UiT THE ARCTIC UNIVERSITY OF NORWAY

The Faculty of Humanities, Social Sciences and Education

Common Ground: Representation and Language of *Place* in Indigenous Literature

Sámi and Māori Articulations from a Comparative and Trans-Indigenous Perspective, in *Trekways of the Wind* by Nils-Aslak Valkeapää, and *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* by Tina Makereti

Jean Kavanagh

Master's of Philosophy in Indigenous Studies
UiT The Arctic University of Norway
May 2018

UNIVERSITY OF TROMSØ

The Faculty of Humanities, Social Sciences and Education

Common Ground: Representation and Language of *Place* in Indigenous Literature

Sámi and Māori Articulations from a Comparative and Trans-Indigenous Perspective,
in *Trekways of the Wind* by Nils-Aslak Valkeapää,
and *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* by Tina Makereti

A thesis submitted by

Jean Kavanagh

Master's of Philosophy in Indigenous Studies
UiT The Arctic University of Norway
May 2018

Supervised by:
Associate Professor Ruben Moi
Department of Language and Literature, UiT Tromsø

Cover art by Eva Cherie
Owenga Road, Chatham Island, NZ

www.evacherieartz.com

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my family first, for their continued love and support, and my friends in Tromsø, Oslo, Ireland and elsewhere.

My gratitude also goes to everyone at the Sámi Centre, and our fantastic teachers in the Indigenous Studies programme, particularly Torjer Olsen, Else Grete Broderstad, and Ellen Marie Jensen for your advice and encouragement throughout; and Rachel Issa Djesa for answering all our queries with your trademark serenity.

To my supervisor, Ruben Moi, for all your support, and being able to achieve the perfect balance between praise and criticism, which is no mean feat in this prolonged process; and to Torhild Skillingstad in the Writer's Centre, for the feedback on my work.

To my hosts in Wellington, Mark, Sharon and Rory the dog; and to Susan Thorpe and everyone at the Kōpinga Marae on Rēkohu, especially my fellow guest Te Karohirohi Kira, who taught me so much about her culture with enthusiasm and pride. Also, a big thanks to Tina Makereti for taking the time to meet with me and grant me an informative interview.

To the Panic Monster, who saw us through many a dark, procrastinatory hour in the reading rooms.

Most of all, I wish to thank my fellow students, Matthew, Liz, Fran, Tuula, Niko, Áslat, Eli, Michael, Catherine, Saara and Kristin, who have taken this journey with me. I am honoured to be counted among such talented and intelligent souls, and I can't imagine sharing this experience with any other group of people.

Abstract

The topic of this thesis is the representation and articulation of the concept of *place* within Indigenous literature. A comparative analysis, exploring different Indigenous worldviews, can lend an insight into the relationship of Indigenous peoples to their land, while retaining specific and distinct aspects of the localized experience. The very definition of Indigenous peoples is tied to an association with place; this connection not merely a physical occupation of a territory, but an ongoing conversation that includes relationship to ancestors, flora, fauna, topographical features, and cosmology.

Literature allows the expression of the intangible, through the medium of language, which can articulate a *sense of place*. This concept is examined through the novel approach of comparing two Indigenous literary works from different parts of the world: *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, a novel by Māori author Tina Makereti; and Nils-Aslak Valkeapää's book of Sámi poetry, *Trekways of the Wind*. The analysis examines how Indigenous concepts of place are represented within these works, with language as a platform to articulate place through naming, translation and story. Finally, the juxtaposition of selected passages from the chosen literature, through Chadwick Allen's trans-Indigenous methodology, gives a deeper insight into how literature can create a sense of place, from an Indigenous-to-Indigenous perspective.

Keywords: Place, Indigenous, literature, Sámi, Māori, Moriori, trans-Indigenous, Valkeapää, Makereti

Table of Contents

1 Introduction ... 1

1.1 Making Connections ... 1

1.2 The Topic ... 2

1.3 Research Questions and Objectives ... 3

1.4 Data ... 4

1.4.1 Poetry: *Trekways of the Wind* ... 4

1.4.2 Fiction: *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* ... 4

1.4.3 Interview ... 5

1.5 Relevance ... 5

1.6 The Position of the Researcher and Ethical Research ... 6

1.7 Thesis Overview ... 8

2 Background and Context ... 9

2.1 Introduction ... 9

2.2 Core Texts and Other Literature ... 9

2.2.1 *Trekways of the Wind* by Nils-Aslak Valkeapää ... 9

2.2.2 *Where The Rēkohu Bone Sings* by Tina Makereti ... 11

2.2.3 Other Texts ... 13

2.3 Indigenous Worldviews ... 13

2.4 Notes on the Text ... 15

3 Theory, Methodology, and Academic Works ... 16

3.1 Introduction ... 16

3.2 Geography's Place Theory and Other Disciplines 16
3.3 Postcolonialism 18
3.4 Indigenous Methodologies 20
3.5 Chadwick Allen's *Trans-Indigenous* 23

4 Analysis I: The Representation of Place 25
4.1 Introduction 25
4.2 Titles 26
4.3 Characters 29
4.4 Places 33
4.4.1 Resonant Places 33
4.4.2 The Book As Place 34
4.5 Discussion 35

5 Analysis II:The Language of Place: Naming and Story 38
5.1 Introduction 38
5.2 Language 39
5.2.1 Language and Colonization 41
5.2.2 Language and Revitalization 41
5.2.3 Language and Landscape 43
5.3 Naming and Placenames 46
5.3.1 Naming 46
5.3.2 Placenames 48
5.3.3 The Politics of Naming Places 50
5.3.4 Translation 53

5.4 Story and Place 55

5.5 Discussion 59

6 Analysis III: Trans-Indigenous 63

6.1 Introduction 63

6.2 The Texts 66

6.2.1 From *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* 67

6.2.2 From *Trekways of the Wind* 68

6.3 A Trans-Indigenous Reading 69

6.3.1 Pieces in Transition 69

6.3.2 Warm Prairie Wind 70

6.3.3 Spiral, Koru, Labyrinth 71

6.3.4 Reading Across: Other Alphabets 72

6.3.5 The Indigenous Other 74

6.3.6 A Sámi Reading of a Māori text, a Māori Reading of a Sámi text 74

6.4 Common Ground 76

7 Conclusion 78

7.1 Summary of Analysis 78

7.2 Books on the Shelf 80

8 Works Cited 82

1 Introduction

1.1 Making Connections

It was my first morning on the island of Rēkohu. I woke up in the Kōpinga Marae, surrounded by carvings of the Moriori ancestors on the walls and on the central post, *Ka Pou a Rangitokona*. The large, pentagonal room was intimate, despite its size, and I felt humbled to be present in that sacred space. Opening the blinds, the large windows gave a panoramic view of Lake Huro, the Te Whānga Lagoon, and the open ocean beyond it. I had been invited to stay in the marae while carrying out research for my thesis, and that morning my host, Susan Thorpe, suggested that I come along with them to Manukau Bay. A sperm whale had been beached on the shore of the island a week earlier; they had removed the jawbone and were taking it down to the bay. The plan was to remove the teeth, which are very valuable, and then lower the jawbone into the sea with ropes, so the fish would clean the flesh from the bone. Whale bone has a lot of traditional uses, today it is used mainly for ornament and carving.

The trailer was backed down to the shore, and the men commenced the arduous task of extracting the teeth from the jaw. I was told that, in Moriori tradition, if an elder dies on the island, a whale would beach on the shore a short time later. This was a gift from the ocean gods. What I was witnessing was a scene not many outsiders get to see, a practice performed by many generations on Rēkohu. I got into conversation with Susan's husband, Maui Solomon, the grandson of the last 'full-blood' Moriori, Tommy Solomon. I had passed Tommy's memorial statue with interest on our way down to the bay, having read about it in Tina Makereti's novel, *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*. I told Maui I was studying in the Centre for Sámi Studies in Tromsø University. He said he had worked closely with a Sámi at one point, on international Indigenous issues. That man was Mattias Åhrén. Åhrén had been my lecturer in Indigenous Law, and has worked for the United Nations on Indigenous rights, issues that are considered within the poetry of Nils-Aslak Valkeapää. So there I was, an Irish student from a land inside the Arctic Circle, making associations on an island in the middle of the Pacific Ocean, eight hundred kilometres east of the main islands of Aotearoa/New Zealand. Making that real connection, being in that place, situated me within my research. My work had begun.

1.2 The Topic

The topic of this thesis is the representation and articulation of the concept of *place* within Indigenous literature. A comparative analysis, exploring different Indigenous worldviews, can lend an insight into the relationship of Indigenous peoples to their land, while retaining specific and distinct aspects of the localized experience. Geographers Jay Johnson and Soren Larsen claim, in the introduction to their book *A Deeper Sense of Place*, 'We are marked by the landscapes we inhabit, and they inevitably follow us into our interactions with others' (2013, p. 11). This is not a new idea in Indigenous discourse. The very definition of Indigenous peoples is tied to an association with place, as is demonstrated in the International Labour Organization (ILO) Convention no.169, and in the Martinéz Cobo Report to the UN Sub-Commission on the Prevention of Discrimination of Minorities. As part of the attempt to approach a definition of Indigenous groups, both use the prerequisite of peoples having a tie to ancestral lands, being descended from the original occupiers of those territories, and therefore having a continuous attachment to a particular place (Minde, 2008). For Indigenous peoples, this connection is not merely a physical occupation of a territory, not an objective, Cartesian space. It is an ongoing conversation that includes relationship to ancestors, flora, fauna, topographical features, and the language of naming, indeed the very language of cosmology. For Māori people, for example, the idea of creation is seen as a continuous action, where 'the world is sung into existence, the flesh is sung onto the bones, and the relationships are sung which bind all together within the cosmos…the spoken word connects the breath of people to that of the world and animates, brings life to place' (Murton, 2013, p. 146).

While the connection to and representation of the concept of place could be examined within political, legal, or anthropological fields of research, I have chosen to look at the literature of Indigenous cultures. Literature allows the expression of the intangible, through the medium of language, which can articulate a (hidden) history, a *sense of place*. This can be explored through comparing Indigenous literary works. *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, a novel by Māori author Tina Makereti, gives a narrative voice to the history of the Moriori people of Rēkohu. Nils-Aslak Valkeapää's book of poetry, *Ruoktu Váimmus (Trekways of the Wind)* articulates the deep connection between the Sámi people and the landscape. The Chatham Island, or Rēkohu in the Moriori language, and Sápmi, an area covering the North of

Norway, Sweden, Finland, and the Kola Peninsula in Russia, are landscapes that have formed the people, their culture, and their way of life.

The analysis will examine how Indigenous concepts of place are represented within these works, with language as a platform for the articulation of place through naming, translation and story. Finally, the interpretation of selected passages from the chosen literature, through Chadwick Allen's trans-Indigenous methodology, is shown to give a deeper insight into a sense of place from an Indigenous-to-Indigenous perspective.

1.3 Research Questions and Objectives

Indigenous Studies is interdisciplinary in nature, as it covers many different fields of research. Writing a literature thesis within an Indigenous framework will produce some challenges, as it is neither a Literature thesis, nor is it Social Science. Comparing two literary works from Indigenous authors, from different parts of the world, and exploring the concept of *place* within this literature, provokes the primary research question:

> How are Indigenous concepts of place represented and articulated in the collection of poetry, *Trekways of the Wind* by Sámi artist and poet Nils-Aslak Valkeapää, and the novel, *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, by Māori author Tina Makereti?

Taking this question as the parameter for the research, the objectives will be to look at how *place* is represented in the within the novel and poetry collection, and how language articulates a sense of place using naming, translation, and story. Chadwick Allen's trans-Indigenous methodology, in juxtaposing excerpts from the two Indigenous texts, gives an Indigenous-to-Indigenous comparison that enhances an understanding of both Māori and Sámi worldviews and experience. These objectives can be explored through these three tasks:

> How this literature identifies with and contributes to Indigenous concepts of place in the representations of titles, characters and locations;

> What tools or markers used by the authors through language, such as naming, translation and story, convey a connection to the landscape;

> What can be learned by comparatively juxtaposing the literature of Indigenous narratives of shared colonial histories from diverse parts of the world, and do these texts arrive at similar conclusions, in the era of decolonization and globalization?

These three objectives form the basis of the three chapters of analysis within this thesis, examining language and place within the core texts, and considering how literature evokes an Indigenous concept of *place* that is both specific and universal.

1.4 Data

1.4.1 Poetry: *Trekways of the Wind*

Áillohaš, or Nils-Aslak Valkeapää (1943-2001) is probably the most renowned of Sámi writers. He is also a musician and an artist, and these factors come in to play in many of his works, as he tends to use all media. *Ruoktu Váimmus* (*Trekways of the Wind*) includes poetry, drawings and musical scores. This text is particularly accessible to the non-Sámi reader, and is an exploration of the Sámi concept of place and identity. The use of Sámi placenames serve as anchors to personal histories and ancestral roots in the land.

1.4.2 Fiction: *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*

Māori author Tina Makereti's novel, *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, tells of the controversial history of the Moriori, a pacifist people on Rēkohu, the Chatham Islands east of Aotearoa/New Zealand, who were invaded in 1835 by two *iwi* (tribes) of Māori, and subsequently slaughtered or enslaved. The protagonists of the novel are connected to this story, in different timelines in history. Makereti's novel title ties the concept of place to a reconnection with ancestors, and a hidden, almost forgotten past, and a reclaiming of Indigenous identity.

1.4.3 Interview

The analysis of Tina Makereti's novel, *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* is complemented by an interview with the author. This was conducted while on fieldwork in Wellington, New Zealand, in October, 2017. In the interview, Makereti gave insight into the process of her choice to give the story of the Moriori a voice through the medium of fiction, rather than history or non-fiction. This story is represented through her choice of locations, the different worldviews of the characters, and the use of Māori and Moriori vocabulary within the text. This interview highlights and reinforces some of the main themes explored within the analysis.

1.5 Relevance

In the context of literature, all human communities, since time immemorial, have had their storytellers, their songs, their sacred words. Stories contain the essence of a community. In telling stories, the people learn the codes, the taboos, the ambitions that are expected of them. Words create ritual, they form the parameters of a society. There is power in words – in ancient Ireland, the poets had the same status as the druids, and with words a king could have his reputation raised or destroyed by a satire, in a society where honour was everything. *Dindsenchas*, or the 'Lore of Places' could be recited, giving the history and etymology of places, much like the Māori tradition of *Whakapapa Māori,* which traces a people's genealogy and connects them to their lands.

In modern times, this evolved from the oral to the written tradition. With colonization, the power of the word shifted onto the page. Laws were written down, treaties were composed and signed in ink, and peoples were displaced. Places were translated and renamed on new maps. Books were published and circulated, telling about the 'savage' native communities who lost their power, their voice. It is only in the last century that this balance has been redressed. With the written word, the colonized have taken on the forms of the colonizer and made them their own; they now have the power of self-representation, to tell their own stories, evoke their own landscapes.

Tina Makereti discusses the power of literature in interview, and how it affects people, when she says, of writing her novel about the history of the Moriori people on Rēkohu, 'I

always wanted to write a story, not a history, or not as non-fiction, because story really stays with people' (2017, p. 7). Nils-Aslak Valkeapää connects his poetry to art and music, and creates a sense of connection between the Sámi and their landscape within his books. What is new, or, at least, largely unexplored, is comparing these literatures across different Indigenous cultures, bypassing the dominant mainstream literary culture. While every Indigenous society is unique, there are insights to be gained from similar colonial experiences. The research is based on what place means to peoples, their histories, and how the language of naming and the sense of the sacred are related to the physical landscape. Comparative research in the field of Indigenous literature enhances the relationships and connections between cultures, and continues the process of forming networks within the field of Indigenous Studies.

1.6 The Position of the Researcher and Ethical Research

Growing up in Ireland, I was always aware of the shadow of our history, of Ireland's position as England's first colony. My mother tongue is commonly referred to as Hiberno-English, and is peppered with double-verbs, reversed syntax, and Gaelic words there is no English translation for. The Troubles in Northern Ireland were the backdrop to my childhood and teens. The Potato Famine of 1845 was discussed as if it had happened last week. The looming presence of historical subjugation has permeated Irish culture like a collective trauma. This led to my interest in other communities with shared histories, and in 2010, I went out to Pine Ridge Indian Reservation in South Dakota, home to the Oglala Lakota people, to do voluntary work with an organization there, the first trip of many. Wounded Knee is located not far from where I lived, a place that symbolizes both tragedy and rebellion: the site of the massacre in 1890 that effectively ended the Indian Wars; and the occupation by tribal members and the American Indian Movement in 1973. I have seen first-hand what it means to be Indigenous in the United States today; and have witnessed the poverty and social conditions that go along with that. I have also seen hope; there is a new pride in the younger generation for their culture and heritage, a revitalization of language and the traditional arts; and last year with the protests at Standing Rock to the north, a new voice. I see literature as an integral part of this; the stories, poems and songs stand as a witness to history as it unfolds.

My primary degree was in English Literature and Irish Folklore, which form the basis for the choice of my research in this thesis using literature, storytelling, and *Dindsenchas,* the etymology of placenames. As a poet myself, I have explored, in my first collection, *Other Places* (2014), the idea of place and belonging; it therefore feels like a natural move for me to consider a similar topic within an academic context. Taking what I term an 'in situ' approach, my studies in the University of Tromsø locates me in Sápmi, the traditional homeland of the Sámi people, and Indigenous Studies naturally focuses on aspects of Sámi local culture, history and politics; through this, and getting to know the landscape and people, I have gained some insight into the Sámi worldview. In September 2017, I went to Aotearoa/New Zealand to conduct research, in Wellington and on Rēkohu. This gave me a greater depth of knowledge of the Māori and Moriori cultures, and allowed me to experience some of the locations mentioned in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*.

I am aware, as a non-Indigenous researcher, of my position as an outsider within the cultures and traditions I discuss. Therefore I approach my research with sensitivity and respect, in order to gain a deeper understanding and knowledge of other cultures, languages and worldviews, and represent these responsibly within my thesis project. This project mainly concerns literature analysis, but ethics still come into consideration when dealing with texts. It requires a certain respect and sensitivity to the subject matter, and a responsible representation of the authors' works. The value of this thesis should be reciprocally beneficial to the research and the researched, and it is important to evaluate the possible consequences of my project. Having done research on the Chatham Islands in New Zealand, and also conducted an interview with the author Tina Makereti, this ethical approach involves keeping in touch with the people who aided me on the ground in my research, making them aware of any material I may use, and asking their permission to do so; and making my thesis available to them on completion. Exploring the worldviews of cultures other than my own, I am aware of the limitations of my knowledge. Therefore my respect and gratitude for my teachers and the coursework within Indigenous Studies, my fieldwork, and the relationships formed with Lakota, Sámi, Māori and Moriori people, has guided my research and provided the basis of my understanding of and insight into the Indigenous perspective.

1.7 Thesis Overview

Having provided an introduction to the research in this chapter, the next chapter looks at the background and context of the chosen literary texts, the Indigenous worldviews discussed in the analysis, and some general notes. Chapter 3 discusses the theories and methodologies that provide the framework for the analysis, and the relevant academic literature associated with this. Chapter 4 is the first chapter of analysis, and focuses on how place is represented in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* and *Trekways of the Wind*. The analysis explores how the concept of place is evoked through the titles of the works, the characters within the texts, and the locations and landscapes described. Chapter 5 examines how language articulates place, looking at language itself, and how concepts of language are tied into the landscape. The process of naming, placenames, and translation in the literary texts form a discussion of colonialism and the renaming of places as a form of power, control, and legitimization. The use of storytelling as a means of connecting to and locating people within their occupied landscape is also discussed. Chapter 6, the final chapter of the analysis, focuses on a passage of prose from *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* and a poem from *Trekways of the Wind*. Using Chadwick Allen's methodology of *juxtaposition*, the texts are placed alongside each other, in order to consider Indigenous-to-Indigenous relationships, in what Allen terms as *trans-Indigenous*. The final chapter concludes with a summary of the research, relating back to the research questions, discusses the main findings of the analysis, and the position of the thesis within the discipline of Indigenous Studies in general.

2 Background and Context

2.1 Introduction

This chapter establishes some background to the texts chosen, and situates them within the larger framework of Indigenous and postcolonial culture and history, and also within the context of the Indigenous global and institutional revitalization process that has gained momentum since the latter half of the twentieth century. The term 'Indigenous' remains largely undefined in the political sphere, as it has grown to include marginalized groups within national boundaries of countries in Africa and Asia, and the term covers a multitude of peoples' cultures, traditions and epistemologies. Therefore, the particular Indigenous groups whose worldviews are mentioned in this analysis are highlighted. Some notes on the text, explaining the use of spelling, and the method of reference for the unpaginated *Trekways of the Wind* are also explained.

2.2 Core Texts and Other Literature

2.2.1 *Trekways of the Wind* by Nils-Aslak Valkeapää

At the foundation meeting of the World Council of Indigenous Peoples in Port Alberni, on the west coast of Canada, in 1975, the issue was raised as to whether the Sámi, a group of white Europeans, could be considered as an Indigenous people. Some of the Latin American delegates in particular were suspicious, but the leader of The International Work Group for Indigenous Affairs (IWGIA), Helge Kleivan, related in Spanish the colonial history of the Sámi people, referring to them as 'white Indians'. Following this, some Sámi performers, wearing the traditional *gákti,* took to the stage, and Nils-Aslak Valkeapää performed the traditional *yoik* of the Sámi. The crowd was won over and, as Henry Minde articulates, they 'passed a test that resulted in them being credited with the status of indigenous people on an international scale' (Minde, 2003, p. 85). Since then, the Sámi have been involved in the Indigenous movement in the international arena, which has helped the process for self-determination on the state level in their home countries.

