IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON GEOSCIENCE AND REMOTE SENSING, 2022

# A new spectral harmonization algorithm for Landsat-8 and Sentinel-2 remote sensing reflectance products using machine learning: a case study for the Barents Sea (European Arctic)

Muhammad Asim, Atsushi Matsuoka, Pål Gunnar Ellingsen, Camilla Brekke, Member IEEE, Torbjørn Eltoft, Member IEEE, and Katalin Blix

Abstract—The synergistic use of Landsat-8 Operational Land Imager (OLI) and Sentinel-2 Multispectral Instrument (MSI) 2 data products provides an excellent opportunity to monitor 3 the dynamics of aquatic ecosystems. However, the merging of data products from multi-sensors is often adversely affected 5 by the difference in their spectral characteristics. In addition, 6 the errors in the atmospheric correction (AC) methods further increase the inconsistencies in downstream products. This work proposes an improved spectral harmonization method for OLI 9 and MSI-derived remote sensing reflectance  $(R_{rs})$  products, 10 which significantly reduces uncertainties compared to those 11 in the literature. We compared the  $R_{rs}$  retrieved via state-12 of-the-art AC processors, i.e., Acolite, C2RCC, and Polymer, 13 against ship-based in-situ  $R_{rs}$  observations obtained from the 14 Barents Sea waters, including a wide range of optical properties. 15 Results suggest that the Acolite-derived  $R_{rs}$  has a minimum bias 16 for our study area with median absolute percent difference 17 (MAPD) varying from 9 to 25% in the blue-green bands. 18 To spectrally merge OLI and MSI, we develop and apply a 19 new machine learning-based bandpass adjustment (BA) model 20 to near-simultaneous OLI and MSI images acquired in the 21 years from 2018 to 2020. Compared to a conventional linear 22 adjustment, we demonstrate that the spectral difference is 23 significantly reduced from  $\sim 6$  to 12% to  $\sim 2$  to < 10% in the 24 common OLI-MSI bands using the proposed BA model. The 25 findings of this study are useful for the combined use of OLI 26 and MSI R<sub>rs</sub> products for water quality monitoring applications. 27 The proposed method has the potential to be applied to other 28 waters. 29

Index Terms-Barents Sea, Ocean Color, intersensor-30 31 comparison, remote sensing reflectance, machine learning.

32

#### I. INTRODUCTION

THE Barents Sea is the northernmost Arctic shelf sea and 33 one of the most productive oceans in the world [1]. It 34 contributes up to 40% of the total primary production in the 35 Arctic system [2] and represents an ultimate region for ex-36 ploring and monitoring the impact of Arctic climate change 37

M. Asim, K. Blix, C. Brekke and T. Eltoft are with the Department of Physics and Technology, UiT The Arctic University of Norway (UiT), Tromsø, Norway, e-mails: {muhammad.asim, camilla.brekke, torbiørn.eltoft}@uit.no.

A. Matsuoka is with the Institute for the Study of Earth, Oceans, and Space, University of New Hampshire, Durham, NH, 03824, USA, e-mail: {atsushi.matsuoka}@unh.edu.

P. Ellingsen is with the Department of Electrical Engineering, UiT The Arctic University of Norway, Narvik, Norway, e-mail: {pal.g.ellingsen}@uit.no.

[1]. The Barents Sea is experiencing significant alterations 38 in its physical and biological characteristics in response to the ongoing global warming [3], [4]. The surface is exposed to prolonged exposure to sunlight during summer and fall, leading to a decrease in sea ice extent and an increase in the production and seasonal growth of phytoplankton [4].

1

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

Understanding the effect of altered physical and environmental conditions on the ecosystem of the transitional Barents Sea requires temporally frequent monitoring of the biogeochemical changes occurring in the water columns [5]. Traditional ship-based sampling takes place discontinuously, is time-consuming, and is expensive. Alternatively, satellite derived remote sensing reflectance  $(R_{rs})$  can be used to derive in-water constituents, such as Chlorophyll-a (Chl-a), offers broad spatial coverage, repeated overpasses, and is of relatively low cost [6], [7]. Accurate and consistent retrieval of  $R_{rs}$  is therefore a vital step towards the estimation of biogeochemical quantities from remotely sensed data [8].

Capturing an abrupt biological phenomenon such as phytoplankton spring blooms from space requires the acquisition of ocean color imagery with short time intervals (2-3 days) at a high spatial resolution (< 60 m) [9], [10]. However, most of the existing ocean color sensors with a higher temporal resolution, including the Ocean and Land Color Imager (OLCI) onboard Sentinel-3A/B, Moderate Resolution Imaging Spectroradiometer (MODIS), Geostationary Ocean Color Imager (GOCI), Visible Infrared Imaging Radiometer Suite (VIIRS), Second-generation Global Imager (SGLI), as well as the upcoming PACE Ocean Color Instrument (PACE-OCI), have a much coarser spatial resolution (250-1000 m). This reduces their suitability for detecting fine features in natural waters [11], [12].

In contrast, high spatial resolution satellite sensors such 71 as the Operational Land Imager (OLI) on-board Landsat-8 72 (L8) and the Multispectral Imager (MSI) on-board Sentinel-73 2A/2B (S2-A/B) with spatial resolution <60 m, have consid-74 erable potential for observing the optical quality of water 75 bodies with more spatially-detailed information not feasible 76 with other ocean color sensors. However, these two sensors 77 have individually a low-frequency revisit time of 16 days for 78 OLI and 5 days for MSI, respectively, [13], not sufficient for 79 near-daily monitoring of the water surface [11]. 80

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

The optical remote sensing of the Barents Sea is asso-81 ciated with several challenges. Being an aquatic system 82 in the high north, it experiences polar night during the 83 winter season and is frequently covered by clouds in the 84 summer, which severely limits the availability of cloud-free 85 scenes to work with. Furthermore, for accurate retrieval 86 of water quality (WQ) parameters, the elimination of the 87 atmospheric influence is essential. Atmospheric correction 88 (AC) is particularly challenging in the high north due to 89 long ray paths caused by the higher solar zenith angles and 90 adjacency of sea ice, and there is uncertainty associated 91 with the validity of existing AC methods [14]. 92

To optimize the availability of ocean color data for 93 regular monitoring of the Barents Sea waters during sum-94 mer months, it would be most favourable to combine 95 MSI and OLI observations [13]. L8 OLI and S2 MSI have 96 the same band design and provide similar observations; 97 however, they are not strictly identical. These sensors have 98 different fields of view (FOV), spatial resolution, spectral 99 bandwidth, and spectral response functions (SRFs) [9], [15]. 100 Such differences lead to inconsistencies in downstream data 101 products such as the  $R_{rs}$  and the biogeochemical quantities 102 derived from diagnostic  $R_{rs}$  signature [16]. The differences 103 introduced by spatial resolution and FOV can be reduced by 104 minimizing the bidirectional reflectance distribution factors 105 (BRDFs) [17]; however, the spectral differences caused by 106 SRF's and spectral bandwidths remain a challenging task for 107 developing seamless products. The difference in the SRFs' 108 of the sensors increases the differences in the pixel values, 109 which in turn create variations in spectral index values and 110 can lead to misinterpretations of the results [16]. 111

<sup>112</sup> In this paper, we study the merging of MSI and OLI <sup>113</sup> imagery for water surface monitoring in the high north by <sup>114</sup> addressing two key aspects: i) We investigate whether the <sup>115</sup> use of standard AC algorithms results in realistic  $R_r s$  values <sup>116</sup> at these latitudes. ii) We develop a comprehensive method <sup>117</sup> for merging OLI and MSI data products by introducing a <sup>118</sup> new band adjustment (BA) method.

It is noted that to account for the differences in relative 119 SRF's of S2 MSI and L8 OLI, most of the previous studies 120 have either used linear regression or fixed per-band regres-121 sion coefficients to reduce the spectral difference between 122 L8 and S2-derived R<sub>rs</sub> products [9], [11], [15], [18], [19]. 123 Pahlevan et al. used a machine learning (ML) based tech-124 nique, originally developed in [20], to predict MSI-derived 125  $R_{rs}$  from those derived from OLI [10]. They simulated 126 hyperspectral  $\rho_t$  using MODTRAN code for each matchup 127 site and processed through SeaDAS to generate  $R_{rs}$  using 128 vicarious gains. Similarly authors in [21] used simulated 129 MSI-OLI synergies to monitor dissolved organic carbon 130 (DOC) fluxes in Arctic rivers [21]. With a goal of producing 131 consistent multi-mission global WQ indicators, the authors 132 in [22] evaluated the performance of retrieval models for 133 estimating WQ indicators from near-simultaneous images 134 of OLI, MSI, and OLCI sensors. Wang et al. evaluated the 135 consistency of suspended particulate matter (SPM) concen-136 trations retrieved from same-day OLI-MSI overpasses in 137 turbid waters and reported that the consistency in SPM 138

concentrations is highly dependent on the performance of 139 the AC [23]. Some studies have used combined OLI-MSI 140 images to enable the monitoring of lake and river waters; 141 however, the cross-sensor performance was validated using 142 only 1-4 coincident same-day overpasses [24]-[26]. Other 143 studies have evaluated the spectral consistency between 144 OLI-MSI R<sub>rs</sub> products without validating against the in-145 situ  $R_{rs}$  data [18], [19], [27]–[29]. This leads to uncertainties 146 in satellite-derived  $R_{rs}$  estimates, which in turn affect the 147 estimation of biogeochemical quantities [8]. As per our 148 knowledge, no study has been reported on the validation of 149 AC using S2 or L8 in the Barents Sea, restricting match-ups 150 in the time window of within ±3 hours recommended for 151 validating ocean color products [30]. 152

To achieve spectral harmonization of OLI-MSI R<sub>rs</sub> prod-153 ucts over Barents Sea waters, the present study first eval-154 uates the performance of three state-of-the-art AC models, 155 C2RCC [31], Acolite [32] and Polymer [33] against ship-156 based in-situ  $R_{rs}$  observations. The aforementioned step 157 ensures realistic  $R_{rs}$  estimates from satellite images for the 158 study region. The top performing AC scheme was then se-159 lected to estimate  $R_{rs}$  products from near-simultaneous OLI 160 and MSI images over the Barents Sea region from the year 161 2018 to 2020, limiting the difference in observations to <30 162 minutes. Instead of fitting the transformation coefficients 163 of a linear regression model, we propose a new ML-based 164 spectral bandpass adjustment (BA) method for spectral 165 alignment of OLI-MSI R<sub>rs</sub> products. The proposed spectral 166 BA method is based on a feedforward multilayer perceptron 167 (MLP) developed previously for a different application and 168 data in [34]. The neural network (NN)-based model is 169 tuned to spectrally adjust S2-A/B radiometry to replicate 170 the spectral bandpasses of L8 for the common bands on 171 both sensors. To the best of our knowledge, no such study 172 has been conducted to explore the efficiency of NNs in 173 improving the spectral alignment of OLI-MSI  $R_{rs}$  products, 174 particularly over high latitude waters. 175

Our study provides a detailed analysis of the performance of the three aforementioned AC schemes compared against in-situ  $R_{rs}$  observations and an evaluation of inter-sensor spectral consistency between OLI and MSI images based on the new BA method. A flow-chart of the work is shown in Fig. 1. The major contributions of the present study are as follows:

- We have collected ship-based above-water  $R_{rs}$  measurements continuously over the course of the ship's route. This novel dataset covers a wide array of atmospheric and aquatic conditions in the Barent Sea.
- Considering in-situ *R<sub>rs</sub>* data as a ground truth, performance of Acolite, C2RCC, and Polymer AC schemes are examined.
- We have evaluated the spectral consistency between real L8 and S2 images over the Barents Sea region from 2018 to 2020. To ensure similar aquatic and environmental conditions for inter-sensor comparison, we have considered observations acquired from nearly simultaneous overpasses (< 30 minutes).
- To minimize the spectral differences in  $R_{rs}$  products, 196

IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON GEOSCIENCE AND REMOTE SENSING, 2022.

