight that
361 can be gained from such datasets, we explore the relationship between overriding ice velocity and
362 overdeepening morphology. We nevertheless acknowledge important uncertainties associated with

363 current subglacial topography datasets (see Discussion) and apply strict quality-control criteria to
364 our mapping of bed depressions and analyses of their metrics.

365 **5.1 Motivation**

366 It has been proposed that many glacially moulded bedforms, including flutes, drumlins and mega-
367 scale lineations lie on a continuum of scale that reflects the velocity of overriding ice (e.g. Clark et
368 al., 2009; Heidenreich, 1964; Stokes and Clark, 2002). The elongation ratio (ER) in particular is
369 assumed to correlate strongly with ice velocity for these phenomena, with analysis of high
370 landform ER values often used to infer ice-streaming conditions (e.g. Clark, 1993; King et al.,
371 2009; Ó Cofaigh et al., 2013; Stokes and Clark, 1999). A similar correlation may exist for
372 overdeepenings because fast-flowing ice should enhance rates of headward erosion by quarrying
373 and abrasion (Herman et al., 2011; cf. Hooke, 1991) and rates of sediment evacuation and abrasion
374 at the overdeepening lip (cf. Alley et al., 2003). Proof of this relationship would have significant
375 value for palaeoglaciological research because it would provide information on former ice
376 velocities in regions where erosional processes have dominated or the preservation of depositional
377 bedforms has been poor.

378 **5.2 Quality-control procedures**

379 Comparison of mapping results for Bedmap2 and for the higher-resolution CReSIS dataset (Fig.
380 10) demonstrates that the spatially variable distribution of empirical measurements in both datasets
381 produces artefacts that are mapped as bed depressions. In the Bedmap2 topography, these artefacts
382 mainly constitute smaller, isolated, spherical depressions that are aligned with the flightlines used
383 to collect airborne radar measurements of ice thickness (Fig. 10C). Mapping of the same domain
384 from the higher-resolution dataset identifies a significantly greater number of bed depressions,
385 many of which have a similar isolated, spherical appearance, albeit at a smaller scale
386 commensurate with the increased resolution of the dataset and density of flightlines (Fig. 10D). In
387 contrast, the first-order characteristics of larger depressions do not differ substantially when
388 mapped using the higher-resolution dataset, as demonstrated by planform (Fig. 10C–D) and long-
389 profile (Fig. 10E) characteristics of the Byrd Glacier depression. Mapping from higher-resolution
390 datasets therefore improves the detail in respect of the outlines (and thus metrics) of larger and
391 some smaller depressions, but artefact depressions are still present.

392 To avoid the inclusion of spurious metrics from artefact depressions, mapping of overdeepenings
393 from gridded datasets requires application of quality control criteria regardless of data resolution.
394 For this study, a suite of criteria have been considered and applied that are based on known dataset
395 uncertainties (cf. section 2.2):

- 396 1. Bed-elevation uncertainty. Absolute bed-uncertainty data beneath grounded ice is provided
397 with the DEMs for Greenland and Antarctica (Fretwell, et al., 2013; Bamber et al, 2013).
398 Although this is a good measure for estimating uncertainties in overdeepening absolute depth
399 (i.e. the elevation of the deepest point in relation to sea level), it is not a robust criterion for
400 assessing adequate delineation of mapped features, which is dependent on relative
401 uncertainties in the immediate area of the bed. For this reason, criteria based on flightline
402 density and depression size (below) were also considered.
- 403 2. Flightline density. Criteria were used to specify a minimum depression width in regions of
404 sparse empirical data, resulting in the removal of small, isolated depressions characteristic of
405 artefact depressions produced by kriging. Areas of sparse data were identified using a
406 flightline density mask that showed the density of flightlines within a 10 km radius of each
407 grid cell. Depressions with widths less than 20 km were excluded if they did not intersect areas
408 with densities > 0.11 , which is roughly equivalent to two flightlines within the given radius.
409 The choice of criteria reflects the observation by Fretwell et al. (2013) that absolute errors in
410 elevation generally increase over distances of up to 20 km, beyond which errors appear largely
411 uncorrelated with distance.
- 412 3. Depression size. Several size criteria were employed. Firstly, large features (e.g. tectonic
413 basins) were removed by excluding depressions with bounding contours exceeding 2,000 km
414 in perimeter (an area equivalent to 1.5 times the catchment area of Pine Island Glacier,
415 Antarctica; cf. (Vaughan et al., 2006). Depressions beyond this size are unlikely to have a
416 glacial origin. Secondly, in regions with flightline densities > 0.11 , depressions with adverse
417 slopes shorter than 5 km were excluded because depressions of this size were unlikely to be
418 adequately resolved by empirical measurements. Finally, a minimum overdeepening depth of
419 40 m was applied regardless of other criteria because shallow depressions are likely to have
420 many sources, including kriging, bed elevation uncertainty, and geology. This value is
421 intermediate between the minimum published absolute uncertainty values for the Bedmap2
422 (± 66 m) and Greenland (± 10 m) datasets (Fretwell, et al., 2013; Bamber et al, 2013).
- 423 4. Elongation with respect to the current ice-flow direction (cf. section 4.2.2). In accordance with
424 the majority of landforms sculpted by flowing ice (e.g. flutes, drumlins, roche moutonnées,
425 troughs), overdeepenings are generally elongate in the direction of ice flow. This criterion can
426 therefore be applied to exclude potentially non-glacial depressions. Though some genuine
427 overdeepenings will be excluded, including those with complex planforms formed under
428 previous ice-flow configurations, strict filtering of landforms on the basis of ice flow direction
429 will be beneficial for many applications because it should remove ‘relict’ landforms or those