In fact, one could look at the entire process of Sámi revitalization through the lens of Nils-Aslak Valkeapää's contribution, both in the arts and in the political arena. From the seventeenth century, the Sámi people had been colonized and missionized within the borders of the Northern parts of the four countries that make up their homeland, Sápmi (namely Norway, Sweden, Finland and the Kola peninsula in Russia). The *yoik*, as an instrument of the *noaidi*, the Sámi shamen, had been forbidden as part of this religion. Valkeapää, a Sámi from the Finnish side, was working for the cultural rights of the Sámi, as the coordinator of cultural projects in the World Council of Indigenous Peoples. He established the *yoik* as part of the world music scene, interpreting it in a fusion with other genres such as jazz and modern composition. Valkeapää organized the first festival of Indigenous art and culture, *Davvi Šuvva*, in 1979, and performed at the opening ceremony of the Winter Olympics at Lillehammer in 1994. His *Bird Symphony* was awarded the international *Prix Italia* in 1993. Not limiting his talents to music, he also established the publishing house DAT for Sámi literature, and published books of poetry which incorporated some of his artworks, and won the prestigious Nordic Council's literature prize in 1991, for his book of poetry and photographs, *Beaivi Áhčažan (The Sun, My Father).* He also acted in and wrote the musical score for the film *Ofelaš* (*Pathfinder*) in 1987. In 2001, the feminine counterpart to *Beaivi Áhčažan* was published, a poetry collection entitled *Eanni, Eannážan* (*The Earth, my Mother*). This was translated to English in 2017.

Ruoktu Váimmus (Trekways of the Wind) was published in Sámi in 1985, followed by translations into Swedish (1987), Norwegian (1990), and English (1994). It is a trilogy based on three previous publications, *Giđa ijat čuovagadat (White Spring Nights)* in 1974; *Lávlo vizar biellocizáš (Bluethroat, Twitter, Sing)* in 1976; and *Ádjaga silbasuonat (Stream's Silver Veins)* in 1989. While *The Sun, My Father* was written very much for the Sámi people themselves, *Trekways of the Wind* opens up the audience to non-Sámi readers, which is one of the reasons for the choice of this text. It contains poems not just about the Sámi people, but also incorporates other Indigenous peoples whom he met on his travels to Greenland, Canada and the prairies of North America, therefore widening the scope of his work to an international Indigenous level. It contains not only poetry, but also many of his own illustrations, and the notation of a musical score, Pehr Henrik Nordgren's *Lávllarádu*, based on some of the poems from *Bluethroat, Twitter, Sing*. The book is unpaginated, which leads

the reader through text, art and music, into its own world, very much rooted in the idea of landscape as a basis for the inspiration of the artistic forms.

2.2.2 *Where The Rēkohu Bone Sings* by Tina Makereti

Tina Makereti has Māori (Ngāti Tūwharetoa, Te Ati Awa, Ngāti Rangatahi), Pākehā (a New Zealander of European descent) and, according to family stories, Moriori ancestry. *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* is her first novel, and won the 2014 Ngā Kupu Ora Aotearoa Māori Book Award for Fiction. She has also written a short story collection, *Once Upon a Time in Aotearoa* (2010), and edited an anthology of Pacific literature with Witi Ihimaera, *Black Marks on the White Page* (2017). Makereti teaches in the BA Creative Writing, Masters' Creative Writing and PhD Creative Writing programmes at Massey University, Palmerston North. Her writing follows in the tradition of the Māori literature written in the second half of the twentieth century, which, like the Sámi revitalization, mirrored the political situation concerning Indigenous rights. The Treaty of Waitangi, signed in 1840 by the Māori people and the British Crown, became the focus of Māori protest in the 1960s, which ended up in the creation of the Waitangi Tribunal in 1975, a commission of inquiry dealing with Māori land rights claims in Aotearoa/New Zealand. Alongside this, Māori writers, such as Witi Ihimaera and Patricia Grace, were beginning to publish. Ihimaera's book of short stories, *Pounamu, Pounamu* (1972) is widely considered to be the first fiction published by a Māori author that gives insight into Māori lives, uses Māori concepts and language, and deals with Māori identity. Makereti, like Ihimaera and Grace, writes in English but uses many Māori words in the text, and explores issues facing the contemporary Māori today.

In writing *The Rēkohu Bone Sings*, Makereti tells the story of the Moriori, the people of the Chatham Islands, or *Rēkohu* in the Moriori language, (*Wharekauri* in Māori). A sensitive subject, she wanted to give the story a voice, and, asking permission to do so, she talks about the 'need to place, to make the Moriori the centre of the story, to make it from their perspective' (2017, p. 9). The novel explores, in three different timelines, the invasion in 1835 of Rēkohu by two Māori *iwi* (tribes), Ngāti Mutunga and Ngāti Tama, who had been displaced from their traditional lands in Taranaki on the main islands. The slaughter was immense, and unprecedented in Moriori history. Those who were not killed (ritualized cannibalism was part of this) were enslaved, and some were taken back to the main islands.

Many died afterwards, through ill treatment or *kongenge* (despair). They were separated from their families, women were sexually abused, marriage between Moriori was forbidden, and they were forced to break their own taboos (*tapu*). (King, 1989). The dispossession of land was another devastating factor. The 'dislocation from their livelihoods, traditions and *tapu* reduced their vitality as a community' (Brett, 2015, p. 139). For the Moriori, their worldview was tied into the landscape.

This invasion had a detrimental effect on how the Māori people were viewed. The two *iwi*, Ngāti Mutunga and Ngāti Tama, and their actions on Rēkohu, quickly became extended to all Māori, and 'Moriori became part of a narrative of unbridled Māori violence towards an inferior people that served as justification for Pākehā colonization and 'civilization' of alleged Māori barbarism' (Brett, 2015, p. 145). In fact, many have argued that the actions of these two *iwi*, not even all members of the tribes, were not consistent with general Māori practice, and had been influenced to a large extent by European colonialism. Makereti states: 'they already had had their culture quite radically changed, by the musket mainly…and had become more vicious in the face of more vicious warfare' (2017, p. 9). Historian Michael King refers to a 'borrowed currency of racism' where Māori travelling to Sydney became aware of the treatment of the Aboriginal people by the Europeans, and coined a term for 'blackfellas' in Māori to refer to the Moriori – *paraiwhara*. (1989, p. 16). The Māori therefore saw the Moriori as an inferior race, and did not adhere to general practices of conquest seen on the main islands; they did not intermarry, their children were not recognized as members of their *iwi*, the concept of 'slavery' was more akin to that of European colonists elsewhere. The kind of racism that prevailed on Rēkohu was therefore not usual in the customary norms of Māori warfare, and was influenced significantly by their own colonial encounter on the main islands of Aotearoa/New Zealand. The novel, while addressing the story of the Moriori, also offers the Māori viewpoint through the character of Bigs, who has embraced his Māori culture. As one of the descendants of Imi, the Moriori ancestor spirit who died during the invasion, both he and his sister Lula come to terms with their Pākehā, Māori and Moriori heritage, and find a sense of belonging in the land, on the island of Rēkohu.

2.2.3 Other Texts

While the main focus for this thesis is on the two chosen texts, *Trekways of the Wind* and *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, other Indigenous literature by Native American, Māori and Sámi authors are also referenced. Brian Friel, an Irish postcolonial playwright at the forefront of the influential Field Day Theatre Company in Northern Ireland, illustrates in particular aspects of placenames, naming, and story in his play, *Translations* (1981), as demonstrated in Chapter 5. *Translations* centres its dramatic analysis on 'anxieties of naming, speaking, and voice and the relation of these to place, identity, and self-realization' (Deane, 1990, p. 14). The theme of the play is language, or loss of a native language to that of the coloniser's, and describes the process of the anglicization of Irish placenames by the British army, and the consequences of this on a rural, Irish speaking village in Donegal, in the northwest of Ireland.

2.3 Indigenous Worldviews

While one can draw common threads through the Indigenous outlook and experience on the global level, it is also necessary to honour the specificity of local epistemologies within this research. In most cases, the Sámi and Māori worldviews are discussed, as the authors, Valkeapää and Makereti come from these points of reference, and are therefore the most appropriate in the analysis. The Moriori worldview intersects that of the Māori, as the languages and concepts are related, and many Moriori on Rēkohu would be of mixed descent. For example, the concepts of *tapu* (sacred, or forbidden) and *taonga* (something prized or treasured) would be similar. They do, however, diverge significantly in some fundamental ways. Although the Kōpinga Marae was constructed as a hub for Moriori gatherings, the Moriori did not traditionally build maraes. Instead, they would have used the sacred groves of Kōpi trees, where the dendroglyphs of the ancestors are carved on live trees, for meetings and ceremonies. The marae is named 'Kōpinga' in honour of these trees, and the carvings on the walls and central pou in Hokomenetai, the central area in the marae, are based on the dendroglyphs. The most essential difference between Māori and Moriori worldviews is the Moriori system known as Nunuku's Law. Conditions were tough on the islands, and constant warfare would not have been beneficial to the community at large. Nunuku, an elder living some time around the 16th century, created a law that demanded the performance of ritualized

combat that ended at the first sign of abrasion or blood, and was generally adhered to. Moriori feats of masculinity were expressed in climbing cliffs for birds' eggs, collecting shellfish, or in carving or manufacturing tools. This kept in balance the management of resources, and so the 'pursuit of a peaceful existence was therefore not an ideological imperative, but an environmental necessity'. (Brett, 2015, p. 136). Nunuku's Law had a significant impact on the Moriori people at the time of the invasion in 1835, as, after some debate, they decided to uphold this law rather than enter into combat with the newcomers. Today, Nunuku's Law is endorsed within the revitalization process of The Hokotehi Moriori Trust, which includes education, traditional knowledge in archaeological practice, repatriating artefacts and buying back lands, and in the future, establishing a research facility on the islands. Another main area of concern is to do with reasserting control over naming places, as 'naming and knowledge of a place is known to be strongly connected to retention of guardianship roles and duties – "a sense of place"' (Solomon & Thorpe, 2012, p. 254). This idea of naming the cultural landscape reinforces the attachment and sense of belonging the Moriori feel to these islands, and in respect to this, the use of 'Rēkohu' when referring to the main Chatham Island is privileged within this thesis.

Other Indigenous worldviews from different parts of the globe are also discussed, particularly from the Native American perspective. Lakota native Vine Deloria's philosophies on relationality are mentioned, and Keith Basso's seminal work with the Western Apache people highlight many important perspectives on placenames and stories of place. Paula Gunn Allen (Laguna Pueblo, Lakota) is referred to in terms of Indigenous concepts of time, and N. Scott Momaday (Kiowa) is also referenced in relation to Indigenous concepts of place.

It is also useful to discuss some of the central ideas in what is referred to as the 'Western', or, as preferred here, the Eurocentric worldview. This is a term often condensed within the discourses of Indigenous Studies, so it may be appropriate for the purposes of this thesis to unpack the core assumptions of its paradigms. Within the Eurocentric perspective, one can say there is an assumed hierarchical subjectivity, where the white western male is the 'centred subject', the subject with most agency and voice. The Enlightenment period's scientific bias led to a division between science and religion, a metaphysical dualism commonly referred to as the Cartesian division of mind/body split, and the notion of binary oppositions. A positivist approach affirms that all knowledge regarding matters of fact is based on the "positive" data of experience and the realm of logic and science. The Eurocentric

worldview also contains concepts of universal truths (statements of ideas that are applicable in every context), or grand narratives. These grand narratives include the Christian notion of redemption, Marxist utopianism, and progressivism.

2.4 Notes on the Text

The spelling of Māori and Sámi words within the thesis are based on the considered usage of the peoples themselves. Although there are some alternatives, it seems consistent to use the translators' spellings of Sámi words within *Trekways of the Wind*, as the poems are often quoted. This leads to homogenous spelling integrity throughout the thesis. Therefore, for example, *yoik* is used instead of *joik*, and *gákti* instead of *gahkti*. As *Trekways of the Wind* is unpaginated, a system enabling reference to the poems had to be found, which was based on one used by Bjarne Markussen in his article, 'Law and Multimodal Aesthetics: Nils-Aslak Valkeapää's *Trekways of the Wind*' (2013). He claims the organizing unit follows the logic of a picture-book, and therefore uses the double-spread, whether text or illustration, rather than the single page. Not including the foreword and the glossary, he comes up with 161 double-spreads. Taking this method, but breaking it down for ease of locating the poems, the reference system used here divides the book into the three sections, 'White Spring Nights', 'Bluethroat, Twitter, Sing', and 'Stream's Silver Veins'. They are sections 1, 2, and 3. The first double-spread is the title page (ds.1). So, for example, the poem 'My Home is in my Heart' is located in Section 2, on the double-spread number 45. That is, 2: ds.45. This allows the reader to access more readily the poems quoted in the analysis, and negotiate a way through the landscape of the book itself.

3 Theory, Methodology, and Academic Works

3.1 Introduction

This chapter deals with theories that give a framework for this thesis, and provide a common academic language with which to refer to specific aspects of the analysis. These paradigms ground the positioning of this research within the wider scholarly field. An overview of each theory or methodology is illustrated, the application of its relevance to the analysis is discussed, and the academic literature that provides insight and reference to the thesis is described. The discipline of Indigenous studies is multidisciplinary, and therefore theoretical aspects from other areas, such as geography, anthropology, and literary critical theory have been garnered, alongside the methodologies and research paradigms associated with Indigenous research.

3.2 Geography's Place Theory and Other Disciplines

The concept of *place* is one of the fundamental terms in the discipline of geography. Tim Cresswell, in his book *Place: An Introduction* (2015), defines place as 'a meaningful location' (p. 12). Historically, *place* in geography was defined by 'regions' - different and specific areas on the Earth's surface, termed 'chorology', that could be discussed in comparison to other places. Human geography has since incorporated the relationship of people to their environment, and shared cultural spaces. *Place* has become a central concept that emphasizes subjective experience, taking into consideration philosophies such as existentialism and phenomenology (pp. 33-5). Scholars such as Yi-Fu Tuan address elements of *place* that include linguistic construction through naming, storytelling and the moral dimension of 'home'. He claims, 'words, alone, used in an appropriate situation, can have the power to render objects, formerly invisible because unattended, visible, and impart to them a certain character' (1991, p. 684). Cresswell defines three main approaches within the field of geography:

1) A descriptive approach, which sees the world as a set of places, dealing with the distinctiveness and particularity of places, following in the tradition of regional geography.
2) A social constructionist approach, which looks at the uniqueness of place as part of the wider process of its construction, with underlying social conditions, such as capitalism, patriarchy or colonialism. This approach has encouraged geographers into the arena of critical theory, applying poststructuralism, marxism and feminism to their discipline.
3) A phenomenological approach, which deals less with particularity, or social forces in its construction as a concept, but sees *place* as the essence of human existence. 'Places' are not as important as *place*. This is the realm of humanistic geographers, neo-humanists, and phenomenological philosophers.

There is some obvious overlap in these areas, and research can be approached from all three angles. As Cresswell asserts, 'Recently, geographers and others have attempted to write accounts of place that have some of the syncretic and descriptive characteristics of early regional geographies but are informed by phenomenology, poststructuralism and assemblage theory' (2015, p. 56). Other geographical scholars, along with anthropologists and other disciplines, have increasingly been taking into consideration the Indigenous concept of place in their fields of research.

In Jay Johnson and Soren Larson's *A Deeper Sense of Place: Stories and Journeys of Collaboration in Indigenous Research* (2013), they discuss the role of geographical research between academics and Indigenous peoples. Indigenous worldviews and epistemology are now being taken into consideration, where 'collaboration today begins more often with an open negotiation between Indigenous people and academic practitioners over the inquiry's purpose, design, and dissemination of results' (p. 8). The book looks at various research projects, from fishing practices to cultural resource management, where the Indigenous perspective has been highlighted, and has enhanced the research process in line with Indigenous self-determination.

Keith Basso, as an anthropological ethnographer, has researched ideas of place within the Indigenous epistemologies of the Western Apache people in his influential work, *Wisdom Sits in Places: Language and Landscape Among the Western Apache* (1996). Basso explores the relationship between language and landscape, how things are named, and the stories of

place, which have proved useful to this thesis, particularly in the chapters that analyze the representation and the articulation of place through language. In the field of Onomastics, Laura Kostanski and Guy Puzey's book, *Names and Naming: People, Places, Perceptions and Power* (2016) have provided helpful chapters on naming and placenames, particularly in the context of Sámi placenames. Research these disciplines have provided an academic framework when discussing place as a concept, but as this thesis looks at *place* through the lens of literature, some key literary critical theories are also utilized within the work.

3.3 Postcolonialism

For any analysis on Indigenous literature, the vocabulary and concepts from postcolonial theory are hard to avoid. Postcolonialism emerged from the shortcomings of Eurocentric theory to deal with the complex issues of the literature of peoples with a shared history of having been colonized. These groups then attempt to centralize their position from the margins of empire, and address their ongoing legacy of historical, political, linguistic and cultural oppression through concerns with identity, nationality, race, class, ethnicity, gender, language and power. Postcolonialism, in its most recent forms, considers not just those countries which have regained independence as a previous colony, such as India, and African and Caribbean countries, but also the decolonization strategy of reconstituting native cultures, and the neocolonising process dealing with modern capitalism, where multinational corporations control the globe.

Focusing on the omnipresent power struggles and the intersection of cultures, postcolonialism works through 'maintaining a critical perspective on relations of power, while at the same time challenging the binary categories of homogenous colonizing and colonized groups and the reproduction of these polarities' (Nash, 1999, p. 459). Edward Said's seminal work, *Orientalism* (1978), introduces the idea of this polarization in his concept of the 'Other' as a European construct of 'the Orient' to be everything Western civilization is not – 'exotic', 'uncivilized', 'backward', 'childlike'. This ties in to Franz Fanon's notion of a 'manichean allegory', the dualistic concept of binary opposites, where one can see conflict in terms of light/dark, or good/evil; which is then transposed to other

cultures as Occident/Orient, civilized/savage, colonizer/colonized, and suchlike. This, he claims, in *The Wretched of the Earth* (1961), is the recurring structure of colonial society.

The binary of centre/margin, where the seat of empire is located in the metropolis, (such as London), implies the colonial subject is relegated to the margins, the periphery. The act of 'writing back' to the centre is discussed in Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin's book, *The Empire Writes Back* (1989). Due to the cultural hegemony of maintained dominance of the European literary canon as the standard and the norm, the production of texts from the 'colonies' are seen as 'isolated national offshoots of English literature, and which therefore relegate them to marginal and subordinate positions' (p. 7). 'Writing back' deconstructs this notion, as, like feminist texts, there is an insistence in giving this literature a stance, a voice, that is both cultural and political.

While aspects of postcolonialism present ways to negotiate theoretical critiques of colonial suppression, there are inherent problems with aligning Indigenous experience with that of the postcolonial settler populations of, for example, the USA or Australia. These postcolonial societies are not necessarily congruent with the Indigenous experience – colonization, for many Indigenous people, is not over, and they are still marginalized within their own territories. As Chadwick Allen states, in his book *Blood Narrative* (2002), 'Indigenous minority discourses pose a problem for those orthodox postcolonial theories that designate 'essentialism', 'nativism', 'nationalism' and so forth as anachronistic politics, because Indigenous minority discourses often emphasize land and treaty rights and because they often insist on persistent racial, cultural and linguistic distinctiveness despite other changes over time' (p. 30). In this way, postcolonialism seems to offer only a polarized choice between essentialism and hybridity. Brian Murton also warns against the idea that 'self-consciously postcolonial theory mirrors its own views rather than engaging with alternate ontologies when working with Indigenous communities' (2013, p. 140). Postcolonialism as an umbrella term, while useful, poses limitations within its generalizations, a flattening out of historical experience, which does not always allow for the specificity of the Indigenous experience.

Some concepts from other critical theories, such as postmodernism and poststructuralism, are also implicit in an Indigenous reading. For example, Jean-Francois Lyotard's term for the totalizing narratives or metadiscourses of modernity, 'grand narratives', which have provided ideologies with a legitimating philosophy of history. Lyotard argues that

such authoritarian universalizing narratives are no longer viable in postmodernity, which heralds the emergence of 'little narratives', that deconstruct the grand narratives or universal truths of the Enlightenment's notions of progress. (Selden, Widdowson, & Brooker, 2013, p. 205). In Indigenous terms, these 'little narratives', which are less dualistic, and non-hierarchical, are evoked by Indigenous people's own versions of history and reality. As Sámi scholar Rauna Kuokkanen states, 'In a postmodern world, boundaries and strict divisions between dualistic notions are blurred. This is also typical of Indigenous people's societies. Therefore, it is possible to suggest that Indigenous societies have always been "postmodern"' (2000, p. 414). Postructuralist ideas addressing the de-centring of the subject, anti-universalism, and alternative forms of writing fall into line with Indigenous paradigms, since these 'share similar goals' (p. 414). Furthermore, poststructuralism challenges the nature of language as a signifier, and sees language rather as a subject in process, as discourse. This is explored in the analysis chapter on language and naming. Postcolonialism, postmodernism and poststructuralism all share aspects of the methodologies within the decolonization process, which has increasingly been taken up by Indigenous scholars themselves. They have created their own paradigms, that centre on Indigenous epistemologies and worldviews.