Spatially overlapping Time difference < 30 minutes Data acquisition **OLI-MSI** scenes Cloud cover < 30% Atmospheric Correction and Match-ups selection Validation against in-situ  $R_{rs}$ Acolite- R<sub>rs</sub> Pre-processing Inter-comparisons steps OLI-MSI R<sub>rs</sub> intercomparisons selection Spectral alignment of Spectral Bandpass Adjustment OLI-MSI R<sub>rs</sub> products  $MSI^* = F(W \times MSI + B)$ Harmonized OLI R<sub>rs</sub>  $MSI^* R_{rs}$ OLI - MSI\* R<sub>rs</sub>

Fig. 1: Flow chart of the proposed spectral harmonization approach with major steps of analysis. i) OLI-MSI scenes acquisition at the top of the atmospheres (TOA) with spatially overlapping region. ii) Validation of Atmospheric correction schemes against the in-situ  $R_{rs}$ . The AC scheme in good agreement with in-situ  $R_{rs}$  is selected to process near-simultaneous OLI-MSI images. iii) The MSI  $R_{rs}$  products are bandpass adjusted to that of OLI  $R_{rs}$  products. The proposed BA model minimize the spectral difference in OLI-MSI  $R_{rs}$  products. *W* and *B* represents weights and biases of the BA model.

we propose a new NN-based algorithm for spectral BA 197 of S2 MSI  $R_{rs}$ , using L8 OLI  $R_{rs}$  products as a reference. 198 The present paper is organized as follows: Section 199 II briefly discusses the proposed spectral harmonization 200 method, the AC processors, and the new BA algorithm. 201 Section III presents information on the in-situ and satellite 202 data collection followed by the main methodology, which 203 comprises of two major prepossessing steps, i.e., match-204 up section (III-B2) and inter-comparison selection (III-B2) 205 before the spectral alignment of OLI-MSI images presented 206 in section III-D. The experimental results are discussed 207 in section IV, which elaborates on the performance of 208 AC schemes against the in-situ  $R_{rs}$  followed by inter-209 comparisons of OLI and MSI  $R_{rs}$  products before and 210 after spectral alignment of OLI-MSI R<sub>rs</sub> products. Finally, 211 conclusions are drawn in section V. 212

213

#### II. SPECTRAL HARMONIZATION

To harmonize the remote sensing reflectance  $(R_{rs})$  data 214 from Landsat-8 (L8) and Sentinel-2 (S2) into a single 215 dataset, correction factors must be applied to mitigate the 216 spectral differences in their  $R_{rs}$  products [13]. Previous 217 studies have used linear regression models to adjust S2 218 radiometry to replicate the spectral bandpasses of L8 [9], 219 [11], [15]. The spectral bandpass adjustment (BA) converts 220 atmospherically corrected S2-derived Rrs products to L8-221 derived products. Therefore, atmospheric correction (AC) is 222 an important step in order to ensure reliable input data 223 before spectral harmonization of their data products. There 224 are several AC algorithms that can be used for spectral 225

harmonization of these sensors. However, the performances 226 of these methods have not yet been evaluated for the 227 Barents Sea waters. This might be due to the lack of in-228 situ radiometric data. In this work, we first evaluate the 229 performance of AC processors against in-situ observations. 230 The  $R_{rs}$  retrieved via top performing AC scheme was then 231 used to harmonize L8 and S2-derived Rrs products using 232 the proposed machine learning (ML)-based spectral BA 233 method. In the following subsections (II-A and II-B), we 234 have briefly described the AC processors; the data used for 235 validation of AC methods and the spectral alignment of S2 236 and L8  $R_{rs}$  products. More details are provided in section 237 III. 238

# A. AC evaluation

# 1) Data: Sentinel-2A/B (S2-A/B) MultiSpectal Instrument240(MSI) images with a time gap of $\pm 3$ hours of in-situ241observations (see Section III-B1) acquired in the year 2021242were used to compare the AC algorithms' performances243(hereafter referred to as match-ups; see Section III-B2 for244details).245

2) AC processors: The goal of AC is to accurately retrieve  $R_rs$  from the received satellite signal  $rho_t$ . In this work, we have compared the performance of three AC processors. 248 C2RCC v1.0 [31], Polymer v4.13 [33], and Acolite version 20211124.0 [32]. 250

These AC processors have significant differences in their 251 methods. The Acolite dark spectrum fitting (DSF) scheme relies on black pixel assumption and includes an aerosol 253 model. This scheme is recommended for clear and mixed 254

239

clear/turbid waters [35]. The C2RCC AC is a machine 255 learning (ML)-based scheme where the neural networks 256 (NNs) are trained on different water types and extreme 257 ranges of scattering and absorption properties [31]. The 258 Polymer scheme, which was primarily developed to work 259 in sun glint regions [33] does not make a black pixel 260 assumption or include an aerosol model, but works on the 261 principle of the per-pixel spectral matching method. These 262 AC processors have shown reasonable success in processing 263 high resolution sensor imagery such as L8 and S2 imagery 264 over global oceanic waters having various optical properties 265 to extremely turbid inland waters [5], [7], [8], [35], [36]. 266 Yet none of them have been evaluated in the Barents Sea 267 region. It should be noted that there is currently no ideal 268 AC processor available for generating seamless  $R_r s$  products 269 from these sensors. 270

#### 271 B. Spectral BA method

1) Data: To harmonize the  $R_{rs}$  products from L8 Operational Land Imager (OLI) and S2 MSI sensors, we have used near-simultaneous overpasses with a time-difference of  $\leq \pm 30$  minutes from April to September for 2018-2020 (hereafter referred to as inter-comparisons; see section III-C for details).

278 2) Method: In the present study, a new machine learning 279 (ML) based algorithm using a fully connected feed-forward 280 Multi-Layer Perceptron (MLP) is developed to minimize 281 the spectral difference between OLI-MSI  $R_{rs}$  products. The 282 architecture and systematic system diagram illustrating the 283 main components of the proposed BA method are given in 284 section III-D.

#### 285

#### III. MATERIALS AND METHOD

## 286 A. Satellite data

In this study, S2-A/B MSI and L8 OLI imagery are used. Details on band characteristics of these satellite sensors are provided in Table. I. Level 1C MSI and Level 1T OLI collection-1 data, calibrated top-of-atmosphere (TOA) reflectance ( $\rho_t$ ), were acquired from ESA's Copernicus Open Access Hub (https://scihub.copernicus.eu/) and Earth Explorer (https://earthexplorer.usgs.gov/), respectively.

# 294 B. Match-ups

1) In-situ data collection and processing: The in-situ 295 above-water measurements were assembled from multiple 296 field campaigns in the year 2021 aboard the Norwegian 297 icebreaker R/V Kronprins Haakon. The data were collected 298 autonomously while the ship was at sea and cover a broad 299 range of aquatic and environmental conditions. A set of 300 TRIOS RAMSES hyper-spectral radiometers (two radiance 301 sensors and one irradiance sensor) were mounted on the 302 ship to collect radiometric data in a spectral range from 303 320 to 950 nm at  $\sim$ 3 nm resolution, and an integration time 304 of 30 seconds. During each campaign, in addition to the 305 predefined sampling stations where the ship was left free 306 to float during the field measurements, in-situ data were 307

also collected along the transect. This data is the longest record of in-situ radiometric measurements in the Barents Sea in Norwegian territorial waters. In terms of matchup scenes, only S2 cloud-free images with a time gap of  $\pm 3$  hours with the in-situ observations in the year 2021, are shown in Fig. 2.

4

The radiometric quantity utilized in this study is the 314 remote sensing reflectance,  $R_{rs}$ , defined as  $L_w(0^+)/E_d(0^+)$ 315 [37]. Here  $L_w(0^+)$  and  $E_d(0^+)$  are the water-leaving radiance 316 and downwelling irradiance measured just above the water 317 surface. The  $R_{rs}$  is computed using the procedure given in 318 [38]. The processed in-situ  $R_{rs}$  spectra were then filtered to 319 eliminate the remaining erroneous measurements using the 320 criteria defined in [7], [38] with some slight modifications 321 as follows: 322

- Mean  $R_{rs}$  intensity in range (350-400 nm)  $_{323} \ge -0.0005 \text{ sr}^{-1}$  to ensure that spectra are not  $_{324}$  significantly negative in the ultraviolet range.  $_{325}$
- Mean  $R_{rs}$  intensity in range (800-900 nm)  ${}_{326} \ge -0.0005 \text{ sr}^{-1}$  to remove spectra that are significantly  ${}_{327}$  negative in this range of NIR region.  ${}_{328}$
- Maximum  $R_{rs}$  intensity  $\leq 0.03 \text{ sr}^{-1}$  to remove spectra 329 affected by sun glint and foam. 330
- In order to exclude the measurements effected by direct solar transmittance, ship shadows and reflections, the ship log data, i.e, the ship heading from North, and solar azimuth angles were used to maintain the viewing relative azimuth angle between sensors and the sun in the range ( $90 < \Delta\Phi < 180$ ).

In addition to the above-mentioned criteria, the in-situ 337  $R_{rs}$  spectra were excluded if the sun zenith angle > 65°. 338 The in-situ spectra that passed the above criteria were av-339 eraged over the spectral response of the MSI acquired from 340 (https://earth.esa.int/web/sentinel/user-guides/sentinel-2-341 msi/document-library/). The processed in-situ  $R_{rs}$  spectra 342 after weighted averaged over the spectral response of the 343 MSI, are shown in Fig. 4. 344

In this study, bidirectional water correction was not 345 applied for neither in-situ nor satellite-derived  $R_{rs}$  data [7], 346 [39]. This is because i) the bidirectional contribution from 347 water is generally small [39], and ii) we wanted to minimize 348 the additional uncertainties that could be associated with 349 the correction (e.g., glint, boat disturbances, sky reflectance, 350 etc.). It should be noted that the Acolite DSF method does 351 not take into account the bidirectional correction, so a 352 direct comparison is not possible [40]. 353

2) Match-ups selection: In this work, the comparison 354 between in-situ  $R_{rs}$  and atmospherically corrected  $R_{rs}$  is 355 carried out for S2 MSI images only; the nearest L8 over-356 passes have high zenith angles (> 70°) and are therefore 357 not included in the match-up analysis. For a match-up 358 selection, Rrs data were taken from re-sampled S2 images 359 over a window of  $3 \times 3 R_{rs}$  pixels (equivalent to  $180 \times 180$  m) 360 centered around the in-situ location [10], [44]. A median 361 value of  $R_{rs}$  pixels that passed the quality flags was selected 362 to best represent a match-up. To prevent overlap between 363 the match-ups, the distance between the central pixel of 364 the  $3 \times 3$  pixels window should be greater than 180 m365

5

IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON GEOSCIENCE AND REMOTE SENSING, 2022.