430 with complex morphologies that are unlikely to be in equilibrium with present ice sheet
431 processes.

432 5. Topographic confinement. Empirical observations indicate that overdeepenings are most
433 common where ice flow is topographically confined (e.g. within valleys and outlet glacier
434 troughs), meaning this criterion can be applied in conjunction with (4) to exclude probable
435 non-glacial depressions. Notably, by favouring depressions that are located within troughs
436 where ice flow direction is likely to have been stable over many glacial cycles, this criterion
437 will exclude depressions with morphologies that may have evolved under varying ice-flow
438 configurations. For this study, depressions were classified as topographically confined if the
439 mean elevation of topography surrounding the depression exceeded the elevation of the lip by
440 a value greater than 500 m (cf. section 4.3; Fig. 9C).

441 **5.3 Results and interpretation**

442 To test the relationship between overdeepening ER and ice velocity for contemporary ice sheets,
443 our mapping methods allow the ER of Greenland and Antarctic depressions to be plotted against
444 ice-surface velocities (Joughin et al., 2010b; Rignot et al., 2011b) measured above the deepest
445 point in each depression (Figure 11). Because of dataset limitations and uncertainties regarding the
446 origin and morphological inheritance of nested depressions, we restrict our analysis to ‘parent’
447 depressions that are elongated in the direction of ice flow and that pass the other quality criteria
448 detailed above. In addition, we separately analyse the subset of depressions that can be categorised
449 as ‘topographically confined’. Not unexpectedly, these plots show substantial scatter,
450 demonstrated by very low R^2 values, that is consistent with the limitations of the source datasets
451 and the simplicity of our approach. Nevertheless, significance values for three of the plots are <
452 0.05 and therefore support a probable relationship, indicating that improvements in bed-data
453 quality and quality control criteria will provide a stronger foundation for such a link. Furthermore,
454 significance values are strongest for topographically confined depressions, despite the number of
455 depressions within these subsets being significantly smaller. This is particularly evident for
456 Greenland, where the relationship for elongated depressions is not statistically significant. The
457 application of strict quality criteria means that the inclusion of spurious depressions arising from
458 DEM artefacts is not thought to be a significant influence on the observed relationships.

459 **6. Discussion**

460 **6.1 Overdeepening identification and mapping approaches**

461 A necessity for automated mapping approaches at the scale of whole ice sheets is the development
462 of simple but robust methods of landform delimitation (e.g. Saha et al., 2011). Overdeepenings

463 present a considerable challenge in this respect because closed-depressions can arise from
464 glacial and geological processes, though large tectonic basins (e.g. Wilkes subglacial basin) are
465 easily excluded and smaller tectonic basins (e.g. the Vostok basin in East Antarctica) are relatively
466 rare. An overriding concern, however, is how to define overdeepenings as mappable landforms.

467 For many applications, the identification and mapping of overdeepenings as ‘subaerial’ closed-
468 depressions, which is a well-established definition (e.g. Fountain and Walder, 1998), would seem
469 to be appropriate. However, because the movement of ice, water and sediment at the base of an ice
470 sheet is driven largely by the ice surface gradient, overdeepenings mapped using our methods are
471 not necessarily ‘closed-depressions’ in a subglacial context. For example, an overdeepening will
472 only form a ‘closed-depression’ in the subglacial hydraulic gradient, thereby forming a lake, where
473 the ratio of adverse slope to ice surface slope gradients exceeds the ‘ponding’ threshold (Clarke,
474 2010). Further, the ‘surface’ of the subglacial lake will be inclined in the opposite direction to ice
475 flow, and the gradient of the subglacial lake ‘surface’ will vary in response to changes in ice-
476 surface and hydraulic gradients during glacial advance and retreat. For purposes of understanding
477 the formation of features that evolve over time periods that span many glacial cycles, the
478 dependence of such glaciological thresholds on the ice surface gradient means they are unsuitable
479 for the development of mapping criteria. Our approach may not therefore be suited to applications
480 that aim to understand specific glaciological purposes, but, in the absence of a more appropriate
481 definition, our approach provides an effective and robust method at the ice sheet scale.