3.4 Indigenous Methodologies

In North America in the Nineties, there was a focus within Indigenous methodologies on 'hybridity and poststructuralist play', but then it developed more towards 'identity, pan-Native urbanity, and movement over rootedness and grounded memory…outside the limiting rhetorics of colonization' (Justice, 2016, p. 24). Craig Womack, in *Red on Red: Native American Literary Separatism* (1999), looks for what he terms as an 'Indigenous Literary Nationalism', defined by Daniel Heath Justice as ' a broad category for a diverse set of connected ideas about the role that Indigenous perspectives and experiences play in the interpretation of Indigenous literary productions' (p. 24). This is about the 'specifity of orientation' in place and time, taking into account context, centrality, and a recognition of difference, between the many tribes of North America. For example, Womack discusses the strategy of Joy Harjo, when she uses 'the idea of the Muskogee world to decenter the assumption that things European are normative. If one is always reacting *against*

Eurocentrism, then Europe is still the center' (1999, p. 242). This process has not been restricted to North America. Indigenism, and Indigenous methodologies put forward by scholars such as Linda Tuhiwai Smith, who incorporates the *Kaupapa Māori* methodology into her research in Aotearoa/New Zealand in *Decolonizing Methodologies* (1999). Kaupapa Māori research is:

1) Related to 'being Māori'
2) Connected to Māori philosophy and principles
3) Takes for granted the validity and legitimacy of Māori, the importance of Māori language and culture
4) Is concerned with the struggle for autonomy over their own cultural well-being (p. 187).

Smith ties this in with the wider process of Māori self-determination, claiming, 'Decolonization must offer a language of possibility, a way out of colonialism' (p. 204). Applying this research paradigm takes into consideration the specific epistemologies of the Māori tradition, and is connected to the language, knowledge and culture. In Smith's and Womack's models, the Nationalist approaches are very much based on the local, the culturally Indigenous specific within the nation. Arnold Krupat, on the other hand, takes cultural critique to the boundaries that exist *between* cultures.

In Arnold Krupat's book, *Ethnocriticism* (1992), he defines an ethnocritical approach within North America, as 'an interdisciplinary mix of anthropology, history and critical theory…needed for the study of Indian-White relations in the literature and culture of this country' (p. 4). He consolidates this with the concept of the *frontier*; not as the point to which 'civilization' has advanced, but rather, 'in a more relational manner, the frontier is understood as simply that shifting space in which two *cultures* encounter one another' (p. 5). While this liminality allows the binary oppositional sets like ''us/them, 'West/rest' to break down, this encounter between colonizer and colonized necessarily implies an asymmetrical power-laden contest, which, in itself, may become another form of imperialism; Indigenous peoples always become *subjects* of inquiry. There can be, he argues, no non-violent criticism of the Other. In *Red Matters* (2002), Krupat elaborates his concept of ethnocriticism to what he refers to as 'cosmopolitan comparativism'. Cosmopolitanism has a global comparative aim, where the common values of Indigenous cultures are explored on an international level, and set against the dominant paradigms of the Eurocentric discourse. Krupat claims, 'From an indigenous

perspective, it is not the nation, but the "earth" that is the source of the values on which a critical perspective must be based' (p. 10). The Cosmopolitan Indian, he argues, takes their identity from 'a commitment they share with Indigenous people everywhere to what Vizenor has called the tribal values of *continuance* and *survivance*' (2008, p. 362), from shared histories of dispossession and displacement from colonial suppression, where, despite the processes of assimilation and annihilation, Indigenous peoples are still here.

Krupat examines the three critical positions, as he sees it, in the US today – Indigenism (tribally specific, grounded in the culture and knowledge of an individual tribe), Nationalism and Cosmopolitanism. Indigenism and Nationalism are often set in opposition to Cosmopolitanism, pitting the local approach against the global approach. In the extreme, Nationalists may come across as 'irrational separatists who allow no room for the contributions of non-Native, non-tribally specific, or non-nationalist scholars' and Cosmopolitanists are seen as 'academic careerists disconnected from the concerns of Indigenous communities and "real" politics on the ground' (Allen C. , 2014, p. 379). This rift distracts Indigenous scholarship from the real issues of self-representation and production, and limits the range of scholarship and methodological practices that could be explored. Krupat argues for an alliance. He asserts: 'All three positions are inevitably interlinked; each can achieve its full coherence and effectiveness only in relation to the others…All three positions may be enlisted for the project of an anti-colonial criticism' (2008, p. 361). Harald Gaski has put forward these three approaches for the Sámi scholar – in his article 'Indigenism and Cosmopolitanism: A pan-Sámi view of the Indigenous perspective in Sámi culture and research' (2013). The Nationalist approach involves a pan-Sámi community basing its frame of reference in one nation, which, in the Nordic region, can combine with the Indigenist approach. Regarding the Cosmopolitan approach, he states, 'first, the Sámi voices were more engaged in working for Indigenous peoples' rights at a purely political level, and second…the Sámi concentrated primarily on developing scholarship about ourselves in our own language' (p. 120). This has led to a lack of time for engagement with the international Indigenous discourse, but, he claims, the Sámi 'are now once again headed back to the international arena at full speed' (p. 120).

Other Indigenous scholars have established ways of accessing research using Indigenous methods, such as using personal narrative as a way of positioning the researcher within the text, and considering the relationship between researcher and researched as active

reciprocity. Shawn Wilson's book, *Research is Ceremony* (2008), demonstrates these two research paradigms. Margaret Kovach explores the use of storytelling, of oral narrative as a research method in *Indigenous Methodologies* (2009), considering the Indigenous 'ways of knowing' as a central concept. Vine Deloria's collection of his works, *Spirit and Reason* (1999), offer good examples of his philosophies concerning relationality. These methodologies engage with specific Indigenous ways of knowing, exchange, and locatedness, taking into consideration the epistemological parameters of Indigenous research that move beyond notions of hierarchy and categorization.

3.5 Chadwick Allen's *Trans-Indigenous*

Chadwick Allen's methodology outlined in his book, *Trans-Indigenous* (2012), forms the basis for the third analysis chapter. Using the method of juxtaposing Indigenous texts and reading *across* genre, media, worldviews and practices, Allen's book asks: 'Which specific formats for *purposeful* Indigenous juxtapositions are productive within the field of literary studies? How might the potential of specific juxtapositions to provoke readings *across* various categories enable interpretations of a broad range of texts and practices? And how might such juxtapositions contribute to calls not only for the intellectual and artistic sovereignty of specific nations but also for an Indigenous intellectual and artistic sovereignty global in its scope?' (p. xviii). As a comparative form, juxtaposition attempts to place these texts side by side in order to create an Indigenous-to-Indigenous perspective, that circumvents a referral to the Eurocentric dominant literary culture, where the treatment of the texts 'locates itself firmly in the specificity of the Indigenous local while remaining always cognizant of the complexity of the relevant Indigenous global' (p. xix). In this way Allen bypasses the perceived academic rift between Nationalism and Cosmopolitanism within Indigenous scholarship. He also discusses the limitations of Indigenous scholarship within the 'ivory tower' of the dominant academic institution: 'No large-scale haven exists outside the Indigenous-settler binary and its asymmetrical relations of power' (2014, p. 377). The trans-Indigenous method, Allen argues, seeks to 'promote the work of denaturalizing the settler nation-state as the assumed ground (the only beginning) and implied horizon (the only end) for studies of Native American and Indigenous literatures' (2014, p. 378). In other words, the

practice of a trans-Indigenous method seeks to centre the Indigenous within academic scholarship on a global scale.

A poem from *Trekways of the Wind* by Nils-Aslak Valkeapää and a short passage from the novel *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* by Tina Makereti. are examined, using Allen's method of juxtaposition. This analysis highlights, under the theme 'sense of place', the insights gained from different Indigenous worldviews, concepts within the specific cultures, and a reading across the texts. Extra dimensions of meaning are produced regarding the relationship of people to their land, and to each other, by transposing an element from the Sámi worldview onto the Māori text, and a Māori concept onto the Sámi text. This situates the chosen poem and prose passage within a matrix of relationships that might not necessarily have been identified had the texts been considered on their own, or compared to the 'centre' of dominant literary forms. This prevents the marginalization of the Indigenous context, placing it instead at the centre of intellectual activity.

While both literary theory and Indigenous paradigms for research provide useful frameworks for arguments made within this thesis, they should be seen as complimentary, rather than contradictory; this is an ongoing conversation within academic research on Indigenous literature. The following three chapters contain the analytical part of this thesis, and theories and methodologies contained here are referenced.

4 Analysis I: The Representation of Place

'Traveling a pathway is to act in history and in the future, and contemporary practices take place in a continuum where there is no beginning and no end'

(Nergård, 2004, p. 91)

4.1 Introduction

What is a sense of place? Or more specifically, what is the relationship between people and their place? Place is not just a location one inhabits, it has emotional ties, and invokes a belonging, a concept of 'home'. Place is a connection to something larger than oneself. An Indigenous understanding of place is often referred to in terms of time – they have been on the land since 'time immemorial'. Relationship to place can be expressed through named landmarks, the movement of seasons, and through personal and ancestral history. Often, in many Indigenous cosmologies, the people come from the land itself. As Keith Basso states, in *Wisdom Sits in Places* (1996):

> What people make of their places is closely connected to what they make of themselves as members of society and inhabitants of the earth, and while the two activities may be separable in principle, they are deeply joined in practice. If place-making is a way of constructing the past, a venerable means of *doing* human history, it is also a way of constructing social traditions and, in the process, personal and social identities. We *are*, in a sense, the place-worlds we imagine (p. 7).

Academic research had largely ignored this Indigenous identification with landscape until recently. In the area of geography, for example, there has been a shift towards incorporating traditional knowledge into research. Johnson and Larsen discuss this in their introduction to *A Deeper Sense of Place* (2013), 'To collaborate with Indigenous communities is to engage with an ontological understanding that views their places as storyscapes…not fixed, stagnant markers of history but living stories that recreate the ontological and epistemological foundations of their community through their retelling' (p. 10). And it is through these storyscapes and histories that literature enters the picture. As the storytelling tradition flows form the oral to the written word, Indigenous writers, since the second half of the twentieth century, are using the mediums of literature, such as poetry and fiction, to tell their own

stories, in their own voices, as a means of 'writing back'. How, within these literary constructs, do these Indigenous writers articulate and represent their particular concept of 'place'? The sense of place in Tina Makereti's novel, *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, and Nils-Aslak Valkeapää's poetry collection, *Trekways of the Wind*, can be explored through the titles of their books, the characters, and the descriptions of place within their work. For both authors, their sense of identity, as Māori and Sámi respectively, is tied up with a deep connection to their land, its history, and their people's presence upon it. Stories, in both the oral and the written word, are a means to a culture's continuity.

4.2 Titles

In the title of Makereti's *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, in the naming of the novel, we are already given markers to an Indigenous perspective. Her choice to privilege the Moriori name of the island, *Rēkohu*, over the Māori (Wharekauri) or Pākehā (Chatham Island) names indicates that the Moriori people are the narrative's main concern. As she says in interview, 'it was important to have the Moriori name in the title. Because this isn't the story of Wharekauri, this is the story of Rēkohu' (2017, p. 2). The word *bone* is the same as the word for 'tribe': *iwi* in Māori, *imi* in Moriori. This resonates throughout the novel, as the spirit ancestor has forgotten his own name and uses 'Imi'; 'this I-word does not work – we call me Imi….Bones that is. Bones and people' (p. 42). At one point in the modern-day timeline, one of Imi's thigh bones is discovered by a young white boy, on the beach, which his horrified mother recognises as '*human'* (p. 43). This associates the land of Rēkohu with the scattered bones of the Moriori, from the Māori invasion of 1835. The author already anticipates this story by placing the words *Rēkohu* and *bone* together in the title. The use of the interrogative pronoun, *where*, implies the importance of location. The title itself is not a complete sentence – unless it is an answer to a question; if so, the place, *Rēkohu*, is the answer. The question, or quest, for the protagonist, Lula, is that of identity, of return, of healing ancestral wounds. This occurs through the inheritance of a piece of land on Rēkohu, as a means of restitution for the way her mother had been treated by her Māori *iwi*, for having Moriori blood. This returns herself and her twin brother physically to the island, reuniting them with the place and with their *imi*, the Moriori people.

The use of the verb *sings* brings in the idea of language, as a song is music accompanied by words, or at least, human voice. It also invokes the place, as the author describes the geography of Rēkohu in these terms – 'the sea chose a different song for every shore' (p. 256). But the verb 'to sing' also has another connotation. When someone under interrogation *sings*, it means they are giving up information. And it is the *bone*, as archaeological evidence, that tells of the island's history. The Māori /Moriori word for *bone* is *iwi/imi*, which also means 'tribe', and Lula goes to her mother's relatives for information, and retrieves the stories about her Moriori ancestry. The last word in the title is *sings.* Song is also a form of celebration, of coming together, and as we see in the final pages, the newly built Kōpinga Marae provides a meeting-place for the scattered community of the Moriori people. They gather to remember their ancestors, whose names are carved on the central pole, the *Ka Pou a Rangitokona*, which Lula circles, reading the names:

> She stood in the centre and looked through the windows, turning, and seeing Rēkohu in every direction. Turning, and being embraced on all sides by the world outside. The house did not separate her from the land. They were in her then. The ancestors whose memory was etched in the posts of the house (p. 265).

The borders between the internal and the external become less distinct here; there is no difference between the inside of the marae and the land it stands on, and both become part of Lula in the sense that 'place' for her is now a belonging, a connection to both her people and the island.

The translated title of Nils-Aslak Valkeapää's text, *Trekways Of the Wind*, also evokes a place or a path, taken from the last lines of the book: 'I journey / on the sea of time / follow / the tracks of the wind' (p. 3: ds.49). Almost immediately, the reader is aware of a movement over a landscape, *trekways* suggesting paths that are followed in a nomadic pattern over generations, perhaps invisible to those who do not know the land. This is borne out by the association with *wind,* which over time, can be seen to have predicable patterns of movement, and would be familiar to those who carry the traditional knowledge of place. *Trekways* and *wind* also bring together the people and nature, interlinked throughout Valkeapää's work, and tied into the old Sámi way of life:

> How I respect
> the old Sámi life
> That was true love of nature

where nothing was wasted

where humans were part of nature (p. 2: ds.40)

This stanza illustrates that Valkeapää does not distinguish between human, animal and landscape, all are equal, and are spoken of in terms of each other. The paths of the Sámi nomad and the paths of the wind are the same; he states, 'I belong to the wind' (p. 2: ds.14). The poet and the wind travel across the tundra, where they both belong: 'I would like to die / as I have lived / disappear among the tundra winds / be transformed into birdsong' (p. 2: ds.15).

The book's title in Sámi, *Ruoktu Váimmus*, means 'home is in the heart', and lends another dimension to a sense of place. Taken from the central poem in Section 2, the poet writes, 'My home is in my heart / it migrates with me', stating 'How can I explain / that I can not live in just one place / and still live / among all these tundras' (p. 2: ds.45). These verses illustrate an indigenous sense of movement across a landscape; of belonging to, rather than having ownership of, the land. The choice to use a different title in English may be due to the bias of cliché in the use of the word 'heart'. As Harald Gaski, one of the translators, states in the preface:

> Valkeapää is not afraid to use the word "heart" in his poem in spite of it being perhaps the most clichéd expression of all. In Sámi it is a little different relative to the literary tradition: the poetic usage does not have as long a tradition and therefore has not managed to produce so many clichés (1994, p. unpaginated).

The word 'home', too, may face the same bias, but the Sámi title and its translation both indicate an attachment to a location, namely the land known as Sápmi. The poet 'migrates' over the tundra on the traditional routes of a reindeer herder (known as *transhumance*), therefore covering a large area, from the mountains through the tundras, and down to the seashore in summer months. This pattern of movement is one of the central themes in the book. In the first section, 'White Spring Nights', the poet travels from winter to summer pastures and back again, in the seasonal loop from spring to spring. In the second section, 'Bluethroat, Twitter, Sing', the first narrative follows a young boy sent away to an institutional school for Sámi children; the second is a love story, and the third deals with the Sámi notion of home, in conflict with the colonizer, 'the others', who come 'with papers / and say / this belongs to nobody / this is government land' (p. 2: ds.49). In the third section, 'Streams' Silver Veins', the poet undertakes a journey to Greenland, Canada, Alaska and the

American prairie, where he meets with other Indigenous peoples. All these movements follow contours of landscape, both figuratively and visually, within the book, and serve as a reminder of where the poet is 'placing' himself on his journeys, his *trekways.* As the titles of the two literary texts give questions, answers, stories, and a form of redemption through 're-location', we can also find a literary exploration of the concept of place represented in the authors' constructs of characters.

4.3 Characters

In *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings,* there are five main characters in the novel, in three different timelines. In the present day, twins Lula and Bigs are grappling with their Pākehā, Māori and Moriori heritage and identity. In the 1880s, Iraia is a Moriori slave to the Māori family of Mere, a girl his own age. *Imi* is the Moriori ancestor spirit, who was killed in the invasion on Rēkohu in 1835. He can travel through time and space, and watches over his descendants, the other characters, who are unaware of his presence. Each of these characters can be associated with a particular place where the events of the novel take place.

Imi is identified with the island of Rēkohu, where he lived and died. As a spirit caught between worlds, he is free in the narrative to move through the timelines, and comment on the other characters, while also revealing his own story to the reader. His physical bones are part of the island, and he describes the island, in its deforested state, as bones (p. 174). This places him in a relationship with the land and its history, and this, as a Moriori, is what he represents in the novel. Mere is a Māori from Queen Charlotte Sounds, near Picton on the South Island of Aotearoa/New Zealand. Her life in the late nineteenth century is still lived within the traditional Māori culture. Even though she elopes with Iraia to Wellington, she eventually returns. Her story is very much located in this area, which is symbolized in the novel by her attachment to her dead mother's jar of rēwina (bread yeast), that she carries with her 'like a talisman' (p. 12). She accidentally leaves it behind when she elopes, and is reunited with on her return. She represents, in this place, her Māori society at this time. Iraia is a Moriori slave whose mother was brought from Rēkohu to Queen Charlotte Sounds. He grew up there, with no knowledge of his traditional homeland, and is acutely aware of his status – 'he carried it with him each moment, the sense that he was not a real person, but a shadow of one' (p. 20).

Iraia is only free in Wellington, when Mere and he elope, as there he can find work and provide for his family. Here, a sense of place is equated with freedom, where he has the liberty to make his own decisions. When Iraia falls sick and dies, Wellington is where Mere buries him, in 'this strange city – this was the only place he had made his own life, his own choices. Perhaps it would not be so bad for him to stay here' (p. 155). Iraia also exemplifies here the urban Indigenous, those who have made their home in a city environment, where nowadays a larger percentage of Indigenous people are living.

Bigs, or William, is the twin brother of Lula, with a Pākehā father and a Māori mother. Having darker skin than his sister, he embraces his Māori heritage, moving to the South Island and immersing himself in the language and culture with his Māori girlfriend. The discovery of his Moriori ancestry disturbs him, due to the historical repercussions this has had for the Māori, and he cannot embrace it in the way that Lula can, saying 'all I know is that I can't go there yet. I can't let go of everything that guided me' (p. 259). He places himself as Māori in modern-day Aotearoa, and represents that outlook in the novel. His twin sister Lula, however, lacks any sense of identity, or sense of place at the beginning of the novel. She wanders, goes travelling. 'She thought that out there, in Europe, in Asia, the villa in Greece or the village in Cambodia, she would find herself' (p. 66). In London, Lula visits the British Museum, and comes across a carving of a Māori male figure on display (p. 68). This moment triggers an epiphany within her, and she returns to Aoteraroa/New Zealand. Her mother's subsequent death propels her into the recognition, not only of her Māori, but her Moriori heritage. Lula's search finally brings her to Rēkohu, the *where* of the title. This resembles the Māori word *whare*, which loosely translates as a type of house, a temporary dwelling, or 'people within a house'. In other words, she comes back to a located centre. The other four characters represent place as distinct locations, providing, perhaps, a 'Nationalist', or tribally specific perspective. Lula, on the other hand, could be seen as the globalizer, taking the 'Cosmopolitan' perspective, as she travels to London, the false centre of empire, before reasserting herself within her Indigenous identity. In this way, Makereti deconstructs the island of Rēkohu as a marginal location, and places it again at the centre, both for the story of the Moriori people, and for the character Lula's sense of identity and place.

While moving from the genre of novel to poetry, the idea of 'characters' can still be applied to the latter. While Makereti's characters in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* each represent a different facet of the idea of location, the characters in Valkeapää's book are fluid,

interchangeable, and localized within the landscape. Even the land takes on a persona, becomes a character in itself, that changes with the seasons. The first person we come across is the painting of the woman on the cover. She is wearing the Sámi clothing, the *gákti*, which locates her in her Sámi tradition. Harald Gaski suggests, in his preface to *Trekways of the Wind*, that she may be the Daughter of the Sun, the mythical being who favours the Sámi, as the Sámi are descendants of the sun. She, depicts a sense of movement, walking towards the reader with energy. Maybe it is she, and not the poet, who greats the reader in the opening lines of text, 'Hello my dear friend / hello again dear sister / hello again dear brother…*bures bures*' (1994, p. unpaginated). The reader has already been moving through the landscape for a few pages before coming to the text, through drawings of mountains that follow on from each other across the pages. This greeting, in an unfamiliar territory, gives a feeling of welcome, and that the reader has encountered their host in the landscape.