Fig. 2: Geographic location of (a) the in-situ radiometric spectra that passed the quality control procedures and nearcoincident with Sentinel-2A/B overpasses, are represented by different legends. b) closeup showing a matching transect. (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the web version of this article.)

	Landsat-8 OLI		Sentinel-2A/B MSI	
Swath/field of view Altitude Bands	180 km/15° 705 km Wavelength [nm] (Band center)	Spatial Resolution [m]	290 km/20.6° 786 km Wavelength [nm] (Band center)	Spatial Resolution [m]
Coastal aerosol	435-451 (443)	30	433-453 (443)	60
Blue	452-512 (482)	30	458-523 (490)	10
Green	525-600 (561)	30	543-578 (560)	10
Red	636-673 (655)	10	650-679 (664)	10
Red edge			698-793 (705)	20
Ū.			733-748 (740)	20
			773-793 (783)	20
NIR	851-879 (865)	30	785-900 (842)	10
			855-875 (865)	20
SWIR	1566-1651 (1609)	30	1565-1655 (1610)	20
SWIR	2107-2294 (2201)	30	2100-2280 (2190)	20

Authorized licensed use limited to: UIT The Arctic University of Norway. Downloaded on January 18,2023 at 14:09:44 UTC from IEEE Xplore. Restrictions apply

TABLE I: Sentinel-2A/B MSI and Landsat-8 OLI spectral bands and spatial characteristics [9], [15], [24], [41]–[43].

from the central pixel of the preceding match-up. Pixels 366 contaminated by adjacent land, cloud cover, and sun glint 367 were masked using the AC pixel quality flags in the default 368 settings. The spectra were discarded if  $R_{rs}$  value higher 369 than 1 or less than  $-0.0005 \,\mathrm{sr}^{-1}$  at any wavelength [7]. In 370 addition, a match-up was discarded if the number of valid 371 pixels were < 5 or failed to pass the homogeneity test, i.e. 372 coefficient of variation (CV) < 0.15 for bands at 443, 492 373 and 560 nm [30]. 374

Though we have collected continuous ship-based data from the year 2021, allowing a time window of  $\pm$  3 hours [30], we achieved four cloud-free S2 match-up scenes. This 377 is due to the frequent cloud coverage and the disregarding 378 of any possible errors in the in-situ  $R_{rs}$  measurements 379 to ensure high quality data. After matching in-situ  $R_{rs}$ 380 measurements collected along the navigation of the ship to 381 S2 overpasses, we extracted 277 match-up pixels for Acolite, 382 compared to 226 and 338 match-up pixels for the Polymer 383 and C2RCC algorithms, respectively. The different numbers 384 of match-ups resulted from the difference in default quality 385 flags used for the individual AC (non-water pixels such as 386 clouds, shadows, and land). 387



Fig. 3: An example of a near-simultaneous overpasses of OLI-MSI over Longyearbyen. The red frame shows the OLI image footprint, and the black frame represents the MSI image footprint. The inter-comparisons are made for the overlapping region (pixels) represented by a blue frame. The time-difference between the two overpasses is 15 minutes. (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the web version of this article.)

# 388 C. OLI-MSI R<sub>rs</sub> inter-comparisons

The core part of the present study is the spectral harmonization of OLI-MSI  $R_{rs}$  products (Fig. 1). Details about  $\rho_t$  inter-comparisons are provided in Appendix A-A. An example of near-simultaneous OLI-MSI overpasses over the study region is given in Fig. 3.

For  $R_{rs}$  inter-comparisons, we have considered near-394 simultaneous overpasses with a time difference of  $\pm 30$ 395 minutes with low or no cloud cover. The differences in 396 data products under such a narrow time window, to a 397 large extent, can be attributed to differences in the sensors' 398 absolute radiometric responses [10], [27]. In this study, the 399 OLI-derived data products are considered as the reference 400 to assess MSI products [9] due to the OLI's improved signal-401 to-noise ratio (SNR) [45] and radiometric calibration [46]. 402 The  $R_{rs}$  inter-comparisons were carried out for the water 403 pixels in the common bands only, depicted in Table. IV. 404

To minimize random noise and artifacts, a median value 405 of valid water pixels (non-masked) over 6 × 6 and 3 × 3 406 pixels window were extracted from 30 m L8, and 60 m re-407 sampled S2 images, respectively. The whole window was ex-408 cluded from inter-comparison if the CV across the window 409 was greater than 50%. In addition, spectra with  $R_{rs}(\lambda) > 0.03$ 410  $(sr^{-1})$  and  $R_{rs}(865nm) > 0.001$  were removed from the inter-411 comparison [7], [47]. These modified thresholds were deter-412 mined by analyzing both the in-situ (Fig. 4) and satellite-413 derived  $R_{rs}$  spectra from a wide region of the Barents Sea, 414 i.e., the open waters, coastal waters, and marginal sea-415 ice region. Some erroneous or non-realistic spectra might 416 have occurred from the underestimation/overestimation 417 of the path reflectance, cloud shadow, sun-glint, or sub-418 pixel contamination due to sea-ice. The masking thresholds 419

adopted in the present study allow the retrieved spectra to 420 converge, provide a realistic water spectrum, and match the 421 spectral shape of in-situ measurement. To avoid over cor-422 rection by AC processors, the  $R_{rs}$  intensity should be larger 423 than  $-5 \times 10^{-4}$  sr<sup>-1</sup> in the range 800 nm to 900 nm [47]. 424 In addition, we have experimented with different flagging 425 criteria mentioned in the previous works [9], [10], [28] to 426 improve the inter-sensor spectral consistency. For example, 427 to minimize the bidirectional effects, we computed the view 428 zenith angle per band and performed the inter-comparisons 429 for the pixels with the view zenith angles (VZA) within 430 the  $\pm 5^{\circ}$  range [10]. Similarly, we exclude inter-comparison 431 scenes with solar zenith angle  $(>65^{\circ})$  [9]. To ensure similar 432 environmental and aquatic conditions and acquire an ad-433 equate amount of inter-comparison pixels, we experimen-434 tally analyzed the effect of time-gap (10-60 minutes) on 435 the spectral difference between S2 and L8 overpasses [10], 436 [27], [28]. To avoid the large computational burden, inter-437 comparison pixels were selected within a window of 180 × 438 180 and 90 × 90 for L8 and S2 images, respectively, around 439 the central pixel in the shared region. 440

6

44

# D. Proposed Bandpass adjustment model

The architecture and systematic system diagram illustrating the main components of the proposed BA method are given in Fig. 5. In the following subsections, we further explain the architecture and training process following the  $R_{rs}$  inter-comparisons described in section. III-C. 446

1) Reflectance adjustment of Sentinel-2 observations: 447 To harmonize the spectral domains of OLI L8 and MSI 448 S2, using L8  $R_{rs}$  as a reference, the proposed BA model 449 accounts for the differences in SRF of these sensors. The BA 450 model is trained to perform pixel-by-pixel transformation 451 from S2 derived  $R_{rs}$  to L8 derived  $R_{rs}$ . Note that, in this 452 work following the study [9], the BA model was trained for 453 combined S-2A and S-2B sensors. The trained model was 454 then used to predict L8 OLI equivalent  $R_{rs}$  for those derived 455 from S2 MSI. Following that, the OLI  $R_{rs}$  and the adjusted 456 MSI  $R_{rs}$  (MSI<sup>\*</sup>) are then merged. The framework shown in 457 Fig. 1 gives an overview of the workflow we used to train 458 our model for performing the spectral harmonization, i.e., 459 the transformation of MSI S2  $R_{rs}$  products into the spectral 460 domain of OLI L8. In the current work, we have used 461 the four visible bands common to S2 and L8, i.e., Band-1 462 (ultra-blue/coastal aerosol), Band-2 (blue), Band-3 (green), 463 and Band-4 (red). The spectral adjustment is performed 464 individually for each of these bands [9], [10]; however, for 465 better generalization of the model, we have increased the 466 number of input features [48]–[50]. The  $R_{rs}$  product, the 467 normalized  $R_{rs}$  in the range between 0 and 1, and the  $R_{rs}$ 468 in log-scale, were given as an input to the network. This 469 means that the network has three input features and one 470 output. Fig. 5 illustrates a schematic block diagram of our 471 developed BA model. 472

*2) Hyperparameters:* The selection of a suitable set of connecting weights, the depth of the network, the number of neurons in each hidden layer, batch size, activation 475

IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON GEOSCIENCE AND REMOTE SENSING, 2022.



Fig. 4: In-situ  $R_{rs}$  spectra of the four match-ups with a time-difference of  $\pm$  3 hours with Sentinel-2 A/B overpasses, convoluted to the S2-MSI spectral bands using the Sentinel-2 A/B Spectral Response Functions S2-SRFs (version 3.0). The solid black lines refer to the mean  $R_{rs}$  spectra.

function, learning rates, and regularization all play a crucial 476 role in estimating any measurable function between the 477 input and output vectors [51]. In this regard, different 478 designs of the MLP were implemented, and the one with 479 three hidden layers having 25, 15, and 10 neurons and tanh 480 activation function is found to be the best performer based 481 on the validation error (Table. II). In the current study, a 482 mini-batch gradient descent method is used to compute the 483 gradients of the cost function with respect to the weights w 484 and biases b of the network. After the activation function, 485 486 the batch normalization (BN) was applied after each hidden layer for regularization [52]. The BN minimized the internal 487 covariance shift in the data distribution in the layers and 488 speed up the learning process [52]. The output of the model 489 is a single value of  $R_{rs}$  (MSI<sup>\*</sup>), which is passed to the 490 loss function. The difference between the adjusted MSI  $R_{rs}$ 491 equivalent to the OLI one (MSI<sup>\*</sup>) and the true value of  $R_{rs}$ 492 OLI is minimized by the optimization process using the 493 back propagation algorithm. In this work, the loss function 494 is based on the root mean square log difference (RMSLD) 495 along with the  $\ell_2$  norm on the weights and the biases, w 496 and b: 497

$$L = \sqrt{\frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} \left( \log_{10}(z_i) - \log_{10}(\hat{z}_i) \right)^2 + \lambda_1 \ell_2(W, b)}$$
(1)

where  $\hat{z}_i$  is the predicted value and  $z_i$  is the corresponding ground-truth value, *N* is the total number of samples, and  $\lambda_1$  is a hyper-parameter used to assign relative importance to the second term. The batch size is fixed to 64 samples, and the initial learning rate  $\eta_0$  was set at 0.0075, which decreases by 5% after every 100 epochs. The choice of these two hyperparameters was made based on the training and validation errors. For faster convergence of the model, the weights and biases were initialized using the Xavier method [53]. The parameters/hyper-parameters are summarized in Table. II.