482 The timescale of overdeepening formation nevertheless presents challenges for applications that
483 seek to relate overdeepening characteristics to former or present ice sheet parameters, as we have
484 attempted to achieve in our example test of a relationship between overdeepening ER and
485 overriding ice velocity. First, changes in ice-sheet flow configuration associated with ice sheet and
486 landscape evolution process that span many glacial cycles means some overdeepenings, perhaps in
487 particular ice sheet sectors, may have formed under conditions unlike those that have prevailed in
488 more recent ice sheet history. Second, changes in ice sheet geometry in response to shorter-term
489 climatic variations will affect ice flow patterns and subglacial hydrological gradients, meaning the
490 precise location of in- and out-flow points relevant over the time scale of overdeepening formation
491 can never be precisely known. Third, it has been proposed that spatial patterns of erosion and
492 sedimentation at the glacier bed, which are dictated by the ice surface gradient, mean
493 overdeepening morphology should maintain equilibrium with ice sheet geometry (e.g. Hooke,
494 1991; Alley et al., 2003). However, the timescales required for subglacial processes to produce
495 adjustments in overdeepening morphology in response to even slow changes in ice sheet geometry
496 are unknown and may mean that this assumption is invalid.

497 In light of the complex issues described above and poor knowledge of the geology beneath the
498 present ice sheets, our study has developed methods and criteria that utilise information on present
499 ice sheet flow and geometry and, in particular, that focus our analysis on depressions for which a
500 glaciological origin is most secure. This approach is particularly important for analysis of
501 overdeepening morphology because this requires identification of overdeepening adverse and
502 normal slopes and the exclusion of overdeepenings that do not appear to conform to present ice
503 flow configurations. Further, the latter involves a particular focus on features beneath
504 topographically constrained outlet glacier systems where ice-bed processes and characteristics are
505 most likely to demonstrate equilibria with present ice geometry. The first important consideration
506 therefore is the identification of depression in- and out-flow points, for which we utilised ice
507 surface elevation to infer the points where maximum ice flux enters and exits each depression
508 (section 4.1.3). Prediction of in- and out-flow points using calculated subglacial water fluxes are
509 unsuitable because flow is sensitive to subtle changes in ice-surface gradient that may cause flow
510 to ‘pond’ and deviate around the adverse slope. As we have indicated above (sections 4.1.1 and
511 4.1.2), without the presence of an overlying ice sheet, there will be significant uncertainty
512 concerning ice flow direction, especially for depressions in subglacial mountain ranges and across
513 large areas in the ice sheet interiors.

514 The second important consideration is overdeepening planform morphology and context because
515 overdeepenings that do not have simple ovoid forms and that are elongate in the direction of ice
516 flow are likely to be non-glacial or ‘relict’ features. These are therefore unlikely to possess
517 morphologies that are in equilibria with ice sheet processes. Criteria applied here utilised analyses
518 of planform shape, elongation and ice flow direction to exclude features with circular or complex
519 planform morphologies and with ovoid morphologies that are not elongate in the direction of ice
520 flow. Given that ice flow configurations in Greenland and Antarctica are likely to be stable over
521 many glacial cycles, and given that assumptions concerning overdeepening planform shape are
522 indeed valid, the application of these criteria should provide a very robust means of limiting the
523 mapped dataset to overdeepenings that are appropriate for the investigation of overdeepening
524 evolution and ice-erosion feedbacks. Nevertheless, because the majority of ice flow is organised
525 into outlet glacier or ice stream systems that occupy deep troughs that extend far into the ice sheet
526 interiors (e.g. Morlighem et al., 2014), further confidence can be achieved by means of excluding
527 overdeepenings that are not confined by step topography. For this study, the high relief threshold
528 used to define topographically confined overdeepenings (section 4.3) further limits the dataset to
529 overdeepenings in deep troughs where ice flow configuration is likely to be highly stable.