The poet-as-character, a Sámi man, often takes other shapes – he is *eadánas ealli*, a term for a reindeer who stands apart from the herd, representing the position of the artist, like the *noaidi*, or shaman before him. Although he is on the 'inside' of the society, his role is as an observer and commentator (Gaski 2015, p.257). In 'Bluethroat, Twitter, Sing', he moves into the third person when describing the young boy's experience of boarding school – 'He had to reside in a boarding-school / He had never seen such a big house / He was afraid he'd get lost there' (p. 2: ds.18). In the love poem, he identifies as a Bluethroat bird, using the Sámi word *Biello-Cizás*. His lover is presented in terms of nature, for example, she transforms with the morning sun – ''the rays caress your legs / give your breasts a reddish hue / turn your hair golden' (p. 2: ds.29). We also see this in 'White Spring Nights': 'When darkness fell / you became visible / in the lines of the mountain' (p. 1: ds.2). The lover is therefore placed within the terms of landscape; she becomes the mountain.

In 'Streams' Silver Veins', the poet's encounter with other Indigenous peoples are both strange and familiar, the 'strange people of strange nations / with strange colours / and strange customs' (p. 3: ds.4), but then 'the teepee poles thrust black against the sky / like the *lávvu* poles against ours', show connections between them, 'so familiar / have I been / here before' (p. 3: ds.12). The drawings and paintings of the Inuit and Native Americans show them at home in their own landscape, at ease, or dancing in their regalia. Indian drums join with yoiks, '*gáktis* and feathers' (p. 3: ds.15) combine to celebrate Indigenous similarities. The spectre of the colonizers are represented as 'alien', 'unknown', humans who do not

connect to the earth, are *out of place*. They 'wanted to possess and coveted the lands', and even more alarmingly, 'wanted to take our place' (p. 3: ds.20). This phrase has a double-meaning which can refer to either land or people – the place, as land, can be taken; also the people can be substituted *on* the land. This has the effect of drawing the lines between Indigenous peoples and their homelands, in the sense of the Cartesian split between human and land, a colonial dislocation.

Animals, birds and fish also appear as characters in the book, both in the text and in the illustrations. Like the landscape itself, they are on a par with humans, and not seen as inferior. As Bjarne Markussen states, 'Pictures of animals and the tundra dominate, suggesting that humankind is merely a small part of nature' (2013, p. 5). Sometimes they represent the change of the seasons; 'I see fish swim…summer is on its way' (p. 1: ds.16); autumn comes 'when the birds stop singing' (p. 1: ds.20). Reindeer feature prominently throughout all Valkeapää's works; he came from a reindeer herding family, but never had a herd himself. Gaski suggests that he compensated for this 'by writing, conjuring up, a private reindeer herd', expressed in visual imagery, photographs, terminology, and 'in a phonetic and realistic working context while it is on the move' (2010, p. 316). Birds are also prevalent, such as the bluethroat, plover, ptarmigan, goose, swan, gull, owl; as well as the dog, weasel, hare, otter, horse, fish, and a passing reference to a chicken. Their images appear randomly, and are not necessarily related to the accompanying text, which gives the impression of coming across them, as one would, while moving through the landscape. Markussen describes this as an interaction between text and image that does not overlap, but 'interact in a vision of life in a constantly moving, restless rhythm…they correspond in mood rather than motif' (2013, p. 9). *Trekways of the Wind* is populated, like the land, with its own ecology of people, animals, plants, topography and weather. These aspects of the landscape deepen the connection to the poet's sense of belonging, familiar as he is with the movement, both across the tundra and through the changing seasons. Like the characters in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, there is a sense that the people, animals and entities are not separate from the places that they occupy, that the context the characters are placed in is essential to an understanding of the literature as a whole.

4.4 Places

4.4.1 Resonant Places

In *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings,* there are places of significance on the island of Rēkohu that the characters visit and interact with. Makereti contextualizes these places to express a connection between the people and the landscape; with resonances of both a human and a sacred history. Place, in this sense, is not just where something happened, it actually holds and retains memory. Lula and Bigs come to Waitangi, the main town, and see 'what could have been a tropical beach', but find it 'strewn with tyres, old iron drums and nets, plastic bottles, even the odd toy' (p. 206). They are surprised such a beautiful setting should be covered in litter, but the reader receives an explanation in the next section. Iwi describes the beach as a 'forgotten place', but it is more that the people 'don't want the remembrance of it'. Some of the worst slaughter of the Moriori took place on this beach, Iwi remembers 'the water dirty with blood'. He claims the 'townsfolk leave the rubbish down there so no one look at it as good place' (p. 208). This ritual of desecration by the locals serves as an act of both remembrance and forgetting; the rubbish replaces the bones that once scattered the beach, and also serves as a deterrent to the enjoyment of its beauty, preventing the denial of the violence that once occurred in this place. Made ugly, the beach therefore falls into disuse, as an attempt to ignore, to forget.

In contrast to this notion of 'forgetting' The Tommy Solomon statue stands as a memorial. Erected in 1986 at Owenga, it spells the beginning of the revival process for the Moriori on Rēkohu. In the novel, Makereti describes Lula's encounter with the statue as if he is a living person, standing at the end of the field, and welcoming her 'with a wide grin', and watching her with a friendly gaze (p. 229). She comes to 'seek the company of this smiling man', remembered as the last of his kind, and greets him aloud (p. 230). In this way, the author evokes the idea of the transcendence of heritage, that the statue is not a monument to the dead, but a presence among the survivors. Embodied in stone, as a redress of the trauma visited on his people, this is still very much Tommy Solomon's world, and Lula is inspired 'to listen' to the 'ocean and the land', to hear its story, where the place itself has a voice.

Lula also visits Hāpūpu, the remnant of a once larger forest on the east coast of the island, where the Moriori had carved figures (dendroglyphs) into living Kōpi trees. Although weathered and covered in moss, the carvings, possibly hundreds of years old, are still visible

today. In this grove, this sacred space, Lula describes 'curved, heart-shaped faces, grinning, crouching on light feet, proud feathered top-knots above' (p. 238). As she moves between the trees, coming across each carving as they reveal themselves, she feels a sense of joy emanating from the figures, and 'can almost hear the laughter from their open mouths' (p. 238). Once again, there is a sense that the figures are alive, that they are relevant, as she states, 'not museum pieces, not objects to be preserved, but living, breathing, growing entities' (p. 239). She feels an ease and warmth in this place, connecting to the trees and the land; and to her own ancestry; as we are told later that Iwi himself has had his likeness carved into one of the trees by his dying wife. He claims that by his wife doing this, 'she opens the path for my return one day' (p. 242), a prophecy fulfilled by Lula, the descendant of his bloodline. There is a sense with both of these characters that this space moves beyond the physical dimension, that its palpability also creates belonging, a connection to place that feels like home. This feeling of a domestic space is also prevalent at the middens at Henga, bare circular patches in the sand dunes, where the Moriori once lived and ate their meals, areas almost left intact. This space also resonates, through the discarded shells and blackened cooking stones, the signs of daily life. Lula meditates, 'we were here…this is how we lived' (p. 247). This 'we' that Lula uses, forms a connection back to her bloodline, her ancestors. This is not just a setting, in a physical sense, but the memory of a people imprinted on the land, which widens the scope of the concept of place to an epistemological relationality where land is the archive, the reservoir of history and belonging.

4.4.2 The Book As Place

In *Trekways of the Wind,* the landscape and its inhabitants could be seen, not only as characters in the book, but as the book itself. The book has three dimensions – the text, the art, and the music score, which interact and articulate the landscape in word, sight and sound. Time, or the fourth dimension, is represented by the fact that the book is unpaginated, and therefore fluid and relational. This multidimensional aspect takes away from the expected linear form of convention between the covers of *Trekways of the Wind*. One can turn pages backward and forward, or start in the middle, follow the path of a reindeer herd, the line of a mountain or a stream, the lines of a poem, or the notation of music at will. The sense of place is not fixed in time, but is eternal, a constant circling of the seasons of the year, or travelling

back and forth between pastures. This belies the Eurocentric concept of reading, a systematic movement from left to right, using a bookmark to 'keep one's place', like the scientific following of a formula. The images of the reindeer herd often travel across the pages in the opposite direction, from right to left, which is in keeping with the fact that when they are gathered, they tend to circle in an anti-clockwise motion. The image of the clock in the final section, replacing the sun, has no hands, and is drawn as an incomplete circle (p. 3: ds.39), deconstructing the linear concept of keeping time, *from* the past and *into* the future. Time here is relational, within the landscape created. Paula Gunn Allen, in *The Sacred Hoop* (1986), refers to the 'traditional tribal concept of time' as fluid, timeless:

> The tribal sense of self as a moving event within a moving universe is very similar to the physicists' understanding of the particle within time and space. There is plenty of time in the Indian universe because everything moves in a dynamic equilibrium and the fact of universal movement is taken into account in the ritual life that is tribal existence (p. 147).

Valkeapää, in *The Sun, My Father*, writes 'and time does not exist, no end, none / and time is, eternal, always, is / rises, falls / is born, dies / thus / days, years, are rounded...in motion / the trek in the heart / land / rounded off / life's circle' (p. poem 566). Valkeapää has not only conjured up a private reindeer herd, he has, between the covers of *Trekways of the Wind*, articulated the paths of his entire world, an Indigenous universe with its own cycles of migration, stories, seasons, life and death. He writes, 'I leave now / to return / travel far / to be close' (p. 3: ds.2). *Trekways of the Wind* is that pathway, following both a linear and cyclical movement, locating itself firmly in the local, then spiralling out to include other Indigenous people and places.

4.5 Discussion

Tina Makereti's *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* and Nils-Alsk Valkeapää's *Trekways of the Wind* explore and articulate a sense of place in various ways. The titles have both prioritized location as a theme, in an Indigenous sense; in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* by Makereti's use of the Moriori name of the island, 'Rēkohu', and in *Trekways of the Wind* by evoking a nomadic sense of movement connected to nature by juxtaposing the words 'trekways' and

‘wind’; or, in Valkeapää’s native language, ‘home’ and ‘heart’. Characters too are representative of place in both texts; in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, these are more archetypal, taking the perspectives of characters both dislocated from and centred within the Māori and Moriori cultures. In *Trekways of the Wind*, the characters are interchangeable with their surroundings, can shape-shift, become animals or represent aspects of nature and the land itself. Specific places in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* can evoke memory and connection with ancestors within the plot structure of the book, as a celebration of cultural retrieval.

The book itself can be its own landscape, as in *Trekways of the Wind*; one that the reader enters and wanders through, encountering people, animals and birds, rivers, mountains and tundra, with the text of the poems as signposts, and the musical score as a soundscape. The guide is the poet as *noaidi*, or shaman, who leads the reader along ancient paths, from the realm of the physical landscape into the realm of literature and art. As Kathleen Dana observes, ‘Literature, by its text-bound nature public, enduring and authoritative, is markedly distinct from traditional shamanic practice, which is secret, fleeting, and oral…however, both poet/artist and shaman are equipped in remarkable ways to negotiate between worlds, and in the hands of shaman-poets, text becomes to tool of prophecy and mediation’ (2011, p. 7). This spiritual mediation, between the physical place and the literary realm, is also evoked in Makereti’s work.

In *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings,* it is in the building of a Moriori ‘place’, the Kōpinga Marae, where revival and revitalization occur; the living have a place to gather, the dead are named, evoked and remembered on the central post, with the dendroglyph figures of the ancestors carved around the walls. Tina Makereti writes about another marae, Auckland University’s Waipapa marae, Tane-nui-a-Rangi, situated on campus. She uses the *wharenui* (the central house, the body of the ancestor connected to the earth and sky) as a metaphor for a house of literature in Aotearoa: ‘Imagine it. The swirling, spiralling, notched lines of poetry; the strong limbs and bright eyes of fiction; various non-fictions in repeating patterns overhead’ (2017, p. 3). She asks: ‘Think about what creative texts do that other texts don’t do. They ask us to imagine. They ask us to dream…to remember who we are and to imagine who we might be. To create our worlds afresh. To save us’ (2017, p. 10). In stories, written by Indigenous peoples, the culture is kept alive, both for the people themselves, but also as a representation of their perspective for others. Makereti considers the time when Māori authors

like Witi Ihimaera and Patricia Grace started publishing books, and 'these stories came into people's lives and they were saying, I didn't know this existed in our country. That was the power of literature…and people were upset, as they thought the writers were "stirring up trouble"; the writers were saying, "no, this is just what life is like for us"' (2017, p. 7). Literature created an awareness, an exposure, as she claims of *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, 'If you've had generations of purposeful eradication of memories and connections, then one of your most powerful ways back is to re-imagine that connection' (2017, p. 6). Margeret Kovach asserts, 'In considering story as both method and meaning, it is presented as a culturally nuanced way of knowing' (2009, p. 94). This marae of literature, like the Kōpinga Marae on Rēkohu, is a way back, a 're-imagined' place that takes shape in a physical landscape, that becomes part of the land, interchangeable with the stories, the gathering of a people, the reclaiming of history. Places themselves, in both the prose and poetry, are alive, not just in the sense of relationality with the people and animals, or the seasons, but also alive with meaning. They are not just locations where things happen, they *are* the stories, the histories. How this is further represented by the authors, through language, naming and story, is the subject of the next chapter.

5 Analysis II:The Language of Place: Naming and Story

> 'Where language touches the earth, there is the holy, there is the sacred.'
>
> (Momaday, 1997, p. 124)

5.1 Introduction

It is generally accepted that a connection to land, to ancestral territory, is synonymous with what it means to be Indigenous. Having a distinct language is also part of that definition, as language contains the worldview of a people; it is the vessel of culture. Historically, for many Indigenous peoples, the loss or partial loss of language, as with the land, occurred through the assimilation practices of colonization. The subsequent revitalization of some Indigenous languages, implemented within, for example, Sámi institutions in Nordic countries, and through the Māori language movement *Te Kohanga Reo* in Aotearoa/New Zealand, has been an integral part of decolonization, both for communities and in academic research (Albury, 2015; Smith, 1999). Literature is the written word, itself a kind of 'transplantation' of language, where story functions in oral society to preserve history, genealogy, location, reminders of norms and taboos, and ties to the sacred.

In Indigenous literature, the two authors use language to convey the landscape in relational terms, or, more specifically, evaluate the imagined borders between humanity and nature, or people and place. Literature is made of language, and therefore the first part of this chapter takes a closer look at the medium of language itself, the effect colonization has had on language, and its subsequent revitalization within Indigenous communities; as well as exploring the relationship between language and place. The next part looks more closely at how language and place intersect; how naming and placename demonstrate the relationality of people and their environment, and what is in danger of being lost when a language is removed or translated. The medium of storytelling further deepens the attachment to place, showing evidence of presence and history; and how story can allow access to 'ways of knowing' in the immediate environment.

5.2 Language

Language is, for all humans everywhere, the primary method of communication. As children, we develop the skills not only of vocabulary, but also the complications of grammar and syntax. This learning process occurs not just on a cultural level, but it is hardwired in our brains, as part of our biological makeup. We are unique as a species, for although other animals have forms of language, 'human language is the only language that is symbolic, allowing us to refer to absent and even abstract objects and situations' (Stumpf, 2001, p. 475). Language is not only a means of communication, it also locates us in our own specific culture, it creates a sense of belonging. When we speak, we reveal to others, even through an accent or dialect, where we come from, allowing them to *place* us within our communities, our provinces, and our countries.

Language also shapes our world. It is what we use, how we relate to our surroundings in order to make sense of where we are, and who we are. It contains, within its structure, all the contents of our society, forms the way in which we create a worldview; it harbours our knowledge and our history. Language is not static, but a subject in process. It is a site of discourse; we are in dialogue with our traditions. Language is always a plural construct (Bakhtin, 1981). Harald Gaski, talking about research on Sámi oral traditions and literature, has this to say:

> Values and traditions have taken part in forming our common understanding of what is valuable and important in Sámi culture…research on Sámi literature and traditions is important; it helps us to understand these traditions, and to extract the knowledge that oral tradition has maintained. That is why it is meaningful…to view language as our most important tradition bearer – as a reservoir of knowledge from which to draw (2013, p. 115).

Here he expresses the idea that language has a value other than just as a means of communication; it acts like a repository of culture and traditional knowledge. Literature, too, plays a role in this, as the written word in Indigenous literature is often drawn from the oral tradition.

Nils-Aslak Valkeapää, for example, has taken the Sámi oral yoik tradition and transposed it to both the form and content of his poetry. One does not perform a yoik *about* a person, a reindeer, or a mountain – one *yoiks* them. This performance collapses the perceived

space between yoiker and yoiked, with the yoik as the medium. The entity being yoiked is then the owner of that yoik; through the process of creation, performance and ownership, a symbiotic relationship is implied between the two involved. Humans, animals and nature are therefore perceived as being on the same plane; there is no hierarchy (Gaski, 2008; Ramnarine, 2009). Valkeapää evokes this integration of entities in the last poem of his book, *The Earth, My Mother*, when he writes, 'the cosmos / the universe / all of it / resonates / yoiks / hums / intones / roars / SINGS / RESOUNDS / BEAUTIFULLY', and alone on the last page, in large font, the last word of the poem – 'YOIKS'. (pp. 334-5). Leaving this word to stand large on its own page allows 'yoik' to encompass all that has gone before; the power of the yoik, as word, as performance, embodies the entire 'universe'. His poetry often repeats lines, maybe in the same poem, or intentionally throughout, in the manner that a yoik performed may come back on itself, in a circular manner, and repeat a phrase or an idea. In this way, the oral yoik tradition is maintained within the written text. Valkeapää uses this specific form to place the poems within the Sámi holistic value system; language is part of, not separate to, the process of human living. Indigenous written literature can often be seen to use words and language to convey tradition, not just in the way language is used in general, but also in the use of words specific to the culture.

In *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, Tina Makereti, like many other Māori authors, uses Māori words within her prose that do not necessarily convey the same meaning in translation, or have no English counterpart. The glossary in the book is for Moriori words only, as it is not expected that the vast majority of readers would understand these; but Māori words and phrases are commonly used in Aotearoa/New Zealand, and would be familiar to most of the Pākehā population (Albury, 2015). Even for other English readers, the context often gives a good indication as to what the word encompasses, even though the full resonance of its meaning may not be understood. In interview, Makereti discusses responding to an American agent for her book, and while putting together the first chapter, she came across the word *whare* (a type of Māori house, a temporary dwelling). She says, 'I could not find an English equivalent that would give any sense of what a *whare* is…and you want those resonances, you want the word to embody all those things that it could possibly be…and you can't do that if you just go 'house'. It's a house. It's a Māori house. But that doesn't tell you what it looks like, what it smells like, how it's made' (2017, p. 11). This is a good example of how words hold a certain power, how they retain an ideological understanding that does not exist in

another language. In postcolonial theory, this is known as a metynomical gap; where the untranslated words stand for the embodiment of the colonized culture, as markers of identity in the adopted literary form. We see this also in *Trekways of the Wind*, where the reader is greeted with 'Bures bures' in the Sámi language on the opening pages, where language not only indicates a differentiating function, but also *places* the reader within the Sápmi landscape.

5.2.1 Language and Colonization

'One of the first approaches to erasing a culture is to attack its language because language holds such insight into the social organization of a people', Margeret Kovach states. 'Without language to affirm knowledge daily, it is easy to lose cultural memory' (2009, p. 60). Historically, the colonizer has attempted to achieve this by the process of assimilation, annihilating a people's language, for example, through education. Young Indigenous children were sent to schools where they were forbidden to speak their own tongue. In boarding schools, they were divorced not only from their language, but also from their culture implicit in that language, from their families, and from intimate knowledge of their homelands. In fact, assimilation often included forcible removal of peoples from one place to another. This was a physical separation, not only from their culture, but also from their environment. Assimilation involved a *displacement*. The loss of language was also a loss of place, of belonging, of home. As Rauna Kuokkanen suggests:

> We know that language is power through its means of creating realities. The use of the power of the word has many times been the only means of resisting colonial oppressors…through the power of the word, we can regain our voices and be heard. And when we speak with our own voices, we can no longer be misrepresented' (2000, p. 426).

So how important is it to regain that language, that vocabulary, and what part does it play, for the representation of Indigenous people's 'own voices' in the recent revitalization processes?

5.2.2 Language and Revitalization

The revitalization of Indigenous languages has, for the most part, been at the very centre of the decolonization process for Indigenous peoples. It is also important to note, however, that

for many peoples, their languages are considered endangered, dying, or dead, due to the number of native speakers dying out; with estimations that 3,000 Indigenous languages will be extinct by the end of this century (Smith, 1999, p. 148). In the cases of Māori and Sámi languages, while they remain in a minority of the population, steps have been taken to promote the use and learning of language by the majority governments. These policies have led to a dissemination of their languages to a wider audience.

In Sápmi, various institutions have undertaken the role of revitalizing the Sámi languages, and the three Sámi Parliaments in Norway, Sweden and Finland have, to varying degrees, a say in how this process has been implemented in schools and society in general (Morkenstam, 2016). For example, in Norway, language revitalization falls under the aegis of the policies for self-determination, where the Sámi Parliament manages and receives funding for all issues regarding Sámi languages. The Sámi Language Act in 1990 established the right for Sámi children to receive an education in Sámi in core geographical areas, and the Norwegian Broadcasting Corporation, NRK, has a station in Karasjok solely dedicated to television and radio programmes in Sámi languages (Albury, 2015).

The biculturalist approach taken by the Aotearoa/New Zealand government, fusing both Māori and Pākehā cultures for a modern nation, has led to Māori vocabulary and customs being used more frequently in the media, and on ceremonial occasions (for example, the use of the *haka*), as an indication of the interethnic identity of the population (Albury, 2015). Language initiative for pre-school children, known as *Te Kohanga Reo*, or 'language nests' for the Māori language have been implemented, and *Te Reo Māori* (the Māori language) is more widely taught in schools (Smith, 1999). The 1987 Māori Language Act gave the Māori language equal status with English in all legislative matters, including *Te Taura Whiri*, the commission which promotes and implements the language, and *Te Reo,* the Māori language television channel, was set up in 2011.