3) Experimental Setup: To evaluate the performance of 509 the proposed BA model, the inter-comparison  $R_{rs}$  pixels 510 were randomly split into 80% training and 20% testing 511 samples using 5-fold cross-validation. The training samples 512 in each split are subdivided into training and validation 513 (70% and 30%) samples. Using the training data only, the 514 BA model is trained for 5000 epochs in each split. To 515 avoid overfitting and better tuning of the hyper-parameters, 516 during the training process, the BA model with weights and 517 bias terms having minimum validation error is utilized to 518 estimate  $R_{rs}$  (MSI<sup>\*</sup>) on the unseen data. The BA model is 519 developed in Tensor Flow, Python [54]. 520

The linear regression model is also implemented in a 521 Python environment and has been utilized in different 522 studies for the spectral-adjustment [9], [11], [15]. Using L8 523 as reference data (Eq.(2)), the regression coefficients are 524 calibrated by combining training and validation data. 525

$$Y(\lambda_i) = a_0 R_1(\lambda_i) + a_1 R_2(\lambda_i) + a_2 R_3(\lambda_i) + b$$
(2)

Where  $\lambda_i$  represents band number of S2 and L8 respectively. 526 Here  $a_0$ ,  $a_1$ ,  $a_2$  and b are regression coefficients. These 527 coefficients are obtained for each pixel by minimizing the 528 spectral difference between S2 and L8  $R_{rs}$  products. Here 529

#### IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON GEOSCIENCE AND REMOTE SENSING, 2022.



Fig. 5: The proposed framework for spectral bandpass adjustment. a) L8 and S2 scenes acquisition at the TOA with a time difference of < 30 minutes overpasses the same region (Appendix A-A). b) Overlapping region between near-simultaneous S2 and L8 scenes. c) The TOA reflectance ( $\rho_t$ ) are corrected for atmospheric effects to extract water surface  $R_{rs}$ . Pixels affected by land and cloud are masked (section III-C). d) L8 and S2 bands with non-water  $R_{rs}$  pixels flagged. e) Spatial re-sampling of water  $R_{rs}$  pixels (section III-C). f) Feature expansion and flagging erroneous pixels (section III-C). g) Input to the Fully Connected (FC) neural network with an input layer, three hidden layers and an output layer (section III-D). The hidden layer blocks consist of an FC and Batch Normalization (BN) layers. h) Network loss computation and weights update (section III-D2) and l) Predicted OLI (MSI<sup>\*</sup>)  $R_{rs}$  products for each band from that of MSI  $R_{rs}$  products.

TABLE II: Parameters of the proposed model for spectral harmonizat
--

Parameters	Value/Selection	Description
Layers	5	input-layer, 3 hidden-layers, output-layer
Number of Neurons	3,25, 15, 10, 1	
Weight Initialization	Xavier	
Activation Function	tanh	
Learning Process	mini-batch gradient descent	
Loss Function	RMSLE	
Regularization	Batch-Normalization, L2-norm and Early stopping	
Optimizer	Adam	initial learning rate=0.0075
Batch-size	64	

 $R_1$ ,  $R_2$ ,  $R_3$  represents the S2 derived  $R_{rs}$  products, the normalized  $R_{rs}$  product in the range between 0 and 1, and the  $R_{rs}$  product in log-scale.

# 533 E. Evaluation Metrics

The differences in the in-situ and MSI derived  $R_{rs}$  prod-534 ucts (section IV-A) and  $R_{rs}$  between L8 and S2 (section 535 IV-B), are expressed in terms of the root mean square 536 difference (RMSD), the root mean square difference in log 537 scale (RMSLD), the median absolute percentage difference 538 (MAPD), the median relative percentage difference (MRPD) 539 and the coefficient of determination  $(R^2)$ . These metrics are 540 represented by Eqs.(3), (4),(5), (6), and (7), respectively. 541

$$RMSD = \sqrt{\frac{1}{N_t} \sum_{i=1}^{N_t} (X_i - Y_i)^2}$$
(3)

8

$$RMSLD = \sqrt{\frac{1}{N_t} \sum_{i=1}^{N_t} \left( \log_{10}(X_i) - \log_{10}(Y_i) \right)^2}$$
(4)

$$MAPD = 100\% \times median\left(\frac{|X_i - Y_i|}{|Y_i|}\right)$$
(5)

$$MRPD = 100\% \times median\left(\frac{X_i - Y_i}{Y_i}\right) \tag{6}$$

IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON GEOSCIENCE AND REMOTE SENSING, 2022.

$$R^{2} = 1 - \frac{\sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{N_{t}} (Y_{i} - X_{i})^{2}}}{\sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{N_{t}} (Y_{i} - \bar{X})^{2}}}$$
(7)

where  $X_i$  represents S2 derived  $R_{rs}$  and  $\rho_t$  products (sections IV-A, A-B and IV-B).  $Y_i$  represents in-situ  $R_{rs}$ or L8 derived  $R_{rs}$  and  $\rho_t$  products (A-B and IV-B). Here,  $N_t$ , indicates number of test samples.  $\bar{X} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{i=1}^{N} X_i$  is the mean  $R_{rs}$  value and *median* is the median operator.

#### IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The results are presented in two subsections. Subsection 548 IV-A shows comparison of Acolite, C2RCC and Polymer-549 550 retrieved  $R_{rs}$  with the in-situ data (match-ups). The performance analysis of these AC processors is described in two 551 settings: i) an assessment of each processor independently 552 and ii) an evaluation of common data (considered as valid 553  $R_{rs}$  pixels by all the AC processors) among AC processors. 554 The latter allows performance assessment using identical 555 match-ups, while the former allows an assessment of their 556 practicality, including the masking of non-water and erro-557 neous pixels. 558

The inter-comparison of OLI-MSI  $R_{rs}$  products (before and after spectral BA) are illustrated in subsections IV-B, and IV-C respectively.

#### 562 A. AC evaluation

547

To provide a straightforward assessment of the performance of an individual processor, the match-ups for  $R_{rs}$ at 443, 492, 560, and 665 nm derived from the Acolite, the C2RCC, and the Polymer using MSI data are shown in Fig. 6 (see also Table. III for error matrics).

In general, the scatter plots in Fig. 6 show that Acolite tends to overestimate  $R_{rs}$ , whereas the opposite holds true for C2RCC and Polymer except the red band; the degree of over-or underestimation varies depending on the spectral band (improving or degrading from the blue to red) and the magnitude of  $R_{rs}$ .

For Acolite, the overestimation of  $R_{rs}$  values decreases from the 443 nm to the 560 nm band. The  $R_{rs}$  estimates are close to the 1:1 line at 560 nm (Fig. 6 a3). However,  $R_{rs}$  at the 665 nm band are significantly above the in-situ observations.

For C2RCC and Polymer, while significant underestimates are observed at higher  $R_{rs}$  values at 443 nm, the degree of underestimation reduces at 492 and 560 nm (Figs. 6 b1-3). At 665 nm, the  $R_{rs}$  values are dispersed around the 1:1 line irrespective of the in-situ  $R_{rs}$  range but bias is minimal (Fig. 6 b4 and c4; Table. III).

Overall, Acolite and C2RCC showed the smallest biases 585 from the in-situ  $R_{rs}$  measurements with an averaged RMSD 586 of  $3.33 \times 10^{-3}$  and  $3.49 \times 10^{-3}$ , respectively (Table. III). In 587 contrast, the Polymer derived  $R_{rs}$  products have a higher 588 error with an RMSD of  $4.20 \times 10^{-3}$ . The Acolite derived 589  $R_{rs}$  exhibits better performance with reduced RMSD of 5% 590 and 20% compared to C2RCC and Polymer. According to 591 the other criteria, including MAPD and RMSLD, Acolite 592

performed moderately better in the 442-492 nm bands with 593 MAPD=21% and RMSLD=0.154, best in the 560 nm band 594 with MAPD < 10% and RMSLD=0.079, however, high un-595 certainties were found in the 665 nm band with MAPD=63% 596 and RMSLD=0.234. At 665 nm, Acolite estimates are signifi-597 cantly higher than the in-situ  $R_{rs}$  with MAPD=49% greater 598 than C2RCC-retrieved  $R_{rs}$ . The MRPD further corroborates 599 the limited performance of Acolite in the 665 nm band, and 600 better performance in the 443-560 nm bands compared to 601 C2RCC and Polymer. In the 665 nm band, C2RCC is the 602 top performer with MAPD=~8% and RMSD=11% less than 603 Polymer. 604

It is noted that consistent positive or negative biases 605 are evident across all the processors. For example, MRPD 606 is always positive for Acolite, but it is negative for all 607 bands for C2RCC and Polymer. The higher estimates of 608  $R_{rs}$  relative to in-situ values from the blue to green bands 609 using the Acolite DSF scheme are consistent with those 610 from previous studies [6], [55]. The overestimation of Acolite 611 derived  $R_{rs}$  is likely attributed to the underestimation of 612 aerosol loads or differences between the estimated AOT and 613 the true aerosol properties [7], [8]. This is partly explained 614 by the averaged AOT of ~ 0.12 at 550 nm derived from 615 Acolite in the present study. The averaged AOT of 0.12 616 illustrate moderate aerosol loads compared to AOT-550 nm 617 measured over AERONET stations in [56], [57]. In contrast, 618 Polymer and C2RCC estimates are significantly lower than 619 the in-situ and Acolite-derived  $R_{rs}$ . Similar performance for 620 Polymer and C2RCC (underestimating higher  $R_{rs}$  values) 621 are reported in [58] and [59]. This is attributed to the 622 discrepancy between the in-situ water reflectance and a 623 water reflectance model implemented in Polymer proces-624 sor (F. Steinmetz, personal comm.). For C2RCC, while the 625 exact cause of the discrepancy is unknown, the limited 626 performance may be due to the difference between optical 627 properties of the training sets used in C2RCC-nets, which 628 is not necessarily representative of the Barents Sea waters. 629 This hypothesis is supported by Kratzer et al. [60], which 630 improved the performance using the locally tuned C2RCC-631 nets for the Baltic Sea (10% improvement in the RMSD). 632

Our discussion on the performance of the three proces-633 sors remains the same, using either all valid data available 634 for an individual processor or common data for all of 635 the processors. Using the common match-ups between the 636 three AC processors, the MAPD improved by < 1% for 637 Acolite, > 3% for C2RCC and <6% for Polymer. Similarly, all 638 processors show improved RMSLD and MRPD. For example, 639 the RMSLD reduces by 10% for Acolite retrieved  $R_{rs}$  data. 640 No significant difference is observed in the RMSD. In 641 this study, none of the AC schemes meet the 5% retrieval 642 accuracy requirement across the blue-green bands [61], 643 except Acolite at the 560 nm band for the common data. It 644 should be noted that this requirement is typically valid for 645 clear and oligotrophic waters where optical properties are 646 exclusively dominated by phytoplankton (Chl-a  $< 1 \, \text{mgm}^{-3}$ ) 647 [62]. Larger uncertainties have been observed in the turbid 648 waters in the blue-green bands, 25 to 60% in [8], 23 to 42% 649 in [39], and 40 to 60% in [7]. 650

IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON GEOSCIENCE AND REMOTE SENSING, 2022.

10



Fig. 6: Overall performance comparison of AC processors against the in-situ data in the four visible bands using data acquired from the S2 MSI. Detailed statistical metrics are available in Table. III. The solid black lines are the 1:1 match.