530 6.2 Relevance and scientific potential

531 The compilation of glacial-landform datasets alongside improvements in the resolution of
532 remotely sensed data has led to numerous and detailed analyses of subglacial phenomena across
533 palaeo-glaciated domains, including drumlins (Clark et al., 2009), glacial lineations (Greenwood
534 and Clark, 2009; Spagnolo et al., 2014; Stokes et al., 2013), meltwater channels (Margold et al.,
535 2011) and ribbed moraine (Dunlop and Clark, 2006). Much of this work has been driven by the
536 need to decipher the glaciological significance of such landforms, as well as the need to obtain
537 robust morphological data to enable testing of numerical models that simulate ice sheet and
538 landscape evolution processes (e.g. Evans, 2009; Jamieson et al., 2010; Melanson et al., 2013). For
539 overdeepenings, process understanding has been disadvantaged by an absence of quantitative
540 studies, meaning characterisation of overdeepening distribution and morphology falls far behind
541 that achieved for comparable glacial landforms, including cirques, valleys and drumlins. Given the
542 strong influence exerted by reverse bed slopes on subglacial hydrology, ice-flow dynamics and
543 ice-sheet stability (e.g. Cook and Swift, 2012), the acquisition of similar data for understanding of
544 overdeepening form and evolution is important. Moreover, comparison of overdeepening
545 morphology with ice sheet parameters has the potential to yield major advances.

546 In terms of ice sheet behaviour, overdeepenings are known to have potentially far-reaching
547 implications for ice, water and sediment movement. First, a large body of empirical (e.g. Iverson et
548 al., 1995) and theoretical work (e.g. Röthlisberger and Lang, 1987; Creyts and Clarke, 2010)
549 demonstrates that overdeepenings raise subglacial water pressures by reducing the transmissivity
550 of the subglacial drainage system, thus modify important boundary conditions that affect ice-bed
551 coupling and rates of basal sliding. Second, the amplitude and wavelength of topography at the ice
552 sheet bed is of fundamental significance to ice-sheet sliding laws (Schoof, 2005). Third, the
553 significance of overdeepenings for rapid ‘collapse’ of marine terminating outlet systems during
554 forced retreat has been demonstrated theoretically (Schoof, 2007) and empirically (e.g. Nick et al.
555 2009), although the backstress provided by reverse slopes indicates that overdeepenings beneath
556 grounded ice may have a stabilising influence on ice sheet flow. Given the availability of ice
557 velocity data and knowledge of subglacial topography, the possibility that overdeepenings promote
558 or resist ice flow according to the specific morphology of the adverse slope (cf. Cook and Swift,
559 2012) is therefore eminently testable. Further, a large dataset of overdeepening characteristics
560 enhances the potential to gain process-based insights by stimulating development and testing of
561 numerical ice-erosion models (e.g. Egholm et al., 2012).

562 Fundamental questions also remain in terms of overdeepening origin and evolution. Cook and
563 Swift (2012) propose that patterns of erosion and deposition that are dictated by the ice surface
564 gradient (cf. Hooke, 1991; Alley et al, 2003) mean all glacier and ice sheet beds should tend

565 toward a uniformly overdeepened long-profile, with deepest erosion occurring near the long-term
566 average equilibrium line altitude (ELA) (e.g. Hallet et al., 1996; Boulton, 1996; Anderson et al.,
567 2006). However, observations indicate that beds with multiple overdeepenings are common,
568 indicating that ice-water-sediment-erosion (IWSE) feedbacks produce very localised deep glacial
569 erosion by reinforcing patterns of erosion and sedimentation (e.g. Hooke, 1991; Alley et al., 2003)
570 and thereby act as an important constraint on overdeepening size and morphology (Cook and
571 Swift, 2012). The ability to map overdeepenings and compare quantitative information on their
572 morphology with information on ice sheet data offer significant potential to test assumptions
573 relating to the controls on overdeepening location and form. In addition, quantitative
574 measurements are again necessary to motivate and test numerical ice-erosion models. Notably,
575 parameterisation of IWSE processes in numerical ice-erosion models that couple the flow of ice,
576 water and sediment is now being realised (e.g. Egholm et al., 2012), and increasingly sophisticated
577 treatments of the ice flow (Egholm et al., 2011), erosion (e.g. Iverson, 2012) and water flow (e.g.
578 Werder et al., 2013), promising unprecedented ability to explore the implications of coupled IWSE
579 processes on the evolution of subglacial landscapes.