Literature, too, had played a part in the revitalization of language, as Indigenous writers are now publishing in their own languages. Even when this is not the case, and they write in the majority language, 'the boundaries of poetry, plays, songwriting, fiction, and non-fiction are blurred as Indigenous writers seek to use language in ways that capture the messages, nuances and flavour of Indigenous lives' (Smith, 1999, p. 151) . This process of self-representation, or, to use the postcolonial term, 'writing back', has gone hand in hand with the political movements of decolonization; Indigenous literature's struggle for its own

Indigenous voice mirrors the struggle in the international arena for the land rights and self-determination of Indigenous peoples. In this sense, land and language are intertwined.

5.2.3 Language and Landscape

A peoples' worldview includes language as the thought process and means of articulation. When this worldview is applied to the concept of place, it can cause misunderstandings at the point of contact with another language and culture. Words are untranslatable; concepts, coming from different points of departure, are rendered unintelligible. We see this in Valkeapää's 'My Home is in My Heart' from *Trekways of the Wind*, where the poet is reduced to silence: 'I say nothing / I only show them the tundra', when faced with those who 'come to me / and show books / Law books / that they have written themselves / This is the law and it applies to you too' (p. 2: ds.50). Their laws and books are meaningless to the Sámi way of life; the concept of communal ownership of land is not understood by the strangers, nor does the Eurocentric idea of private property resonate with the traditional worldview of the Sámi. Communication has broken down, the poet gestures to the landscape as a way to try to explain where his home is, that it 'migrates' with him; he says, 'How can I explain / that I cannot live in just one place / and still live / when I live / among all these tundras' (p. 2: ds.45). The tundra must speak for him; but those who come cannot 'hear' the land's 'voice'. The poet's gesture of showing them the tundra is taken as a visual sign. Harald Gaski claims the verb 'see' here in relation to the tundra 'carries more meaning than just registering that the tundra is there. It means understanding how important it is for the first person narrator and his people, for their survival, their sense of belonging and indeed their very identity' (2010, p. 310). This cultural composite of communication the strangers cannot comprehend; they cannot access this information by merely 'looking' at the tundra.

Landscape as a purely visual representation, the idea of a painting where 'landscape' is represented only through the eye, is the Cartesian worldview, 'based on metaphysical dualism and laden with perceptions that derive from the Enlightenment: the fragmentation of human knowledge and the distancing of oneself both physically and mentally from the research object' (Kuokkanen, 2000, p. 413). In other words, 'Man' has been separated from nature and placed 'himself' on a higher realm; landscape merely becomes a domain of separable objects which, in order to be made understood, must be broken down, isolated into

its separate parts in order to be dissected and studied. This scientific approach, observation in isolation, 'delegitimises alternate ways of knowing' (Murton, 2013, p. 143). Lakota academic Vine Deloria argues particularly against this worldview, as an Indigenous perspective would claim all ecosystems exist within a process of relationality to each other, and therefore cannot be studied in isolation. He applies the Lakota phrase *Mikakuye Oyasin*, meaning 'we are all relatives' as a practical methodological tool, meaning 'we observe the natural world by looking for relationships between various things in it', a concept as 'applied to a universe that people experience as alive and not dead or inert' (1999, p. 34). While the Cartesian subject/object worldview can be seen as opposite to the Indigenous concept of relational connectedness, Deloria does argue a space for both, once Western science does not dismiss 'personality' and 'sense of purpose' as 'mysticism and superstition' (1999, p. 39).

This relational understanding of landscape, particularly as a connection to language, can also be seen in traditional Māori ways of knowing, as discussed by Brian Murton, in his chapter, 'From Landscape to Whenua' in *A Deeper Sense of Place* (2013). He chooses to take a phenomenological approach to landscape, that is, that objects attain meaning through their perception or connection to human consciousness. This understanding is closer, he argues, to the methodologies of *Kaupapa Māori*. Māori see the world as encased in a set of relationships. The word *whenua,* for example, is not a direct translation of the word *land* – it incorporates concepts such as *country*, *ground*, and also *placenta*, which demonstrates the ties land has to the people. *Tangata whenua* means *people of the land*. This phrase does not just refer to the people who live on the land, but to those who belong to it. A relationship to the landscape is more than merely representative. Māori may have an idea of landscape as something visual, but it is not the dominant form of knowing:

> Oral societies speak not about the world, but directly to the world, acknowledging animals, plants, and even landforms as expressive subjects with whom they might expect to find themselves in conversation. Language for oral societies is thus not a specifically human possession but rather a property of the animate earth, in which humans participate (p. 146).

What creates the world is speech – unlike the structuralist view of language as a series of codes imposed upon the world, language is the property of the world.

One can see, as mentioned previously, how the Sámi yoik encompasses this worldview. In the 'Streams' Silver Veins' section of *Trekways of the Wind*, the yoik itself comes from the poet and the earth:

> And irrepressibly a yoik rose to the sky
> beyond time
> beyond cognizance
> rippled
> dripped
> out from the heart
> out of the ground (p. 3: ds.28).

The yoik here is an expression, from out of both the poet's heart and the ground, in conversation with the sky. The language of yoik is known to and created by all entities; it is expressed here not as an 'either/or' in humanity and nature, but more as a 'both/and'; one of the key concepts of Indigenous methodologies. It does not exclude or compartmentalize, but sees everything in holistic terms.

Murton continues this theme of connection by saying that the Māori understanding of creation is viewed as a process of 'continuous action, in which particular forms of sound and thought play an essential role…thought and spoken words exist together for Māori, with sound being the original foundation for thought to be conceptualized and expressed in words….the spoken word connects the breath of people to that of the world and animates, brings life to place' (2013, p. 147). Therefore language, especially sound and speech, replaces the prominent visuality of Eurocentric ways of constructing landscape for Māori. In fact, the land constructs the language. This idea of land and language can also be tied to the representation of character in Indigenous literature.

In *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, the ancestor spirit Imi has taken his name from the Moriori word for *tribe*; he represents all his people in the choice of his name; *imi* also means *bone*, his bones in the earth, that have become of the earth of the island. His sense of place is tied to his descendants as well as to his place of birth and death, which come together when Lula visits the Kōpinga Marae. When she reads the names of his people, the ones on the central post who were alive before the invasion, in her mind, he demonstrates this worldview when he says 'the young ones, they sing and talk, they call us into being' (p. 267). The ancestors are remembered and invoked through the ritual of naming. When Imi hears the

sound of his own name, he 'rises out of the earth-place then, feel myself light, feel myself mist, feel myself leave the world of hard surface' (p. 267). He has had his name returned to him; he can now move on to the next world, like Valkeapää's yoik rising into the sky: 'Ka pou a Rangitokona takes us up to the widest part of heaven, the sky spread open, hūnau beneath. I am there' (p. 268). The relationship of place to language demonstrates, within these texts, the power of the word. Language calls place into being, and is at its most potent in the act of naming. It is in this act of naming, this articulation of relationship, where language and landscape most strongly connect.

5.3 Naming and Placenames

5.3.1 Naming

Names differ from other forms of language; they are specific, to people, places or things, within language and culture. Names are given. Sometimes they are earned. They are relational; they can connect people to their family, or people to their territories. They can describe a topography. They can imply the sacred. In the Introduction to *Names and Naming: People, Places, Perceptions and Power* (2016), Kostanski and Puzey assert:

> Names can represent deeper kinds of identity, act as objects of attachment and dependence, and reflect community mores and social customs, while functioning as powerful determinants of inclusion and exclusion…names are not only symbols of their referents but also manifestations of cultural, linguistic and social heritage in their own right (p. xiii).

Names are not arbitrary. They are markers of a culture, and because they are less likely to change over time, they often preserve archaic forms of tradition within the language. They are intentionally representative of meaning, sometimes layers of meaning, and hold an emotional resonance for people, more than other words do.

A good example of this can be seen in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, where the character Lula, when cleaning out a wardrobe in one of the bedrooms in the house on Rēkohu, comes across 'Words and designs scrawled in childish writing on the inner wall of the closet. A heart with an arrow through it, a koru design that overflowed and reached tendrils out towards the other walls, and the words 'love', 'hate' and 'Tui'' (p. 204). The name Tui, her

mother's name, disturbs her; she has no idea if her mother ever visited the island or why she would have been 'stuck in a closet long enough to write all that'. At the same time, the name connects her to the place. Even if this was not her mother, names often run in families, and despite her reaction, the childish graffiti confirms her relationship with Rēkohu and its people.

Valkeapää, too, associates names with the environment; in the love poem in 'Bluethroat, Twitter, Sing', the lover names himself 'Biello-Cizáš' which means 'bluethroat' in Sámi (p. 2: ds.24), once again blurring the borders of 'human' and 'nature'. The yoik itself, throughout his poetry, summons up the landscape with a voice that is equivalent to the act of naming, 'In the depth of my being / a yoik grows / sadly / with tears in my eyes / I yoik in the voice of the heart / how I respect / Sápmi' (p. 2: ds.44). Sápmi, the name of the land, is sung through the heart-voice; as yoiker Ánte Mihkkal Gaup once said, in interview, 'A yoik is your deepest name' (Ramnarine, 2009, p. 191). This 'act of naming', as Margeret Kovach argues, in terms of Indigenous research frameworks, 'gives purpose and offers grounding…Tribal knowledge systems are holistic. They move beyond the cognitive to the kinetic, affective, and spiritual. They are fluid…are born of self-in-relation' (2009, p. 176). This fluidity, this reciprocal relationship between namer and named, where names mirror back a reflection of identity and belonging, can be transposed to the relationship between people and the way they name their landscape.

Native American writer N. Scott Momaday also articulates this expression of language and place. Through the language of naming, there is an understanding of the sacred - 'names and being are indivisible'. Something that bears a name can be said to exist, it has a 'being', that contains a particularity, a specific relation and reference. 'If we are speaking of place, which is (or ought to be) a fundamental concept in our lives, the particularity is critical. We know who we are (and where we are) only with reference to the things about us' (1997, p. 124). In other words, the place, the sacred space a people occupy, as human beings, is part of what defines them. Naming, as Makereti and Valkeapää's texts demonstrate, holds a unique position in the language and representation of place in Indigenous cultures. One of the ways people identify with a place, how they invoke a sense of belonging, is by naming that place.

5.3.2 Placenames

Placenames validate the relationship between humans and their connection to place. How and what people name their landscape indicates and prioritizes not only the function of a place (locating a water source, for example), but has meaning in terms of history, culture, and a sense of the sacred. As William Basso claims, 'If place-making is a way of constructing the past, a venerable means of *doing* human history, it is also a way of constructing social traditions and, in the process, personal and social identities. We *are,* in a sense, the place-worlds we imagine' (1996, p. 7). These names for place function as a metaphor for our belief systems, and preserve traditions. Many Irish placenames, for example, such as *Cnoc na Sí* (the Hill of the Fairies), might indicate a hill containing an ancient monument or dwelling, which would therefore be known in folk terms as a sacred place. This could become a point of pilgrimage, or, more often than not, a location to avoid in case of angering the spiritual entities inhabiting it (Ní Cheallaigh, 2012). This is one of the main reasons many archeological sites in Ireland have remained intact throughout the centuries, places preserved by the taboo of folk memory in placename.

Often with placenames, specific locations or topographical features are named for what they are. Basso, in his research as an ethnographer with the Western Apache, discusses the naming of places as markers for how they are seen. In other words, they serve as landmarks for those travelling through the landscape; names such as 'Bitter Agave Plain', or 'Scattered Rocks Stand Erect'. But to the local people, these names mean more than this. The names were given by those who first came to these places. One of his Apache informants, Charles, begins describing how his ancestors would have related to the landscape when they first came to the area: 'Now they are arriving here, looking all about them, noticing everything about this place. It looked to them as it looks to us now. We know that from its name – its name gives a picture of it, just as it was a long time ago' (1996, p. 12). Even when the landscape has changed, for example, at Snake's Water, the past and the present overlap, giving evidence of climatic shifts over time, which is resonant in the name given. Snake's Water is an inactive spring which has now run dry; 'Charles explains that what we observed at Snake's Water is not at all uncommon; there are more places like it, scattered throughout Apache country, that have undergone physical changes and no longer conform to the way their name describes them…"The names do not lie," Charles states emphatically. "They show

us what is different and what is still the same" (1996, p. 15). This relationship with place connects people to their forebears in a way that collapses time; they are seeing their ancestors' arrival to this place as not in the past, but in a continuous present tense; even when the placenames show change.

This idea of named places calling the ancestors into continuous being is also innate in the Māori worldview. Although there is no term for 'placename' in the Māori language, the act of naming their surroundings falls into the broader context of placing order on the world. As the oral tradition relies on a 'genealogically based chronology', the habits and activities of the ancestors are associated with places, and named thus, embodying the environment through a working life, which Brian Murton illustrates by quoting various scholars' names for this: 'habitation' (Casey); the 'work world' (Heidegger); and the 'taskscape' (Ingold) – 'The experience of making a living in an environment is central to what it means to inhabit a place, to dwell in it. Such places can be named by those who continue to live there, and the act of naming places not only brings them to life, but also the ancestors who had made and named them' (2013, p. 149). The placename here does not stand alone, apart from those who inhabit the land, but is intertwined with the peoples' daily routines and lifestyles, as an aspect of the whole.

In *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, there is an interruption of this idea, between the geographical locations described, the 'middens' where cleared spaces are evident in the land and where daily routines took place, and the names of place we are given by the ancestor spirit Iwi. He gives two placenames, 'Long Home' and 'Crying Waters', as the places he and his wife come from, vague locations not associated with a definite point on any contemporary map ('Long Home' could relate to Long Beach, the beach beside the middens near Henga). There is an inference that 'Crying Waters' is somewhere near the beach at Waitangi; as he says 'When they named it, they could not know it would be crying without end' (p. 208). The disruption of this Māori worldview of naming, where names are the site of living, is demonstrated by the description of the unnamed middens, the site of domestic activity, with no specific placename, juxtaposed with two placenames without a specific location. This removal of connection between location and placename, in the context of Indigenous everyday life, could be seen as a metaphor for the deliberate colonial attack on language, as a method for dislocating a colonized people from their culture.

Valkeapää, on the other hand, uses placenames to attach place to people as a form of resistance to colonization. In 'My Home is in my Heart', he associates various landmarks with his family, offered as evidence of occupation on the land:

> Our ancestor kept fires on Allaorda
> on Stuorajeaggis' tufts
> on Viiddesčearru
> Grandfather drowned in the fjord while fishing
> Grandmother cut her shoe grass in Šelgesrohtu
> Father was born in Finjubákti in burning cold
> And still they ask
> where is your home (p. 2: ds.50)

Once again, domestic activities play a role – keeping fires, fishing, cutting shoe grass (grass which the Sámi line the inside of their shoes with), birth – all indicate the named landscape as part of daily existence, as sites of stories of family events. The binary discourse of Fanon's 'manichean allegory', 'inside/outside', is still being applied by the strangers; 'they still ask'. The Eurocentric idea of 'home' is something 'inside' four walls, and static; rather than the Indigenous view that encompasses 'home' as the entire landscape, and moves over it. As Harald Gaski explains, 'Sámi place names contribute to providing the Sámi language reader the feeling of being on familiar ground, out on well-known terrain, something that is, of course, very essential for feeling secure and at home' (2015, p. 264). The named places break down the borders of the idea that 'home' is a territory 'inside' a fence; the external is internalized, exists both within and without, simultaneously. This holistic view defines the Indigenous concept of a sense of place, where humans are not separate from the land, but of it, and vice versa. In the process of colonization, this clash of cultural worldviews does not remain in the philosophical sphere, but quickly enters into the political arena.

5.3.3 The Politics of Naming Places

William Basso discusses the sense of *place* as a concept people take for granted – until a dislocation occurs. This event places a people into unfamiliar territory, where, 'on these unnerving occasions, sense of place may assert itself in pressing and powerful ways, and its often subtle components - as subtle, perhaps, as absent smells in the air or not enough visible

sky – come surging into awareness' (1996, p. xiii). But this dislocation does not necessarily have to be a physical removal from a landscape; this can occur through language, through the renaming of place. As Linda Tuhiwai Smith remarks:

> Renaming the land was probably as powerful ideologically as changing the land. Indigenous children in schools, for example, were taught the new names for places that they and their parents had lived in for generations. These were the names which appeared on maps and which were used in official communications. This newly named land became increasingly disconnected from the songs and chants used by Indigenous people to trace their histories, to bring forth spiritual elements or to carry out the simplest of ceremonies (1999, p. 53).

Here, the familiar is overlaid with a language which denies not only access to place, but to the culture and ceremony attached to place. This 'loss of memory' can erase histories, break down the methods for passing on tradition and knowledge; in short, an effective process for assimilation into the dominant culture. Placenames are one of the repositories of memory; the signposts, both literally and figuratively, on the landscape that announce a connection to those who live there. Negotiating between language and geography, placenames are 'at once both material and metaphorical, substantive and symbolic – read, spoken, mapped, catalogued and written in the everyday intimate and official bureaucratic geographies of road signs, streetnames and addresses – are all about questions of power, culture, location and identity' (Nash, 1999, p. 457). When names become official matters, when they enter a bureaucratic system of cartography and signage, the issue of control becomes the responsibility of the dominant majority, which is complicated when the power balance is in favour of the colonizer.

In Sápmi, for example, the oral tradition of naming has faced different measures from the nation states of four different countries – Norway, Sweden, Finland and Russia. Various processes of assimilation have rendered local Sámi placenames in some areas almost invisible, where official state maps and road signs have either translated placenames into the language of the state, or have prioritized alternative versions from dominant members of the population. This position 'seeks therefore to maintain the status quo and continue the policy of silencing the Indigenous toponomy' (Helander, 2016, p. 230). The decolonization process has sought to rectify this, with varying degrees of success, with legal acts such as The Sámi Language Act in Finland (1992), and the Place-Names Act in Norway (1991), which seeks to

use Sámi placenames in Sámi domicile areas in the northern areas of those countries. Since then, many road signs and maps have appeared in bilingual form, though this has not been without some resistance. In Norway, Municipal authorities have been slow to implement the name changes, and on occasions when the bilingual signs have been erected, the Sámi placenames have often been painted over, disfigured, and even shot with bullets. In 1989, in Gáivuotna- Kåfjord municipality, which was the first to be incorporated into the Sámi Language Administration area in Troms county in Norway, the Sámi name on the sign was damaged many times in the first few years. The previous Norwegianization of the Sámi may be an explanation for this, where 'the aim was to assimilate the Sámi people into Norwegian culture, and hence Sámi language and cultural expression were heavily stigmatized' (Pedersen, 2016, p. 224). Kaisa Helander also attributes this resistance to 'a fear among the Norwegian population of a shift in the balance of power from the majority to the minority' (2016, p. 244). This illustrates the very real emotions people attach to the names of where they dwell, and the lengths they will go to in order to protect this lingual aspect of perceived territory.

Nils-Aslak Valkeapää, as a figure for Sámi and Indigenous rights most of his life, would not have been unaware of the politics behind these acts of naming and renaming; and, as shown previously, has used placenames throughout his poetical works to anchor language to landscape, and landscape to the Sámi. As Harald Gaski remarks, 'Ailu's [Valkeapää's] use of place names in the Trekways book (especially in the long poem "My home is in my heart") are mainly to connect to the landscape, and make it even clearer that Sápmi has a long history of presence, which the place name is also a proof of' (Personal correspondence, 2018). For example, in 'Bluethroat, Twitter, Sing', Valkeapää writes, 'At Ádjajohka there is / the same clear spring water'; 'Over Ádjagorsa a rough-legged buzzard / soars with the wind' (p. 2: ds.15). Both placenames in these contexts are associated with the environment – a spring, a buzzard, the wind, which indicate a relationship between a placename and the entities within the environment. The names themselves mean 'grandfather's creek' and 'grandfather's gulch' respectively, which triangulates the connection between the land, its name, and the Sámi ancestor, implying a relationship that goes back over a long time, and therefore is evidence of Sámi occupation.

Makereti, in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, chooses the island's Moriori name 'Rēkohu' over the Māori 'Wharekauri' and the English 'Chatham'. The fact that the island

has three names gives an indication of the complexity of the political landscape. The English name, ‘Chatham’, comes from the ‘discovery’ of the island in 1791, when those aboard a British naval vessel briefly landed on Rēkohu, and became involved in a skirmish with the Moriori. The captain named the island after his ship. (King, 1989, p. 43). The Māori name, Wharekauri, comes from the name of a place on the north of the island, and an apparent misunderstanding. The story goes that when the Māori landed there, and asked the Moriori the name of the island, they gave the name of the locality instead (Makereti T. , 2017, p. 3). This process of naming a place, as evident within the two texts, holds the power of legitimization for a people within their own world. The European idea of ‘discovery’, settling on new territory, involves a translation of sorts; a transposing of language and worldview onto a location.

5.3.4 Translation

Why are original placenames renamed or translated by colonizers? Is this a form of control, a method of exercising power, a way to legitimize a claim to territory? Laura Kostanski and Guy Puzey explore these themes in their introduction to *Names and Naming: People, Places, Perceptions and Power* (2016). Names act as ‘identifiers of history and community’, and help define who we are, both as an individual and as a group. The act of naming is power, it is the power to create the world. Naming is a ‘political act’, and translation, ‘in its broadest cultural sense – but also in narrower terms – is a complex process that requires nuanced understanding of the layered cultural meanings inherent in words, not least in names. If these considerations are lacking, misunderstandings arise, and opportunities for enhanced cultural understanding, dialogue and exchange can be thwarted’ (2016, p. xvii). They use the literary example of Brian Friel, the Irish playwright, and his play *Translations* (1981), the first play produced by The Field Day theatre company in Northern Ireland in 1980, a turbulent time in Ireland’s history. As scholar Seamus Deane states: ‘Ireland is the only country that has had both an early and a late colonial experience’, and talks about the need for a ‘new discourse for a new relationship between our idea of the human subject and our idea of human communities.’ (1990, p. 3).