# B. Spectral bandpass adjustment for $R_{rs}$

The previous section indicated that the  $R_{rs}$  products retrieved via Acolite have minimum spectral differences from the in-situ  $R_{rs}$  compared to the other AC processors tested in the present study. As mentioned in section I, the key objective of this study is to develop a practical method for merging MSI and OLI images in terms of  $R_{rs}$  products. Before doing so, OLI-MSI  $R_{rs}$  products retrieved via Acolite, Polymer and C2RCC were examined. Our inter-comparison results show that S2 and L8-derived  $R_{rs}$  products retrieved to the AC processors, as illustrated by the evaluation metrics in Table. IV and Appendix (Table. B.1). In the following section, the Acolite derived OLI and MSI  $R_{rs}$  products are used for spectral harmonization (see Figs. 1 and 5). 659

The relationships between the OLI and MSI-derived  $R_{rs}$  666

Bands	Ν	<b>RMSD</b> $(10^{-3} \text{ sr}^{-1})$	RMSLD	MAPD	MRPD
All data					
443 nm Acolite	277	5.44	0.182	25.79	25.79
492 nm Acolite	277	3.89	0.126	16.94	16.78
560 nm Acolite	277	2.31	0.079	9.840	5.690
665 nm Acolite	277	1.72	0.234	63.40	63.40
443 nm C2RCC	338	5.61	0.297	33.91	-33.91
492 nm C2RCC	338	4.11	0.252	22.08	-21.19
560 nm C2RCC	338	3.62	0.246	24.28	-22.46
665 nm C2RCC	338	0.65	0.257	14.11	-10.11
443 nm Polymer	226	6.73	0.203	37.09	-36.99
492 nm Polymer	226	4.93	0.140	24.09	-24.06
560 nm Polymer	226	4.43	0.191	25.92	-25.92
665 nm Polymer	226	0.74	0.205	22.30	-21.92
		Common data			
443 nm Acolite	167	5.30	0.158	24.50	24.50
492 nm Acolite	167	3.86	0.109	16.01	16.01
560 nm Acolite	167	2.26	0.071	9.16	4.940
665 nm Acolite	167	1.71	0.233	62.94	62.94
443 nm C2RCC	167	6.63	0.188	33.25	-33.25
492 nm C2RCC	167	4.88	0.121	20.22	-19.93
560 nm C2RCC	167	4.33	0.133	21.09	-19.71
665 nm C2RCC	167	0.64	0.103	12.33	-8.560
443 nm Polymer	167	7.14	0.210	37.35	-37.35
492 nm Polymer	167	5.30	0.134	24.33	-24.33
560 nm Polymer	167	4.78	0.144	24.18	-24.18
665 nm Polymer	167	0.75	0.138	21.65	-20.32

TABLE III: Match-ups of remote sensing reflectance derived from Acolite, C2RCC, and Polymer AC processors against the in-situ dataset for all the valid data. For each band, the best results are shown in bold.

<sup>667</sup> products retrieved by applying Acolite to  $\rho_t$  TOA (presented <sup>668</sup> in Appendix A-B) are shown in Fig. 7 (a1-a4). Also shown <sup>669</sup> is the relationship between OLI  $R_{rs}$  and  $MSI^* R_{rs}$  derived <sup>670</sup> from MSI after spectral BA OLS regression (Fig. 7 b1-b4) <sup>671</sup> and the NN based model proposed in the present study <sup>672</sup> (Fig. 7 c1-c4) for the common visible bands.

Without BA, the average differences in  $R_{rs}$  products 673 retrieved via Acolite are estimated to range from 6 to  $\sim 12\%$ 674 (Table. IV). Visual inspection of the scatter plots in Fig. 7 675 (a1-a3) and comparison of the MRPD show that OLI-derived 676  $R_{rs}$  products are higher in magnitude than that of MSI-677 derived  $R_{rs}$  products from blue to green bands. These 678 findings are in accordance with [10]. The highest bias is 679 found in the  $R_{rs}(665 \text{ nm})$  products with MRPD of ~ -11% 680 and RMSLD=0.096. The worst performance in the red band 681 is likely due to the lower water reflectance measured at 682 higher wavelengths in oceanic waters [7]. In addition, with 683 reference to Table. I and the study [63], the red bands of L8 684 and S2 have the minimum percentage of overlap in the SRF 685 and a larger difference in the central wavelengths, which 686 also contributes to the higher bias. Likewise Acolite, C2RCC 687  $R_{rs}(665 \,\mathrm{nm})$  products also achieved a worse performance 688 (Table. B.1). Comparing all the evaluation metrics, the 689 minimum spectral difference is achieved in the 561 nm 690 products with MAPD=6.58% and  $R^2 = \sim 0.95$ . 691

After applying the proposed spectral BA, the difference 692 was significantly reduced from < 10% to < 3%, demonstrat-693 ing the effectiveness of the proposed approach (Table. IV). 694 Comparing the performances of the BA methods and con-695 sidering MAPD and RMSLD as performance measures, on 696 average, the proposed BA approach reduced MAPD and 697 RMSLD by ~ 2.8% and ~ 41%, compared to the ~ 1.1% and 698 ~ 33% improvement made by the OLS regression model. In 699

addition, the proposed BA approach has achieved reduced 700 RMSD, 8% less than the OLS regression model. Fig. 7 701 further demonstrates the outperformance of the proposed 702 BA model over the OLS model. This is because the proposed 703 BA model takes advantage from the capability of a deep 704 neural network to accurately learn and model the nonlinear 705 problem (transformation of MSI- $R_{rs}$  to that of OLI- $R_{rs}$ ), 706 while preserving the spectral properties of the two satellite 707 sensors. It can been seen that the OLS model underesti-708 mates the higher  $R_{rs}$  values ( $R_{rs} > 0.018$  in Fig. 7 (b1-b3) 709 and  $R_{rs} > 0.005$  in Fig. 7(b4)). In contrast,  $R_{rs}$  using the 710 proposed BA model is less affected by the magnitude of  $R_{rs}$ 711 values, highlighting the generalizability of the model which 712 is partially due to the extension of input feature vectors 713 (see Fig. 5 in section III-D). Our results show that the OLS 714 model can reduce the reflectance difference to only a few 715 degrees. It is possible that the OLS transformation coeffi-716 cients may not be suitable to solve nonlinear harmonization 717 problems where different water types may exist. Comparing 718 all the bands, the highest improvement is achieved in the 719  $R_{rs}$ (482 nm) products, while the lowest is in the  $R_{rs}$ (561 nm) 720 products by both the BA methods. Overall, our analysis 721 indicates that the proposed BA model has achieved better 722 performance in the spectral adjustment for S2 MSI data 723 to fit L8 OLI data with a considerable decrease in the 724 RMSD (30%). The RMSD and median difference of  $\sim 5 \times 10^{-4}$ 725 and  $3.53 \times 10^{-5}$  sr<sup>-1</sup>, respectively, are within the acceptable 726 uncertainties for ocean colour products, i.e.,  $5 \times 10^{-4}$  [64]. 727 The improvement in spectral alignment between OLI-MSI 728  $R_{rs}$  products is evident for all the bands in Table. IV. 729

IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON GEOSCIENCE AND REMOTE SENSING, 2022.



Fig. 7: Inter-comparison of  $R_{rs}$  products for OLI and MSI processed via Acolite. Detailed statistical metrics are available in Table. IV.

# 730 C. Further evaluation of proposed BA method

To ensure the performance of the proposed BA method, we use additional scene images of OLI and MSI that are independent relative to those used in the previous section. Fig. 8 shows an example of near-simultaneous OLI and MSI image pairs acquired over the study site on July 24, 2019. It can be seen that the study site contains both coastal and open ocean waters.

1) Comparison of R<sub>rs</sub> products: In Fig. 9, OLI-derived 738 R<sub>rs</sub> products alongside with MSI products retrieved via 739 Acolite, C2RCC and Polymer are shown. Overall, the Acolite 740 scheme produces MSI-derived  $R_{rs}$  similar to those of OLI, 741 as compared to C2RCC and Polymer. The fine spatial details 742 of in-water optically active components are noticeable in 743 Acolite-processed  $R_{rs}$  products in OLI-MSI images at nearly 744 the same location. C2RCC and Polymer schemes have also 745 captured the spatial variations in the  $R_{rs}$  products, however, 746

© 2022 IEEE. Personal use is permitted, but republication/redistribution requires IEEE permission. See https://www.ieee.org/publications/rights/index.html for more information. Authorized licensed use limited to: UIT The Arctic University of Norway. Downloaded on January 18,2023 at 14:09:44 UTC from IEEE Xplore. Restrictions apply.

TABLE IV: Inter-comparison of OLI-MSI  $R_{rs}$  products for N=8500 pixel pairs extracted from near-simultaneous 42 OLI and 71 MSI image pairs. The best results are shown in bold.

Method	<b>RMSD</b> $(10^{-4} \text{ sr}^{-1})$	RMSLD	MAPD	MRPD	$R^2$
	Coastal aerosol (	443 nm)			
Proposed NN	8.41	0.035	4.999	0.015	0.879
OLS	8.62	0.039	6.319	0.472	0.865
No Bandpass Adjustment	9.120	0.048	8.056	-3.558	0.846
	Blue (482 nm)				
Proposed NN	4.94	0.028	2.841	-0.449	0.964
OLS	5.79	0.032	5.074	-0.085	0.95
No Bandpass Adjustment	9.380	0.057	6.679	-6.554	0.869
	Green (561 nm)				
Proposed NN	4.29	0.037	4.5	-1.213	0.974
OLS	4.47	0.038	5.337	-0.289	0.972
No Bandpass Adjustment	6.16	0.058	6.586	-5.0	0.946
	<b>Red</b> (665 nm)				
Proposed NN	2.69	0.053	9.705	0.693	0.895
OLS	3.20	0.063	12.084	1.533	0.852
No Bandpass Adjustment	4.46	0.096	11.917	-10.775	0.714



Fig. 8: OLI and MSI images acquired over the study region with a time-difference of 17 minutes. The OLI and MSI scenes were acquired on July 24, 2019.

<sup>747</sup> a larger difference is observed in the magnitude of esti-<sup>748</sup> mated  $R_{rs}$  in the two datasets, especially close to the coast, <sup>749</sup> as illustrated by the ellipses in Fig. 9. Furthermore, the <sup>750</sup> masking of clouds and land in Acolite-processed products <sup>751</sup> is consistent, whereas C2RCC and Polymer have masked <sup>752</sup> larger areas in MSI images than OLI.

It is worth noticing that although Acolite-processed  $R_{rs}$ 753 have well captured the spatial variations and sharp frontal 754 regions in both datasets, OLI images appeared to be 755 brighter than those of MSI, especially in the red band, 756 which is in accordance with the results shown in Fig. 7 and 757 Table. IV. The MAPE (>11%) is highest in the  $R_{rs}$ (655 nm) 758 products. The lower  $R_{rs}$  values are evident in all the MSI 759 products. These differences may be attributed due to a 760 change in atmospheric variables such as aerosols within 761 the short (±30 minutes) time-difference between OLI-MSI 762 images, the differences in the spectral bands of MSI and 763 OLI shown in Table. I, the image artifacts more pronounced 764 in MSI images for this example or inaccurate removal of 765 sea surface reflection due to different sun-sensor geometry 766 between the two senors [65]. Furthermore, some negative 767

retrievals are also observed in the MSI 655 nm band marked with an arrow. The negative  $R_{rs}$  values may be due to the over correction of atmospheric effects [7], [66]. Overall, among the three processors, it is demonstrated that Acolite retrieved OLI-MSI  $R_{rs}$  products are comparable with similar  $R_{rs}$  values range. 773

2) Comparison OLI-MSI\* R<sub>rs</sub> products: In Fig. 10, we have 774 demonstrated the effectiveness of the proposed BA method 775 using the same OLI-MSI images as in Fig. 9. Note that these 776 image pairs are not used in the training of the BA model. 777 The visual comparison illustrates that the spatial details and 778 variations are preserved in the BA adjusted MSI products 779 (MSI<sup>\*</sup>  $R_{rs}$ ) with a decrease in the difference between  $R_{rs}$ 780 values, for example, the areas indicated by ellipses in 781 Fig. 10. Our results in Fig. 9 and Fig. 10 suggest that Acolite 782 retrieved OLI-MSI<sup>\*</sup>  $R_{rs}$  show good agreement and possible 783 future integration of OLI-MSI radiometric data to facilitate 784 consistent, qualitative, and quantitative monitoring of water 785 bodies. The combined use of data products from these 786 sensors will result in an increase in the average revisit time 787 as well as the acquisition of cloud-free images, providing 788

IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON GEOSCIENCE AND REMOTE SENSING, 2022.