580 **6.3 Potential application to overdeepening form**

581 Exploration of the formation and evolution of overdeepenings under contemporary ice sheets
582 offers significant advantages. First, the presence of ice-cover means landform morphology in areas
583 of deep erosion is not obscured by postglacial sedimentation, which complicates analyses of
584 overdeepenings and other erosional features, including tunnel valleys, in palaeo settings (Huuse,
585 2000; Hansen et al., 2009; Preusser et al., 2010; Moreau and Huuse, 2014). Second, the data that
586 are available that describe ice sheet characteristics, including velocity and thermal regime, are
587 vastly superior to that which can be obtained for former ice sheets, for example from numerical
588 modelling. Third, the present ice sheets have remained largely stable features for much of the
589 recent geological past (e.g. Huybrechts, 1993), meaning landscapes and landforms shaped by
590 characteristically slow subglacial processes, and the ice sheets themselves, are more likely to have
591 achieved equilibrium forms that are in balance with climatic, glaciological and tectonic forces.
592 Further, the proposed ability of overdeepening form to maintain equilibrium with ice geometry
593 (see section 6.1) means the existence of subglacial sediments within overdeepenings does not
594 necessarily preclude the ability to obtain process insights.

595 Exploration of the full range of potential applications of our methods is beyond the scope of this
596 paper. Rather, as a single illustration of the potential power of our approach, we have tested for the
597 potential relationship between overdeepening ER and overriding ice velocity. It is nevertheless
598 recognised that evidence for such a relationship is not strong, and this motivates consideration of
599 data and methodological limitations that similar studies must address.

600 Whilst the limitations of available data are considered in the section below, methodological
601 limitations concern the validity of the proposal relationship and the ability of the data to provide a
602 robust test. The validity of the relationship is supported by analogy with a wide range of glacial
603 landforms and the statistical significance shown by the plots (Figure 11). Nevertheless, substantial
604 scatter could indicate a variety of confounding factors. First, numerous factors are likely to play a
605 role in overdeepening morphology. For example, it is likely that elongation ratio is influenced by
606 valley width, meaning width is constrained in a way that length is not, whilst erosion processes do
607 not necessarily scale linearly with ice velocity (cf. the likely influence on quarrying rates of
608 subglacial water pressure variation; e.g. Hooke, 1991; Egholm et al., 2012). Further consideration
609 also needs to be given to the significance of ‘nested’ depressions, which may indicate several
610 different processes and controls. Second, the likely timescales of overdeepening formation mean
611 measured ice velocity is not necessarily indicative of mean ice velocity over the timescale of
612 overdeepening formation. Third, the complexity of subglacial landscapes indicates that filtering
613 methods that attempt to exclude depressions that are unrelated to present ice flow configurations
614 may require refinement. For example, limiting the mapped dataset to elongated and
615 topographically confined depressions, which intends to focus analysis on overdeepenings in fast-
616 moving outlet glacier systems that extend inwards from the ice sheet margins, will not necessarily
617 exclude overdeepenings in buried mountain ranges in the interior of the East Antarctic Ice Sheet
618 that were formed under warm, early ice sheet conditions (e.g. Bo et al., 2009?) where ice is now
619 dominantly cold-based. Finally, the role of adverse slopes in providing backstress and elevating
620 basal water pressures means overdeepenings may accelerate or modulate velocity depending on
621 the specific morphology of the adverse slope.

622 These limitations and others are likely to be relevant to study of other aspects of overdeepening
623 form, including adverse slope morphology and its significance. Notably, sparse data on subglacial
624 process rates and sediment fluxes mean it is impossible to have confidence that overdeepening
625 morphologies are able to maintain equilibrium with ice sheet processes. For Antarctica in
626 particular, slower rates of subglacial erosion and sediment transport may result in overdeepening
627 morphologies remaining in permanent disequilibrium. In addition, modelling evidence indicates
628 rapid landscape evolution during initial glacial cycles, followed by relative landscape stability (e.g.
629 Jamieson et al., 2010; Kessler et al., 2008), meaning long-lived erosional features that include
630 overdeepenings reflect conditions that prevail early in ice sheet history and are not typical of the
631 present day. Finally, we recognise that different mapping approaches may be required where it is
632 necessary to understand the importance of specific subglacial processes. For example, the
633 subglacial lakes prevalence and morphology reflects ‘closed depressions’ in the subglacial
634 hydraulic gradient (e.g. Livingstone et al., 2013?) that are qualitatively and quantitatively different
635 from their topographic counterparts.

6.4 Data limitations, quality control, and methodological recommendations

637 The quality of mapping results and the process-based insights that can be obtained using
638 associated empirical data are dependent on the resolution and quality of available bed topography
639 data. In addition, artefacts may be introduced during interpolation of raw bed-elevation
640 measurements. For mapping and analysis of overdeepenings, automated methods can be used to
641 exclude artefact depressions, but these are not without problems.