Translations is set in 1833, when a detachment of Royal Engineers for the British army come to a rural, Irish-speaking area to carry out an ordinance survey and map the land,

and also to translate the Irish placenames into English: ‘the official task…is to take each of the Gaelic names – every hill, stream, rock…and Anglicise it, either by changing it into its approximate English sound, or by translating it into English words.’ (p. 34). Place in *Translations* is to do with language, how language is weaved into the landscape, and the cultural and political effects of the translation of placenames on the small community. The central conceit of this play is that, although all characters are speaking in English on stage, some of them are speaking in Irish. This becomes clear to the audience as the English-speaking army officers and the Irish locals fail to communicate with one another. The cartographer, Yolland, and a local girl Máire, can only communicate their feelings for one another through the language of the Irish placenames, as Yolland learns these in order to change them into English. At one point, he remarks, ‘I'm concerned about my part in it. It's an eviction of sorts’ (p. 52). This ‘eviction’ of the Irish placenames, being replaced by English ones, places the locals in unfamiliar territory. As the schoolmaster Hugh states, ‘We must learn those new names…We must learn where we live. We must learn to make them our own. We must make them our new home’ (p. 88). Kostanski and Puzey consider this ‘official naming’, and quote Pierre Bourdieu when he describes it as ‘a display of symbolic capital and a symbolic act of imposition…performed by a delegated agent of the state, that is, the holder of the *monopoly of legitimate symbolic violence*’ (2016, p. xx). This displacement of placenames is shown here to be equivalent to a removal from the land itself; the geography, while remaining the same, has been translated into an unrecognizable locality.

Harald Gaski discusses, in the introduction to the English version of Valkeapää's *The Earth, My Mother*, his and the other translators' choice to leave the placenames untranslated. He says, ‘We have decided *not* to translate the place names in the poems…They convey an onomatopoetic playfulness in Sámi, where the main point is to show a sense of belonging to an area, a home district, which is both vocal and concrete’ (2017, p. unpaginated). For example, in *Trekways of the Wind*, placenames such as ‘Dálvadas’ does not have a one-word meaning; it means ‘winter grazing land’ and ‘winter camp site’. The name has connotations as a place used only in winter, when the reindeer are in the mountain pastures. The name ‘Bárbmu’ denotes a warm region where migratory birds come for the winter. It also means ‘the perfect world’ giving an indication of its beauty, as well as its practical advantages as a warm area in winter. ‘Basseuksa’ means the ‘holy gate’, which would imply a place sacred to the Sámi. The Norwegian names seen on signposts do not lend the same musicality, or have

the same mythical connotations that lend depth and history to the names, so the Sámi placenames in the poems are therefore left in their original Sámi language.

Makereti makes a choice of privileging the island's original name of Rēkohu. As she says, 'I had to make a choice, and I chose to privilege the Moriori story because my first responsibility in writing this story was not to do any more harm to them, and their story is the one that hasn't been privileged the most' (2017, p. 2). On the Official Visitor Guide for the island, all three names are given – firstly 'Chatham Island', then 'Rēkohu/Wharekauri' underneath. The map shows placenames like 'Waitangi' 'Owenga', 'Hapupu' interspersed with English names – 'Port Hutt', 'Cape Young', 'Red Bluff'. This demonstrates the layering of history on the landscape, and the diversity of the island's population. It is worth mentioning that there were other Māori people, as well as Europeans, resident on the island before the events of 1835, and whose descendants continue to live there today. The novel itself allows for different viewpoints through the characters, which illustrates a balanced perspective. The author's choice to give preference to one placename is in order to address the 'hidden history' of the Moriori people, to give their story voice, to 'translate back' to the name in the original language of the island.

All three examples, from *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings, Trekways of the Wind,* and *Translations*, show the symbolic power of the named place in literature; whether the placenames are being translated, translated back into the original language, or left untranslated. All are a site of postcolonial resistance within the works, the placenames defy the superimposition of another language on the landscape, and stand as metaphors for located traditions. Makereti, Valkeapää and Friel illustrate the shared experience of colonial histories, from disparate parts of the globe. In a truly Indigenous sense, placenames are both the repository of tradition and dynamic, they allow the language of place to tell its own story, even as the story changes.

5.4 Story and Place

'The universe is made of stories, not of atoms', writes poet Muriel Rukeyser (Kaufman, 2014, p. 467). This power of words, of story, to not only make sense of world but to embody it, to create it, has been part of the human condition since time immemorial. Stories bridge the

distance between the past and the future, retain a continuation of identity, culture and tradition. In oral societies, stories hold what Margaret Kovach refers to as 'ways of knowing' (Indigenous Methodologies, 2009), where their inclusion in research can illuminate belief systems, reinforcements of cultural norms, and reservoirs of histories. The stories people tell are often grounded in the familiar, in known locations, connecting people to the land. In an Indigenous context, local stories of place can subvert the grand narratives of colonization by offering different representations of relationship with the land. A particularly detrimental Eurocentric concept was that of *Terra Nullius*, that is, perceptions of the land as empty (as in, not being used for agriculture), and therefore available to occupy by new settlers. J. Edward Chamberlin gives a good example of this from British Columbia, where government officials were claiming land for the government. This was met by incredulity from the tribal elders, who asked the newcomers, 'If this is your land, where are your stories?' What was understood by this was that 'stories give meaning and value to the places we call home; how they bring us close to the world we live in by taking us into a world of words' (2003, p. 1). Stories create involvement between people, narrative and place, offering evidence of dwelling and memory on the land over generations.

In his research with the Western Apache, William Basso illustrates a deeper connection between storytelling and place; not only do the placenames reveal a history and connection with ancestors, but stories themselves are associated with particular locations as physical settings where the narratives take place. In this way, the listeners are able to anchor the stories with visual imagery. This can then be used as a way of referencing the conduct of the characters in the story, and relating behaviour to a specific landmark. Basso tells of a young girl, coming home from boarding-school, who wears curlers in her hair at a ceremony. In Apache culture, this shows disrespect for the ceremony itself, as women are supposed to attend with their hair worn loose. Instead of admonishing her directly, her grandmother later proceeds to narrate a tale of an Apache policeman who behaved like a white man. The girl gets up and goes home shortly afterwards. Basso encounters the girl two years later, and they discuss the incident. As they do so, they pass by the location where the events of that particular story about the policeman took place, and Basso points it out to her. 'She said nothing for several moments. Then she smiled and spoke softly in her own language: "I know that place. It stalks me every day"'. In this way, Basso claims, stories have consequences on the actions of members of the community, causing them to modify their behaviour and meet

the expectations of their community; but also creates lasting relationships between Indigenous people and their immediate landscape.

An example from literature, often quoted by geographers (Kostanski & Puzey, 2016; Radding & Western, 2010), is the passage from Friel's play *Translations*, where the story associated with the place is about to be eradicated through the translation of the placename. 'Tobair Vree' – 'tobair' meaning 'well', and 'Vree' being a corruption of the name 'Brían' – 'Brian's Well', is the placename at a crossroads:

> A hundred-and-fifty years ago there used to be a well there, not at the crossroads, mind you – that would be too simple – but in a field close to the crossroads. And an old man called Brian, whose face was disfigured by an enormous growth, got it into his head that the water in that well was blessed; and every day for seven months he went there and bathed his face in it. But the growth didn't go away; and one morning Brian was found drowned in that well. And ever since that crossroads is known as Tobair Vree – even though that well has long since dried up (p. 53).

The demolition of the connection between language and place, through an imposed translation, implies the loss of such a story, but here, the placename is retained simply *because* it tells a story. It fires the imagination of the English Yolland, and he insists on keeping it. David Punter claims that storytellers can challenge 'the boundaries of what it is possible to remember'; they threaten the colonial state machine, 'specifically in a postcolonial era, who will not call a close to history…who refuse to accept that the past moment can be surpassed, those whose desperation, although it tells and signifies a story, will not be bought off by the alternative narratives so readily on offer from the consensus of the neocolonisers' (2000, p. 128). The weapon of the storyteller is memory; the story itself becomes an alibi of history, and does not allow for the superimposition of another, more convenient history to be placed over it.

The example of 'Tobair Vree' also contains more information than the story of one man alone; it illustrates the whole tradition in Ireland of 'Holy Wells'. Many wells were, and still are to this day, associated with particular saints, and are thought to have healing properties for specific ailments. Brían was not acting out of context in his culture. His tradition allows the belief in a cure for his disfigurement, and there is a possibility that this well by the crossroads held some tradition of healing. His story therefore may give an indication of an older one – another layer of history retained in folk memory. The narrative

therefore encompasses the practice of pilgrimage to a sacred site, a holy well. The loss of the placename would therefore have obliterated all traces of these layers contained within the story.

This idea of loss, the stories of 'hidden histories', is a concept Makereti addresses in her novel about the Moriori. She herself was unable to trace an ancestor back to Rēkohu, although family stories say that he was Moriori. She sees fiction as a way to uncover the story, to return to that place:

> When everything's been taken, all you've got left is a re-imagining, so if you've had generations of purposeful eradication of memories and connections, then one of your most powerful ways back is to re-imagine that connection, and it's kind of ironic that I was never able to make that direct genealogical link to the ancestor that we thought we had from Rēkohu, because that was what my story was about. So if there was a link there, it's been eradicated so thoroughly, that we can't make that connection. But the story has always existed (2017, p. 6).

In this way, story is used in literature to fill in the gaps; it articulates the suppressed histories and grasps, through the imagination, the missing pieces that are retained in the memory of the community. As Makereti remarks, 'we live in a world that doesn't allow us to pass on our oral traditions as precisely, because they used to be only held by certain people [in Māori tradition], and passed on in very precise ways' (2017, p. 6). The story of the island in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* is a sensitive portrayal of all points of view, including, through the character of Biggs, the Māori viewpoint, while still highlighting the hidden story of the Moriori. The story is found in places on the island, the places tell stories, the sea sings 'a different song from every shore' (p. 256).

Valkeapää also uses the story of place in *Trekways of the Wind* – the first section, 'White Spring Nights', is a love story told through the movement of the seasons over the landscape. 'Bluethroat, Twitter, Sing' contains another love story; the story of a Sámi boy going to boarding school; the story of home and colonization; and the reflections of the old ways of Sápmi. 'Streams' Silver Veins' is the story of a journey – like all journeys, he finds similarities in the familiar as he travels to other Indigenous homelands. All the stories are connected to place, and Indigenous ways of being. For Valkeapää, his poetry, alongside his illustrations, provide a type of reconstruction of the old Sámi ways, that anchor the reader to the cultural landscape, even in the face of colonization:

How I respect old Sápmi
Even if others show me
papers they have written themselves
even if they had written a great deal
what do they know about our feelings
Our ancestors have made a fire
on every slope
they have stepped on every stone
our ancestors
they have lived and died here. (p. 2: ds.42)

The story he tells here is a witness to a sense of belonging to the land; 'papers' and laws are irrelevant when the ancestors have 'stepped on every stone', have moved over the land the same way they have moved through time. As Budhwa and McCreary state, 'Place exists in between the material and the subjective, and serves an important role in the construction of an identity as a subjective and embodied experience. The loss of this distinct sense of place can have significant impact on individuals and communities with such connections' (2013, p. 207). Valkeapää's stance on the land is quietly defiant; he insists through the narratives, the resilience of a Sámi voice; he shows the reader the tundra, he migrates across it, while his home stays within his heart. By moving through the landscape of the book, through images, music and words, the reader learns the stories, is given access to the 'ways of knowing' within the Sámi worldview. Valkeapää's and Makereti's textual examples both illustrate the integral connection between place and story, and how collective memory is retained within locations to evoke a sense of belonging. The 'atoms' of language, the stories, do indeed create their own universe.

5.5 Discussion

This chapter has explored language, firstly as a medium in itself, as a method of human communication, and how it shapes our worldview. Indigenous language, as a cultural identity, has suffered an attempted obliteration in the context of colonization, and revived as part of the

decolonization process. Its connection to the landscape has been explored through the lens of the misunderstandings of conflicting worldviews, where, at point of contact, the Eurocentric notion of private property has clashed with various Indigenous concepts of communal land use, illustrated in the Cartesian concept of the human as separate from the land and its other inhabitants, rather than part of it. Indigenous outlooks within the analysis have focused mainly on the Māori and Sámi concepts of language and place, of alternative 'ways of knowing' the land. The Māori see sound and speech as the very materials the world is made from, how it is 'called into being' through language; the Sámi's tradition of yoik is a language accessible to, and created by, all entities. This relational understanding of place has been shown to be articulated in Valkeapää's poetry, and Makereti's novel, through use of specific words that are resonant with meaning, and oral techniques such as the Sámi yoik.

The connection of language to place is at its most specific when it comes to naming. Names, particularly for places, are markers of identification and communion with the landscape; they are metaphors, allegories and manifestations of cultural heritage and ancestry. Placenames can indicate an historical presence of people on the land, and become a site of resistance in the political sphere, whether in translation, the refusal of translation, or in translating back, as the various examples from literary texts have shown. The power of words in the Indigenous oral tradition, also prevalent in Indigenous literature, and as a method for Indigenous research, culminate in the use of story, of narrative, as a powerful tool for self-representation. This self-representation can be used as a means to deconstruct the grand narratives of an imposed culture, and offer alternative stories, or histories.

In this regard, Makereti tells the story of the Moriori people through the re-imagined hidden history of one of her ancestors, Haimona, who family stories claim was from Rēkohu. Like other Māori authors before her, such as Witi Ihimaera and Patricia Grace, these stories highlight the Indigenous experience in Aotearoa/New Zealand and made it accessible to a wider audience. The suppression of these stories is a theme in these novels, for example, in Grace's *Baby No-Eyes*, Shane, a young Māori man asks Gran Kura for 'our names, the secrets, our stories' that have not been passed on, in order to protect the next generation from the pain of assimilation and racism. She replies, 'our stories could kill you' (1998, p. 26). It is these repressed stories, the connection back to the Māori (and Moriori) culture, that Makereti is addressing, hidden for the shame of a people being who they are, in a colonial environment that sees them as 'inferior'.

Similarly, Valkeapää's use of story within his poetry also articulates this sense of shame; in the tale of a young boy sent off to boarding-school, where he is forbidden to speak his own language, and where the children tease him for being a Sámi, calling him 'Reindeer pants Reindeer pants' (p. 2: ds.19). This act of naming, this 'othering', using the traditional cultural marker of the reindeer in a negative sense, can be seen as a typical example of the colonizer's projection of shame onto a culture they consider 'inferior', relating the connection of the boy to nature, in a way that is sees the two things as 'primitive'. Valkeapää counters this way of thinking by evoking the Sámi culture through his art and poetry, 'How I respect old Sápmi' (p. 2: ds.42). Note that he uses here the name of the land, rather than the people, as the two are interchangeable; the lands, as well as the Sámi, have been colonized and changed. Towards the end of the book, the lines of mountains on the page gradually transform into a cityscape, which takes over the next double spread as a black jumble of buildings with white squares, representing lights in the windows (p. 3: ds.39). Although his work has come under criticism for 'romanticizing' the nature aspect of the Sámi way of life, its mythologies and its adherence to the Sámi language, the transition of the oral tradition onto the pages of literature required this necessary articulation, particularly at the time he wrote his books, when the Indigenous political movement, centering around land rights and self-determination, was gathering momentum.

Certainly, Sámi authors and poets who have followed in his wake take different approaches, and write about Sámi identity in urban settings, or as modern Sámi attempting to reclaim their identity. Niko Valkeapää mirrors the perspective of the poet-shaman as the *eaidanas ealli*, the reindeer who stands apart from the herd. The poet, in an urban setting, uses the window as a metaphor of distance between himself and other people: 'It is good / to watch / from behind the window / I watch / as you run on / your way' (2017, p. 19). As an observer, he is visible through the window; he is seen but unseen, witnessing his world. Sigbjørn Skåden, another Sámi author, articulates a fractured Sámi identity:

> She looks at him smoking a fag. After a while she goes inside. She knits. A scarf with a message in Saami for Mum. "Eadni, don leat máilmmi buorremus!" says the pattern. "Mum, you're the best in the world!" Only one word is misspelled (2012, p. Note 4).

The last line is heartbreaking. It sums up the attempt to bridge the cultural loss of language as a mother tongue, a misspelling knitted into a scarf for a mother. It is an intimate picture, that still evokes, albeit an imperfect rendering, a sense of belonging rooted in language, a knitting

together of the generational divide, where one generation of Sámi-speakers did not pass on the language to the next, where the words on a scarf are an endeavour to reclaim it.

This dislocation of language and story is grounded in a metaphorical place, that Arnold Krupat terms the Frontier – not an imaginary line between 'us' and 'them', that moves 'forward' as civilization advances, but 'rather, in a more relativist manner, the frontier is understood as simply that shifting space in which two cultures encounter one another' (1992, p. 4). Despite the material inequality of the power balance of these two encounters, where the dominant culture becomes prevalent, there is an interaction between cultures that prevents, in the process of Indigenous revitalization, a return to a pre-contact, essentialist culture. This interchange, in the space of the frontier, necessarily implies a dual directionality of contact, a 'transculturalization' (1992, p. 15). Moving forward, an Indigenous sense of place requires the kind of reclamation demonstrated in these Indigenous texts, but with a knowledge that 'what occurs on the borders is that oppositional sets like West/Rest, Us/Them, anthropological/biological, historical/mythical, and so on, often tend to break down' (1992, p. 15). While binary oppositions such as these prove useful for analysis, the idea of an ethnocritical frontier blurs these borders, these identities; allows for a continued Indigenous existence beyond decolonization. A sense of place here becomes not only a tie to territory, but also a metaphorical place that can exist within histories of shared experience; as Nils-Aslak Valkeapää describes in his encounters with other native peoples on his travels:

> The drums beat with the rhythm of the heart
> Towards the night the Indian yoiks sound
> Even while dreaming I hear the yoiking
> the drum beats
> and all this
> so familiar
> have I been
> here before (p. 3: ds.12)

While taking into consideration differences in Indigenous cultures on a specific level, there is much to explore within a universal context of Indigenous-to-Indigenous comparison; what Chadwick Allen describes as *trans-Indigenous*. A close reading of two texts, from Makereti and Valkeapää, applying this methodology of *juxtaposition*, is the subject of the next chapter.

6 Analysis III: Trans-Indigenous

'A global Indigenous literary studies (primarily) in English must move beyond scenarios in which Great Book from Tradition A is introduced to Great Book from Tradition B so that they can exchange vital statistics, fashion tips, and recipes under the watchful eye of the Objective Scholar…other projects are more intellectually stimulating, more aesthetically adventuresome, more politically pressing'.

(Allen C. , Trans-Indigenous, 2012)

6.1 Introduction

How might we understand Indigenous literature differently by bringing together distinct Indigenous contemporary traditions, breaking out of simple comparisons and contrasts, and read across, through and beyond tribally and nationally specific texts and contexts? What happens when we bypass the dominant paradigms of colonizer/native binary readings and their inherent asymmetrical relationships of power, and investigate Indigenous-to-Indigenous comparisons of literary connections, intersections and distinctions? Chadwick Allen's comparative methodology of *juxtaposition* is a literary critical practice of focused interactions that provokes readings of Indigenous texts that seek to centre the Indigenous context, rather than have it relegated to the margins; where previously Indigenous literature has had to fit into the academic models that have been provided by the dominant culture. This establishes a different knowing; a refusal to allow the European epistemologies to decide what is the normative or best reading of a text. He terms this *Trans-Indigenous*.

The prefix '*trans-*' seeks to re-examine the comparative '*and*'; affixing itself to words like *trans*lation, *trans*national, and *trans*form. A trans-Indigenous reading occupies a vantage point that shows a different horizon to the established Eurocentric reading, where this type of comparison 'sets each group's discursive practices in relief, suggesting avenues for analysis and theory that are less obvious when text produced by either group are considered on their own' (2002, p. 2). This method allows for links *across* unexplored areas, where little attention has been given to the comparison of specific texts on a global scale, and provokes different kinds of address. As he states, 'the point is not to displace the necessary, invigorating study of specific traditions and contexts but rather to complement these by augmenting and expanding

broader, globally Indigenous fields of inquiry…*Trans-* could be the next *post'* (2012, p. xiv). While this is still a fairly new methodology, it serves to create space for a literary conversation between different Indigenous cultures and offers a new perspective on their own terms. Trans-Indigenous, as an emerging practice, seeks to move *through* what he sees as the shortcomings of literary theory, such as postcolonial theory, when applied to Indigenous writings.