Fig. 9: Comparison between near-simultaneous OLI and MSI R<sub>rs</sub> products derived via Acolite, C2RCC and Polymer, for the similar bands using the images shown in Fig. 8. The areas indicated by ellipses (colors matching the band number) highlight the similarities/differences in OLI-MSI  $R_{rs}$  products when processed via different AC schemes.

0.02

0.01

IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON GEOSCIENCE AND REMOTE SENSING, 2022



Fig. 10: Comparison between OLI, MSI, and MSI<sup>\*</sup> $R_{rs}$  (after bandpass adjustment) products. The areas indicated by ellipses show that OLI produced higher/lower  $R_{rs}$  values compared to MSI. These differences in magnitude are minimized after applying the proposed BA model.

the possibility to increase the frequency of monitoring
the dynamics of sensitive aquatic systems at a spatial
resolution of 10–60 m. Nonetheless, further research efforts
are needed for extensive inter-comparisons of various AC
methods under diverse atmospheric and aquatic conditions
for coastal and inland water applications.

It should be noted that for spectral alignment of OLI-MSI 795  $R_{rs}$  products, the proposed BA model requires correlation 796 between the MSI and OLI-derived  $R_{rs}$  products. In addition, 797 the performance of the BA model depends on the represen-798 tativeness of the training data. In this work, the proposed 799 model is regionally tuned for the Barents Sea only. However, 800 by incorporating data products from global aquatic systems, 801 the training dataset can be extended. The accuracy of the 802 BA model, like that of other ML algorithms, is determined 803 by the distribution and uncertainties in the  $R_r s$  data, which 804 is determined by the performance of AC. 805

#### 806 V. CONCLUSION AND FUTURE WORK

This paper aimed to improve inter-sensor spectral consistency between S2 MSI and L8 OLI  $R_{rs}$  over the Barents Sea. To achieve our objective, we first evaluated the performance of three state-of-the-art AC models, i.e., 810 C2RCC, Acolite (DSF), and Polymer, against in-situ  $R_{rs}$ 811 measurements (match-ups). Our analysis demonstrates that 812 all the processors have degraded performance in the coastal 813 aerosol and blue bands. Acolite overestimated R<sub>rs</sub> values, 814 whereas C2RCC and Polymer have underestimated  $R_{rs}$  > 815  $0.015 \,\mathrm{sr}^{-1}$ . Comparatively, Acolite is more reliable in the 816 green band with an MAPD of < 10% compared to 24 % 817 and 25% errors using C2RCC and Polymer. In the red band, 818 C2RCC is the top performer, but with a MAPD=14%. Overall, 819 Acolite showed the minimum deviation from the in-situ  $R_{rs}$ 820 measurements with an averaged RMSD of  $3.3 \times 10^{-3} (sr^{-1})$ , 821 indicating best performance over the Barents Sea. 822

Regarding inter-comparison of OLI and MSI, our results 823 show that the  $R_{rs}$  products processed via Acolite outper-824 form the others and are estimated to range from 8% to 825 12% with an average RMSD of  $7.3 \times 10^{-4} (sr^{-1})$  in the visible 826 bands. The highest bias was found in the  $R_{rs}$ (665 nm) 827 products with a MAPD and  $R^2$ -score of ~12% and 0.71 828 respectively. The minimum spectral difference is achieved 829 in the  $R_{rs}$ (561 nm) products with  $R^2$ -score of ~0.95. 830

To further minimize the spectral differences in the  $R_{rs}$  831

16

89

products, a neural network-based model was developed 832 to spectrally adjust the S2-A/B radiometry to replicate the 833 spectral bandpasses of L8 for the common bands. The 834 proposed BA model performs pixel-by-pixel transformation 835 of R<sub>rs</sub> from S2 MSI to L8 OLI equivalent one. After applying 836 the proposed BA model, the spectral difference is signifi-837 cantly reduced from < 10% to 2% (relative to 6-12 % without 838 any spectral adjustment), indicating the effectiveness of 839 the BA for S2 imagery. Our results demonstrate that the 840 proposed BA model is able to accurately reconstruct the 841 spectral properties of OLI from MSI R<sub>rs</sub> products, which il-842 lustrates that MSI observations can be used to complement 843 the  $R_{rs}$  products obtained from OLI. For comparison, we 844 have compared the performance of the proposed BA model 845 with the default NASA BA model [9], the OLS regression 846 model. On average, the proposed BA approach reduces 847 the MAPD and RMSD by ~ 2.8% and ~ 30%, compared 848 to ~ 1.1% and ~ 24% improvement caused by the OLS 849 regression model. 850

The obtained results indicate that L8 OLI and S2 MSI 851 products,  $\rho_t$  and  $R_{rs}$ , are sufficiently consistent when the 852 vicarious calibration and spectral BA are applied, respec-853 tively. Future studies will include exploring the potential 854 application of the proposed spectral BA approach to aug-855 ment S2 MSI and Sentinel-3 OLCI data products and future 856 hyper-spectral sensors to be comparable to legacy data. 857 An algorithm for better estimating downstream products 858 such as Chl-a and beyond (e.g., phytoplankton absorption 859 spectra), particularly for optically complex waters, should 860 also be developed in further study. To do that, we expect 861 that the BA approach proposed in the present study will aid 862 in better capturing the biogeochemical changes occurring 863 at a smaller spatial scale in the Barents Sea and beyond. 864

#### APPENDIX A

This section contains information about OLI-MSI  $\rho_t$ inter-comparisons selection and results of spectral difference in their respective products.

# <sup>869</sup> A. Inter-comparison of OLI-MSI $\rho_t$ products

865

For  $\rho_t$  inter-comparisons, we have considered near-870 simultaneous overpasses with a time difference of  $\pm 30$ 871 minutes with low or no cloud cover and low aerosol loading. 872 The acquired S2 and L8 images were converted to 873 unit-less  $(\rho_t)$  utilizing the calibration coefficients in the 874 metadata and used in the TOA inter-comparisons. As the 875 masking algorithm in S2 Level-1C data does not work well 876 for flagging non-water pixels such as cloud shadow and 877 snow [9], we used an additional masking threshold, i.e.,  $\rho_t$ 878 (1610 nm) < 0.215 [8]. Similarly, to remove non-water pixels 879 in L8 imagery, in addition to the Quality Assessment (QA) 880 band in L8 Level 1T data, we have used the same masking 881 criteria. If the median over  $6 \times 6$  and  $3 \times 3$  elements window 882 for L8 and S2 MSI was greater than the masking threshold 883 (classified as cloud or land pixels), the inter-comparison 884 window was excluded. Similar to [10], to ensure low aerosol 885 loading, pixels were excluded for inter-comparison if the 886

median value over aerosol optical thickness (AOT) at the 865 nm band, i.e., AOT(865) in a window of 6 × 6 and 3 × 3 pixels for L8 and S2 images, exceeds 0.028 as a cloud screening [8].

# B. TOA Reflectance comparison

The scatter plots in Fig. 11 show the spectral differ-892 ence for the inter-comparisons (OLI-MSI  $\rho_t$  pixel pairs) 893 in each band. Overall, MSI-derived  $\rho_t$  tends to be greater 894 in magnitude than that of OLI-derived  $\rho_t$  in the coastal 895 aerosol, green, and NIR spectral bands. An opposite trend 896 is observed in the blue and green bands (see also Table. V). 897 The highest deviation from the 1:1 line is observed in the 898  $\rho_t$ (865 nm) products. 899

Values of evaluation metrics enlisted in Table. V permit 900 us to further evaluate the spectral consistency in L8 and 901 S2  $\rho_t$  products. Overall, the spectral difference is minimal 902 in the green band, followed by the red band with RMSLD 903 of 0.012 and 0.013, respectively. Note that to discover the 904 band with the minimum spectral difference between OLI-905 MSI  $\rho_t$  products, we rely on RMSLD more than RMSD since 906 the latter is sensitive to the magnitude of  $\rho_t$ . In addition, 907 RMSLD is consistent with the other evaluation metrics in 908 Table. V. The highest  $R^2(0.97)$  was observed in the green and 909 red bands, which is in accordance with the results reported 910 in [10] after applying vicarious calibration to simulated TOA 911 reflectance data. It is inferred that the OLI and MSI products 912 agree to within  $\sim 4\%$  in the blue bands, < 3% in the green 913 and red bands, without applying any gains. The spectral 914 difference in the NIR band is < 5%, which is comparatively 915 high compared to the visible bands. Referring to Table. V, 916 the high difference in the NIR band is somewhat surprising 917 because the MSI NIR band is quite similar to that of OLI in 918 terms of central wavelength and spectral response profile 919 [63], [67]. In addition, the spectral bandwidth overlap is 920 nearly 80% of the equivalent NIR band of OLI [63]. It may 921 be due to the the lower signal-to-noise ratio of OLI-MSI 922 compared to the visible bands [65]) or limited bandwidth 923 in the NIR band of OLI (2× smaller than the green band) 924 and MSI (~ $1.5 \times$  smaller than the green band), as shown in 925 Table. I. The highest RMSLD is observed in the blue and NIR 926 bands, which MRPD further elaborates. It should be noted 927 that MPRD is negative for the blue and positive for the 928 NIR band, which illustrates that the under/overestimation 929 of  $\rho_t$  products are band dependent. The MAPD and MRPD 930 in the coastal-aerosol and blue bands are almost similar; 931 however, MRPD is positive in the coastal aerosol band 932 whereas it is negative in the blue band. This highlights 933 positive and negative biases in the MSI  $\rho_t$  products in these 934 bands. Among the visible bands, the smallest deviations are 935 observed in the OLI-MSI green band with MAPD and MRPD 936 < 2%. To better understand the uncertainties and their 937 effect on downstream products, we will further evaluate 938 these differences for  $R_{rs}$  products in section IV-B. 939

Restricting the time difference between OLI and MSI 940 overpasses to less than 30 minutes, we assume that the 941 spectral differences illustrated in the spectral plots in Fig. 11 942 IEEE TRANSACTIONS ON GEOSCIENCE AND REMOTE SENSING, 2022.



Fig. 11: Inter-comparison of TOA reflectance  $\rho_t$  products for L8-S2 pairs. Detailed statistical metrics are available in Table. V.

TABLE V: Intercomparison between Landsat-8 OLI and Sentinel-2 MSI  $\rho_t$  product. The number of inter-comparisons (N)=39000 are extracted from near-simultaneous 42 OLI and 71 MSI image pairs.