642 A major limitation, particularly for Bedmap2, is the absolute uncertainty of large swathes of the
643 subglacial topography. For some areas of the East Antarctic interior, absolute bed-elevation
644 uncertainties range up to 1,008 m (Fretwell et al., 2013). Conversely, for the most recent DEM
645 covering Greenland (Bamber et al., (2013), some of the largest errors occur in the mountainous
646 coastal fjord regions where extrapolation, rather than interpolation, has been required to resolve
647 bed elevations. These fjord regions are prime locations for overdeepening development, where
648 topographic confinement dominates the configuration of outflowing ice. Nevertheless, comparison
649 of features mapped from large-scale datasets with those from higher resolution subset domains
650 (e.g. Fig. 10) reveals an encouraging level of consistency. Notably, for the Byrd Glacier
651 depression (Fig. 10 C–D), long-profile form (Fig. 10E) is resolved relatively well by Bedmap2 in
652 comparison to the higher-resolution product, with only minor differences in maximum absolute
653 depth. On the other hand, the size, form and number of smaller depressions in the Byrd Catchment
654 (Fig. 10C-D) is very much influenced by flightline density (Fig. 10A–B), and artefact depressions
655 created at flightline intersections by the interpolation method (i.e. kriging) are evident at both
656 dataset resolutions. Quality control criteria that remove such depressions, as applied in the
657 example study above, are therefore necessary regardless of resolution. Acquisition of even higher-
658 resolution datasets using novel extrapolation approaches (e.g. Morlighem et al., 2014) offers the
659 potential to further understand and improve bed-elevation uncertainties, but kriging is still required
660 where ice flow velocities are low and empirical ice thickness measurements are scarce. The
661 scarcity of empirical measurements across large areas of the present ice sheets means therefore
662 that significant areas of uncertainty will remain.

663 Morphological studies of subglacial phenomena thus require strict appreciation of the uncertainties
664 inherent within the source datasets. The application of multiple quality criteria to mapped results,
665 such as minimum flightline density, is viewed as essential to minimise the introduction of
666 unreliable or spurious data. As such, the limitations of existing subglacial topography datasets
667 mean that the subglacial area that is suitable for landform analyses of the kind presented here is
668 only a fraction of the total area (e.g. only 36% of the grounded Antarctic bed is constrained by
669 measured data at a 5 km resolution in Bedmap2). Formerly glaciated areas on the adjacent
670 continental shelves offer potential to greatly increase the mappable area: for example, studies in

671 Antarctica show that glacial and post-glacial sedimentation in offshore areas may be only 4-5 m
672 thick (e.g. Dowdeswell et al., 2004) and is therefore well below the minimum bed elevation
673 uncertainty in subglacial areas. However, detailed sediment thickness data for offshore areas is
674 available for only restricted areas, and there is limited potential to relate landform location and
675 morphology to ice sheet parameters. In addition, fjord depths are poorly constrained along much of
676 the Greenland coastline, meaning subglacial and offshore topographies are often mismatched by as
677 much as several hundred metres (Bamber et al., 2013). Further strategic data collection is therefore
678 required to address areas of uncertainty, both in the interiors of ice sheets and at present ice-sheet
679 margins.

680 **7. Conclusions**

681 The publication of relatively high-resolution bed-topography datasets covering the entire Antarctic
682 and Greenland ice sheets (Bamber et al., 2013; Fretwell et al., 2013) provides a major opportunity
683 to advance our understanding of the evolution of subglacial landscapes and relationships or
684 feedbacks between ice sheet and landforming processes. Overdeepenings are a key landform in
685 this respect because of the lack of consensus on their origin and their far-reaching influence on
686 critical ice-bed processes and ice-sheet behaviour (cf. Cook and Swift, 2012). To address the need
687 for quantitative data on overdeepening characteristics, we have explored automated methods for
688 mapping glacial overdeepenings and the extraction of metrics that describe their form. Our main
689 methodological findings can be summarised as follows:

- 690 • Hydrological tools and terrain filtering methods fail to adequately capture the complex
691 morphologies of overdeepenings, primarily because terrain filtering lacks precise
692 thresholds required for delimiting closed-depression boundaries and because both methods
693 lack the ability to resolve depression nesting.
- 694 • A novel rule-based GIS method has been proposed that quantitatively tracks changes in
695 the length of closed-contours from initial points of elevation minima. This method
696 provides consistent, morphologically based mapping results and is computationally
697 efficient at ice sheet scales. Its application is therefore not dependent on a particular bed-
698 dataset resolution, requires no abstract threshold parameters to be defined, and is unlikely
699 to be restricted or compromised by anticipated improvements in dataset quality and detail.
- 700 • The limitations of available datasets mean that mapped features require robust scrutiny. A
701 suite of simple quality control criteria that are applicable to the 1 km gridded datasets for
702 Greenland and Antarctica have been proposed that may be adapted according to the nature
703 of the bed-topography dataset or the specific focus of a given study.