While postcolonial theoretical terms such as *othering*, or the concept of binary divides between centre and margin, have proved useful for literary analysis of Indigenous writings, they were originally developed to access the writings of India, Africa and the Caribbean after World War II and as an answer to these nations' independence from the colonial forces. Certain characteristics of these practices can be mapped onto the Indigenous context, but these original models follow a very different historical trajectory as independent states, not to mention the double-bind of settler independence in countries like the USA, where the Americans became independent from the British, but the Indigenous peoples of the continent are still marginalized. As Ashcroft, Griffiths and Tiffin remark, 'In terms of their own developing writing, however, the position of groups such as the Māoris, Inuit, and Australian Aborigines is a special one because they are doubly marginalized – pushed to the psychic and political edge of societies which themselves have experienced the dilemma of colonial alienation' (1989, p. 144). Allen argues, while 'so-called orthodox postcolonial theory is not, of course, the monolith that..critics sometimes make it out to be, and, although highly influential…postcolonial theory can become counterproductive when it extends its (sometimes veiled) analysis of local phenomenon into global abstractions.' (2002, p. 32). Decolonizing Indigenous methodologies have sought to counter these generalizations with more localized forms of paradigm, broadly termed 'Indigenous Literary Nationalism'. These paradigms include Womack's culture-specific separatist interpretations of First Nations in Canada and Smith's *Kaupapa Māori* approach to research in Aotearoa/New Zealand. On the other hand, Arnold Krupat's Cosmopolitanism has argued for a global perspective, where common values in Indigenous cultures are mediators in the discourse with what he terms the 'Western' worldview. Although criticism of these methods lead to Nationalism being accused of essentialism and separatism, and Cosmopolitanism of minimizing tribal or local context, Allen does not engage with this academic debate, and takes a different route. Instead, his

trans-Indigenous methodology acknowledges the shared histories, cultures and traditions of Indigenous peoples, while remaining aware of the distinctions on a local level.

Bypassing the entrenched ideologies of comparing Indigenous literature to that of the dominant mainstream, the process of juxtaposition places 'diverse texts close together across genre and media, aesthetic systems and worldviews, technology and practices, tribes and nations, the Indigenous-settler binary, and historical periods and geographical regions' (2012, p. xviii). In view of Allen's trans-Indigenous methodology, a pertinent question in this exploration of place and language in Indigenous literature becomes: does a juxtaposition of a prose passage from Makereti's *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, and a poem from Valkeapää's *Trekways of the Wind*, offer a deeper insight into the distinct dynamics of Indigenous experience in the late twentieth and early twenty-first century, over geographical boundaries and distinct worldviews? What would a Sámi reading of a Māori text, or a Māori reading of a Sámi text offer in ways of understanding the Indigenous perspective?

In one of the chapters of his book, *Trans-Indigenous,* Allen explores the presence or absence of the function of Indigenous language in each text. For example, juxtaposing a Māori poem, where Māori words and phrases are used throughout, brings into sharp relief the language used in a Native American poem, written entirely in English (2012, pp. 146-53). This is made somewhat redundant as an exercise here, when one of the chosen texts is in translation; *Trekways of The Wind* from its original Sámi, *Ruoktu Váimmus*. Allen's methodology of juxtaposition can be applied to other themes, such as the Indigenous concept of place. Allen takes his starting point for research, as an Indigenous method, from the Indigenous situated approach – where we are, how the researcher is localized, how this affects the research we do across every discipline. As he claims, 'Although not always acknowledged, all scholarship is historically situated, and, to some degree, influenced by the biography of the scholar' (2012, p. xviii). In this case, the point of origin is Tromsø University in Sápmi, and fieldwork was carried out in Aotearoa/New Zealand, which has given an 'in situ' aspect to the research, an embodied experience of being on the land, which has enhanced the positioning of the author of this thesis, as an outsider to both cultures, and a sense of connection to people and place that would not have been possible from within the walls of a University library. The concept of 'venturing out' can often engage the researcher in experiences that can lead back to our own base of knowledge – to surprising places we weren't necessarily expecting. This has inspired a reading of the texts where the starting point

is in unfamiliar territory, but where encounters establish, in two very different contexts, a sense of belonging, and ties to homeland. Here the methodology of juxtaposition is used to analyse excerpts from Makereti's *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* and Valkeapää's *Trekways of the Wind*.

6.2 The Texts

By placing a poem from *Trekways of the Wind* and a prose passage from *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* in juxtaposition, we put them into a conversation with each other, Indigenous-to-Indigenous, bypassing a comparison with the dominant colonial power, to provide Indigenous-centred readings from distinct cultures with a shared colonial experience; across, beyond and through, 'to harness the power of surprising, productive juxtapositions for a method of literary analysis that is explicitly trans-Indigenous' (Allen C. , 2012, p. 146). The chosen prose passage from *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* is a pivotal point in the novel where Lula, the main character, visits the British Museum in London and has an encounter with a Māori figure on display in an exhibition. This significant moment sets in motion a series of events, where she decides to go home to Aotearoa/New Zealand, and begins the process of reconnecting to her Indigenous heritage. The poem from *Trekways of the Wind* describes a moment in the journey of the poet to the American prairies, where he engages with the Blackfeet Indians through the music of ceremony, on the site of sacred space. Both the character, Lula, and the poet-as-character Valkeapää, find themselves in a foreign context in these texts, but manage to transcend, through the Indigenous aesthetic, their displacement; where the 'exotic' transforms into the 'familiar'.

6.2.1 From *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*

She looked, then refocused on the Greek urn fragment in front of her, but couldn't keep her attention from the red-brown carving in the corner. She felt that she should circle the room one piece at a time, that each item should receive her attention, but once she had seen the carved man she couldn't seem to concentrate on the others. She regulated her footsteps and circled the room at a steady, respectful pace, seeing but not staying with the other items. When she finally reached the figure, she wondered what had compelled her to it. She had always liked exotic things. The carving in front of her was from home.

'What are you doing here?' she found herself saying aloud. She had never spoken to an inanimate object before. Then she reached out a hand and placed it on his head. Which wasn't even allowed. She quickly checked the room and saw that she was almost alone. There was a camera and a circulating guard, but no other visitors. She returned her hand to her side, and felt it there still, in her fingers: the urge to make contact.

Something was caught in her throat. A denseness began to build in her chest.

She stepped back. He was smooth and rounded in form, with shapely shoulders and hips, stout knees, long articulate fingers that embraced his stomach and reached up over a prominent collarbone. He was squat, carved to hold up the central post of a house, but fine featured. His head was naturalistic, almost lifesized. He would have been a beautiful man – full-lipped; a straight, broad nose; eyes that still reflected fire from their paua-blue pupils. He had a fine, swirling moko, a well-oiled top-knot. Lula could not remember seeing such a regal example of carving before. At home she'd always thought them a bit kitsch, too kiwiana for her tastes.

The carved figure looked sad. His head inclined downwards rather than straight ahead – usually they were defiant, challenging. The small sign beside him said:

> CARVED MALE FIGURE
> Māori, mid-19th century AD
> From New Zealand, Polynesia

It didn't say where he came from or who his people were. Lula knew there was something wrong with this, but didn't know why she knew. The denseness in her chest carried a sorrow she didn't recognise as her own. There was nothing in the room that meant anything to her except him, but even that did not make sense. She had never cared before.

Without thinking, she reached out to touch the carved man again, and a guard said, 'Please don't touch, Miss', so she took a sudden step back instead, almost losing her footing. She felt watched, and realized how odd she must look to be hanging around this one thing. Ancestor of some kind, she supposed. Once he would have had a name. She did not know for sure if he was hers. (pp. 67-9).

6.2.2 From *Trekways of the Wind*

At night the heart beat the heart beat
the drum beat the drum beat
an Indian yoiked Blackfeet Indians yoiked
the black prairie sand
nebulously spread out in the night
warm dark night
the mind flips through images memories
from a life one did not know one had lived
Yoik on the prairie sand
yoik in our tundra's embrace
noaidi drum
Do not hide any more
come here warm prairie wind
the burning yoik of the blood
come here warm prairie wind
with soft fingers
find my desire
And in the night the drums beat
hearts beat
find a way to regions unknown
Come here warm prairie wind
soft embrace
grasp it
search my desire
squeeze it
the restless burning wind of the blood
in the warm dark prairie night
hot wind
hot blood
on the sand
The heart beats
hearts beat
drums beat
yoiking in the night
the warm prairie wind
hot blood (p. 3: ds.18)

6.3 A Trans-Indigenous Reading

6.3.1 Pieces in Transition

The first text, from *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, begins with Lula in the British Museum, her sense of disorientation accentuated by a hangover, as she comes to a room where the exhibit is entitled 'pieces in transition'. Although the theme is never fully explained, and Lula herself finds it difficult to make the connection between the exhibits, the passage begins with her noticing 'the red-brown carving' in the corner. She does not make her way to the carving directly, but 'feels' she should take a circular path, almost in a ritualistic sense, until she reaches the figure she is 'compelled' towards. The sentence 'she had always liked exotic things' jars slightly, as it interrupts the suspense, but it sets up the surprise when she realizes the carving 'was from home'. She speaks directly to the figure, aloud, and then reaches out to touch its head, to make a physical connection, an 'urge to make contact'. She immediately second-guesses herself, wondering what is 'allowed', checking for cameras and guards. She feels something catching in her throat, as if blocking communication, and a 'denseness'; she steps back to observe from a distance this 'inanimate object', and describes his features – 'natuaralistic, almost lifesized', 'he would have been a beautiful man'. She seems to move between objective and subjective positions throughout, giving archaeological information such as 'he was squat, built to hold up the central pole of a house', and emotional opinion, 'the carved figure looked sad'. Her meditation is then interrupted by the guard, who prevents her from touching the figure a second time, making her feel self-conscious, and not sure if the carving was 'hers'. But the common sense of dislocation is obvious; the carved figure has no name, no local origin other than 'New Zealand, Polynesia', the place they both have originated from, awakening in Lula a sense of belonging. He is the single thing in the room that 'means anything' to her, even if she is unsure why. He evokes in her a sense of sorrow, even if 'she had never cared before'. Within a month after this encounter, she is on a plane home to Wellington. The carving has triggered within her a need to return.

One of the Māori aesthetic systems a carving like this is supposed to have is *ihi*, which means power; *ihi* is derived from the gods and causes the viewer to respond emotionally, physically and spiritually to the work (Allen C. , 2012, p. 132). This is exactly the reaction that the carving provokes in Lula, who herself is 'in transition', travelling the world. This connection to the carving, an ancestor speaking to her across the generations,

reveals to her through her genealogy her 'place' in the world, and she goes home. This sense of displacement represented by both Lula and the carving is further articulated by the physical space in which the encounter happens – that most colonial of institutions, the British Museum. Here, every artefact is in a state of 'transition', having been physically removed and separated from its land and its people. The guard, too, becomes a symbol of empire, maintaining this separation by forbidding Lula to connect with her culture, under his watchful eye. He separates Lula and the carving in a physical sense.

The carving, a *poutokomanawa*, was designed to hold up the central pole of a house. It is unclear whether he ever actually did, but we can probably assume so. Therefore he is not only displaced physically, but also in a functional capacity, and from his spiritual purpose. His encounter with Lula, despite the guard's interruption, reinvigorates his spiritual prowess, and has the desired effect; she goes back to Aotearoa/New Zealand and her mother's family, and engages with her Māori and Moriori genealogy. This journey, this circling through displacement and belonging, is also illustrated in the other text, where Valkeapää finds connections to home in his encounters across the American prairies.

6.3.2 Warm Prairie Wind

This chosen poem is the last in a series of four poems in the third section of *Trekways of the Wind*, 'Streams' Silver Veins', in which the poet embarks on a journey, 'following the command of the blood' (p. 3: ds.3) to other Indigenous locations. These four poems describe Valkeapää's visit to the Blackfeet Indians on the prairies. Juxtaposing this text with Makereti's excerpt from *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, what is most immediately striking is the poet's centredness within his own Sámi culture. Where the character Lula is hesitant, moving back and forth between Indigenous and Eurocentric perspectives, the poet-as-character is at ease with his identity, easily finding connection and similarities with his hosts. The teepee becomes a lávvu, the Indian regalia and gáktis are both donned together for the ceremony, the Indian chant resembles a yoik. The prairie itself transforms into the tundra, 'Yoik on the prairie sand / yoik in our tundra's embrace'. Where Lula's encounter is with a *whakairo*, an ancestor from her own culture, the poet finds his sense of place on the prairie with the Blackfeet tribe, a similar nomadic people. The poem itself is a ritual, where through

its rhythms differences and distances dissipate, and allow for an Indigenous understanding across the two cultures.

The poem begins at night, where the heart and the drum are both beating, lending a feeling of excitement, of anticipation; the beginning of a ceremonial event. The Indians start to 'yoik'; here the poet immediately dissolves the boundaries between the two cultures, locating the vocal accompaniment from Sápmi to the 'black prairie sand'. The shaman drum, 'the *noaidi* drum' is invoked, a drum that allows the shaman to travel between worlds, and the poet's mind 'flips though images memories / from a life one did not know one lived'. The similarities here have transcended into a 'lived' experience through ritual, carried through in the rhythm of the poem, the repeating beating of hearts, of drums, and a recurring reminder of place; the prairie is mentioned seven times in the poem, grounding the reader in a located experience. The 'warm prairie wind' is personified, invoked in language of desire and embrace, in beating hearts, the 'restless burning wind of the blood', an encounter that is sexual in tone, whether in the physical or metaphorical realm. The word 'blood' is repeated, too, symbolizing a connection to ancestors, ancestral memory and ties to land. Blood also circulates, around the body; perhaps lending to the image of the drum circle, of ceremonial dancing. If we transpose the blood's circular motion across to the prose section, we can correlate Lula's circling around the room of the museum as ritual, coming to the carving, as the body's blood will eventually circle back to the heart, Valkeapää's site of 'home'. And 'home' is where her encounter eventually leads her to. This reading across the two texts using Allen's method demonstrates the flow of progression intrinsic to both. The other pattern of transit in the two texts is a movement that leads inwards and out again, in the motion of the spiral.

6.3.3 Spiral, Koru, Labyrinth

By placing these chosen excerpts from *Trekways of the Wind* and *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* side by side, the Indigenous perspective can be seen to move across both texts and cultures in the motif of the spiral, which is evident in both Sámi and Māori traditions. The koru, the fern, is widely used in Māori art, symbolizing mobility; the Sámi have a tradition of stone labyrinths along the north coast of Sápmi. While unsure of their original function, the labyrinth is considered to be ritualistic, a movement from one state to the next, or a way to

move between worlds (Olsen, 1996). Movement in a circular motion is evident in both texts, allowing for the liminal spaces to open up and transform, creating connection, where beginning is linked back to the end, a return to home.

The fictional character, Lula, and the poet-as-character, Valkeapää, do however take their starting point from different positions on the spiral. Valkeapää begins, as in the first two sections of *Trekways of the Wind*, very much centred in the homeplace, in Sápmi, as a Sámi. He then travels outwards from the centre, on a journey that takes him to Greenland, Canada, and the North American prairies. He then returns home, having been through a period of transition, and incorporates his experience back into his tradition. Lula, on the other hand, has a more complicated path. She may begin at the centre, in Aotearoa/New Zealand, but has no sense of groundedness there, and travels outward without any sense of purpose, looking for her centre in the journey itself, looking to 'find herself' (p. 66). It is only when she reaches the outer edges of the spiral, in London, that she discovers her purpose, and returns home in order to find it, making her transition to the very specific location of the island of Rēkohu. This is where her rite of passage ends, this is where she finds belonging. This illustration through motif of the Indigenous sense of place is also evident in other forms of artistic media, associated with the two texts.

6.3.4 Reading Across: Other Alphabets

Allen argues, in *Trans-Indigenous,* that in Indigenous cultures, many artists work across the conventions, genres, forms and borders of artistic media, rather than in the compartmentalized formats common in the dominant culture. One of the 'multiperspectivist strategies' of this methodology is to 'place contemporary Indigenous literature in dialogue with other Indigenous arts and aesthetics' (p. xxii). There are, he claims, other forms of writing other than the alphabetic; for example, in the mathematics of Navajo weaving patterns or the Indigenous earthwork mounds in North America. These artistic forms are also a form of storytelling. In the chosen texts, there are two forms of associated artworks – the carved figure in the museum in the passage from *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, and Valkeapää's drawings accompanying the series of poems in *Trekways of the Wind.*

The *poutokomanawa* carved figure in the museum is a Māori *whakairo*, a carving in wood, stone or bone; or more broadly speaking, an ornament or pattern. These carvings are

imbued with *mana,* which translates as having power, or prestige. This can be broken down into three components, *ihi* (power), *wehi* (fear), and *wana* (authority). These qualities give the carving its sense of 'beauty'. In ritualistic terms, they can bridge the gap between space and time, and allow people to interact directly with their ancestors' (Allen C. , 2012, p. 132). This knowledge adds an extra dimension to the interchange between Lula and the figure. The fact that he was designed for a central pole on a house, most likely a marae, accentuates the separation from his proper 'place'. The vagueness of his original location and his not having a name all resonate with Lula, who herself is detached from her own ancestry and tradition. His story mirrors hers, they are both in a state of dislocation, due to the disconnection from their homeland. Valkeapää, on the other hand, uses illustrations to accentuate the connection to a foreign place and people.

The four poems concerning the Blackfeet Indians are situated over eight double-spreads in *Trekways of the Wind*, which I have numbered 3:ds.12-19. The first double-spread contains the first poem on the left page, and a sketch of a tepee on the right. The second is a drawing of two figures inside a decorated teepee. The third has the second poem on the left, with a drawing of two Indians in full regalia, mirroring the last line of the poem, 'we were dressed for a celebration'. The next spread has a single Blackfoot woman on the left, and the third poem on the right. This is followed by a double-spread with two Blackfeet dancing, and the next spread shows four figures sitting in a drum circle. Although they are in regalia, some details announce the fact that this is not a stereotypical scene from the nineteenth century; one figure is wearing glasses and another is dressed in a t-shirt and baseball cap. The last two double-spreads are on a black background, probably announcing it is now nighttime, mirroring the first line of the last poem, 'at night the heart beat the drum beat'. This poem is on the left, and on the right is a close-up sketch of a Blackfoot man in profile. The last page has three silhouetted figures facing in the same direction, the highlights intimating the direction of the fire. The illustrations serve to complement and comment on the text, to generate a sense of the people and the location. It may also be a reference to the Plains Indians' pictographic calendar known as the Winter Count, in which the tribe records, each winter, a pictograph of a significant event, on buffalo skin, sometimes going back many generations (Allen C. , 2002, p. 170). The illustrations are all of Blackfeet people, which centres and locates the people, through both text and illustration, in this region, this part of the

story. This places them physically in the landscape of the book as a whole, allowing a space for Indigenous-to-Indigenous engagement on equal terms.

6.3.5 The Indigenous Other

A trans-Indigenous reading of the two texts gives a discernible illustration of the breaking down of the standard binary oppositions of what Allen terms settler/native; in these cases, the encounter is Indigenous-to-Indigenous. The Other in these literary encounters is also Indigenous, the power balance is symmetrical. The Indigenous Other is not cast in an oppositional role; they occupy the same space. In Lula's case, the connection is vertical, a transgenerational communication between the carved ancestor and his metaphorical descendant. In the *Trekways* poem, the connection is horizontal; the Indigenous Other is not from the same Indigenous grouping, but allows the poet-as-character to identify more deeply with his own culture. The encounter with the Indigenous Other is an engagement of confronting the self in a new way, of seeing the Indigenous self from an Indigenous perspective. As Allen states, the Indigenous-to-Indigenous connection is a 'cyclical, ongoing process or cross-cultural exchange set free of the colonial and transnational relations of centre and margin' (2012, p. xxv). The conversation entered into with the Indigenous Other is not a matter of appropriation, but of seeing the self more clearly – outside and beyond the confines of the dominant culture.

6.3.6 A Sámi Reading of a Māori text, a Māori Reading of a Sámi text

What kind of interaction can occur across these two literary works, where elements of each other's culture can open up a dialogue that is Indigenous-to-Indigenous, and create a more nuanced understanding of the chosen texts? Juxtaposing this prose passage and poem, the reading is not only text-to-text, but also places the Sámi and Māori worldviews alongside each other, creating a space where elements of these can lead to a deeper interpretation of the writings, and produce new insights. This process moves beyond an investigation centred merely on 'local' knowledge, or reliance on the paradigms of the dominant culture.

Transposing the Māori text's worldview across to the Sámi text, the most obvious Indigenous marker is the *poutokomanawa* in the museum, which the Māori would consider *taonga. Taonga* translates as 'treasures', or 'prized possessions', but include both tangible and

intangible phenomena (Allen C. , 2002, p. 137). In *Trekways of the Wind*, Valkeapää, the poet-as-character finds connections through commonalities, such as traditional possessions. In the series of poems, Valkeapää mentions a number of items we could refer to as *taonga* – 'belts, pearls, silk, fringes, Sámi shoes, moccasins, Sámi gáktis, feathers' (p. 3:ds.14). These possessions bring about an affinity between the two Indigenous groups; as precious cultural markers, they assert their identities to each other, recognize their similarities as they prepare for ceremony. The *taonga* create a shared space between the Sámi and the Blackfeet. *Taonga* are also contained in performance, and the dance in the poem establishes a connection on the spiritual, or ancestral level, where the poet has visions – 'images memories' that are not his own; lives perhaps lived by the ancestors. The *noaidi* drum, one of the most prized of all Sámi possessions, is suffused with *taonga* properties. It, too, can bridge the gap between worlds, and is the medium of sacred knowledge and ritual. The site of ceremony, out on the prairie, conjures up the *taonga* concept of *wahi tapu*, which are sacred places, or a sense of guardianship that ties to place. Establishing the value system of *taonga* in these poems asserts a more meaningful and integral kinship to the encounter between the poet and the Blackfeet tribe. This Māori concept validates the relationship of the people to their place, to their heirlooms, their sacred objects, and to each other; in what Allen terms as a *re-recognizing* of the Indigenous self.