Bands	<b>RMSD</b> $(10^{-3} \text{ sr}^{-1})$	RMSLD	MAPD	MRPD	$R^2$
443 nm	5.20	0.015	3.05	3.05	0.903
483 nm	5.92	0.023	4.96	-4.96	0.850
561 nm	1.88	0.012	1.57	1.33	0.971
665 nm	1.22	0.013	2.40	-2.15	0.973
865 nm	0.99	0.024	3.65	2.55	0.956

and Table. IV solely originate due to the differences in 943 spectral responses of the individual bands. However, the 944 sensor-induced discrepancies might have been influenced 945 by the difference in the TOA reflectance due to, for ex-946 ample, varying illumination and observation geometries or 947 changing aquatic and atmospheric conditions. To study the 948 differences caused by varying observation geometries of 949 sensors and the bidirectional effects, we computed the view 950 zenith angle per band and performed the inter-comparisons 951 for the pixels with the view zenith angles (VZA) within 952 the  $\pm 5^{\circ}$  range. However, no noticeable improvement was 953 caused in the spectral consistency. As a result, our analysis 954

suggests that  $\rho_t$  products of L8 and S2 are consistent in the visible as well as in the NIR channel (<4%). 956

962

17

This section contains results of spectral difference between Landsat-8 and Sentinel-2-derived  $R_{rs}$  products processed via Acolite, C2RCC and Polymer in section IV-B.

DECLARATION OF COMPETING INTERESTS	961
------------------------------------	-----

None.

1021

1022

1023

1024

1025

1026

TABLE B.1: Comparison of Landsat-8 and Sentinel-2-derived  $R_{rs}$  products processed via Acolite, C2RCC and Polymer.

Method	<b>RMSD</b> $(10^{-3} \text{ sr}^{-1})$	RMSLD	$R^2$	MAPD		
Coastal Blue (443 nm)						
Acolite	0.91	0.048	0.846	8.06		
C2RCC	1.87	0.144	0.558	24.10		
Polymer	1.94	0.186	-0.434	29.96		
	Blue (48	82 nm)				
Acolite	0.94	0.057	0.869	6.68		
C2RCC	1.39	0.129	0.762	18.09		
Polymer	1.85	0.154	-0.062	26.08		
	Green (5	61 nm)				
Acolite	0.62	0.058	0.946	6.59		
C2RCC	1.72	0.149	0.506	18.99		
Polymer	0.94	0.109	0.756	19.56		
<b>Red</b> (665 nm)						
Acolite	0.45	0.096	0.714	11.92		
C2RCC	1.49	0.329	-0.041	33.17		
Polymer	0.45	0.198	0.042	46.07		

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The research is funded by the following projects: The 964 Nansen Legacy (RCN number 276730), CIRFA (RCN number 965 237906), and partners. The authors would like to acknowl-966 edge U.S Geological Survey (USGS) and Copernicus Open 967 Access Hub European space agency (ESA) for providing 968 Landsat-8 (OLI) and Sentinel-2 image archives. The authors 969 would also like to thank Cornelius Quigley and Sidrah 970 Hafeez for proofreading the manuscript. Part of this re-971 search was supported by a NASA ROSES project (sponsor 972 award #210319602) and the Japan Aerospace Exploration 973 Agency (JAXA) Global Change Observation Mission-Climate 974 (GCOM-C; the sponsor award #22RT000298) to AM. 975

#### 976

963

#### REFERENCES

- V. Le Fouest, C. Postlethwaite, M. A. M. Maqueda, S. Belanger, and
  M. Babin, "On the role of tides and strong wind events in promoting
  summer primary production in the barents sea," *Continental Shelf Research*, vol. 31, no. 17, pp. 1869–1879, 2011.
- P. Wassmann, M. Reigstad, T. Haug, B. Rudels, M. L. Carroll, H. Hop,
   G. W. Gabrielsen, S. Falk-Petersen, S. G. Denisenko, E. Arashkevich
   *et al.*, "Food webs and carbon flux in the barents sea," *Progress in Oceanography*, vol. 71, no. 2-4, pp. 232–287, 2006.
- [3] T. Haug, B. Bogstad, M. Chierici, H. Gjøsæter, E. H. Hallfredsson, Å. S.
  Høines, A. H. Hoel, R. B. Ingvaldsen, L. L. Jørgensen, T. Knutsen *et al.*,
  "Future harvest of living resources in the arctic ocean north of the
  nordic and barents seas: a review of possibilities and constraints," *Fisheries Research*, vol. 188, pp. 38–57, 2017.
- P. Dalpadado, K. R. Arrigo, G. L. van Dijken, H. R. Skjoldal, E. Bagøien,
   A. Dolgov, I. Prokopchuk, and E. Sperfeld, "Climate effects on temporal and spatial dynamics of phytoplankton and zooplankton in the
   barents sea," *Progress in Oceanography*, p. 102320, 2020.
- [5] C. Kuhn, A. de Matos Valerio, N. Ward, L. Loken, H. O. Sawakuchi, M. Kampel, J. Richey, P. Stadler, J. Crawford, R. Striegl *et al.*, "Performance of landsat-8 and sentinel-2 surface reflectance products for river remote sensing retrievals of chlorophyll-a and turbidity," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 224, pp. 104–118, 2019.
- [6] J. Wang, Z. Lee, D. Wang, S. Shang, J. Wei, and A. Gilerson, "Atmospheric correction over coastal waters with aerosol properties constrained by multi-pixel observations," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 265, p. 112633, 2021.
- [7] M. A. Warren, S. G. Simis, V. Martinez-Vicente, K. Poser, M. Bresciani,
  K. Alikas, E. Spyrakos, C. Giardino, and A. Ansper, "Assessment of
  atmospheric correction algorithms for the sentinel-2a multispectral
  imager over coastal and inland waters," *Remote sensing of environ- ment*, vol. 225, pp. 267–289, 2019.

- [8] N. Pahlevan, A. Mangin, S. V. Balasubramanian, B. Smith, K. Alikas, K. Arai, C. Barbosa, S. Bélanger, C. Binding, M. Bresciani *et al.*, "Acix-aqua: A global assessment of atmospheric correction methods for landsat-8 and sentinel-2 over lakes, rivers, and coastal waters," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 258, p. 112366, 2021.
- M. Claverie, J. Ju, J. G. Masek, J. L. Dungan, E. F. Vermote, J.-C. Roger, S. V. Skakun, and C. Justice, "The harmonized landsat and sentinel-2 surface reflectance data set," *Remote sensing of environment*, vol. 219, pp. 145–161, 2018.
- [10] N. Pahlevan, S. K. Chittimalli, S. V. Balasubramanian, and V. Vellucci, "Sentinel-2/landsat-8 product consistency and implications for monitoring aquatic systems," *Remote sensing of Environment*, vol. 220, pp. 19–29, 2019.
- [11] R. Shang and Z. Zhu, "Harmonizing landsat 8 and sentinel-2: A timeseries-based reflectance adjustment approach," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 235, p. 111439, 2019.
- [12] Q. Vanhellemont and K. Ruddick, "Acolite for sentinel-2: Aquatic applications of msi imagery," in *Proceedings of the 2016 ESA Living Planet Symposium, Prague, Czech Republic*, 2016, pp. 9–13.
- [13] J. Li and D. P. Roy, "A global analysis of sentinel-2a, sentinel-2b and landsat-8 data revisit intervals and implications for terrestrial monitoring," *Remote Sensing*, vol. 9, no. 9, p. 902, 2017.
- S. Bélanger, J. K. Ehn, and M. Babin, "Impact of sea ice on the retrieval of water-leaving reflectance, chlorophyll a concentration and inherent optical properties from satellite ocean color data," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 111, no. 1, pp. 51–68, 2007.
- [15] H. K. Zhang, D. P. Roy, L. Yan, Z. Li, H. Huang, E. Vermote, S. Skakun, and J.-C. Roger, "Characterization of sentinel-2a and landsat-8 top of atmosphere, surface, and nadir brdf adjusted reflectance and ndvi differences," *Remote sensing of environment*, vol. 215, pp. 482–494, 2018.
- [16] D. Scheffler, D. Frantz, and K. Segl, "Spectral harmonization and red edge prediction of landsat-8 to sentinel-2 using land cover optimized multivariate regressors," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 241, p. 111723, 2020.
- D. P. Roy, H. Zhang, J. Ju, J. L. Gomez-Dans, P. E. Lewis, C. Schaaf, Q. Sun, J. Li, H. Huang, and V. Kovalskyy, "A general method to normalize landsat reflectance data to nadir brdf adjusted reflectance," 1048 *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 176, pp. 255–271, 2016. 1046
- [18] K. T. Peterson, V. Sagan, and J. J. Sloan, "Deep learning-based water quality estimation and anomaly detection using landsat-8/sentinel-2 virtual constellation and cloud computing," *GIScience & Remote Sensing*, vol. 57, no. 4, pp. 510–525, 2020.
  [19] J. Chen and W. Zhu, "Comparing landsat-8 and sentinel-2 top of 1051
- [19] J. Chen and W. Zhu, "Comparing landsat-8 and sentinel-2 top of atmosphere and surface reflectance in high latitude regions: case study in alaska," *Geocarto International*, pp. 1–20, 2021.
- [20] N. Pahlevan, S. Sarkar, B. Franz, S. Balasubramanian, and J. He, "Sentinel-2 multispectral instrument (msi) data processing for aquatic science applications: Demonstrations and validations," *Remote sensing of environment*, vol. 201, pp. 47–56, 2017.
- [21] P.-A. Herrault, L. Gandois, S. Gascoin, N. Tananaev, T. Le Dantec, and R. Teisserenc, "Using high spatio-temporal optical remote sensing to monitor dissolved organic carbon in the arctic river yenisei," *Remote Sensing*, vol. 8, no. 10, p. 803, 2016.