704 In addition, we have illustrated our method by testing a proposed relationship between
705 overdeepening elongation ratio and overriding ice velocity for a large sample of depressions
706 mapped beneath the Antarctic and Greenland ice sheets, and discuss the potential insights and
707 limitations that are demonstrated by such an approach. We conclude that:

- 708 • The ability to relate overdeepening characteristics to present ice sheet characteristics
709 indicates significant potential to gain insight into critical ice-bed processes, including
710 those that influence the location, timescale and nature of overdeepening formation, and the
711 co-evolution of ice sheets and their subglacial topographies. However, the limitations of
712 present datasets and the simplicity of our approach mean that strong statistical
713 relationships cannot necessarily be expected.
- 714 • Quality criteria are necessary when analysing subglacial topography datasets. Criteria can
715 avoid the inclusion of spurious depressions arising from DEM artefacts and address
716 limitations associated with the density and accuracy of empirical bed-elevation
717 measurements. However, the level of insight that can be acquired is dependent upon the
718 quality of the metrics that such data permit.
- 719 • Qualified relationships between overdeepening ER and ice velocity were found and, given
720 anticipated improvements in dataset accuracy and resolution, further work is needed to
721 better resolve them. Possible confounding factors include the existence of additional
722 controls on overdeepening length or width and the long timescale of overdeepening
723 formation relative to that of climatic changes that influence present ice velocities.
- 724 • The significance of reverse bed-slopes in glacial systems (Cook and Swift, 2012) indicates
725 that the introduction of overdeepenings into ice sheet beds is itself expected to modulate
726 ice velocities, meaning overdeepening metrics may demonstrate non-linear relationships
727 with ice velocity that reflect a more fundamental process of ice sheet co-evolution with the
728 underlying topography.

729 This work demonstrates that mapping and analysis of even the largest subglacial landforms,
730 including troughs, cirques and overdeepenings, will be an exercise marked with varying aspects of
731 uncertainty that requires strict quality control procedures and close scrutiny of mapping and metric
732 outputs. Nevertheless, anticipated improvements in the accuracy and resolution of bed-topography
733 datasets, including novel extrapolation methods that utilise surface ice velocities, will reduce the
734 need for quality control procedures and achieve convergence of measured landform attributes on
735 ‘true’ values that will facilitate increasingly robust insights from empirical data. We encourage
736 collaboration between the geomorphological, glaciological and numerical modelling communities
737 to identify real and simulated landscape features and IWSE feedbacks that maximise the potential
738 to test simulated landscapes and to expedite process understanding.

739 **Acknowledgements**

740 DAS and HP acknowledge funding from the National Cooperative for the Disposal of Radioactive
741 Waste (NAGRA). We acknowledge the use of data and/or data products from CReSIS generated
742 with support from NSF grant ANT-0424589 and NASA Operation IceBridge grant
743 NNX13AD53A. Discussions with Andrew Sole and Jeremy Ely helped to advance ideas produced
744 in this study, and are gratefully acknowledged.

745 **Table captions**

746 Table 1: Merits of alternative methods for identification of in- and out-flow points of individual
747 enclosed-depressions. Methods are listed in order of preference.

748 **Figure captions**

749 Figure 1: Examples of overdeepenings beneath contemporary and palaeo ice sheets. (A) Subglacial
750 Lake Ellsworth in East Antarctica (Ross et al., 2011) occupies an overdeepening in a major
751 subglacial trough that cross-cuts the Ellsworth subglacial mountains (figure courtesy Neil Ross).
752 (B) The post-glacial lake Veitastondvatnet, shown in an oblique aerial view looking due SW,
753 occupies an overdeepening in a sinuous trough confined by the steep topography of the Sognefjord
754 region, Norway. The lake is approximately 17 km long (image: Google Earth). (C) Trough-floor
755 profiles for Jakobshavn Isbrae, Greenland, and Recovery Glacier, Antarctica, derived from bed
756 topography datasets (Bamber et al., 2013; Fretwell et al., 2013) exhibit numerous overdeepenings.
757 Colours highlight reverse-bed slopes: red indicates slope gradients that exceed the supercooling
758 threshold (cf. Alley et al., 2003); blue indicates slope gradients that exceed the ponding threshold
759 (cf. Clarke, 2005). (D) Bathymetry of the bedrock basin occupied by post-glacial Lago Fagnano,
760 Tierra del Fuego, derived from high-resolution single-channel seismic data, showing numerous
761 ‘child’ basins in black nested within the ‘parent’ overdeepening (here defined by the present lake
762 margin). Glacial erosion has been conditioned by tectonic processes and the location of numerous
763 faults. MF: Martínez fault; RT: Río Turbio fault; RC: Río Claro fault. Figure modified from
764 Esteban et al. (2014) .