The Sámi yoik could also be interpreted as a form of *taonga*. Moving back across the texts, from the space of the prairie to London, what could the yoik tell us about the encounter between Lula and the carved carving in the British Museum? Lula's first reaction to the carving, when she realizes it is 'from home', is to speak aloud to it. She has an 'urge to make contact', but is not really sure how. She asks the carving, 'What are you doing here?' In this way, she is making a connection, attempting, as the yoik does, to collapse the distance of space and time between them, to reinvigorate the ancestor and create communion. To all intents and purposes, Lula is yoiking the carving. But she is not fully successful. The yoik becomes caught in her throat, its power feels like a 'denseness' in her chest as it comes up from the earth, it stays within her body. It is suppressed, like the yoik itself historically has been. This is further compounded by the appearance of the guard, symbolizing the colonial oppressor. He demands she behave in a certain way, creating in her a sense of shame, of being 'watched'; a state known only too well to many Indigenous peoples who were prevented from speaking their own language, from using their own voice. Later in the novel, Lula is more

successful. In a very similar encounter on Rēkohu, this time with the Moriori Tommy Solomon statue, she is more prepared. She walks directly to him, in a straight line, rather than circling around him, and addresses him in his own language (and hers, by way of ancestral connection): 'Tena Koe, Tena Koe Tommy' (p. 230). This time, she uses his name, as the carving in the museum was unnamed. The Tommy Solomon statue is also in his proper place, situated on his homeland, looking out towards the sea, and Lula has found her place, too. Lula's yoik to Tommy here has created the space for her to be there, her voice sounding strange to her in the quiet, and she stands with him, listening, and looking out on his world.

In this way, applying the juxtaposition method to the cultural specificity of the concepts of *taonga* and *yoik* creates a shared space for each to enter the other's sphere and exist together, adding an extra dimension to a reading of the texts, where other methodologies would not provide the tools to do this. One criticism of this methodology might be that the researcher would require an in-depth understanding of both Indigenous cultures, which obviously takes time and funding; and it is likely that few Indigenous scholars would have an 'insider' perspective on more than one Indigenous tradition. Overall, though, the trans-Indigenous process highlights the need for more scholarship regarding Indigenous-to-Indigenous comparison, particularly in the era of the global Indigenous political movement, where Indigenous literature can comment on, critique and enhance the process of Indigenous decolonization and self-determination.

6.4 Common Ground

The vast majority of comparative studies of Indigenous literature deals with comparison to the dominant majority culture, or on a trans-national level, as with Native American texts. A minimum of research has attended to comparing diverse and distinct Indigenous works across these boundaries, at the global level. Chadwick Allen seeks to address these shortcomings in *Trans-Indigenous*, using the comparative method of juxtaposition. Moving past the comparative *and*, he explores the prefix *trans-,* meaning, across, through, and beyond. Looking at Indigenous-to-Indigenous encounters, and using Indigenous motifs and patterns, including other forms of artistic media, he presents a methodology that 'locates itself firmly in the specificity of the Indigenous local while remaining always cognizant of the complexity of

the relevant Indigenous global' (2012, p. xix). A trans-Indigenous analysis of a passage from *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, and a poem from *Trekways of the Wind*, using the theme of 'place', applies the methodology of juxtaposition to the texts. Bypassing the dominant culture's critical methodologies, these texts are considered as a series of engagements of Indigenous representation within a Sámi and Māori context.

From a starting-point of a place that is an unfamiliar territory, the encounters transcend the 'exotic' and come to a point of the 'familiar' through connection to the Indigenous Other; in one case to a Māori *poutokomanawa* in a museum, and in the other with the Blackfeet Nation of the American prairie. Using the motif of the spiral, common to both Māori and Sámi cultures, the liminal and ritualistic aspects of journey are opened up within the texts; revealing where each character is centred, and how they move through a transition to finally incorporate the idea of 'home'. Other forms of artistic media available within or around the two texts, namely the Māori carving and the drawings accompanying the poems in the book, contribute to the expansion of cultural aesthetic knowledge, which informs a deeper understanding of the texts themselves, and also of the Indigenous context that the literature exists within. Finally, taking the example of the Māori concept of *taonga* and the Sámi *yoik,* an exploration was conducted of a Māori reading of a Sámi text, and a Sámi reading of a Māori text. In sum, Chadwick Allen's methodology of juxtaposition demonstrates, through the literature of Indigenous narratives from diverse parts of the world with shared colonial histories, that the conclusions reached, in an era of decolonization and globalization, are diverse and complex. They arrive not at similar conclusions that Indigenous peoples are the same, but provoke a practice of multiple articulations that take into account differences and distinctions that are specific, while reading across, through and beyond traditional groupings, that are understood in Indigenous-to-Indigenous terms of self-representation. Within this relationship, a sense of place is evoked through locating the familiar, a home away from home, a discovery of common ground.

7 Conclusion

7.1 Summary of Analysis

This thesis examines how Indigenous concepts of place are represented and articulated in *Trekways of the Wind* by Sámi poet Nils-Aslak Valkeapää, and *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*, a novel by Māori author Tina Makereti. The first section of the analysis explores how this literature identifies with and contributes to the representation of place in these texts. The titles both prioritize location as a theme, in an Indigenous sense; in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* by Makereti's use of the Moriori name of the island, 'Rēkohu', and in *Trekways of the Wind* by evoking a nomadic sense of movement connected to nature by juxtaposing the words 'trekways' and 'wind'; or, in Valkeapää's native language, 'home' and 'heart'. Characters too are representative of place in both texts; in *Rēkohu*, these are more archetypal, taking the perspectives of characters both dislocated from and centred within the Māori and Moriori cultures. In *Trekways of the Wind*, the characters are interchangeable with their surroundings, can shape-shift, become animals or represent aspects of nature and the land itself. Specific places in *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* can evoke memory and connection with ancestors within the plot structure of the book, as a celebration of cultural retrieval. The book itself can be its own landscape, as in *Trekways of the Wind*; one that the reader enters and wanders through, the poet/shaman as a guide, who leads the reader along ancient paths, from the realm of the physical landscape into the realm of literature and art. Tina Makereti writes about the *wharenui* in Auckland University's Waipapa marae, Tane-nui-a-Rangi, as a metaphor for a house of literature in Aotearoa. Here both authors illustrate a relationality between place and literature, history and story.

The second analysis chapter explores how a connection to the landscape is conveyed in the tools or markers used by the authors through language, such as naming, translation and story. This chapter explores language, firstly as a medium in itself, as a method of human communication, and how it shapes our worldview. Language has been subjugated within the assimilation practices of colonization, and revived as part of the decolonization process. The conflicting worldviews of the Indigenous and Eurocentric concepts of place are articulated in Valkeapää's poetry, in oral techniques such as the Sámi yoik; and in Makereti's novel, through use of specific words that are resonant with meaning. The connection of language to place is at its most specific when it comes to naming. Names, particularly for places, are

markers of identification and communion with the landscape; they are metaphors, allegories and manifestations of cultural heritage and ancestry. Placenames can indicate an historical presence of people on the land, and become a site of resistance in the political sphere, whether in translation, the refusal of translation, or in translating back, as the various examples from literary texts have shown. The power of words in the Indigenous oral tradition, also prevalent in Indigenous literature, and as a method for Indigenous research, culminate in the use of story, of narrative, as a powerful tool for self-representation. This self-representation can be used as a means to deconstruct the grand narratives of an imposed culture, and offer alternative stories, or histories. Hidden histories and the colonizer's projection of inferiority, resulting in a sense of cultural shame and a dislocation of language and story are also discussed, with reference to Arnold Krupat's idea of an ethnocritical frontier that blurs the borders between colonizer and colonized, and allows for a continued Indigenous existence beyond decolonization. A sense of place here becomes not only a tie to territory, but also a metaphorical place that can exist within histories of shared experience.

The final chapter asks what can we learn by comparatively juxtaposing the literature of Indigenous narratives of shared colonial histories from diverse parts of the world, and do these texts arrive at similar conclusions, in the era of decolonization and globalization? The analysis concentrates on Chadwick Allen's methodology of juxtaposition, placing a passage of prose from *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings* alongside a poem from *Trekways of the Wind*. From a starting-point of a place that is an unfamiliar territory, the encounters transcend the 'exotic' and come to a point of the 'familiar' through connection to the Indigenous Other. The motif of the spiral opens up the liminal and ritualistic aspects of journey, through centring, transition and incorporation within the texts. Other forms of artistic media available contribute to the expansion of cultural aesthetic knowledge, which informs a deeper understanding of the texts themselves, and also of the Indigenous context that the literature exists within. Finally, taking the example of the Māori concept of *taonga* and the Sámi *yoik*, an exploration is conducted of a Māori reading of a Sámi text, and a Sámi reading of a Māori text. Chadwick Allen's methodology of juxtaposition demonstrates that the conclusions reached are diverse and complex. The two texts provoke a practice of multiple articulations that take into account differences and distinctions that are specific, while reading across, through and beyond traditional groupings, that are understood in Indigenous-to-Indigenous terms of self-representation.

One of the main challenges of this thesis has been working between the disciplines of Literature and Indigenous Studies. A balance between critical representations and expectations had to be maintained throughout, with an implicit eye kept on both literary critical theory and Indigenous methodologies within the analysis. Within Indigenous Studies in general, it is important to note the spectrum of situations Indigenous peoples may find themselves in; for example, not all communities have access to their original language; or they may live in areas where they make up the majority of the population, while remaining a minority within the nation state. Some Indigenous peoples may have not been raised within their local tradition, but maintain a connection to homelands and relatives. The Indigenous experience is not monolithic, even within specific groups, which is necessary to note when discussing worldviews and epistemologies.

Exploring the literature across two Indigenous groups, Sámi and Māori in this case, is an approach that has not been prevalent within the academic literary sphere, and therefore this thesis examines new methods and covers new ground within the research. Academic work has been done within the local framework of specific communities, such as Linda Tuhiwai Smith's *Kaupapa Māori* research within the Māori world. Many Indigenous texts have been compared to the dominant literary mainstream, as with Arnold Krupat's Cosmopolitan approach. There is room yet for an examination of the trans-Indigenous perspective; across borders, cultures and traditions, where comparison can throw aspects of Indigenous epistemologies into relief, and gain greater insight into the larger Indigenous-to-Indigenous experience. As the Indigenous global movement gains ground, this may be something we will see more of in the future, within the literary field, and within the other disciplines of Indigenous Studies.

7.2 Books on the Shelf

We travelled north from Tromsø's mountains, passing through Skibotn, where Lásságámmi, Nils-Aslak Valkeapää's final residence before his death in 2001, nestles between the steep mountains and the waters of the fjord. Heading into Finnmark, the landscape opens up and flattens out into the tundra, rolling hills and valleys as far as the eye can see. It was February, and the land was covered in snow, temperatures inland so cold it was only possible to be outside for a few minutes at a time. The late sunrise cast a pink hue over the world, and it was

easy, in all that space, to imagine the borderless expanse described in Valkeapää's poetry in *Trekways of the Wind*:

> winds and smoky snow
> sunshine and drizzle
> the sound of bells and dogs barking
> the bluethroat singing
> in the tundra as wide as a sea (p. 3: ds.43)

A few months previously, on the other side of the earth, I had been asked to give what is known as a *koha*, an offering or donation to the Kōpinga marae on Rēkohu, in a reciprocal exchange for the meals and accommodation they provided. After careful inquiries about the cash amount I should offer, I also presented a copy of *Trekways of the Wind*, which had travelled with me on six different flights and many, many hours to reach my destination. I thought of that book then, looking out over the tundra, in the little library of the marae, finding its own sense of place, on the same shelf as *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings*; both books together, symbolizing the connections made, the encounters with people, and the landscapes travelled over, in the journey that has been the research for this thesis.

8 Works Cited

Albury, N. J. (2015). Your Language or Ours? Inclusion and exclusion of non-indigenous majorities in Māori and Sámi language revitalization policy. *Current Issues in Language Planning, 16:3*, 315-334.

Allen, C. (2002). *Blood Narrative: Indigeneity in American Indian and Maori Literary and Activist Texts.* Durham and London: Duke University Press.

Allen, C. (2012). *Trans-Indigenous.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Allen, C. (2014). Decolonizing Comparison: Toward a Trans-Indigenous Literary Studies. I J. H. Cox, & D. Heath Justice, *The Oxford Handbook of Indigenous American Literature* (ss. 377-394). Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Allen, P. G. (1986). *The Sacred Hoop: Recovering the Feminine in American Indian Traditions.* Boston: Beacon Press.

Ashcroft, B., Griffiths, G., & Tiffin, H. (1989). *The Empire Writes Back: Theory and Practice in Post-colonial Literatures.* London: Routledge.

Bakhtin, M. (1981). *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays (ed. Michael Holquist).* Austin: University of Texas Press.

Basso, K. H. (1996). *Wisdom Sits in Places: Landscape and Language Among the Western Apache.* Albuqerque: University of New Mexico Press.

Brett, A. (2015). 'The miserable remnant of this ill-used people': colonial genocide and the Moriori of New Zealand's Chatham Islands. *Journal of Genocide Research 17:2*, 133-152.

Budhwa, R., & McCreary, T. (2013). Reconciling Cultural Resource Management with Indigenous Geographies. I J. T. Johnson, & S. C. Larsen, *A Deeper Sense of Place: Stories and Journeys of Indigenous-Academic Collaboration* (ss. 195-214). Corvallis: Oregon State University Press.

Chamberlin, J. (2003). *If This is Your Land, Where are Your Stories? Reimagining Home and Sacred Space.* Cleveland: The Pilgrim Press.

Cresswell, T. (2015). *Place: An Introduction.* Chichester: Wiley / Blackwell.

Dana, K. O. (2011). Áillohaš and his Image Drum: The Native Poet as Shaman. *Nordlit: Tidsskrift i litteratur og kultur 8(1)*, 7-33.

Deane, S. (1990). Introduction. I T. Eagleton, F. Jameson, & E. W. Said, *Nationalism, Colonialism, and Literature* (ss. 3-19). Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Deloria Jr, V., Scinta, S., & Foehner, K. (1999). *Spirit and Reason: The Vine Deloria Jr. Reader.* Fulcrum.

Fanon, F. (1961). *The Wretched of the Earth.* London: Penguin.

Friel, B. (1981). *Translations.* London: Faber and Faber.

Gaski, H. (2008). Yoik - Sámi Music in a Global World. I H. Minde, *Indigenous Peoples: Self-determination, Knowledge, Indigeneity* (ss. 347-360). Delft: Eburon.

Gaski, H. (2010). Nils-Aslak Valkeapää: Indigenous Voice and Multimedia Artist. I A. e. Ryall, *Arctic Discourses* (ss. 301-328). Cambridge: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Gaski, H. (2013). Indigenism and Cosmopolitanism: A Pan-Sami View of the Indigenous Perspective in Sami Culture and Research. *AlterNative. An International Journal of Indigenous Peoples. Vol 9, Issue 2*, 114-124.

Gaski, H. (2015). Looking Both Ways: Future and Tradition in Nils-Aslak Valkeapää's Poetry. I K. W. Shanley, & B. e. Evjen, *Mapping Indigenous Presence: North Scandinavian and North American Perspectives* (ss. 250-78). University of Arizona Press.

Gaski, H. (2018, April). Personal correspondence.

Grace, P. (1998). *Baby No-Eyes.* Auckland: Penguin.

Helander, K. R. (2016). The Power of Administration in the Official Recognition of Indigenous Place Names in the Nordic Countries. I G. Puzey, & L. Kostanski, *Names and Naming: People, Places, Perceptions and Power* (ss. 229-249). Channel View Publications.

Ihimaera, W., & Makereti, T. (2017). *Black Marks on the White Page.* Wellington: Vintage.

Johnson, J. T., & Larsen, S. C. (2013). *A Deeper Sense of Place: Stories and Journeys of Indigenous-Academic Collaboration.* Corvallis: Oregon State University Press.

Justice, D. H. (2016). Reflections on Indigenous literary nationalism: On home grounds, singing hogs and cranky critics. I C. Andersen, *Sources and Methods in Indigenous Studies* (ss. 23-30). Florence: Taylor and Francis.

Kaufman, J. (2014). *The Collected Poems of Muriel Rukeyser.* Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press.

Kavanagh, J. (2014). *Other Places.* Liscannor: Salmon Poetry.

King, M. (1989). *Moriori: A People Rediscovered.* Auckland: Viking.

Kostanski, L., & Puzey, G. (2016). Trends in Onomastics: An Introduction. I L. Kostanski, & G. Puzey, *Names and Naming: People, Places, Perceptions and Power* (ss. xiii - xxiv). Channel View Publications.

Kovach, M. (2009). *Indigenous Methodologies.* Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Krupat, A. (1992). *Ethnocriticism: Ethnography, History, Literature.* Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Krupat, A. (2002). *Red Matters: Native American Studies.* Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Krupat, A. (2008). Nationalism, Indigenism, Cosmopolitanism: Three Critical Perspectives on Native American Literatures. I H. Minde, *Indigenous Peoples: Self-determination, Knowledge, Indigeneity* (ss. 361-376). Delft: Eburon.

Kuokkanen, R. (2000). Towards an Indigenous Paradigm: From a Sámi Perspective. *The Canadian Journal of Native Studies, 20:2*, 411-36.

Makereti. (2017). Poutokomanawa: The Heartpost. *Auckland Writers Festival 2017* (ss. 1-19). Auckland: University of Auckland.

Makereti, T. (2010). *Once Upon a Time in Aotearoa.* Wellington: Huia.

Makereti, T. (2014). *Where the Rēkohu Bone Sings.* Auckland: Vintage.

Makereti, T. (2017, October 10). Interview in Wellington. (J. Kavanagh, Intervjuer)

Markussen, B. (2013). Law and Multimodal Aesthetics: Nils-Aslak Valkeapää's Trekways of the Wind. *Journal of Illustration Studies*.

Minde, H. (2003). The Challenge of Indigenism: The Struggle for Sámi Land Rights and Self-Government in Norway 1960-1990. I S. Jentoft, H. Minde, & R. Nilsen, *Indigenous Peoples: Resource Management and Global Rights* (ss. 75-104). Delft: Eburon.

Minde, H. (2008). The Destination and the Journey: Indigenous Peoples and the United Nations from the 1960s through 1985. I H. Minde, *Indigenous Peoples: Self-determination, Knowledge, Indigeneity* (ss. 49-86). Delft: Eburon.

Momaday, N. (1997). *The Man Made of Words.* New York: St Martin's Press.

Morkenstam, U. (2016). The Nordic Sámediggis and the Limits of Indigenous Self-Determination. *Gáldu Cála. Journal of Indigenous Peoples Rights No.1*, 4-40.

Murton, B. (2013). From Landscape to Whenua: Thoughts on Interweaving Indigenous and Western Ideas about Landscape. I J. T. Johnson, & S. C. Larsen, *A Deeper Sense of Place: Stories and Journeys of Indigenous-Academic Collaboration* (ss. 146-7). Corvallis: Oregon State University Press.

Nash, C. (1999). Irish Placenames: post-colonial locations. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers, Vol 24(4)*, 457-480.

Nergård, J.-I. (2004). The Sacred Landscape. *Dieđut 3: Landscape, Law and Customary Rights*, 85-92.

Ní Cheallaigh, M. (2012). Ringforts or Fairy Homes: Oral Understandings and the Practice of Archaeology in Nineteenth- and Early Twentieth-Century Ireland. *International Journal of Historical Archaeology, Vol 16, No.2, Archaeology, Memory and Oral Tradition*, 367-384.

Olsen, B. (1996). Stone Labyrinths in Arctic Norway. *Caerdroia 27*, 24-27.

Pedersen, A.-K. (2016). Is the Official Use of Names in Norway Determined by the Place-Names Act or by Attitudes? I G. Puzey, & L. Kostanski, *Names and Naming: People, Places, Perceptions and Power* (ss. 213-228). Channel View Publications.

Punter, D. (2000). *Postcolonial Imaginings.* Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Radding, L., & Western, J. (2010). What's in a Name? Linguistics, Geography and Toponyms. *The Geographical Review, 100 (3)*, 394-412.

Ramnarine, T. K. (2009). Acoustemology, Indigeneity, and Joik in Valkeapää's Symphonic Activism: Views from Europe's Arctic Fringes for Environmental Ethnomusicology. *Ethnomusicology, Vol 53, No.2*, 187-217.

Said, E. (1978). *Orientalism.* Penguin.

Selden, R., Widdowson, P., & Brooker, P. (2013). *Contemporary Literary Theory.* London and New York: Routledge.

Skåden, S. (2012). Notes from a Backwoods Saami Core. Indigenuity Press.

Smith, L. T. (1999). *Decolonizing Methodologies.* London: Zed Books.

Solomon, M., & Thorpe, S. (2012). Taonga Moriori: Recording and Revival. *Journal of Material Culture*, 245-263.

Stumpf, M. P. (2001). Language's Place in Nature. *Trends in Ecology and Evolution, Vol 16, No.9*, 475-6.

Tuan, Y.-F. (1991). Language and the Making of Place: A Narrative-Descriptive Approach. *Association of American Geographers, Vol. 81, No. 4*, 684-696.

Valkeapää, N. (2017). *Lása duohken / Behind the window.* Guovdageaidnu / Kautokeino: Bárus.

Valkeapää, N.-A. (1994). *Trekways of the Wind.* Gouvdageaidnu / Kautokeino: DAT.

Valkeapää, N.-A. (1997). *The Sun, My Father.* Guovdageaindu / Kautokeino: DAT.

Valkeapää, N.-A. (2017). *The Earth, My Mother.* Gouvdageaidnu / Kautokeino: DAT.

Wilson, S. (2008). *Research is Ceremony: Indigenous Research Methods.* Halifax: Fernwood.

Womack, C. S. (1999). *Red on Red: Native American Literary Separatism.* Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.