- [22] N. Pahlevan, B. Smith, K. Alikas, J. Anstee, C. Barbosa, C. Binding, M. Bresciani, B. Cremella, C. Giardino, D. Gurlin *et al.*, "Simultaneous retrieval of selected optical water quality indicators from landsat-8, sentinel-2, and sentinel-3," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 270, p. 112860, 2022.
- [23] H. Wang, J. Wang, Y. Cui, and S. Yan, "Consistency of suspended particulate matter concentration in turbid water retrieved from sentinel-2 msi and landsat-8 oli sensors," *Sensors*, vol. 21, no. 5, p. 1662, 2021.
- [24] B. P. Page, L. G. Olmanson, and D. R. Mishra, "A harmonized image processing workflow using sentinel-2/msi and landsat-8/oli for mapping water clarity in optically variable lake systems," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 231, p. 111284, 2019.
- [25] E. Mandanici and G. Bitelli, "Preliminary comparison of sentinel-2 and landsat 8 imagery for a combined use," *Remote Sensing*, vol. 8, no. 12, p. 1014, 2016.
- P. Li, Y. Ke, J. Bai, S. Zhang, M. Chen, and D. Zhou, "Spatiotemporal dynamics of suspended particulate matter in the yellow river estuary, china during the past two decades based on time-series landsat and sentinel-2 data," *Marine Pollution Bulletin*, vol. 149, p. 110518, 2019.
- [27] M. A. Warren, S. G. Simis, and N. Selmes, "Complementary water quality observations from high and medium resolution sentinel sensors by aligning chlorophyll-a and turbidity algorithms," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 265, p. 112651, 2021.
- [28] S. Hafeez, M. S. Wong, S. Abbas, and M. Asim, "Evaluating landsat-8 and sentinel-2 data consistency for high spatiotemporal inland and coastal water quality monitoring," *Remote Sensing*, vol. 14, no. 13, p. 3155, 2022.
- [29] S. Xie, L. Sun, L. Liu, and X. Liu, "Global cross-sensor transformation functions for landsat-8 and sentinel-2 top of atmosphere and surface reflectance products within google earth engine," *IEEE Transactions on Geoscience and Remote Sensing*, 2022.
- [30] S. W. Bailey and P. J. Werdell, "A multi-sensor approach for the on-orbit validation of ocean color satellite data products," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 102, no. 1-2, pp. 12–23, 2006.
- [31] C. Brockmann, R. Doerffer, M. Peters, S. Kerstin, S. Embacher, and
  A. Ruescas, "Evolution of the c2rcc neural network for sentinel 2 and
  3 for the retrieval of ocean colour products in normal and extreme
  optically complex waters," in *Living Planet Symposium*, vol. 740, 2016,
  p. 54.
- [32] Q. Vanhellemont, "Adaptation of the dark spectrum fitting atmospheric correction for aquatic applications of the landsat and
  sentinel-2 archives," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 225, pp.
  1104 175–192, 2019.
- [33] F. Steinmetz, P.-Y. Deschamps, and D. Ramon, "Atmospheric correction in presence of sun glint: application to meris," *Optics express*, vol. 19, no. 10, pp. 9783–9800, 2011.
- [34] M. Asim, C. Brekke, A. Mahmood, T. Eltoft, and M. Reigstad, "Improving chlorophyll-a estimation from sentinel-2 (msi) in the barents sea using machine learning," *IEEE Journal of Selected Topics in Applied Earth Observations and Remote Sensing*, 2021.
- [35] Q. Vanhellemont and K. Ruddick, "Atmospheric correction of metrescale optical satellite data for inland and coastal water applications," *Remote sensing of environment*, vol. 216, pp. 586–597, 2018.
- [36] K. P. Klein, H. Lantuit, B. Heim, D. Doxaran, B. Juhls, I. Nitze, D. Walch,
  A. Poste, and J. E. Søreide, "The arctic nearshore turbidity algorithm
  (anta)-a multi sensor turbidity algorithm for arctic nearshore environments," *Science of Remote Sensing*, vol. 4, p. 100036, 2021.
- [37] C. D. Mobley, Light and water: radiative transfer in natural waters.
   Academic press, 1994.
- [38] K. G. Ruddick, V. De Cauwer, Y.-J. Park, and G. Moore, "Seaborne measurements of near infrared water-leaving reflectance: The similarity spectrum for turbid waters," *Limnology and Oceanography*, vol. 51, no. 2, pp. 1167–1179, 2006.
- [39] J. Wei, Z. Lee, R. Garcia, L. Zoffoli, R. A. Armstrong, Z. Shang, P. Sheldon, and R. F. Chen, "An assessment of landsat-8 atmospheric correction schemes and remote sensing reflectance products in coral reefs and coastal turbid waters," *Remote sensing of environment*, vol.
  215, pp. 18–32, 2018.
- [40] Q. Vanhellemont, "Sensitivity analysis of the dark spectrum fitting atmospheric correction for metre-and decametre-scale satellite imagery using autonomous hyperspectral radiometry," *Optics Express*, vol. 28, no. 20, pp. 29 948–29 965, 2020.
- 1134[41] "ESA Sentinel-2 MSI Radiometric Performance," accessed 2022-01-04.1135[Online]. Available: https://dragon3.esa.int/web/sentinel/technical-1136guides/sentinel-2-msi/performance
- [42] P. K. Roy, M. B. Roy, and S. Pal, Advances in Water Resources Management for Sustainable Use. Springer Nature, 2021, vol. 131.

- [43] "Landsat-8 science," accessed 2022-01-04. [Online]. Available: 1139 https://landsat.gsfc.nasa.gov/satellites/landsat-8/ 1140
- [44] C. D. Mobley, L. K. Sundman, C. O. Davis, J. H. Bowles, T. V. Downes, R. A. Leathers, M. J. Montes, W. P. Bissett, D. D. Kohler, R. P. Reid *et al.*, "Interpretation of hyperspectral remote-sensing imagery by spectrum matching and look-up tables," *Applied Optics*, vol. 44, no. 17, pp. 3576–3592, 2005.
- [45] J. R. Schott, A. Gerace, C. E. Woodcock, S. Wang, Z. Zhu, R. H. Wynne, and C. E. Blinn, "The impact of improved signal-to-noise ratios on algorithm performance: Case studies for landsat class instruments," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 185, pp. 37–45, 2016.
- B. Markham, J. Barsi, G. Kvaran, L. Ong, E. Kaita, S. Biggar, J. Czapla-Myers, N. Mishra, and D. Helder, "Landsat-8 operational land imager radiometric calibration and stability," *Remote Sensing*, vol. 6, no. 12, pp. 12 275–12 308, 2014.
- [47] P. Qin, S. G. Simis, and G. H. Tilstone, "Radiometric validation of atmospheric correction for meris in the baltic sea based on continuous observations from ships and aeronet-oc," *Remote sensing of environment*, vol. 200, pp. 263–280, 2017.
- [48] E. López-Iñesta, F. Grimaldo, and M. Arevalillo-Herráez, "Combining feature extraction and expansion to improve classification based similarity learning," *Pattern Recognition Letters*, vol. 93, pp. 95–103, 1160 2017.
- [49] M. Asim, C. Brekke, A. Mahmood, T. Eltoft, and M. Reigstad, "Ocean 1162 color net (ocn) for the barents sea," in *IGARSS 2020-2020 IEEE* 1163 *International Geoscience and Remote Sensing Symposium*. IEEE, 2020, 1164 pp. 5881–5884.
- [50] N. Almaadeed, M. Asim, S. Al-Maadeed, A. Bouridane, and A. Beghdadi, "Automatic detection and classification of audio events for road surveillance applications," *Sensors*, vol. 18, no. 6, p. 1858, 2018. 1168
- [51] I. Goodfellow, Y. Bengio, and A. Courville, *Deep Learning*. MIT Press, 2016, http://www.deeplearningbook.org.
   1170
- [52] S. Ioffe and C. Szegedy, "Batch normalization: Accelerating deep network training by reducing internal covariate shift," *arXiv preprint* 1172 *arXiv:1502.03167*, 2015.
- [53] X. Glorot and Y. Bengio, "Understanding the difficulty of training deep feedforward neural networks," in *Proceedings of the thirteenth international conference on artificial intelligence and statistics*, 2010, pp. 249–256.
- [54] M. Abadi, A. Agarwal, P. Barham, E. Brevdo, Z. Chen, C. Citro, G. S. 1178 Corrado, A. Davis, I. Dean, M. Devin, S. Ghemawat, I. Goodfellow, 1179 A. Harp, G. Irving, M. Isard, Y. Jia, R. Jozefowicz, L. Kaiser, 1180 M. Kudlur, J. Levenberg, D. Mané, R. Monga, S. Moore, D. Murray, 1181 C. Olah, M. Schuster, J. Shlens, B. Steiner, I. Sutskever, K. Talwar, 1182 P. Tucker, V. Vanhoucke, V. Vasudevan, F. Viégas, O. Vinyals, 1183 P. Warden, M. Wattenberg, M. Wicke, Y. Yu, and X. Zheng, 1184 "TensorFlow: Large-scale machine learning on heterogeneous 1185 systems," 2015, software available from tensorflow.org. [Online]. 1186 Available: https://www.tensorflow.org/ 1187
- [55] Y. Xu, L. Feng, D. Zhao, and J. Lu, "Assessment of landsat atmospheric correction methods for water color applications using global aeronet- oc data," *International Journal of Applied Earth Observation and Geoinformation*, vol. 93, p. 102192, 2020.
- [56] T. J. Breider, L. J. Mickley, D. J. Jacob, Q. Wang, J. A. Fisher, R. Y.-W.
   Chang, and B. Alexander, "Annual distributions and sources of arctic aerosol components, aerosol optical depth, and aerosol absorption,"
   *Journal of Geophysical Research: Atmospheres*, vol. 119, no. 7, pp.
   4107–4124, 2014.
- [57] M. Á. Obregón, G. Rodrigues, M. J. Costa, M. Potes, and A. M. 1197
   Silva, "Validation of esa sentinel-2 l2a aerosol optical thickness and columnar water vapour during 2017–2018," *Remote Sensing*, vol. 11, 1199
   no. 14, p. 1649, 2019. 1200
- [58] P. R. Renosh, D. Doxaran, L. D. Keukelaere, and J. I. Gossn, "Evaluation of atmospheric correction algorithms for sentinel-2-msi and sentinel-3-olci in highly turbid estuarine waters," *Remote Sensing*, vol. 12, no. 8, p. 1285, 2020.
- [59] H. Liu, X. He, Q. Li, X. Hu, J. Ishizaka, S. Kratzer, C. Yang, T. Shi,
   S. Hu, Q. Zhou *et al.*, "Evaluation of ocean colour atmospheric correction methods for sentinel-3 olci using global automatic in-situ observations," *IEEE Transactions on Geoscience and Remote Sensing*, 2021.
- [60] S. Kratzer and M. Plowey, "Integrating mooring and ship-based data for improved validation of olci chlorophyll-a products in the baltic sea," *International Journal of Applied Earth Observation and Geoinformation*, vol. 94, p. 102212, 2021.
- [61] C. R. McClain, G. Meister *et al.*, "Mission requirements for future 1214 ocean-colour sensors." 2012. 1215

- [62] F. Mélin, G. Sclep, T. Jackson, and S. Sathyendranath, "Uncertainty estimates of remote sensing reflectance derived from comparison of ocean color satellite data sets," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 1219 177, pp. 107–124, 2016.
- [63] R. Chastain, I. Housman, J. Goldstein, M. Finco, and K. Tenneson,
  "Empirical cross sensor comparison of sentinel-2a and 2b msi,
  landsat-8 oli, and landsat-7 etm+ top of atmosphere spectral characteristics over the conterminous united states," *Remote sensing of environment*, vol. 221, pp. 274–285, 2019.
- [64] C. Del Castillo, S. Platnick, and D. Antoine, "Pre-aerosol, clouds, and ocean ecosystem (pace) mission science definition team report," in *Proceedings of the Ocean Carbon and Biogeochemistry Workshop*, *Woods Hole, MA, USA*, 2012, pp. 16–19.
- [65] N. Pahlevan, B. Smith, C. Binding, and D. O'Donnell, "Spectral band adjustments for remote sensing reflectance spectra in coastal/inland waters," *Optics Express*, vol. 25, no. 23, pp. 28650–28667, 2017.
- [66] Q. Vanhellemont and K. Ruddick, "Advantages of high quality swir
  bands for ocean colour processing: Examples from landsat-8," *Remote Sensing of Environment*, vol. 161, pp. 89–106, 2015.
- [67] S. Li, S. Ganguly, J. L. Dungan, W. Wang, R. R. Nemani *et al.*, "Sentinel-2 msi radiometric characterization and cross-calibration with landsat-8 oli," *Advances in Remote Sensing*, vol. 6, no. 02, p. 147, 2017.