765 Figure 2: Cartoon showing the long-profile of a subglacial ‘parent’ depression containing nested
766 ‘child’ depressions. Various metrics that can be used to describe the form the depression and
767 associated child depressions are defined that can be extracted using GIS-based techniques.

768 Figure 3: Potential methods for identifying overdeepenings from the subglacial Bedmap2 DEM:
769 A) the application of hydrological tools by means of ‘filling’ sinks (i.e. closed-depressions). The

770 inappropriateness of this method is highlighted by the application to differently sized domains: the
771 visible boxed domain (red) and the entire Bedmap2 domain (blue). B) The application of ‘terrain
772 filtering’, using a low-pass, circular (200 km) Gaussian filter and a standard deviation value of 25.
773 Negative residuals (original elevation values minus filtered elevation values) ≤ -450 m are draped
774 over the original Bedmap2 topography.

775 Figure 5: Identification of elevation minima. (A) Initial Bedmap2 DEM; (B) quantitative terrain
776 analysis mask identifying areas of depression-like topography (see text); and (C) points of
777 elevation minima within enclosed depressions (closed contours) contained by the terrain analysis
778 mask.

779 Figure 6: Identification of enclosed-depression perimeters and their nestings using the contour
780 tracking method. (A) Linear transects drawn from each elevation minima intersect with contours.
781 The length change between adjacent contours is calculated to identify abrupt increases in contour
782 length that indicate that a contour is beyond the contour that defines the closed-depression
783 perimeter (see text). (B) Parent and child depressions are identified using multiple-passes of the
784 contour-tracking algorithm and using a threshold contour-length increase of $> 190\%$ (break of
785 slope) to identify the closed-depression boundary. (C) Parent and child depressions classified
786 using a top-down approach.

787 Figure 7: Cartoon illustrating the use of the ice-surface elevation data to identify of overdeepening
788 in- and out-flow points for an elongate overdeepening oriented in the direction of ice flow.
789 Topographic focussing of ice flow into the overdeepening means these points are suitable proxies
790 for the principal overdeepening entry and exit points in terms of the greatest ice flux.

791 Figure 8: Identification of overdeepening in- and outflow points using ice surface elevation data
792 (cf. Fig. 7) and overdeepening long-profiles. (A) Ice-surface elevation (coloured scale) draped over
793 the Bedmap2 subglacial topography (hillshaded DEM beneath the colour). (B) In- and out-flow
794 points of parent depressions identified from (A) and long profiles, comprising adverse and normal
795 slopes, calculated using a ‘least-cost’ routing analysis (see text).

796 Figure 9: Depression-shape classification methods and results. (A) Parent depressions enclosed by
797 a polygon representing the smallest rectangle possible by area. (B) A magnified view of the
798 depression boxed in red in (A) showing the bounding rectangle and transects (red lines oriented
799 perpendicular to the least-cost path) used to calculate depression mean width. (C) Example
800 classification output.

801 Figure 10: Comparison of subglacial topography, flightline density, and mapping outputs for
802 Bedmap2 versus a higher resolution dataset (CReSIS; see text) covering a sector of the Byrd
803 Glacier catchment. (A–B) Radar flightline tracks (black) and interpolated subglacial topography
804 (see legend in B). (C–D) Mapping results, showing differences in the shape, size and number of
805 parent and child depressions as a consequence of interpolation of data from contrasting flightline
806 densities to produce datasets with contrasting resolutions. (E) Long-profiles for transect A–A' in
807 (C) and (D).

808 Figure 11: Example application of data on overdeepening form, showing overdeepening
809 elongation ratio versus ice-surface velocity above the overdeepening minima for (A) Antarctica
810 and (B) Greenland. Red points are overdeepenings that are elongated in the direction of ice flow;
811 green points are the subset of these overdeepenings that have been classified as topographically
812 confined. Values for best-fit regression lines show the significance of the regression relationship;
813 R^2 values are ≤ 0.03 , reflecting considerable scatter that is discussed in the text.